

AALBORG UNIVERSITET

The Purist and A Tourist: A Sustainable Approach to Tourism Development and Consumption.

Lucky Tshall

Master Thesis in Tourism

The School of Culture and Global Studies Aalborg University

Supervisor: Karina Madsen Smed

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my deep and sincere gratitude to my research supervisor, Karina Madsen Smed, Cand. mag. English and International Studies with tourism as a supplement, Ph.D., Aalborg University, for granting me the opportunity to do research and providing invaluable guidance throughout this research. Her enthusiasm, vision, sincerity, and motivation have deeply inspired me. She has taught me the Methodology to carry out the research and to present the research as clearly as possible. It was a great privilege and honour to work and study under her guidance. I am sincerely grateful for her time. I would also like to thank her for her empathy and great sense of understanding.

I am extremely grateful to my mother for her love, prayers, caring and sacrifices for educating and preparing me for my future. I am very much thankful to Clara for her unconditional love and patience, understanding, and continued support. Also, I express my deepest thanks to Birgit for her guidance and support when I needed a mother in Denmark. My special thanks go to the stakeholders who took their time to participate in the research and provide me with valuable data.

Abstract

Tourism development often focuses on the economic sustainability of a destination, and as tourism consumption matures, contemporary approaches to tourism development are necessary, and this paper will focus on sustainable tourism development and consumption using the purist and tourist concept developed by the researcher. Sustainability has developed significantly in the tourism industry, presenting innovative approaches and standards for policy, and encouraging the creation of the notion of sustainable tourism. There have been several institutional initiatives in this respect, and they have moulded a framework for both applied and theoretic development and have facilitated the spread of the paradigm of sustainability as an overall feature of modern-day tourism.

A qualitative study has been conducted with data collected through structured and semistructured interviews as well as through the analysis of secondary data from previous research. The purpose of the paper is to bring attention to the different aspects that can be used to interpret and communicate sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption using the purist and the tourist approach to sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption. The study represents a valuable addition to the current literature on sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	2
Abstract	3
1.Introduction	6
1.1 Background to Study	6
1.2 Problem Formulation	7
1.4 Limitations	8
1.5 Thesis Outline	8
2. Literature Review	9
2.1 The Tourist Vs A Purist	. 10
2.1.1 Dependants	. 11
2.1.2 Conservatives	. 12
2.1.3 Criticisers.	. 13
2.1.4 Explorers	. 13
2.1.5 Belonging Seekers	. 14
2.2 Sustainable Tourism Development	. 15
2.2.1 The principle of Environmental Sustainability Development in Tourism.	. 15
2.2.2 The Principle of Social Sustainability Development in Tourism	. 16
2.2.3 The Principle of Cultural Sustainability Development in Tourism	. 17
2.2.4 The Principle of Economic Sustainability Development in Tourism.	. 18
2.3 Sustainable Tourism Consumption	. 19
2.3.1 The Utilitarian Approach.	. 19
2.3.2 Social and Psychological Approaches.	. 20
2.3.3 System of Provision / Institutional Approaches	. 21
3. Methodology	. 22
3.1 Research Design	. 22
3.1.1 Research Approach	. 22
3.1.2 Research Paradigm	. 23
3.2 Sampling Technique	. 24
3.2.1 Purposive Sampling	. 24
3.3 Sample	. 25
3.4 Data Collection Methods	. 26
3.4.1 Secondary Data	. 26

3.4.2 Semi-Structured Interviews
3.4.3 Email Interviews
3.5 Data Analysis
3.6 Validity
3.7 Reliability
4. Analysis
4.1 Understanding Sustainable Tourism Development
4.1.1 Sustainable Tourism Development Importance for the Local Economy
4.2 Challenges of Sustainable Tourism Development and Sustainable Tourism Consumption 33
4.3 Areas of Action
4.3.1 Inclusion
4.3.2 Policy Development
4.3.3 Stakeholder Collaboration
Discussion
5. Conclusion
References
Appendix
Appendix 1- Interview Guidelines for Policy Makers (Government Officials)
Appendix 2- Interview Guidelines for Tourism Stakeholders (Guides, Hotel Managers, Destination Managers, Service Providers)
Appendix 3- Email Interview Guidelines for Tourism Stakeholders (Government, Guides, Hotel Managers, Destination Managers, Service Providers)
Appendix 4 Interview with Kim De Coster Founder at Slow&Co53
Appendix 5 Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism
Appendix 6 Bernie Meyer, Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa
Appendix 7 Beki Libangalele Director of Responsible Tourism South Africa
Appendix 8 : Yanga Gijana; Founder of Travel with Yang Steeze

1.Introduction

1.1 Background to Study

Tourism development often focuses on the economic sustainability of a destination and as tourism consumption grows, modern approaches to tourism development are necessary and this paper will focus on sustainable tourism development and consumption using the purist and tourist concept developed by the researcher. The concept of purist considers sustainable tourism development and consumption from a perspective of developing tourism products and services focusing on the effect tourism development has on society, the environment, and the economy of these tourism destinations. The concept seeks to understand the fundamental principles of development by identifying a sustainable approach to consume tourism while utterly adhering to traditional values, culture, and tradition especially when consuming tourism products and services.

On the concept of the tourist, sustainable tourism development and consumption should create opportunities that satisfy the simplest tourist needs by driving their curiosity and continuous ambition while being simple and easy to consume. Also, this approach will focus on the effect tourism has on society, the environment, and the economy. Furthermore, a study conducted by Fan, Zhan, Jenkins, & Tavitiyaman (2017) and (Cohen, 1974) will inform the concepts that will be used to identify tourist typologies and enlighten the idea of sustainable tourism development and consumption applying the purist and tourist approach.

The process and the final product are equally essential, and tourism development should embrace the pursuit of sustainability as much as they embrace sustainability. The contrast between the tourist and purist categorises the type of sustainable tourism development we seek to achieve. The purist can find value and meaning based on a fundamental principle, where else a tourist has curiosity, ambition, and the drive to seek out and appease the need to consume and experience.

Moreover, the paper will define sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption to assist in understanding theories that will be applied to explain the idea. The concept of this paper is to formulate an approach to sustainable tourism development and consumption that attract and serves both the purist and the tourist sustainably.

1.2 Problem Formulation

The internet created a language that is impenetrable by large brands, a community that is influenced by groups of individuals defining taste. The push and pull factor of how pop culture defines tastes affects sustainable development and consumption and through the power of advertising at its essence is what drives culture, taste, and decision making. These internet communities direct the attitudes and behaviours of millions of people. In 2018 Iceland had 2.34 million visitors (Stastita, 2021) with an increase of more than 1 million tourists from the previous year, these tourists are the results of popular Instagram influencers visiting the country and overwhelming the nature and infrastructure designed to accommodate limited numbers of people. Tenbarge (2019) writes that to keep Wyoming wild, a tourism board overseeing the Instagram handle of Delta Lake, along with other natural beauties, has started a campaign to stop people from geotagging their photos and promoting slogans like "geotag destinations responsibly" the movement reflects the severe challenges destinations experience from an increased number of tourists.

Applying this perspective, the study will strive to investigate the way the tourism stakeholders think of sustainable tourism development and subsequently sustainable tourism consumption at the destination level thus trying to answer the following research question:

• How have tourism stakeholders (Government, Scholars, Developers, Planners, and SMEs) approached sustainable tourism development and influenced sustainable tourism consumption?

To reach a thorough understanding of the subject matter the research will also consider a subquestion:

• What are the roles do stakeholders take to understanding sustainable tourism development?

The objective of the study is to interpret and communicate sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption using the purist and the tourist approach to sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption.

1.4 Limitations

The research process faced limitations that need to be accepted. One of the limitations of the research is the lack of contributors from the Danish Ministry of Tourism as research participants, agencies like Visit Denmark and Wonderful Copenhagen as they would have given a distinctive perspective on tourism sustainability as they are viewed as leaders in the industry. The main issue was Covid19 restrictions that were implemented by the government, thus forcing most organisation to be closed or diverted priorities to sustain the business, therefore, management did not have time to participate in the research as it was not a priority for them.

1.5 Thesis Outline

The thesis is well-defined into five chapters. Primarily the introduction explains the objective of the study and the limitations of the study.

The literature review will introduce part of the current knowledge available in three concepts: Sustainable Tourism Development, Sustainable Tourism Consumption, The Tourist and The Purist approach to tourism.

The methodology chapter will explain the main attributes of the research process comprehensively from the paradigm, approach, and design of the study. Furthermore, the selection of the techniques will be clarified as well, together with the validity and reliability of the study.

The analysis chapter will outline the data collected following different categories that emerged in the process and discuss them concerning the subject matter and align them to academic literature as well as real-life data.

Finally, the last chapter will reflect on the study, and the research will draw a conclusion and provide recommendations to the research problem.

2. Literature Review

A prevalent literature review was completed to obtain insight into available research on sustainable tourism development, sustainable tourism consumption, a tourist, and a purist approach towards tourism. Developing knowledge with existing literature has multiple benefits for the research. First, it permits the researcher to find essential definitions and theories that will provide support to understanding the topic being researched. It also helps identify subsequent knowledge gaps that the research might try to address. And finally, it illustrates how other studies have confronted empirical research on the subject, which might lead to unveiling interesting theoretical and methodological concepts.

This chapter is designed into three main sections. The first section will focus on defining and explaining tourist typologies from Fan, Zhan, Jenkins, & Tavitiyaman (2017) perspectives: *dependants, conservatives, criticisers, explorers, and belonging seekers* as they inform modern tourist behaviours while linking, applying, and comparing it to Cohen (1974): *the organised mass tourist, the individual mass tourist, the explorer, and the drifters,* exceptional tourist typology definition. It then continues to define the purist approach, and the concepts applied to accentuate understanding of the concept of a purist in a tourism perspective: *preserve, maintain, and educate.* The literature on the purist concerning tourism is extremely limited, therefore, the researcher used an unconventional approach to comparing and discussing the linkage between tourist and purist to support the existing literature.

The second section explores the literature on the role of sustainable tourism development, which comprises four sub-sections dedicated to introducing key theories: *the principle of environmental sustainability development in tourism, the principle of social sustainability development in tourism, the principle of social sustainability development in tourism, the principle of cultural sustainability development in tourism and the principle of economic sustainability development in tourism.*

The third and final section is concerned with the concept of sustainable tourism consumption which contains three sub-sections and will be analysed, defined, and discussed using Hall's (2013) approaches on sustainable tourism consumption: *the utilitarian approach, social and psychological approach, and system of provisions/institutional approach.*

2.1 The Tourist Vs A Purist

UN (2020) defines a tourist as any person without distinction as to race, sex, religion, or language who enters the territory of a state other than that in which that person ordinarily resides and stays there for not less than twenty-four hours and not more than six months during any twelve months for legitimate non-immigrant purposes such as touring, recreation, sports, health, family reasons, study, religious pilgrimage, or business. Fan, Zhan, Jenkins, & Tavitiyaman (2017) study established methodical and compelling research of different types of tourists, the following depictions attempted to portray each tourist type by explaining each dimension through covering determinants, activities, intensity, impacts, and attitudes. Consequently, a tourist typology including five tourist types was established: *Dependants, Conservatives, Criticizers, Explores, and Belonging Seekers*. These types of tourists collaborated with Cohen's (1974) tourist typologies: *organised mass tourists, individual mass tourists, explorers, and drifters*, which are used to develop an understanding of the characteristics.

Cambridge (2021) defines a purist as someone who believes in and follows very traditional rules or ideas in a subject, for instance, someone concerned with the purity of a language and its protection from the use of external or modified practices. Purists idealised the tourism industry as an ivory tower, believing that a demonstrated distance from political, economic, and social influence was needed to implement development in an unbiased and genuine manner (Hancock, Hughes, & Walsh, 2017). Purist's ambitions were informed by their normative vision of sustainability and uniqueness, also for purists, tourism development driven by profit-making destroys the authenticity of the culture at the destination (Hancock, Hughes, & Walsh, 2017). Tourism development in the purest form will regulate and manage the number of people to ensure the service providers do not exceed carrying capacities and threaten sustainability (Parks & Allen, 2009). It is important to note that this scenario presents a cost inhibitive problem for many people, in reducing the number of people who can visit a site, the cost per person will need to be proportionately larger to accomplish the environmental and local goals of sustainable tourism development (Parks & Allen, 2009). However, this approach means that only people with excessive disposable income will afford to visit the destinations.

The tourist versus a purist approach to tourism development and tourism consumption is a new concept to tourism and it is developed by the researcher, therefore, literature that addresses this

phenomenon is extremely limited and the researcher will be applying different concepts that were developed in linguistics as a purist approach to language development and translate them to a tourism perspective to formulate literature that will support the concept of a tourist versus a purist that the researcher is seeking to discourse on the study. Furthermore, concepts developed by Parks & Allen (2009) on ecotourism as a purist approach will be applied to compare and support the literature, *Preserve*; supporting traditional lifestyles, help preserve them for future generations and it encourages local landowners to develop low-impact tourist facilities, *Maintain*; provides economic incentives to stop poaching and protect wildlife, tourist revenue benefit the local providers and producers and *Educate*; promotes environmental awareness, education, and protection of natural resources, travellers experience real culture and lifestyle rather than artificial replicas and it enhances understanding across cultures.

2.1.1 Dependants.

The unique features of this group are their dependent nature, they normally travel with their friends or relatives who can accompany them for the whole trip or join packaged tours which every detail is planned, and they relatively have few travel experiences, the majority of which fully rely on their travel companions (Fan, Zhan, Jenkins, & Tavitiyaman, 2017). Additionally, they have limited interactions with locals due to their limited language competence, age, personality, or other constraints before any contact with locals, perceptions or prejudices and word of mouth may also restrain them from any contact with host communities, as a result, they have limited direct contact with locals, the intensity of which is very superficial (Fan et al., 2017). This group is heavily linked with Cohen's (1974) organised mass tourist typology which is characterised as highly dependent on an environmental bubble created, supplied, and maintained by the international standardised tourism industry, which is all-inclusive fully packaged holidays, familiarity, non-existent novelty, and highly controlled.

From the purist perspective of preserving as suggested by Parks & Allen (2009), the tourism industry paid little attention to preserving the very nature that made its products desirable, as organised mass tourist or dependent led tourism frequently led to resource depletion and negative impacts on the values of the local people and their cultural heritage. Furthermore, pollution and overuse led to the degradation of the natural beauty in many sites, the number of tourists visiting influenced a change in culture and heritage to accommodate tourists, and finally, the economic

influence and pricing structure at the local destinations (Parks & Allen, 2009). It is crucial to understand that dependants are essential in maintaining a destination as they provide economic benefits to sustain the value chain of the destination and industry as a whole (Barr, Gilg, & Shaw, 2010). Finally, even though dependants are heavily criticised they provide necessary pressure towards tourism stakeholders to develop a destination and they often educate the limited local people they interact with on western perspectives which in turn builds curiosity amongst the local people and aspire them to seek change or development (Angelevska-Najdeska & Rakicevik, 2012).

2.1.2 Conservatives.

According to Fan, et al., (2017), conservatives establish contact with locals to obtain information or solve problems and the longer they stay at a destination, the more contact they will have with the host community as they get to familiarise themselves with the host destination. These tourists are associated with Cohen's (1974) description of individual mass tourists as they rely on institutional facilities like scheduled flights and centralised tourism booking systems to arrange as much possible before departing their home destination and often, they get to visit the same attractions as mass tourists, but they do it at their own pace. Additionally, other elements may influence contact with locals, for instance, the type of development at the destination, travel companion's travel experience, and communication skills (Fan et al., 2017). It is important to understand that this tourist type is not isolated from the host environment, as a study conducted by Wicken (2002) found that when asked these tourists suggested that they would return to the destination even though they experienced challenges.

Using the Parks & Allen (2009) concept on the purist, linking it with Fan et al., (2017) notion of the conservatives supporting traditional lifestyles of the local population aids in preserving the traditions for future generations as conservatives have limited but meaningful contact with locals at the destination. Subsequently, sustaining the market for conservatives helps maintain the destination as tourism activity results in revenue that benefits the local service providers and producers (Parks & Allen, 2009). Finally, the purist approach can serve as an educational tool for both the conservatives and the residents by promoting environmental awareness, enhancing understanding across both cultures since conservatives are known to have contact with residents

and thus might result in an enhanced visitor experience while benefitting the host community (Andereck & Nyaupane, 2010).

2.1.3 Criticisers.

These tourists interact with local hosts not only for obtaining information but also expecting to know more about the destinations, they have more travel experiences than the previous two typologies both individually and with packaged tours (Fan et al., 2017). Regarding contact elements, these types of tourists report fewer elements to influence their contacts with hosts, among which previous experiences and political/cultural sensitivity are newly emerged in this group (Fan et al., 2017). According to Laxson (1991), criticisers have a significant understanding of destinations and identify the difference for instance Hong Kong and Mainland China, these contacts may reinforce the criticiser's original culture and prejudices of the host culture. Then again, during travelling, they discover the destination through their cultural lens and make judgements according to their cultural standards (Laxson, 1991).

The purist approach is aligned towards the criticiser typology as they seek both seek to question how travel is conducted and the contact with residents (Parks & Allen, 2009). The fact that criticisers take time to understand the destinations and the locals through questioning the transitioning of culture when penetrated by western culture is important towards the concept of developing tourism using the purist approach (Laxson, 1991).

2.1.4 Explorers.

Explorers certainly have more social contact with locals as they are experienced travellers, they purposely interact with the residents and seek to know more about the local's life through informal and formal contact (Fan, et al, 2017). Also, they attend some local events, visit non-tourist areas, and approach non-tourism-related natives to experience something novel and exciting (Fan, et al, 2017). This typology is associated with Cohen's (1974) characterisation of explores as they organise their trips independently as they are looking to get off the beaten track but they rely on comfortable accommodation, reliable transportation, and the environmental tourist bubble is abandoned occasionally.

The purist approach to tourism must be met within the perspective of sustainable development, such as conservation of cultural assets, accurate analysis of resources, authentic visitor

experience, and stimulating revenue for tourism (Lussetyowati, 2015). Explorer's involvement at a destination tends to encourage the development of tourism which not only deals with identification, administration, and protection of heritage principles but also with the impact on communities, the economic and social benefits of locals, provision of financial resources as well as marketing and promotion (Lussetyowati, 2015). The combination of explorer's behaviour and the purist approach preserves local cultures, maintains the authenticity of the destination, and educates both tourists and residents (Parks & Allen, 2009).

2.1.5 Belonging Seekers.

The most distinguishing feature of this tourist type is that their contact with locals is for social purposes; they like to associate with natives through deep communications and mutual sharing of experiences, participation in their daily life and making friends to the point that some tourists end up making lifelong friends (Fan et al., 2017). Some tourists are fortunate enough to get invited to local's homes and they view this experience as an authentic experience and after contact, they usually have a positive attitude towards the region, destination, and locals (Fan et al., 2017). This typology shares similar characteristics with drifters as mentioned in Cohen's (1974) study; they will seek novelty at all costs, they will try to avoid all contact with "tourists", their spending patterns tend to benefit immediate locals rather than large tourism corporations that do not give back to local communities.

Ideally, this is the most aligned typology when considering Parks & Allen's (2009) perspective on the purist approach to tourism. Belonging Seekers support traditional lifestyles by interacting with the local people and not reserving their contact with locals, according to Bone (2010) this is important as it helps preserve the local culture through interaction with tourists and locals, the local find pride in their heritage and culture when visitors are sincerely interested in their lifestyle (Parks & Allen, 2009). Furthermore, they support maintaining destinations as their interactions provide economic incentives that directly support locals, the environmental efforts, and wildlife conservation (Parks & Allen, 2009). Finally, through their resources and experience in travelling, they educate locals, help raise awareness of social concerns, climate change issues, and preservation of heritage and culture (Parks & Allen, 2009).

2.2 Sustainable Tourism Development

Tourism development is an essential part of the development of other sectors that are always implemented in a sustainable manner that always synergises with various components and other supporting sectors (Amerta, Sara, & Bagiada, 2018). The development of tourism in the world is concerned with the aspect of sustainable attributes of preservation of cultural heritage and protection of the natural environment and multiple destinations have begun to minimise the social-cultural impacts and the impacts on the environment due to tourism (Amerta, Sara, & Bagiada, 2018). Recently tourism tended to no longer adapt to the strained tourism development but more of special interest tourism development or deemed as an alternative tourism development (Amerta, Sara, & Bagiada, 2018). World Tourism Organisation (1999) defines sustainable tourism development as development that supports the needs of present tourists and host regions while sustaining and enhancing opportunities for the future, it envisioned as leading to management of all resources in a way that economic, social, and environmental needs can be fulfilled while maintaining cultural integrity, biological diversity, essential ecological processes, and life support.

The concept of sustainable tourism development is based on four basic principles namely, *The Principle of Environmental Sustainability Development*: which provides development consistent with the vital ecological process, biological diversity, and biological resources. *The Principle of Social Sustainability Development*: offering development that highlights the traditional values of the host community while strengthening the identity of the community. *The Principle of Cultural Sustainability Development*: by providing development aligned with cultural values of the community and protect the cultural identity and heritage. *The Principle of Economic Sustainability Development*: to provide a cost-effective development and resources to be managed in a manner that they can be utilised in the present and the future generations (Angelevska-Najdeska & Rakicevik, 2012).

2.2.1 The principle of Environmental Sustainability Development in Tourism.

A great deal of the discussion has been underlined by the uneven and unequal nature of tourism development; this is most strikingly articulated at the international level as the inequality of first world tourism vs third world tourism is evident (Mowfurth & Munt, 2009). This also reflects two facets of sustainability: an environmental or an ecologically centred meaning of sustainability as

protecting and enhancing resources and biodiversity but also on the other hand, an attempt to sustain cultural products for the benefit of First World tourists, retaining places that are free from mass tourism and tourists (Mowfurth & Munt, 2009). As expected, to satisfy the needs of these first-world tourist policies and regulations have been put in place in efforts to conserve these attractions at the expense of the local communities. According to Mowfurth & Munt (2009), two basic interpretations can be made, each of which represents a contradiction, first, environmental issues and environment-focused organisations have been treated as compassionate causes and have attracted widespread interest and support from international NGOs, even in the light of quite dominant policies.

While this support reached its height in the 80s and has then faded somewhat, it, however, remains a significant pull for the new middle classes or so-called environmental tourists (Angelevska-Najdeska & Rakicevik, 2012). Secondly, tourism very much represents a double-edged sword for the socio-environmental movement in that it is an activity that is both despised and respected (Angelevska-Najdeska & Rakicevik, 2012). It has become a focus for both critiques because of its impacts on the environment and advancement as a means of achieving sustainable development in developing countries. Eckersley (1992) suggested that national parks are effective tools for environmental sustainability as they seek to conserve nature and make it pay for itself, a captivating argument for environmental conservation for many cash impoverished third-world governments. Furthermore, applying this perspective, conservation is envisioned as a sustainable tourism development by sustaining the environment for human production and consumption (Eckersley, 1992).

2.2.2 The Principle of Social Sustainability Development in Tourism.

There is a substantial quantity of research that reveals that local communities in developing countries reap fewer benefits from tourism because they have little or no control over the decision-making process in how the industry is developed and they cannot match financial resources available to external investors and their opinions are rarely heard. Lane (2018) suggests that to develop social sustainability in tourism collaboration is needed between the scholarly community, which research concepts such as sustainable tourism, the tourism industry, tourism authority, and especially the local community to put in practice what is known as sustainable tourism development. Furthermore, Roca-Puig (2019) highlights mutual benefit and trust

between business and society as fundamental to social sustainability which adds weight to responsible tourism and corporate social responsibility in tourism as positive factors in resident's quality of life.

Tourism social studies often inform on the impact of quality of life for the residents in tourist destinations in developing countries based on studying their attitudes concerning impacts on communities and the environment (Helgadottir, Einarsdottir, Burns, Gunnarsdottir, & Matthiasdottir, 2019). Subsequently, the quality of life in a tourism destination is fundamentally a subjective experience of individual life satisfaction of which various indicators must be weighted for the relative importance of local communities to conclude impacts of tourists and the tourism industry (Andereck & Nyaupane, 2010).

2.2.3 The Principle of Cultural Sustainability Development in Tourism.

(UNWTO, 2017) defines cultural tourism as a tourism activity in which the visitor's important motivation is to learn, experience, discover and consume the tangible and intangible cultural attractions/products in a tourism destination. These attractions/products related to a set of distinctive material, intellectual, spiritual, and emotional features of a society that encompasses arts and architecture, historical and cultural heritage, culinary heritage, literature, music, creative industries, and the living cultures with their lifestyles, value systems, beliefs, and traditions. South African Tourism (SAT) has identified the development of cultural tourism as one of the country's key growth areas but unfortunately, the potential for cultural tourism development does not correspond with the actual use of cultural resources in South Africa as part of the tourism mix (Ivanovic, 2008). This is the case for most tourism destinations in developing countries especially located in the global south. Worryingly, a study found that in general tourists lack empathy with cultural tourism products, which further implies that such products are taken out of their original cultural setting and become unrecognisable as authentic expressions of the original traditional culture, therefore, developing community-based cultural tourism is of urgency (Ivanovic, 2008).

The approach utilised in developing countries should emphasise cultural heritage resources dominating cultural tourism development. Cultural resources occupy a central position not only in tourism development but also in marketing as well as the main mechanism for tourist experiences and the main motivation for tourism activities in developing countries (Ivanovic, 2008). Previously limited significance was given to the protection and conservation of cultural heritage resources as marketing and tourism product development were the important factors for successful tourism development. Due to the government's commitment in South Africa towards a responsible approach to tourism development and embracing various suggestions from the UN, UNESCO, International Council Monuments and Site Charters (ICOMOS) following the guidelines for protection, conservation, preservation, presentation, and interpretation of national cultural heritage further sole reliance on marketing and cultural tourism product development is becoming highly sought-after (Ivanovic, 2008).

2.2.4 The Principle of Economic Sustainability Development in Tourism.

According to (UNWTO, 2008) economic sustainability addresses the long-term viability of economic operations, fairness, and equity of benefits distributions, employment, income-earning opportunities, and poverty alleviation.

Despite increased apprehensions about the negative economic impacts of tourism on host communities, insufficient attention has been paid to assess tourism's economic sustainability (Qui, Fan, Lyu, Lin, & Jenkins, 2019). The tourism industry is currently facing extraordinary challenges worldwide especially in developing countries due to the maturity of the sector and rapidly growing environments, thus, concerns about negative economic impacts of tourism on host communities continue to prevail highlighting the importance of evaluating economic sustainability in the development of tourism destinations in developing countries (Qui, Fan, Lyu, Lin, & Jenkins, 2019). Nevertheless, most current sustainability evaluation tools and guidelines tend to focus on environmental and social perspectives (Buckley, 2012). Most researchers do relate to economic sustainability but mainly focus on macro-level and objective indicators such as gross domestic product, employment rates, and investments. In contrast, beneficial macro-level objectives perspectives fail to capture many other indicators that have significant importance to local stakeholders, who are affected by tourism development strategies and who have their interpretations of economic sustainability (Muresan, Oroian, Harun, Arion, Porutiu, Chiciuden & Lile, 2016).

2.3 Sustainable Tourism Consumption

Several models, theories, and studies of climate change and tourism, sustainable tourism, sustainable mobility, and sustainable consumption, in general, contain an underlying belief about an individual's capacity to act (Hall, 2013). These assumptions correlate to both behaviour and governance, provided that the range of policy measures that the state utilises to achieve its policy goals is based on assumptions regarding individual and collective behaviour (Hall, 2011). As defined by the (United Nations , 2020) sustainable consumption of tourism is about the use of services and related products to tourism, which responds to the basic needs of a traveller and conveys a better quality of life to the host community while minimising the use of natural resources and toxic materials as well as the emissions of waste and pollutants over the life cycle of the services or products so as not to jeopardise the needs of future generations (Clarke, 2012). The following section will explore three different approaches to understanding behaviour regarding sustainable tourism consumption: the utilitarian, the social/psychological, and the systems of provision/institutional approach.

2.3.1 The Utilitarian Approach.

The utilitarian approach to behavioural change makes use of a traditional neo-classical microeconomic view of consumption by individuals as rational utility-maximisers (Hall, 2013). The approach presumes that people consume goods and services in free markets with perfect competition and information to decide a course of action that provides the greatest ability to the individual to make a sustainable decision (Hall, 2013). As much as the intellectual basis of neoclassical economies has been widely criticised, particularly in terms of the relationship of its notions to real-world economic behaviour (Keen, 2011), the approach underlies many modern neo-liberal economic policies and has inspired the socio-political construction of rational efficiency expanding neo-liberal consumers (Bone, 2010) & (McGuigan, 2006). Through this perspective, attempts to promote sustainability tend to depend on government intervention to correct market failure and ensure that private and corporate organisations and individuals have better information on which to base their sustainability decisions (Christie, 2010). The approach aims to attract reasonable actors with the information to overcome an intelligence insufficiency and promote realistic behaviour (Gadenne, Sharma, Kerr, & Smith, 2011). However, access to education and information about climate change and more sustainable forms of tourism consumption has not led to considerably enhanced sustainability behaviour (Ockwell, O'Neill, & Whitmarsh, 2010).

2.3.2 Social and Psychological Approaches.

The disappointment of neo-classical economic models to substantially improve levels of sustainability behaviour has led to the understanding that behaviour does not change simply because of the better quality of information (Whitmarsh, 2009). According to Hall (2013), the criticism of the neo-classical model has primarily come from two social/psychological sources: Behavioural economics and Consumptions studies. Behavioural economics acknowledges that individuals have bounded rationality (Conlisk, 1996). Furthermore, it often engages in satisficing behaviour, for instance, Simon (1965) suggests it is an option that satisfies most needs but not an ideal solution, as well as the character of social standards and routines that are not subject to coherent cost-benefit calculations, including concepts of community and fairness in economic outcomes (Folmer & Johansson-Stenman, 2011).

Considerably, concerning the approach of influencing behaviour, it also emphasises that too much diversity in the market leads to information overload and ensuing difficulties in decision-making (Seyfang, 2011). The focus of satisficing is not new and has long been influential concerning policymaking (Simon, 1965). Nevertheless, it has recently assumed improved significance for climate change solutions (Thynne, 2008). Including transition management in sustainable tourism (Gossling, Hall, Ekstrom, Brudvik-Engeset, & Aall, 2012).

The focus of nudging is in reconstructing the choice architecture to encourage beneficial decision-making consumers, such as decreases in emissions (Hall, 2013). The approach indicates that the goal of public policymaking should be to drive citizens towards making positive decisions as individuals and society as a whole while preserving individual choices (Hall, 2013). Acting as choice architects policymakers shape the context, process, and environment in which people make decisions, and in doing so they utilise cognitive biases to manipulate people's choices (Alemanno, 2012).

A key insight of such a method is that people do not act as secluded individuals and instead consumption is socially situated and often deeply embedded with habits and norms being significant (Hall, 2013). An insight that is common with studies of consumption recognises that

consumption is a multi-layered phenomenon that is full of meaning as well as its role as a form of identity, cultural and social affiliations, and relationships (Seyfang, 2011). The representational value of consumption and its purpose for social distinction as well as selfexpression has long been recognised as essential for tourism and leisure consumption (Chen & Hu, 2010), plus exclusively concerning sustainable tourism consumption (Barr, Gilg, & Shaw, 2010).

2.3.3 System of Provision / Institutional Approaches.

The third approach takes a more organisational perspective on the administration of systems of consumptions and provision by focusing on the contextual collective societal institutions, norms, rules, structures, and infrastructures that gratify individual decision-making, consumption, and social practices (Hall,2013). Based on Southerton, Van Vliet, & Chappells (2004) these are referred to as infrastructures of provision institutions and systems of provisions: vertical commodity chains compromising production, marketing, finance, distribution, advertising, retail, and consumption that entails a more comprehensive chain of activities between two extremes of production and consumption, each relation of which plays a potentially important role in the social construction of the commodity equally in its physical and cultural aspects (Fine & Leopold, 1993).

The significance of the systems of provisions approach is that it highlights socio-technical systems of provision and can therefore support consumers to particular social practices of behaving and consuming (Lorenzoni, Nicholson-Cole, & Whitmarsh , 2007). The approach criticises the other two approaches by indicating that positioning the challenge of sustainable consumption and mobility as a problem of personal choice fails to appreciate the socially situated and structured nature of consumption and is arguably a suspect theory of choice given that it accepts that people could and would behave differently if only, they knew what harm they were doing (Hall, 2013). Such ideas inform programmes of research into relationships between environmental belief, action, and design of policy initiatives initiated around the provision of more and better information (Southerton, Van Vliet, & Chappells, 2004b). Additionally, much-needed research on consumption fails to recognise that consumers do not consume the services that are made possible by resources and a focus on end consumers obscures important questions

about the design and production of possibilities and relationships to demand and use (Southerton, et al, 2004b) & (Hall, 2013).

3. Methodology

This chapter concentrates on defining the research design, data collection, and sampling techniques used to complete the study. Qualitative research introduces an understanding of the human condition in different contexts and a perceived situation, nevertheless, there is no perfect designed study, and unexpected events always appear (Marriette, 2016). Qualitative research entails collecting and analysing non-numerical data to understand concepts, opinions, or experiences and it can be used to gather in-depth insights into a problem or generate new ideas for research (Bhandari, 2020). The research will implement the pragmatism philosophy method. Accordingly, this study involves subjects from different parts of the world, developing countries, and developed countries, therefore, makes the pragmatism method a fitting philosophy for the study. The chapter concludes with the delineation of the qualitative validity and reliability of the study.

3.1 Research Design

3.1.1 Research Approach

The research will be conducted employing a qualitative approach. Qualitative research contributes to understanding the human condition in different contexts and of the perceived situation (Mariette, 2016), nevertheless, there is no perfect design study and unexpected events will always appear. Peterson (2019) states that qualitative researchers venture into unexplored territory, make sense of participants, language, behaviour, make assertations based on findings, compare those with what exists in the literature and suggest applications and new research directions. Qualitative research contains a set of interpretive material practices that make the world observable, they turn the world into a sequence of representations, including field notes, conversations, interviews, photographs, recordings, and memos, at this level qualitative research comprises of an interpretive and naturalistic approach to the world (Davies & Hughes, 2014).

In this case, the qualitative method was chosen since it permits the researcher to focus on the meanings, perceptions, and experiences given by respondents. The core focus of the research is to gather perspectives, attitudes, and ideas from subjects involved rather than numbers or

statistics. The purpose is to convey awareness to the narrative of sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption by attending to and providing a voice to those who are working on developing tourism and those who are affected by the consumption of tourism while taking account of social, economic, and environmental impacts in the process. It is essential to recognise that qualitative research comes with challenges. The main issue is how many financial resources, time, and effort the researcher is willing to invest in the study (Patton, 2002).

This research will primarily implement abductive reasoning which fundamentally means moving back and forth between deductive and inductive reasoning (Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2016). Eriksson & Kovalainen (2008) maintain that deduction develops on the notion that theory is the first source of knowledge hence a deductive process progresses from theory to empirical research to balance certain hypotheses. Furthermore, induction starts with empirical research with the purpose to generate theoretical results (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2008). An abductive approach allows an adaptable research process that can be altered because of unexpected empirical results or new theoretical insights (Dubois & Gade, 2002). An argument presented by Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill (2016) emphasises that abduction starts with the observation of a surprising fact and then develops a reasonable theory of how this could have happened, also some reasonable theories would explain the phenomenon better than others and help discover more surprising facts.

The research began by studying literature on sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption. After reviewing theories on sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption, the empirical findings discovered surprising new facts such as the approach of sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption using the purist and tourist method.

3.1.2 Research Paradigm

The research aims to understand sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption using the purist and tourist approach. In this section of the study, the researcher seeks to define the research paradigm to be followed throughout the process.

The philosophical foundation upon which the research is formulated influences how researchers approach the problem articulation by directing what should be studied, how it should be studied,

and how results should be analysed and presented. Therefore, according to Bryman (2012) incorporating a particular paradigm suggests accepting detailed assumptions on *Ontology*: the study of what it is, *Epistemology:* the study of what it means to know, and *Methodology*: the choice of data collection methods and data analysis.

The study is conducted using the Pragmatism Philosophy method. Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, (2012) assert that it is important to recognise that there are different aspects of understanding the world and conducting research, that no one point of view can ever present the entire picture as the world has multiple realities. Furthermore, Kelemen & Rumens (2008) continue suggesting that concepts are only relevant where they support action. Pragmatism strives to reconcile both *objectivisms*: assumptions of natural sciences and *subjectivism*: assumptions of arts and humanities, facts and values, accurate and rigorous knowledge, and different contextualised experiences (Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2012). It is done by considering theories, concepts, ideas, hypotheses, and research findings not in an abstract form but in terms of their practical consequences in specific contexts (Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2012).

The paradigm was chosen because it was viewed as the most suitable approach to guide this study, the researcher strives to find different ideas, concepts, and theories to work with different types of knowledge and methods to solve the research problem.

3.2 Sampling Technique3.2.1 Purposive Sampling

Data collection is important in research, as data is meant to contribute to a better understanding of a theoretical framework (Bernard, 2002). It then becomes trustworthy how data is obtained and from whom the data will be acquired be done with ethical acumen, especially since no amount of analysis can make up for improperly collected data (Walliman, 2011). The purposive sampling technique is the sensible choice of sampling due to the qualities the participants possess, furthermore, it is a non-random technique that does not need underlying theories or a set number of participants (Etikan, Musa, & Alkassim, 2016). The researcher determines what needs to be known and sets out to find individuals who can and are willing to provide the data by virtue of knowledge and experience (Bernard, 2002). Expert sampling was the technique used as it called for tourism experts to be the subjects of the purposive sampling, moreover, it is a positive tool to

use when investigating new areas of research as it informs on whether the study would be worth conducting (Etikan, Musa, & Alkassim, 2016).

Unlike random studies, which intentionally include a varied cross-section of ages, backgrounds, and cultures, the concept behind purposive sampling is to focus on a group of individuals with certain qualities who will better be able to assist with the relevant search (Etikan, et al, 2016).

3.3 Sample

A sample group is made up of different people based on their same or similar characteristics (Huppertz, 2019). The study focused on people who are directly involved in tourism development and influence tourism consumption. Government or policymakers were part of the sample population as the researcher seeks to understand how they inform tourism policy. Tourism service managers are important to the study as they influence how tourism services are distributed and they filter consumption. Business developers and entrepreneurs are crucial as these stakeholders satisfy the needs of tourists and help develop local communities in tourism destinations and this applies to local tour guides. Finally, scholars will be part of the sample group as they influence the development, policy, and consumption of tourism products and services.

The study does not focus on one geographical location but an international setting across three different countries, Denmark, South Africa, and The United States of America. The reason the researcher chose these regions is due to fact that the researcher currently resides in Denmark, and was born and raised in South Africa, and has an extensive network of tourism professionals in the US, also the common factor in these regions is that they have a higher-level tourism development, and the tourism policies are world-class often used as a model for other countries. The target group will be reached through Zoom and Email due to the geographical distance between the researcher and respondents and due to Covid19 restrictions. A total of twenty potential respondents were contacted requesting interviews through zoom or email namely, Visit Copenhagen director, The National Travel and Tourism Office USA, The Department of Tourism South Africa, University of Johannesburg and multiple private businesses. Four people responded and agreed to participate on the study through zoom interviews, Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism South Africa, Kim De Coster Founder at Slow&Co., Bernie Meyer, Director of Incentive and Responsible

Tourism South Africa and Beki Libangalele Director of Responsible Tourism South Africa. Yanga Gijana founder of travel with Yang Steeze agreed to participate through email.

3.4 Data Collection Methods

3.4.1 Secondary Data

The earliest step of data collection was to gather secondary data available online from Google Scholar, AAU Library, and physical books from the library. Secondary data refers to data that was collected previously and initially collected for a different purpose but align with the research purpose (Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2016). Furthermore, secondary analysis refers to the use of existing research data to find answers to a question that is different from the original work (Szabo & Strang, 1997). Using secondary data has some advantages as they allow researchers to save time and resources and they are understated and more often easily accessible. The challenge with secondary data is the fact that it was collected for different purposes and it might not completely match the study being conducted and there is no definite way of verifying the initial process (Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2016).

3.4.2 Semi-Structured Interviews

Kallio, Pietila, Johnson, & Kangasniemi (2016) ascertain that in a qualitative study, as in research methods in general, rigorous data collection procedures are the main factors that influence quality and reliability (Kitto, Chesters, & Grbich, 2008) and significantly influence the results of the study (Gibbs, Kealy, Willis, Green, Welch, Daly, 2007). Interviews are the most frequently used data collection method (Taylor, 2005) and the semi-structured format is often used interview technique in qualitative research (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006). The reason why semi-structured interviews are a popular data collection method is that they proved to be versatile and flexible (Kallio, et al, 2016). They can be mixed with both individual and group interview methods (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006) and the rigidity of their structure can be varied depending on the purpose of the study and research question (Kelly, 2010). Galletta (2012) states one of the main advantages is that the semi-structured interview method is successful in allowing reciprocity between the subject and the interviewer to improvise follow-up questions based on participants responses (Hardon, Hodgkin, & Fresle , 2004) and allowing space for participants different verbal expressions (Polit & Beck, 2010).

Due to Covid 19 pandemic, it was not possible to travel and meet respondents consequently, interviews were conducted through zoom which represented a set of limitations. Bryman (2012) maintains that zoom/phone interviews should not last too long as it is easier for the respondent to disconnect from the conversation over zoom/phone rather than in person. Moreover, communicating over skype/phone makes it harder to maintain high engagement with respondents (Bryman, 2012). To remedy the situation the researcher has planned to keep the interviews under an hour to not distract the subject's busy schedule.

3.4.3 Email Interviews

Email exchanges are evolving as an alternative method for conducting interviews in qualitative research (Gibson, 2010). Qualitative researchers gradually use technology to gather research data more efficiently and economically (Walker, 2013). The key advantage of the email interview is that it presents a convenient and practical alternative to exterminate geographical barriers and financial concerns that impede face-to-face interviews (Walker , 2013). According to Fritz & Vandermause (2017), qualitative researchers using email interviews for data collection found that scheduling advantages of the email interview expands access to participants and encourages greater participation of working professionals. Although video and telephone interviews offer the same advantage, a distinct feature of the email interview is the ability to conduct asynchronous interviews (Hawkins, 2018). Different from interviews in real-time, participants can respond to email prompts at their convenience and at a time that is suitable for them (Gibson, 2014). Beyond effortless accessibility, the exceptional asynchronous nature of email interviews allows the participant more control over their level of participation (Hawkins, 2018). Furthermore, control of their level of involvement offers an ethical advantage over conventional synchronous interviews as the participant controls the amount of time spent in the interviews (Mason & Ide, 2014).

Email interviews pose challenges too and Bowden & Galindo-Gonzalez (2015) suggest that the biggest challenge is the uncertainty as to whether participants are who they say they are. The lack of social interactions in email interviews means there is no body language, pauses, and tones are not detected which may increase ambiguity and misinterpretation of the message being exchanged (Chen & Hinton, 1999). Delays in receiving data are common because participants in email interviews respond to questions at their convenience and the researcher may have to wait

several days to receive a response (Cooper, 2009). Furthermore, the delay of responses may also eliminate spontaneity as a source of data and respondents may even forget to reply to the questions (Opdenakker, 2006).

3.5 Data Analysis

Thematic analysis was the chosen method to analyse the primary data collected and the secondary data. Braun & Clarke (2012) allude that thematic analysis is a method for methodically identifying, organising, and presenting insight into patterns of themes/meanings across a data set. The thematic analysis allows researchers to see and make sense of collective or shared meanings and experiences, furthermore, it is essential to understand that identifying unique and peculiar meanings and experiences discovered only within a single data element is not the focus of thematic analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2012). The patterns of meaning that thematic analysis allows the researcher to identify a need to be important about the specific topic and research being studied (Braun & Clarke, 2012) and (Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2016). The two main reasons to use thematic analysis are accessibility and flexibility for both small and large qualitative data sets that lead to rich descriptions, explanations, and theorising (Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2016) and (Braun & Clarke, 2012). The size of the data set was sufficient to perform an analysis manually without the assistance of software. A thematic approach was chosen as it allowed the researcher to identify themes that will support to answer the research question.

3.6 Validity

Validity in qualitative research means the relevance of the tools, processes, and data (Leung, 2015). Whether the research question is valid for the desired results, the choice of Methodology is suitable for answering the research question, the design is valid for the Methodology, sampling and data analysis is accurate and finally, the results and conclusions are valid for the sample and context (Leung, 2015). The challenge in assessing the validity of qualitative research can start from the ontology and epistemology of the issue being researched for instance the concept of an individual is seen differently between humanistic and positive psychologists owing to differing philosophical perspectives (Waterman, 2013). The selection of Methodology must enable detection of findings/phenomena in the applicable context for it to be valid, due to regarding the cultural and contextual variable (Leung, 2015). For sampling, methods and procedures must be appropriate for the research model and be distinctive between systematic (Finfgeld-Connett,

2010), purposeful (Palinkas, Horwitz, Green, Wisdom, Duan, Hoagwood, 2015) or theoretical adaptive sampling (Coyne, 1997) & (Hentz-Becker, 1993) where the systematic sampling has no *a priori* theory, purposeful sampling often has a particular objective or outline and theoretical sampling is influenced by the continuous process of data collection and theory development. For data extraction and analysis, several methods were implemented to enhance validity including 1st tier triangulation (of researchers) and 2nd tier triangulation (of resources and theories) (Finfgeld-Connett, 2010), (Lincoln & Guba, 1985) well-documented audit trail of materials and processes (Carcary, 2009), multi-dimensional analysis as a concept or case-orientated (Jansen, 2010), (Mathew & Huberman, 1994) and respondent verification (Lincoln & Guba, 1985), (George & Apter, 2004).

3.7 Reliability

In quantitative research, reliability refers to precise replicability of the process and results, in qualitative research with diverse concepts, such definition of reliability is difficult and epistemologically counter-intuitive (Leung, 2015). Therefore, the principle of reliability for qualitative research lies with consistency (Carcary, 2009) & (Grossoehme, 2014). A scope of inconsistency for results is accepted in qualitative research given the Methodology and epistemological logistics reliably yield data that is ontologically similar but may differ in-depth and quality within similar dimensions (Leung, 2015). Silverman (2009) recommended five methodologies in augmenting the reliability of the process and results in qualitative research: refutational analysis, constant data comparison, comprehensive data use, inclusive of the deviant case, and use of tables. When data is obtained from the original source, researchers need to verify its truthfulness in terms of form and context with continuous comparison (George & Apter, 2004), either alone or with peers also referred to as a form of triangulation (Patton, Enhancing the Quality and Credibility of Qualitative Analysis, 1999). The scale and analysis of data included should be as comprehensive and inclusive regarding quantitative aspects if possible (Patton, Enhancing the Quality and Credibility of Qualitative Analysis, 1999). Adopting the Popperian dictum of falsifiability as the principle of truth and science, attempted to contradict the qualitative data, and analysis should be performed to assess the reliability of the study (Allmark, 2003).

4. Analysis

The comprehensive data set collected from interviews and online documents were thematically analysed and presented in this chapter using different themes that materialised during the analysis process. The data will be contested with existing literature on the subject to contextualise the findings and place them into a clearer perspective.

The first section introduces data collected under the theme of understanding sustainable tourism development and its purposes. The second section will focus on the challenges the stakeholders experience regarding sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption. The third final section will examine the areas of action to induce sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption by applying the tourist and purist approach proposed by the researcher in detail on how this approach can be interpreted and subsequently used to inform future sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism development tourism consumption.

4.1 Understanding Sustainable Tourism Development

Sustainable development is the primary approach of development, and tourism has immense environmental, economic, and social impact in the modern world hence the development of this sector is associated with all three mentioned dimensions of sustainability (Streimekiene, Svagzadience, Jasinkas, & Simanavicius, 2021).

The general global acceptance of sustainable tourism development is the three pillars of economic sustainability, social sustainability, and environmental sustainability, and this how it is done in South Africa. The focus is on the term responsible tourism, which is more appropriate because it differs a little bit in each location in the world and the inclusivity, which has as a lot to do with social responsibility and social sustainability and transformation. Those things are unique to South Africa, and this forms part of that definition. So, therefore, it is not just environmental, social, or economic but all those things that need to be rather impacted (Bernie Meyer, Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa 2021).

"Furthermore, we have a responsible tourism strategy that defines it officially, but indeed for us, it is a familiar concept. Precisely, it is tourism that is inclusive, and it does not negatively impact the environment, society, and economic opportunities. Presume tourism transformation goes up of South Africa and positively addresses the

three evil strikes in terms of poverty, inequality, and unemployment, that is sustainable development". (Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism).

Tourism is one of the most perspective and dynamic businesses globally, and it is of great importance to design and develop tourism purposefully and sustainably through the search for compromises between environmental, economic, and social aims of society. (Streimekiene et al., 2021) The sustainable tourism development management must retain a high satisfaction degree of tourists needs, assure significant experience for consumers, increasing their consciousness under issues of sustainability, and proliferating practices of sustainable tourism among them (Streimekiene et al., 2021). According to (Kim De Coster, Founder of Slow & Co, 2021), it is easy in three words, the people, planet, and profit. The people referring to the society where the development occurs, the planet focusing on the environmental impacts, and the profit referring to the economic opportunities provided by the development.

"There is not one of them that can go well without the other, they have intertwined, and then when you translate that to tourism, I feel lots of people are looking to, is a hotel sustainable or is an excursion sustainable? Then I explain it is a lot more because tourism has an entire value chain. You need to look towards the suppliers, as a hotel can deem themselves sustainable for instance, they install solar panels and installed water filters. Does that make them sustainable? Well, it is a step in the right direction, but it is certainly not enough because if you do not see what your suppliers are doing and then what their supplier's supplies are doing, it needs to be the entire value chain for me". (Kim De Coster, 2021)

This statement is also supported by the Amerta et al., (2018) study suggesting that all actors involved should implement a sustainable manner when supporting various actors in development.

4.1.1 Sustainable Tourism Development Importance for the Local Economy

Muresan, et al., (2016) States that most research on the economics of sustainable tourism focuses on macro-level and objective indicators such as gross domestic product while failing to capture many important indicators that are important to local stakeholders who are affected by tourism development strategies and have understandings of economic sustainability.

Tourism development is important for destinations where consumption takes place, not just in developing countries but also in developed countries. Tourism is often the main economic driver, and it is evident now with Covid hitting all the sectors of the industry, and everything has been

closed for months, and people are out of work. Until everything gets back up and running, it is stressful for the local economy.

" I have noticed that the entire value chain is suffering because the main income of the islands is tourism and when that fell away, all the people that work in tourism no longer had work or temporarily unemployed, make less money, so they spend less money, so it is affected the entire economy, and I think lots of businesses are very much struggling to survive right now, so tourism is extremely important. There has been a lot of talks now in this situation that we need to investigate not just the model of tourism, but also need to investigate our economy model. We need to make sure we utilise other sectors and diversify and not depend so much on being on tourism" (Kim De Coster, Founder of Slow & Co, 2021)

The tourism industry is currently facing unexpected challenges worldwide, especially in developing countries due to the maturity of the sector and most recently Covid 19. Thus concerns about the negative economic impacts of tourism on local communities continue to exist, accenting the significance of evaluating economic sustainability in developing countries (Qui, Fan, Lyu, Lin, & Jenkins, 2019).

"From a proportion of the local economy, tourism is a significant contributor. Unfortunately, we are experiencing Covid, and the impact is evident but so significant that the President declared parts of the legislators focus areas of the economic recovery plan as well, include tourism because it has low barriers to entry, and it has an extensive value chain which creates a lot of jobs easily without waiting for people to be specifically scaled up. In addition, tourism is also a major foreign export for the country. It helps economically very significantly, and with the conversation of equality, the importance of tourism is critical, and I think we, the country, will realise it now. The impact of COVID-19 on a reduced level and to see just the number of jobs affected. The number of small enterprises that are affected ultimately erodes your tax base if these companies cannot operate and they will not pay taxes and that as another impact, and then I think on top of that is there is a range of soft impacts and place-specific with tangible impacts in terms of promoting the country as a destination and creating pride and social cohesion and those helpful things and finally, even though this strategy is set on a national level and work around developments on a national level and promotion of tourism offer on a national level. Tourism happens locally in communities, whether it is a city or a small village in a rural area does not matter, but that is where the direct impact is felt in terms of job creation or economic concessions. So, I think it is critically important". (Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism) & (Bernie Meyer, Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa 2021).

The same conviction as demonstrated earlier is shared by several stakeholders in both developing and developed countries, and it illustrates how tourism plays an important role in the survival of the region's delicate socio-economic ecosystem. Particularly sustainable tourism development, as it could be an important apparatus to educate local people about sustainable tourism development and accelerate local economies and eventually encourage sustainable consumption.

4.2 Challenges of Sustainable Tourism Development and Sustainable Tourism Consumption

Even though a keen consensus of objectives has been emphasised regarding sustainable tourism development to encourage sustainable tourism consumption, the stakeholders expressed their concerns over several issues that delay the process.

Stakeholder collaboration is the biggest challenge to sustainable tourism and consumption of the public and private partnerships because there is a lot of willingness from the private sector, but on the public side, the willingness is not there as much they know they exude more power than the private sector.

"In the case of South Africa, we have the issue of corruption, and it is the reputation the public sector has, thus creating reluctance by other stakeholders like the private sector and the local people. We need to overcome that, we need to move from the policy to the legislative framework, which is probably second to none. I was on the UNWTO workshop this morning and were presented to a panel of experts, and they hail South Africa on its data acquisition, and its policy and our Constitution is probably next to the Canadian Constitution, one of the best in the world, but the implementation is the biggest issue, the professionalisation of the public sector must happen because we will not be able to realise a lot of our potential" (Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism).

Most challenges are due to awareness. Lots of people do not really know what sustainability is; therefore, they think it is a bunch of trying to save the planet hippies when it has a lot more impact if you would try and do it right. Secondly, once that awareness is created, lots of people and businesses feel overwhelmed. It is important to always take it step by step, there is nothing wrong with not implementing it all at the same time, and it takes time, and unfortunately, there is not enough time, but slow development is better than no development.

"Going back to awareness, if I say sustainable development goals, I remembered two years ago. I was hired to train a hotel, and it was a small hotel chain, and I had to train several directors, hotel directors, and the management team. I went in, and when I asked, can anybody tell me what the 17 sustainable development goals are? They just looked at me like what? What are you talking about and? I thought, Oh my God. Yeah. There are lots of people that are not aware of what sustainability is and even in the professional world, so it is a challenging topic" tourism (Kim De Coster, Founder of Slow & Co, 2021).

People do not see sustainable tourism as something that is necessary for them to do; they do not see sustainability as an integral part of their business model because there are no immediate visible effects. This statement is supported by Hall's (2013) study on sustainable consumption, on the system of provision/institutional approach he ascertains that positioning the challenges of sustainable consumption as a problem of personal choice fails to appreciate the socially situated and structured nature of consumption and a suspect theory of choice given that it accepts that people could and would behave differently if only, they knew what they were doing.

"In most instances, people see it is in as an extra burden as they have been doing their business this way for all these years, and this is now a new thing that they must do in terms of conserving energy and stuff like that. But also, in an environment where tourism businesses were squeezed quite tightly in the last two or three, five years, people look at things that they really must do for their businesses to get going and turn a profit, and some of the things that they believe will look good towards their consumers. Therefore, sometimes people see responding to something that is nice to do good for them and if they do not do it, nothing happens" (Beki Libangalele Director of Responsible Tourism South Africa, 2021)

Finally, it was declared by most respondents that sustainable tourism development has been greatly restricted by these challenges, therefore, creating a strong impediment for sustainable tourism development and sustainable consumption. However, these challenges are being addressed in multiple ways that are categorized into three different strategies described below.

4.3 Areas of Action

From the analysis of the interviews and contribution of literature, it was possible to characterize three areas of action that the tourist and purist approach can develop to encourage sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption. These areas can be described as inclusion (women and minorities), policy development, and stakeholder collaboration. They were working on these qualities through a rejuvenated way of thinking and operating within sectors and stakeholders.

4.3.1 Inclusion

Discussions regarding the detrimental effects of high levels of inequality need a better understanding of tourism contribution to inclusive growth; if tourism supports inclusive growth, it should establish productive economic opportunities while ensuring equal access to these opportunities (Bakker, 2019). The inclusive growth approach deems creating abundant employment opportunities for marginalized groups as the primary means of inequality alleviation within countries (Ianchovichina & Lundstrom-Gable, 2012). Tourism is thought to be a labourintensive sector and includes requiring the utilization of soft skills and small investments and can therefore offer employment for low skilled workers, immigrants, unemployed youth, ethnic minority groups and long-time unemployed women with family responsibilities (UNWTO & ILO, 2014).

"From a social inclusion perspective, we have a tourism sector BBBEE codes and Women in Tourism programme to mention a few. All our programmes have a specific focus and dedicated focus to have women and young people who are beneficiaries of our programme address social inclusion. In addition, we have communitybased tourism to assist communities approximating tourism facilities and services such as IsiMangaliso, Kruger National Park. We develop tourism assets for them around the parks and give training on how to run those assets so that we can have both transformation and sustainable tourism. Transformation is a national imperative. Therefore, we have specific targets that we need to meet from the social inclusivity point of view. As mentioned earlier, the focus is on women, youth, on people of colour. That is where the tourism BBBE codes come to effect, so when there is any development, they speak directly to the programme which the Department implements to address the social impacts of the legacy of apartheid. We are working on a concept now; we did a resource efficiency training programme in partnership with Bernie's team. We train 60 young people across the country in terms of resource efficiency assessments. It is phase one of the programme, but we want to enable them to start their businesses and do resource efficiency assessments with water, power, and waste. We are starting with the state-owned entities to become more energy efficient as State-owned entities are not that efficient." (Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism).

The poverty growth inequality proposed by the UN supports the idea that a country's change in poverty is determined by a function of income, income growth, distribution and change of distribution (Bourguignon & Chakravarty, 2003). This had led policymakers to realize that to reduce poverty, inclusive growth policies must allow people from different genders, groups, religion, ethnicity and across different sectors, manufacturing, agriculture, transport services to contribute and benefit from economic growth (De Haan & Thorat, 2013). This is parallel to McKinley's (2010) approach to inclusive growth, which encompasses two elements; sustainable growth that will create and develop economic opportunities and certify broader access to these opportunities so that members of society can participate and benefit from the growth.

The characteristics of the tourism sector prove that it can be used to contribute to greater inclusion in developing and developed countries (Bernie Meyer, Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa 2021). However, most of the barriers to increased inclusion are grounded in long-standing causes, including political, economic and cultural conditions; the inclusion approach can still be applied by tourism policy-makers and researchers to focus on mitigating the effects of these root causes and identifying the limitations that delay the path to a more inclusive tourism sector (Bakker, 2019)

4.3.2 Policy Development

The development of a sustainable tourism policy could be a useful way to encourage new forms of business practice, promoting conservation of landscapes, protecting culture and heritage, as well as increasing employment (Castellani & Sala, 2010). To determine the influence of institutional agencies in the process of creating the concept of sustainable tourism, the appearance and meaning of the concept of institutional policy, documents are studied in the context of their interaction of three structural concepts (Torres-Delgado & Palomeque, 2012). These are the characteristics of tourism, the role of the state and the shaping of tourism policy, and finally, the paradigm of sustainability (Torres-Delgado & Palomeque, 2012). Sustainable tourism and the transformation of the role played by government policy is a subject of constant interest, especially when viewed over time, so that changes and trends can be traced (Bramwell & Lane, 2010).

Tourism policy is extremely important as it will help sustainable develop tourism development and encourage sustainable business practices across all the stakeholders involved in the industry (Yanga Gijana; Founder of Travel with Yang Steeze 2021).

"But do we want to become law? I would not support it being compulsory and would rather need to give you a very solid education campaign around the benefits of sustainability across the board in the world. We are really struggling a lot with transformation, and we are now in court with a couple of entities around our tourism equity fund because we have not necessarily done a good job of educating our stakeholders around the importance of some of these sustainability issues and the critical measure, which is basically a business imperative. If you want to be sustainable in South Africa, you need to do it again in a transformative way, and you need to be sensitive to the realities of climate change" (Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism).

The connection between governance and sustainability can also be observed indirectly in other situations (Torres-Delgado & Palomeque, 2012). The principles of governance support the focus on sustainable planning for tourism, the need to integrate the stakeholders in the development process (Gunn, 1993) and a return to the two vital aspects of strategic planning: forecasting and
the use of local agents adapt to changes (Torres-Delgado & Palomeque, 2012). The following statement supports this reasoning.

"I tend to agree with Maylene. I think if you look at tourism, it is already indirectly over-regulated, even though there is no direct legislation as a tourism act regulating the sector. We only regulate the tourist guides in that, so everything less regulated from our side. That is all-other major cutting impacts on tourism operations because tourism is such a complex industry that does not, or sector that does not fit into a specific economic sector, because we are affected by food regulations, alcohol regulations, environmental regulations. So, there is enough legislation in place that already regulates our sector, and for small business, those regulations and rules books are a lot of burden on them, so you do not want to add burden by creating more rules that need to be enforced. I agree with Maylene; that is not the way to go. Incentives are one option, but it is risky, so legal legislation and incentives are blunt instruments. I think the true way to do this is through awareness and education" (Bernie Meyer, Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa 2021).

The previous two statements suggest that tourism policy is important, but it should not be part of the legislature as it will over-regulate the industry, thus creating a barrier for entry, but with climate change looming in the sector, legislation might be an effective solution.

"I think it is not just necessary, but I think it is a critical requirement. It should be a critical requirement for any future development that leads to tourism because, through legislator, we can make sure that we can sustain the future and protect the future or the tourism sector. Now, if you have read which I imagine you have read the 1996 white Paper, it is very clear, but the only way for us to grow tourism in South Africa is through responsible tourism. The paper dates to 1996, so it was a major requirement then, and I think that strongly a policy that forces people to integrate these principles into how they plan, develop, and manage their businesses is critical. Because if we do not do that, then responsible tourism becomes like a tax in your business is not part of your business it just is a nuisance, this thing that you know you must do but you do not like doing it. So, unless we build it so that it is part of the DNA of how you develop tourism, we still have a long way to go" (Beki Libangalele, Director of Responsible Tourism South Africa, 2021)

In conclusion, Kim De Coster, Founder of Slow & Co, supports this statement suggesting that legislation is a critical tool in propelling sustainability and sustainable development.

"I find it a difficult question. On the one hand, yes, if you see that here, for instance, and I think it was European legislation. As said, I am not the specialist, but like with the plastic bags, he is getting suddenly you must pay for those plastic bags, that is what moved. So many people start using their own bags instead of single time getting a plastic one for free. All that made supermarkets go to like these biodegradables paper bags or they started offering a different type of bags, and I am pretty sure that would not have moved as fast if it were not for legislation" (Kim De Coster, Founder of Slow & Co, 2021).

4.3.3 Stakeholder Collaboration

Tourism has long been pursued by governments as a method of development in host destinations, adversely some host destinations have some characteristics that impede their ability to achieve the full benefits of tourism (McComb, Boyd, & Boluk, 2017). Subsequently, many destinations have found that the benefits to be gained are exaggerated, and stakeholder collaboration has been considered essential for the success of sustainable tourism (McComb, Boyd, & Boluk, 2017). Tourism destination stakeholder collaboration can be predominantly beneficial in addressing specific factors applicable to sustainable tourism development at the destination, which may obstruct the success of the destination; however, successful attempts to implement stakeholder collaboration have been limited (McComb, Boyd, & Boluk, 2017).

According to Kim De Coster, stakeholder collaboration is essential for sustainable tourism development, but the government needs to be at the forefront by encouraging and engaging with the different sectors that are involved in the development of sustainable tourism.

I think this good initiative coming from us the private sector as well at the NGOs as those are the institutions that are first movers and working together to provide solutions and generating awareness. Creating awareness must be done on so many different levels towards locals like or people in general and that must come unfortunately from government level because like if you talk about public education when it starts with the child or anything else, then whether it is the town Hall or the province or the community or Spanish government, things must be done. They are the ones deciding on how the educational system is and which town hall they want to host workshops on. (Kim De Coster, Founder of Slow & Co, 2021).

According to Ryan & Zahra (2004) the role of the public sector in tourism development through national, regional and local tourism organisations. They found that government bodies possess the ability to legislate and impose regulations on the tourism sector through the exertion of power (Ryan & Zahra, 2004). Therefore, government bodies or the public sector can hold coercive power in stakeholder collaborations in the tourism development context (Saito & Ruhanen, 2017) and (Ryan & Zahra, 2004).

"I think the government through the networking process is trying to do that at a restructured level. When you in government there is big business, the NGO's and trade unions and social formations that you need to deal with consistently. Yes, in theory we should be collaborating more, but when you get down to the sector level it becomes a little bit more challenging. So, can we work better Together? Absolutely, can we be more inclusive with community inputs? Definitely, I think that we are trying to really involve communities in terms of rural and tourism businesses better than previously marginalised and like I said, the community-based tourism incubation

programme is a step in that direction. In the private sector, think I see in South Africa they are doing phenomenally well if you look at the presentation or those sponsors and support, they could be in place for saving the sector from the effects of COVID-19." (Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism).

The role of government is important in encouraging stakeholder collaboration as they have the ultimate influence, and they have the power to control behaviour through legislation. Bernie Meyer the Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa suggests that more could be done.

"I do not think it is as good as it should be and could be, but I think it is a very important point that you raise I think all of this is dependent on collaboration and it relates to the integrated nature of tourism. We are reliant on as a sector on different departments on government level, transports, and home affairs, and all these different sectors need to work together to get the enabling environment that works for the sector on all levels. But at the same time as government, we are also the enabler we cannot drive the thing it needs to be driven by communities and private sector. So, it is I think in theory we always talk about it in the underworld papers they talk about integrated approach where you have all sectors, or all stakeholders involved in our important it is, so we do it in writing and in our policy work, but in practise those relationships are dynamic and fluid. So, now I do not think we had the best space with the private sector. I think we were in a much better space I think in the last 10 years, around 2010 with the FIFA World Cup, I think that was the closest that industry and governments and everyone has ever been to one coordinated goal and I think we slipped a little bit so we not working as well together as we should" (Bernie Meyer the Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa, 2021)

It is evident that stakeholder collaboration is important when trying to achieve sustainable tourism development and the biggest challenge at this moment is to collaborate with the government as they have the resources and influence to bring all the sectors together and work towards achieving a common goal which is sustainable tourism development.

Discussion

From the research findings, several interesting insights have been drawn about sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption and how it has been approached by the different stakeholders. This section will review inclusion, policy development and stakeholder collaboration in detail.

First, sustainability should be the core of any tourism development going into the future. Sustainable development should account for the sustainability of the triple bottom line especially since tourism is perceived as a tool that generates development for societies, boost their economic activity and conserve the environment. Now more than ever the concept of sustainable development should be fundamental for the planning of the future not only for tourism products and service, but all sectors linked to tourism.

Through the conversation with the stakeholder's community-based tourism emerged as an essential concept to cultivate sustainable development and consumption. The concept of community-based tourism automatically encourages inclusion, when the local people have decision making power it allows them to control how tourism flows in their destination, distribution of economic benefits and protection of their cultural assets. It is important to recognise that to see inclusive growth, a conversation about addressing inequality at destinations is needed. People do not have equal opportunities nor access to these opportunities due to historical barriers and cultural differences, the findings showed that policymakers in South Africa understand that there is inequality and thus negatively affects the development of tourism as well as the community at large. Therefore, community-based tourism has the capacity to involve women, youth, minorities, and immigrants in the sector. However, it is important to recognise that community-based tourism does not have the power to change everything as the government needs to be involved and development is a process consequently, it might take longer than anticipated.

The idea of creating a policy that will foster tourism businesses to be more sustainable is sensitive for both the government and the private sector. Organisations believe that the creation of policy that will force them to be sustainable will be bad for their business understandably so, it will affect investments as no business wants to conducted business in an over-regulated region or country. However, a policy might be the most effective solution, findings showed that majority of the people are leaning towards the idea of creating policy that will regulate businesses if we were planning to reverse or slow down climate change. As one respondent mentioned that if we start now in a decade, it will not feel like governments are over-regulating companies but more like a DNA of a business just like audits or paying taxes.

Collaboration among stakeholders is a necessary condition to develop tourism especially towards the direction of sustainability. As shown in the analysis every single initiative in the tourism sector is somewhat supported by collaboration between two or more sectors or agencies. For instance, The Department of Tourism South Africa works closely with the private sector to train and educate 60 young people across the country to conduct resource efficiency assessments and eventually start their own businesses consulting for the government. This is a small fraction, but it gives an idea of how much can be achieved when collaboration between stakeholders can be prioritised.

5. Conclusion

The objective of the thesis was to interpret and communicate sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption using the purist and the tourist approach to sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption. Following the pragmatism paradigm, a qualitative study was designed to answer the research question: How have tourism stakeholders (Government, Scholars, Developers, Planners, and SMEs) approached sustainable tourism development and influenced sustainable tourism consumption? The literature on sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption provided an imperative outline for the research. The primary data was collected through interviews with three tourism government officials from South Africa and one Belgian business owner and these interviews were conducted on zoom. Furthermore, one interview was conducted through an email interview with a South African business owner based in the United States of America.

From collecting and analysing data, it can be argued that stakeholders understand sustainable development of the sector and have an idea on how it should be done but the biggest challenge is implementation. This is due to multiple reasons; stakeholder collaboration has not been the best over the years especially if there is no common goal. The private sector has been leading the charge with implementing sustainability practices and that can be owed to consumers as they are becoming more conscious, and demand sustainable products and services and the private sector also uses this as an opportunity to promote their businesses. The government has been active but only on paper, but no direct laws or influence has been exerted by the governing agencies. From the analysis it was discovered that the private sector is opened to the idea of policy creation that will for sustainable development and consequently influence sustainable consumption. Furthermore, research findings suggested that focus is put more on development but not enough on consumption, as it is part of the issue as well.

Despite these challenges, what is indisputable is that sustainability is extensively recognized as an aspect of tourism, to the point that it is now inseparable from the idea of contemporary tourism. Any initiative that aims to influence tourism in the present context must consider sustainability as a component in achieving the kind of tourism anticipated. This is the main achievement of recent years, and it certainly represents a qualitative difference in the way that the activity is contemplated.

Through the analysis, two recommendations can be made to help in communicating and interpreting sustainable tourism development and sustainable tourism consumption: first, development should be inclusive; the focus should be on local people, and community-based tourism should be prioritised as it has the potential to balance the inequality, secondly, policy creation; there needs to be a policy that facilitates the development of tourism products and services, it needs to focus on sustainability of the triple bottom line, the environment, the people and the economy.

Further research aimed at the relationship between sustainable tourism development and sustainable consumption is needed to help stakeholders in achieving a common goal which is collaboration to achieve sustainability. Primary data collection with stakeholders would be valuable to accelerate a greater understanding of the methods that push stakeholder collaborations, and researchers may also consider studying each stakeholder's specific role to help understand the problem.

References

- Alemanno, A. (2012). Nudging Smokers: The Behavioural Turn of Tobacco Risk Regulations. *European Journal of Risk Regulation*, 32-42.
- Allmark, P. (2003). Popper and nursing Theory. Nursing Philosophy: An International Journal for Healthcare Professionals, 4-16.
- Amerta, M. S., Sara, M., & Bagiada, K. (2018). Sustainable Tourism Development . *International Research Journal of Management, IT and Social Sciences*, 248-254.
- Andereck, K. L., & Nyaupane, G. P. (2010). Exploring the Nature of Tourism and Quality of Perceptions Amongst Residents. *Journal of Travel Research*, 248-260.
- Angelevska-Najdeska, K., & Rakicevik, G. (2012). Planning of Sustainable Tourism Development. Social Science and Behavioral Sciences, 210-220.
- Bakker, M. (2019). A Conceptual Framework for Identifying the Binding Constraints to Tourism-Driven Inclusive Growth . *Tourism Planning and Development*, 575-590.
- Barr, S., Gilg, A., & Shaw, G. (2010). Helping People Make Better Choices: Exploring the Behaviour Change Agenda for Environmental Sustainability . *Applied Geography* , 712-720.
- Bernard, H. R. (2002). *Research Methods in Anthropology: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches.* Walnut Creek: Alta Mira Press.
- Bhandari, P. (2020, July 30). *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*. Retrieved from https://www.scribbr.com/: https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/qualitative-research/#:~:text=Qualitative%20research%20involves%20collecting%20and,generate%20ne w%20ideas%20for%20research.
- Bone, J. D. (2010). Irrational Capitalism: The Social Map, Neo-liberalism and Demodernization of the West . Critical Sociology , 717-740.
- Bourguignon, F., & Chakravarty, S. R. (2003). The Measurement of Multidimensional Poverty . *The Journal of Economic Inequality*, 25-49.
- Bowden, C., & Galindo-Gonzalez, S. (2015). Interviewing When you're not Face-to-Face: The Use of Email Interviews in Phenomenological Study. *International Journal of Doctoral Studies*, 79-92.
- Bramwell, B., & Lane, B. (2010). Sustainable Tourism and the Evolving Roles of Government Planning . *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1-5.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2012). Thematic Analyis. In H. Cooper, P. M. Camic, D. L. Long, A. T. Panter,
 D. Rindskopf, & K. J. Sher, APA Handbook of Research Methods in Psychology Vol 2: Research, Designs: Quantitative, Qualitative, Neuropsychological and Biological (pp. 57-71).
 Washington: DC: American Psychological Association.
- Bryman, A. (2012). Social Research Methods. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Buckley, R. (2012). Sustainable Tourism: Research and Reality . Annals of Tourism Research , 528-546.

- Cambridge. (2021, April 20). *Cambridge Dictionary*. Retrieved from https://dictionary.cambridge.org/: https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/purist
- Carcary, M. (2009). The Research Audit Trial- Enhancing Trustworthiness in Qualitative Inquiry . *Electronical Journal of Business Research Methods*, 11-24.
- Castellani, V., & Sala, S. (2010). Sustainable Perfomance Index for Tourism Policy Development . *Tourism Management*, 871-880.
- Chen, P. T., & Hu, H. H. (2010). How Determinant Attributes of Service Quality Influence Customer Percieved Value: An Emperical Investigation of the Australian Coffee Outlet Industry. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 535-551.
- Chen, P., & Hinton, S. M. (1999). Real-Time Interviewing using World Wide Web. Sociological Research Online, 1-5.
- Christie, L. H. (2010). Understanding New Zealand Homeowners: Apparent Reluctant to Adopt Housing-Sustainability Innovations. (*Unpublished Thesis*) Victoria University, 1-65.
- Clarke, C. A. (2012, December 31). *Resource Effeciency*. Retrieved from www.unep.org: https://wedocs.unep.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.11822/13484/Charles_Arden_10YFP_presen tation_GC_27_150213rev.pdf?sequence=1;isAllowed=
- Cohen, E. (1974). Who is a Tourist? The Sociological Review, 527-555.
- Conlisk, J. (1996). Why Bounded Rationality? Journal of Economic Literature, 669-700.
- Cooper, R. (2009). Online Interviewing: Its not as Simple as Point and Click. *The Weekly Qualitative Report*, 250-253.
- Coyne, I. T. (1997). Sampling in Qualitative Research. Purposeful and Theoretical Sampling; Merging or Clear Boundaries? *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 623-630.
- Davies, M. B., & Hughes, N. (2014). *Doing a Successful Research Project: Using Qualitative or Qualitative Methods*. London: Macmillan International Higher Education.
- De Haan, A., & Thorat, S. (2013). *Inclusive Growth: More than Safety Nets*. Ottawa: International Research Center.
- DiCicco-Bloom, B., & Crabtree, B. F. (2006). The Qualitative Research Interview. *Medical Education*, 314-321.
- Dubois, A., & Gade, L. E. (2002). Systematic Combining: An Abductive Approach to Case Research. *Journal of Business Research*, 533-566.
- Eckersley, R. (1992). Green Versus Ecosocialist Economic Programmes: The Market Rules OK? *Political Sciences*, 315-333.
- Eriksson, P., & Kovalainen, A. (2008). Research Philosophy. In P. Eriksson, & A. Kovalainen, *Qualitative Methods in Business Research* (pp. 11-25). London: Sage Publications.
- Etikan, I., Musa, S. A., & Alkassim, R. S. (2016). Comparison of Convenience Sampling and Purposive Sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 1-4.

- Fan, D. X., Zhan, H. Q., Jenkins, C. L., & Tavitiyaman, P. (2017). Tourist Typology in Social Contract: An Addition to Existing Theories. *Tourism Management*, 357-366.
- Fine, B., & Leopold, E. (1993). The World of Consumption. London: Routledge.
- Finfgeld-Connett, D. (2010). Generalizability and Transferability of Meta-Synthesis Research Findings. Journal of Advanced Nursing, 246-254.
- Folmer, H., & Johansson-Stenman, D. (2011). Does Environmental Economics Produce Aeroplanes Without Engines? On the Need for an Environmental Social Sciences . *Journal of Environmetal* and Resources Economics, 337-361.
- Fritz, R. L., & Vandermause, R. (2017). Data Collection Via In-Depth Email Interviewing: Lessons from the Field. *Qualitative Health Research*, 1-10.
- Gadenne, D., Sharma, B., Kerr, D., & Smith, T. (2011). The Influence of Consumers Environmental Beliefs and Attitudes on Energy Saving Behaviours. *Energy Policy*, 7684-7694.
- Galletta, A. (2012). Mastering Semi-Structured Interview and Beyond: From Research Design to Analysis and Publication. New York: New York University Press.
- George, M., & Apter, A. J. (2004). Gaining Insight into Patients Beliefs Using Qualitative Research Methodologies . *Current Opinion in Allergy and Clinical Immunology*, 185-189.
- Gibbs, L., Kealy, M., Willis, K., Green, J., Welch, N., & Daly, J. (2007). What Have Sampling and Data Got to do with Good Qualitative Research. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Public Health*, 540-544.
- Gibson, L. (2010, April 08). *Realities Toolkit: Using Email Interviews*. Retrieved from ERSC National Center for Research Methods: http://eprints.ncrm.ac.uk/1303/1/09-toolkitemail-interviews.pdf
- Gibson, L. (2014, August 28). *What is Email Interviewing*. Retrieved from YouTube: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wTzJdFbaakg
- Gossling, S., Hall, M. C., Ekstrom, F., Brudvik-Engeset, A., & Aall, C. (2012). Transition Management: A Tool for Implementing Sustainable Tourism Scenarios? *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 899-916.
- Grossoehme, D. H. (2014). Overview of Quality Research . Journal of Health Chaplain, 109-122.
- Gunn, C. A. (1993). *Tourism Planning: Basics, Concepts, Cases*. Bristol: Routledge: Taylor & Francis Group.
- Hall, M. C. (2011). A Typology of Governance and its Implications for Tourism Policy Analysis. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 437-457.
- Hall, M. C. (2013). Framing Behavioural Approaches to Understanding and Governing Sustainable Tourism: Beyond Neoliberalism, "Nudging" and "Green Growth"? *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1091-1109.
- Hancock, S., Hughes, G., & Walsh, E. (2017). Purist or Pragmatist? UK Doctorial Scientists Moral Positions on the Knowledge Economy. *Studies in Higher Education*, 1244-1258.

- Hardon, A., Hodgkin, C., & Fresle, D. (2004, April 07). *How to Investigate the Use of Medicines by Consumers.* Retrieved from World Health Organisation: http:// apps.who.int/medicinedocs/en/d/Js6169e/
- Hawkins, J. E. (2018). The Practical Utility and Suitability of Email Interviews in Qualitative Research . *Nursing Facility Publications*, 493-501.
- Helgadottir, G., Einarsdottir, A. V., Burns, G. L., Gunnarsdottir, G. P., & Matthiasdottir, M. E. (2019). Social Sustainability of Tourism in Iceland: A Qualitative Inquiry . *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, 404-421.
- Hentz-Becker, P. (1993). Common Pitfalls in Published Grounded Theory Research . *Qualitative Research Health* , 254-260.
- Huppertz, L. (2019, July 17). Digital Marketing . Retrieved from https://blog.mynd.com/: https://blog.mynd.com/en/successful-target-groupanalysis#:~:text=A%20target%20group%20is%20made,their%20nature%20on%20different% 20levels.
- Ianchovichina, E., & Lundstrom-Gable, S. (2012). What is Inclusive Growth? Commodity Prices and Inclusive Growth in Low Income Countries. In R. Arezki, C. Patilo, M. Quintyn, & M. Zhu, *Commodity Prices and Inclusive Growth in Low Income Countries* (pp. 147-160). Washington DC: International Monetary Fund.
- Ivanovic, M. (2008). Cultural Tourism. Cape Town : Juta.

.

- Jansen, H. (2010). The Logic of Qualitative Survey Research and its Position in the Field of Social Research Methods. *Forum Qualitative Socialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research*.
- Kallio, H., Pietila, A.-M., Johnson, M., & Kangasniemi, M. (2016). Systematic Methodological Review: Developing a Framework for Qualitative Semi-Structured Interview Guide . *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 2954-2965.
- Keen, S. (2011). Debunking Economics- Revised and Expanded Edition: The Naked Emperor Dethroned? London: Zed Books.
- Kelemen, M., & Rumens, N. (2008). An Introduction to Critical Management Research . London: Sage
- Kelly, S. E. (2010). Qualitative Interviewing and Style. In I. Bourgeault, R. Dingwall, & R. De Vries, *Sage Handbook of Qualitative Methods in Health Research* (pp. 307-327). London: Sage.
- Kitto, S., Chesters, J., & Grbich, C. (2008). Quality in Qualitative Research. *Medical Journal of Australia*, 243-246.
- Lane, B. (2018). Will Sustainable Tourism Research be Sustainable in the Future? An Opinion Piece. *Tourism Management Perspective*, 161-164.
- Laxson, J. D. (1991). How "We" See "Them" Tourism and Native Americans. Annals of Tourism Research, 365-391.
- Leung, L. (2015). Validity, Reliability abd Generalizability in Qualitative Research. *Journal of Family Medicine and Primary Care*, 324-327.

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). Naturalistic Inquiry. Valles M. Tecnicas, 20.

- Lorenzoni, I., Nicholson-Cole, S., & Whitmarsh , L. (2007). Barriers Percieved to Engaging with Climate Change Among the UK Public and their Policy Implications. *Global Environmental Change*, 445-459.
- Lussetyowati, T. (2015). Preservation and Conservation Through Cultural Heritage Tourism. Case Study: Musi Riverside Palembarg. *Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 401-406.
- Mariette, B. (2016). How to Plan and Perfom a Qualitative Study Using Content Analysis . *Nursing Open Plus*, 8-14.
- Marriette, B. (2016). How to Plan and Perfom a Qualitatitive Study Using Context Analysis. *Nursing Plus One*, 8-14.
- Mason, D. M., & Ide, B. (2014). Adapting Qualitative Research Strategies to Technology Savvy Adolescents. *Nurse Researcher*, 40-45.
- Mathew, M. B., & Huberman, M. A. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Source Book.* Sage : New York.
- McComb, E. J., Boyd , S., & Boluk , K. (2017). Stakeholder Collaboration: A Means to the Success of Rural Tourism Destinations? A Means to the Success of Rural Tourism Destinations? A Critical Evaluation of the Existence of Stakeholder Collaboration Within Mournes, Northen Ireland . *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 286-297.
- McGuigan, J. (2006). The Politics of Cultural Studies and Cool Capitalism. Cultural Politics, 137-158.
- McKinley, T. (2010). Inclusive Growth Criteria and Indicators: An Inclusive Growth Index for Diagnosis of Country Progress (Working Paper 14). Manila: Asian Development Bank.
- Mowfurth, M., & Munt, I. (2009). *Tourism and Sustainability: Development, Globalisation and New Tourism in Tourism in the Third World*. London: Routledge.
- Muresan, I. C., Oroian, C. F., Harun, R., Arion, F. H., Porutiu, A., Chiciuden, G. O., & Lile, R. (2016). Local Residents Attitudes Towards Sustainable Rural Tourism Development . *Sustainability* , 1-80.
- Ockwell, D., O'Neill, S., & Whitmarsh, L. (2010). Behavioural Insights: Motivating Individual Emissions Cuts Through Communication. In C. Lever-Tracy, *Handobook of Climate Change* and Society (pp. 341-350). London: Routledge.
- Opdenakker, R. (2006). Advantages and Disadvantages of Four Interview Techniques in Qualitative Research , 1-11.
- Palinkas, L., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Purposeful Sampling for Qualitative Data Collection and Analysis in Mixed Method Implementation Research. Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Service Research, 533-544.
- Parks, T. H., & Allen, C. (2009). The Development of a Framework for Studying Ecotourism . Intenational Journal of Management, 89-98.

- Patton, M. Q. (1999). Enhancing the Quality and Credibility of Qualitative Analysis. *Health Service Research*, 1189-1208.
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative, Research and Evolution Methods*. Thousand Oaks, Carlifonia : Sage Publications.
- Peterson, J. S. (2019). Presenting a Qualitative Study. Gifted Child Quarterly, 147-158.
- Polit, D. S., & Beck, C. T. (2010). *Essentials of Nursing Research, Appraising Evidence for Nursing Practice*. Philadephia: Lippincott Raven Publishers.
- Qui, H., Fan , D. X., Lyu, J., Lin, P. M., & Jenkins, C. (2019). Analysing the Economic Sustainability of Tourism Development: Evidence from Hong Kong. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Research*, 226-248.
- Roca-Puig, V. (2019). The Circular Path of Sustainability: An Emperical Analysis. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 916-924.
- Ryan , C., & Zahra, A. (2004). The Political Challenge: The Case of New Zealand's Tourism Organisations. In N. Morgan, A. Pritchard, & R. Pride, *Destination Branding: Creating the Unique Destination Proposition* (pp. 79-110). Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Saito, H., & Ruhanen, L. (2017). Power in Tourism Stakeholder Collaborations: Power Types and Power Holders. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 189-196.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2012). *Research Methods for Business Methods*. Harlow: Pearson Education Limited .
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2016). *Research Methods for Business Students*. Harlow: Pearson Education Limited.
- Seyfang, G. (2011). *The New Economics of Sustainable Consumption: Seeds of Change*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Silverman, D. (2009). Doing Qualitative Research. London: Sage Publications LTD.
- Simon, H. A. (1965). Administrative Behaviour. New York : Free Press.
- Southerton, D., Van Vliet, B., & Chappells, H. (2004). Sustainable Consumption: The Implications of Changing Infrastructures of Provision. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.
- Southerton, D., Van Vliet, B., & Chappells, H. (2004b). Introduction: Consumption, Infrastructures and Environmental Sustainability. In D. Southerton, B. Van Vliet, & H. Chappells, Sustainable Consumption: The Implications of Changing Infrastructure of Provision (pp. 1-14). Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.
- Stastita. (2021, February 16). *Travel, Tourism & Hospitality*. Retrieved from https://www.statista.com/: https://www.statista.com/statistics/694114/number-of-international-touristsiceland/#:~:text=In%20the%20period%20from%202010,of%20around%20one%20million%2 Opeople.
- Streimekiene, D., Svagzadience, B., Jasinkas, E., & Simanavicius, A. (2021). Sustainable Tourism Development and Competitiveness: The Systematic Literature Review. Sustainable Development, 259-271.

- Szabo, V., & Strang, V. R. (1997). Secondary Analysis of Qualitative Data . Advances in Nursing Science, 11-74.
- Taylor, M. C. (2005). Interviewing. In I. Halloway, *Research in Healthcare* (pp. 39-55). Maidenhead: McGraw-Hill.
- Tenbarge, K. (2019, July 25). 15 destinations Instagram has helped ruin. Retrieved from https://www.insider.com/: https://www.insider.com/travel-destinations-instagram-influencersruined-2019-7
- Thynne, I. (2008). Symposium Introduction: Climate Change, Governance and Environmental Services: Institutional Perspectives, Issues and Challenges . *Journal of Public Administration and Development*, 327-339.
- Torres-Delgado, A., & Palomeque, F. L. (2012). The Growth and Spread of the Concept of Sustainable Tourism: The Contribution of Institutional Initiatives to Tourism Policy . *Tourism Mananagement Perspectives*, 1-10.
- UN. (2020, June 26). *Definition of "tourist" or "temporary visitor*. Retrieved from https://digitallibrary.un.org/: https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/1484980?ln=en
- United Nations . (2020, January 12). *Sustainable Consumption and Production*. Retrieved from https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/topics/sustainableconsumptionandproduction
- UNWTO & ILO. (2014). *Measuring Employment in the Tourism Industry- Guides with Practices*. Madrid: UNWTO.
- UNWTO. (2008). *Indicators of Sustainable Development of Tourism Destinations*. Madrid: United Nations World Tourism Organisations.
- UNWTO. (2017). *Ethics, Culture and Social Responsibility*. Santiago: United Nations World Tourism Organisation.
- Walker , D. (2013). The Internet as Medium for Health Service Research Part 1. *Nurse Research*, 18-21.
- Walliman, N. (2011). Research Methods: The Basics. New York: Routledge .
- Waterman, A. S. (2013). The Humanistic Psychology-Positive Psychology Divide: Contrasts in Philosophical Foundations. *The American Psychologist*, 124-133.
- Whitmarsh, L. (2009). Behavioural Responses to Climate Change: Assymmetry of Intentions and Impacts . *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 13-23.
- Wicken, E. (2002). The Sacred and Profane: A Tourist Typology. Annals of Tourism Research, 834-851.
- World Tourism Organisation. (1999). Approval of the Global Code of Ethics for Tourism. *Resolution, General Assembly, Thirteenth Assembly* (pp. 1-80). Santiago: www.world-tourism.org.

Appendix

These interviews are semi-structured, a guide is prepared to ask related questions for answering the research questions. The questions asked were open-ended and neutral, additional follow-up questions were compiled during the interview as the conversation progressed and participants shared further.

Appendix 1- Interview Guidelines for Policy Makers (Government Officials)

Introductory Questions:

- How important is tourism for the municipality's (Regions) economy?
- What is your understanding of sustainability or tourism sustainability?
- According to you or your department, how would you describe sustainable development?

Key Topic Questions:

- How much focus is on tourism towards social, economic, and environmental development in the area?
- How has your approach to tourism development changed in the past 10 since climate change is evident?
- What is the tendency of citizens towards tourism development in the area?
- Do you have or see potential in creating a policy that will encourage sustainable tourism development and consider sustainable tourism consumption? And if yes, kindly elaborate.
- What do you think are the greatest challenges in adopting this kind of tourism development strategy?
- How would you describe your collaboration with other stakeholders involved in tourism development in the area such as transportation services, scholars, the accommodation sector, and attractions?

Concluding Question

• What are your hopes for the future of sustainable tourism development and consumption in the area?

Appendix 2- Interview Guidelines for Tourism Stakeholders (Guides, Hotel Managers, Destination Managers, Service Providers)

Introductory Questions:

- How important is tourism for the local or the regional economy?
- What is your understanding of sustainability or tourism sustainability?
- According to you or your sector, how would you describe sustainable development?

Key Topic Questions:

- How much focus is on tourism towards social, economic, and environmental development in the area?
- How has your approach to tourism development changed in the past 10 years since climate change is evident?
- What is the tendency of locals towards tourism development in the area?
- Do you see any potential in the creation of a policy that will encourage sustainable tourism development and consider sustainable tourism consumption? And if yes, kindly elaborate.
- What do you think are the greatest challenges in adopting this kind of tourism development strategy?
- How would you describe your collaboration with other stakeholders involved in tourism development in the area such as the government, transportation services, scholars, the accommodation sector, and attractions?

Concluding Question

• What are your hopes for the future of sustainable tourism development and consumption in the area?

Appendix 3- Email Interview Guidelines for Tourism Stakeholders (Government, Guides, Hotel Managers, Destination Managers, Service Providers)

These email interviews are semi-structured, a guide is prepared to ask related questions for answering the research questions. The questions asked were open-ended and neutral. Since these interviews will be conducted by email, there will not include a follow-up question unless the researcher agrees with the participant on further discussing an issue.

Introductory Questions:

- How important is tourism for the local or the regional economy?
- What is your understanding of sustainability or tourism sustainability?
- According to you or your sector, how would you describe sustainable development?

Key Topic Questions:

- How much focus is on tourism towards social, economic, and environmental development in the area?
- How has your approach to tourism development changed in the past 10 since climate change is evident?
- What is the tendency of locals towards tourism development in the area?
- Do you see any potential in the creation of a policy that will encourage sustainable tourism development and consider sustainable tourism consumption? And if yes, kindly elaborate.
- What do you think are the greatest challenges in adopting this kind of tourism development strategy?
- How would you describe your collaboration with other stakeholders involved in tourism development in the area such as the government, transportation services, scholars, the accommodation sector, and attractions?

Concluding Question

• What are your hopes for the future of sustainable tourism development and consumption in the area?

Appendix 4 Interview with Kim De Coster Founder at Slow&Co. May 12th, 2021

Lucky

Okay, so my first question would be like how important is tourism for the local economy in Tenerife?

Kim

What? Extremely and I would not be able to say percentages, as I would have to investigate that. But obviously I mean the Canary Islands as whole, not just the islands of Tenerife. Tourism is our main economy driver in an obviously because we can see that now like covid as hits and most hotels have been closed for months, and even though there are some people that might work with like the locals, let's say because lots of businesses are closed, and because obviously they work with tourists or are closed temporary. Until everything gets back up and running. But I have noticed as well is that it is an entire chain, like if the majority. If the main income of the islands is hotels or tourism and that falls away, then obviously all the people that work in tourism no longer have work are temporarily unemployed, make less money so they spend less money, so it is affected the entire economy and I think lots and lots and lots of businesses. Very much struggling to survive right now, so tourism here is. Extremely important, there has been a lot of talk now in this situation. We need to investigate not just the model of tourism, but also like we need to investigate our economy itself. We need to make sure there's other things and diversify a little bit and not depend so much on being islands changes things. Because you are like you are an island.

Lucky

Yeah, and this leads to my second question. What is your understanding of sustainable tourism? If you want to explain it to someone who is never heard of the term before the most.

Kim

Oh wow, and I think the first thing I say in. Would be not as much focused on tourism itself, but if there are two things I always try and point out, like one sustainability in general, I feel like lots of people focus on that environmental pillar, as in they think sustainability is. Reduced reuse, recycle and I am kind of like, you know. It is a bit bigger than that. And so, everybody is so focused on let us go, zero waste. Let us cut out plastics, let us reduce let us reuse let us recycle circular economy all on the environmental pillar. While I am very much onto no, no, no. It is a broader approach. You have got these three pillars and the equally important, the easiest one. Because you can talk about. Okay, there is the economical. The social and environmental filler. But for me it is easy in three words. Is the people, planet, and profit.

The profit obviously being the economic and people being social one, they are equally important for me. There is not one of them that can go well without the other. They have intertwined. Then when you translate that to tourism, I feel lots of people are looking too. Is a hotel sustainable or is an excursion sustainable and there? Again, I am kind of like. It is a lot more because tourism has entire value chain. I mean, you need to look too. The suppliers, as in a hotel, can put on. Let us give an example. Okay, I put solar panels. I installed water filters in my hotel. Does that make me sustainable? Well, it is a step in the right direction, but it is certainly not enough because if.

You do not see what your suppliers are doing, and there are your suppliers are not seeing what their supplies are doing. Then it is the entire value chain for me. A restaurant is equally important or a supermarket because those tourists that come and visit this destination will go and buy stuff in a supermarket or will go and buy stuff in a clothing store. Sustainable tourism on the one hand, from the business aspect, and then being a tourist, I think if you go to a destination, I think it's really important you tried to keep into account like how can I lower my impact as much as possible, not just buy if you be there so many things you can do, but if you be renting a car trying to find the most sustainable solution. If you are spending your money, do not do it in this like. I do not know, just souvenir shop where everything comes from the other end of the world and is cheap plastic. Let us try and go to local artisans and let us give back, maybe even to the local culture. Let us support the local economy. Let us see what is happening except for oh, I am in this awesome resort and that is it's noticed. So many things to get me kicked into account. But even with small steps you can make huge difference.

We with Canary Green we had an interview or One of the team had an interview with Harold Goodwin and he even, translates it, he says, like sustainable tourism. It is even a step ahead. It is responsible tourism. It is even more than that, it is. But it is everybody and it is such a broad aspect, like businesses and the entire value chain. And there is a tourist. And then there is the government and with everything when it comes to sustainability, I am always kind of like nobody is too small. As in I am just one person to not make a difference everybody must step in. You cannot say well the government should be doing things or that business should be adapting. No, we everybody should pitch in and support this and change and think it is quite hard to reach perfection it, but there is so much you can do, but I think the two takeaways to me. Are sustainability is not just the environment, it's also like is it economically viable and because it has to be profitable. But profit should be the most important thing and are the people affected? Like are we taking care of the locals of the people? Is it better for the people like tourism can be a good thing really bad thing and it should be a good thing for the locals and then the other takeaway would be it's a lot wider than just the hotel and the excursion you? Do it is a lot more.

Lucky

I feel like you looked at my question without seeing it because he the second the question arises coming was about like the relationship between the social aspects of it, the environment aspect of it and the economic aspect of human being perfectly answered it and have included those. That is at least what I believe as well. That you do not have to look into it as like one single entity but a complete triple bottom line which works together to increase this synergy or biodiversity because if they all included, they work well together. How it is supposed to be, at least in my understanding? So, thank you for that.

This is very good, but it goes to my next question is that like? In the past ten years, how do you see tourism changed, like, how has it been developed with the idea of climate change being a major concern?

Kim

And funnily enough, my time of living on the island is almost 11 years, so your time frame is kind of like the day I arrived totally, because last November. I was here for 10 years. Have I seen changes? Obviously and the thing is with respect to the Canary Islands. We were lucky enough and I am seeing lucky because I am kind of like. I am not sure if that was a good thing, Anne. As

soon as I arrived, which was in 2010, it was still like crisis going on. We are just getting out of that here in Spain, and so tourism started getting like higher and higher again and then. What happened was like Arab Spring and all these countries were a bit dangerous to travel to such as Tunisia, Asia, Egypt, Turkey, and the Canary Islands took loads of advantage of that because all those tourists, instead of going to those destinations suddenly went to the canary island because it is also warm in the winter. So, the island had Golden years, I mean every year it was like more and more tourists came in and I remember thinking at times because I worked in the hotel business buying back. Then, and I remember thinking like I am not so sure like we should be applauding that every year we have. I do not know another million more tourists coming in because they all impact the destination suddenly. What we really felt since I arrived, and then let us say a couple of years before or maybe the year before Covid. It is suddenly. I remember arriving here saying because I am Belgian, what there is no traffic jams here. This is so awesome and then so many years later traffic jams started, and rentals went up so much to the point where if you wanted to hire staff and you wanted to hire them from abroad, they at times had to say no because they could not afford an apartment because the prices rose too much, it was ridiculous. So, there was a part of me thinking this is all good that like the hotels and so on while lots of profit, lots of profit, but. I always felt like were pressuring the destination because it is not always the type of tourism we are seeking. We have several All-inclusive hotels that is not the type of tourist you need. Also, even though the hotel supports the local economy by hiring local people, but your guests do not leave the hotel, so they do not spend any money in the destination. Which is not sustainable, and they are not aware, so it is everything. I mean those tourists produced lots of waste food and waste everything. They add pressure on the destination. And now obviously, then in these ten years, more and more talks started about the 17 Sustainable Development Goals and we need to do something, and as an island, so you look even more into that, because everything we need lots of times is being imported. So, a food and everything because what we basically grow ourselves are goats, bananas and tomatoes, and the rest is imported. So, but then covid happened and you can see how destination questioned itself, how does this economy survive? There is a little bit more talk about maybe we should go for like sustainable tourism, like a different type but then obviously there is lots of other campaigns that get tied in and suddenly, the remote worker and digital nomad is the future of tourism, which I think I'm sorry but as soon as Thailand and everything else opens up again, the ones that are now here in the Canary Islands will go back to Bali and Thailand. So, there is more talk, but I still feel a lot more can be done. Although I have to say speaking about the Canary Islands, from private businesses, I have seen very interesting projects and going all in more and more in those years.

Also, I started here on the island when my own vision was not as sustainable as it is right now. I started specialising in sustainability. It has always been an interest, but like working in it, it is a couple of years, so actually left the corporate world because as kind of like this doesn't feel right. I need to do more than this and that is when you start up my own business. Not sure if That answers your question. I went way off track.

Lucky

No, I think you did. I think it is perfect. I also heard you mention about like the indigenous people. That is like one question I had as well. How is the tendency of local people, how do they feel about tourism in the island?

Kim

I think they vary; it depends on who you speaking to and we have a very diverse population because obviously the Canary Islands as in always and we have. I don't think there's still any left to be fair like because those were the wind shifts, which is in I'm not sure if there's still any people or very few here, and then obviously the Spaniards came. But now it is such a diverse culture, as in look at me. I mean, I am Belgian. My husband was Cuban, or we met here we have a son. He thinks he is born here, but he is kind of like, so he will be Canarias by culture. But he is half Belgian and half is, so it is very. But that is. Lots of people here like lots. It is a very diversified island. It. An in all the islands are. There is some, I think it is still very potted, as in there's people that are very much into this tourism thing, which is good, but we need to focus on making it more sustainable, attracting a different type of tourists. The more sustainable tourists that will help us support that local economy and so they want to go all in for that and realise at the same time are saying we want to diversify. We should not only depend on tourism anymore but then there is another part that is not there yet. I say yet because I am hopeful, and they are kind of like we need tourists. We need loads of tourists and kind of like, yeah. I do not think we need loads that spend little money, I think we need less that spend more money. More awareness is coming up and I have to say I am surprised at times because you feel it with everything and there's more vegan restaurants every single day. It appears there is more zero waste shops. There is more sustainable type of shops and so you kind of like, okay, something is happening because if not, those shops would not open. And there are more hotels, large and small, that are literally and not just. Obviously, there's always the ones that do it because they have to by law but then there's others that really try to make a difference already in advance, that wouldn't be heard, and they just want to do it because they feel that's the right thing to do.

Lucky

There should be like a policy that is created like by the government. Probably that will encourage like I do not know the sustainable tourism developmentally, just in general, like development of the island to be like more sustainable in their approach in developing the island.

Kim

I find it difficult question. On the one hand, yes, if you see that here for instance, and I think it was a European legislation. As said, I am not the specialist, but like with the plastic bags, he is getting suddenly you must pay for those plastic bags, that is what moved. So many people to start using their own bags instead of every single time getting a plastic one for free. All that made supermarkets go to like these biodegradables paper bags or they started offering different type of bags and I am pretty sure that would not have moved as fast if it were not for legislation. So, what I said before I think I will go back to the same thing. I think it must go hand in hand, yes, legislation done right. For instance, if you look to my own country to Belgium and their waste management is a bit different and if you go back and you bring back like your glass bottles or your metal or pet bottles like the plastic ones and you put them in this machine in the supermarkets and you get money back and, then you can go and spend again. You pay it in advance obviously, it is like you buys these 6 bottles you pay it and then you bring him back we return them and then you get your money back, but it makes you recycle the same thing with the weight in these containers or different types of bags and transparent bags if somethings in there that's not supposed to be in it, they just leave it at your doorstep or you get you have to pay per weight so the more waste you produce, the more you pay, which is a rewarding system because if you don't produce a lot of waste do you don't pay a lot of money here in Spain it is kind of like I don't care how much waste you produce or whether or not you recycle. You will pay the same as everybody else and, as a private person it is a lot but at the same time, I've heard hotels talk about this as in that's so not fair us as a hotel are doing so much and we pay exactly the same amount of money as another hotel with the same amount of guests, producing a lot more waste, they should be changing that thing. I think at times legislation could help, with such practises but there are times as well that you kind of think, yeah, okay, this might not be the best way to go about it, or is it realistic sometimes? They implement it is not just legislation. Also, like subsidise for instance you get solar panels, and you get a tax rebate or tax refund or whatever. But can people really afford it? They then must wait two years to get the money back. I do not know there is a lot of nuances there, but I do feel. They must legislation helps the plastic bags is one example of like okay.

Lucky

It brings me to my next question is too like, um, what do you think are the greatest challenges in adopting sustainable ideas or practises?

Kim

I think a lot of it has to do with awareness. I still feel That a lot of people do not really know what sustainability all is about, so they think it is a bunch of trying to save the planet hippies. When it has A lot more impact if you would really. Try and do it right. Secondly, once that awareness is created, I think lots of people and businesses feel overwhelmed. So, I think it is important to always kind of say that hey step by step just one step at a time. There is nothing wrong with not implementing all at the same time and it takes time and unfortunately, we do not have that much time, but it does by step. And if one step goes right, then the next full follow automatically, I mean. There is an example of this local small boutique hotel I always mentioned. They started out very much with the local like the social pillar they hired only local people. They source their products from local companies. They sold local excursions so there was very much onto that like social pillar. But then you got into the hotel. For instance, and they used plastic bottles of water so, you kind of think. That is weird, because you are supposed to be sustainable. It is not weird they were they were just not there yet and then bit by bit they then attack the environmental one and little by little they look like step by step they will get there I think the challenge is in creating awareness which is towards the tourist as well in also if you are doing some good then tell people about it as a destination as well. Tell the world about all these amazing projects are they 100% sustainable? No, who is going to be 100% sustainable? That is like nearly impossible, but. At least I think we should applaud a lot more of the good stuff that is being done, and somehow humans have a tendency to focus on the negative issues or point out the negatives because we can re green the local non-profit at work with to promote sustainable tourism on the island. We wanted to make a difference in that way as well. I think they are very necessary the likes of green peas world like we, WWF, and all sorts of organisations like that to kind of say they cannot be doing that. But I think we have enough of those. If, for instance, I am vegan, you compare. It to veganism. I am not an activist vegan. Is what I would call it, or a fanatic or whatever you would like to call it. I think there is a place for them, and I respect. But I personally feel you will not make anyone consider a change by going. It is trying to understand the other end as well as in okay. Why is it so hard for you to become more sustainable where your doubts, what is it like in going to an open conversation? And I think that still. Missing lots of times, but it is we are getting them more and more an asset. There's. There are still so many people. If you say sustainable development goals, I remember two years ago. I was hired to train a hotel and I was I mean like local, small hotel chain. And I had to train several directors, hotel directors and the management team or the bosses of several departments, like head of Reception and so on and so on. And I went in and when I asked like, can anybody tell me what the 17 sustainable development goals are? They just looked at me like what? Are you talking about and? I thought Oh my God. Yeah. There is lots of people that are not. Aware what sustainability is and even in the professional world, so It is a challenging topic. In every single way, there is so many things that can go wrong. There are so many things in but to me it is kind of like if we would all take it step by step with respect and always open-minded conversation. And I think we can get somewhere. Everybody with every single player, whether it is the private person, the tourist, the business, the government, on every single level.

Lucky

Not since you mentioned that you had an opportunity to work with these people. It brings me to My last question, which is like how would you describe like the collaboration between these stakeholders like the Government and NGOs and the private businesses and the local people? How do they like what is I? How do I put this on like? Do you think that like the collaboration or like, are they all involve do they have these conversations like how is their relationship in Tenerife amongst all those organisations?

Kim

Yes, I think this good initiative coming from the private businesses, people that are moving things along that I am kind of like an even on like the non-profit's aspect of things like these two and they start working together a more and more in a really good way. Creating awareness must be done on so many different levels towards locals like or people in general and that must come unfortunately from government level because like if you talk about public education when it starts with the child or anything else, then whether it is the town Hall or the province or the community or Spanish government, things must be done. They are the ones deciding on how the educational system is town halls decide on which talks will they give? Which workshops will they put out there and for now? If I look at like, let us say the Tenerife government and I feel they talk a lot about it, but at the same time I am kind of like, yeah, there is a lot of talk, but I do not see a lot happening. No. It is still like it looks cool to talk about it, and we are doing this, and we are doing that. But then still, I feel they are not exactly aligned with what is going on in, like the private businesses and they say they are going to do so many things, but then I do not really see it happening which happens a lot in politics of course, because it is politics. And they change every so many years as well. So, if they do not get voted again then it is somebody else and they have different ideas. It is hard and, But from private owned business. Yes, you see a lot happening. Also, there is a lot of them that then complain about how official or public institutions are not involved enough or are aligned enough, it seems like everybody is in his own little boats in compartment working there are some initiatives coming on as in there is this town, there is a local town. Now I am speaking at in Tenerife because I do not have that much knowledge on the other islands. He is like maybe on other islands. They are a bit more developed than we are here, or better working together but itinerary. There is like very. Few projects where all sudden a group of like business owners said we are going to come together because we want to make this town a more sustainable town, not as a destination, not just tourism related in general. But obviously if you depend on tourism, then that automatically effects so towards the locals to make it better, town Hall to make it. So, you see and then time hold it come in sat down and said Okay, let us listen and see what you are up to. But it is pushed more out of private businesses than it is from the government end. I have the personal question of tarot cards.

Lucky

I am interested like on why does your company do specifically?

Kim

The question. And my company is basically IT connector company which means because I have a huge network within this sustainable world across the islands and even away from the island sometimes. I am surprised. I am kind of like. How would you people be buying me? And., I have always worked like that, as in when I used to be in the hotel business, and I had a supplier, and I could think of another hotel that might be an interesting client or the other way around. I used to connect already, like hey going talk to that concept of mine because I think you can really do a good collaboration. I'm all about like sustainable development goal, #17, create alliances and synergy. And when I left the company for me, it was kind of like let us do this, let's turn it into a business so hence I do the networking events Meaning But there's a lot more behind it than that. For Canary Green, for instance, my role is to be like that bridge in between the local businesses, an audience and then carry Green who talks to the tourist Rd. And to promote all those sustainable initiatives, I work with clients that maybe want to start a new sustainable business, but they do not really know where to start because they want to know. Are there local suppliers to do this? So, I look with them. I connect him to their supply chain because I have so many suppliers and I am kind of like do not go looking in England for that because there is somebody here on that island that can do that for you. In And. In an in bigger companies, what I have seen is that I mainly become like an ally to the purchase Department because of the supplier network. But it can also be those times that I even get called. As in. Could you help us find this type of employee? I am not the head-hunter, what I will say is okay. I'll reach out to my own network if there's somebody in there that might be interested, but in that network there's several headhunting companies with that sustainable approach He won't. Yeah. Approved I only do this for sustainable brands or brands looking to become sustainable. I connect. This is what I. All day I connect. The present person to having a network. I think those were like my questions and I feel like a uncertain like really Well and.

Lucky

I truly appreciate it and I feel like there is going to be like a lot that I would use as that part of my data analysis, or I truly appreciate that. And for you taking your time and maybe in conclusion we can just maybe tell me, what are your hopes for like the future of sustainable, sustainable development?

Kim

I think I have always been very optimist, as in as a person, which helps because have you ever worked, heard of the word eco anxiety? And I remember when I first. Started out, I felt a. Bit like that I was like. Oh my God Oh my God the world. Going to shack. And but then, once you start looking into it, you see lots of cool initiatives coming out new businesses so. I am hopeful that we are on the right track and I'm. Sometimes I wonder, is it because it's in my interest and that's why you see so many things and you have this network? Or is it really like a general A?

How do you say that? Reflection of society is SoC becoming more and more aware or sustaining? Be aware and. Somehow Kogan has done a lot of damage on an environmental a level. But I think. People did stop, or some people did kind of stop and sit like oh wait, maybe we should like take a step back and investigate this, especially when it comes to supporting their own local economy. I think everybody has been so hit that they suddenly realise the importance of supporting like the local economy an. So somehow, I am hopeful for that that people when they travel, will. See the relevance more. Of. And not maybe going on a trip. Thinking I am going to be sustainable during my Holidays, but more as in let us go to that local artisan and let us try and. Do things a little bit different, Moon I think where my hopes are least high is on the politics level. I am kind of like oh God and let us not if somebody tells me I am kind of like if we're going to wait until politicians start moving their *** whichever right left centre, whatever. I am kind of like then nothing is ever going to happen. I very much feel this is a bottom-up thing we need. As people as consumers and as business owners. And that's when things will change. But I do not think I'm not exactly helpful when it comes to. I mean, I am in all that the Sustainable Development Goals exist because in the end it's like more of a public institution. But then acid, I feel lots of times politicians just talk and talk and talk. Whichever side they run, whichever vision they have and not a lot is happening. At least here and then. My hope is with consumers and business owners.

Exactly, but I think I, as I mentioned, that I feel like we have covered every question that I have and you we have managed to give me for available inside and I will use this.

Appendix 5 Maylene Broderick, Chief Director: Enterprise Development and Transformation: Ministry of Tourism.

May 12th, 2021

Lucky

So, the first question, my questions are like three sets and it's like a total of 11 question, so I hope it's not a lot, but like the first question I had was like how important is like tourism for our local community or like our local economy.

Maylene

Okay, from a proportion of the economy tourism is a significant contributor. Unfortunately, we are during Covid, and the impact is evident. But so significant, in fact, that the President declared parts of the legislators focus areas economic recovery plan as well, includes tourism because it has low barriers to entry. And you know, it is over an extensive value chain. And because of the libraries change, we can create a lot of jobs easily without waiting for people to be specifically scaled up, etcetera. It is one of the major success within the economy because of their contribution and you know, you can send you information specifically under statistics regarding the tourism contribution to the economy from the tourism satellite account.

Lucky

I understand that my follow up question would since this study is based on sustainable tourism like what is your understanding or how would you describe sustainable tourism or sustainable development?

Maylene

I think from my side then you know we have responsible tourism strategy will be defined it officially, but indeed for us it is familiar. Specifically, it is tourism that is inclusive. And it does not impact on the environment. Suppose the transformation goes up of South Africa and positively addresses the three evil strikes in terms of poverty, inequality, and unemployment. so just places simply.

Lucky

Since you guys mentioned like the Triple bottom line like the environment, social and economy part of it. I am just like maybe interested in knowing like how much focus is put when you develop tourism products and services on those like 3 sectors, like too often to consider these successful social parts of it. The economy can. The environments are part of it.

Maylene

Transformation is it is a national imperative. So, from the social inclusivity point of view, you know we have specific targets that we need to meet. So, the focus should be on women, on youth, on people of colour, you know, and that is where the tourism BBBE codes and we must also ourselves and abide by that so when they do any development into a programme it speaks directly to that, so all the programmes are implemented by the Department have that as a transfer or goal so that the social impact on addressing the legacy of apartheid that we have and from an environmental point of view, they are updating now the tourism environmental impact there is section 1162 which speaks to environmental issues as well as universal access. Could we do better? Yes. Because remember any development that you do in South Africa, you need to approach the department of Environmental Affairs for approval there we need to abide by that devastation and there's some conversions that have happened over time and we actually working on a concept now, we did a resource efficiency training programme in partnership with Bernie's team were we train 60 young people across the country in terms of resource efficiency assessments and it's just phase one of the programme what we want to do is to enable them to start their own businesses to be able to do resource efficiency assessments with water, power and waste. Subsequently then use the key tip which is the green Tourism Incentive programme, to allow our facilities and businesses. Obviously, we are starting with the state-owned entities to become more energy efficient. Evidently state-owned entities are not that efficient, but Bernie can give a bit more detail around the projects that they did it through The Kruger National Park and Robben Island to implement solar energy but that still needs a lot of work to be deemed highly efficient. From a social inclusion perspective, we have a tourism sector BEE codes and Women in Tourism programme to mention a few and all our programmes have a specific focus and a dedicated focus snd I would rather even say a preference to have women and young people that are beneficiaries of our programme so that we address the social inclusion and then of course we have community based tourism really assist communities that approximal to tourism facilities and services such IsiMangaliso, Kruger National Park and we develop tourism assets for them even around the parks, as well as giving training on how to run those assets so that we can have both transformation and sustainable tourism. Because you often hear of social protests and blocking various gates at the Kruger because communities feel disempowered and disenfranchised or you will see these massive lines of people before Covid or these queues to get into Kruger Five Star lodges at R45,000 a night while the locals have never been to the park and they do not understand what is going on in there while it is their ancestral land. So, we are working through our community-based tourism programme to empower communities to access those resources and then also protect those resources in perpetuity. So, they also combat the issue of poaching and as we know the poachers are at the bottom of this illegal supply chain, as there are guys who only make about R5,000 versus the kingpins who are making R50,000 to get that thino horn, ivory, or the lion bones into other countries like Asia. So how do we make communities protect their own assets in perpetuity by getting them to understand the economic, environment and the social value of these assets. We do this through the process of teaching them how to manage those assets sustainably.

When it comes to environmental sustainability in the industry the question is always, I am already practising some of these things? You know, like recycling, more use of water after the Cape Town, you know, Day Zero there is a lot of water efficiency implemented in the Western Cape for it. Why do I need a stamp that says I am doing what I am supposed to do and why do I have to pay? So, I think they still out of debate in the sector around and there are other topics of certification boom and being certified right. Places like must be paid for this for when we already busy with it. And that is where the incentive you know. Like when you say this has come from, we want people to do this. Not for a stamp or certification, but because it makes a sustainability sense.

Lucky

I really like the conversation we just had now because it covered two of the questions that I had as follow up questions, what is the tendency of the local people when tourism is being developed in the region. Care to share your experiences?

Maylene

We work with the incubator programme which is always the SME's which focuses particularly on township and rural tourism as an economic opportunity they are absolutely for it. We experience difficulties in communities where they do not see themselves included and rightly so, there is this thing is amazing tourism and experiences and more foreigners visiting and I think you know people proximal to the park, for example, The Dinokeng Nature Reserve in Gauteng, we took 50 seniors last year for a game drive for the world tourism month for a game drive and lunch in the reserve. You know people grew up in and around at reserve and never ever experienced it, you know, so they will feel like okay, but you know nothing for us without us, you know, so that is something that we are playing much more, much more close attention to in terms of our social tourism strategy, to also show people that even tourism is affordable. It is not only for affluent people or white people. You know they are having a picnic in your local pub or keeping your local park clean so that people can use it is it is domestic tourism because you have left your home and you using a facility. So, our social tourism strategy speaks to that as well. We were trying to educate local people on the fact that tourism is affordable, tourism does not mean jumping on a plane and going straight to Cape Town or Durban, there is tourism right in your own backyard and how do you do that? So, we are trying to address it from a social tourism perspective will also be implementing a domestic tourism scheme this year, which is to subsidise local travel for people who are ordinarily marginal. So that we can have more inclusive

participation in tourism and the younger people who you know can look at pursuing careers and even entrepreneurial opportunities in tourism, so we will be doing national tourism and career Expos, we expose them to what careers are available in tourism so that they can see that you know there are options out there other than being a doctor or nurse the traditional things that you know we were only allowed to do during the apartheid days. Now they need to be opportunities and then they need to be educated around those opportunities. So, this is the social aspect and then of course there is the community-based tourism framework. We are in the process of updating it now and will implement seem two community-based tourism incubators where we will be working with community tourism owned businesses that have been both either by ourselves in environmental or land affairs to help them develop sustainable tourism businesses. Oftentimes we hand over tourism assets to the community and they are not equipped to manage it and then gets run into the ground and we have lots of newspaper articles about it is community infighting and so we will be working in splitting the country into quadrants and then running the two incubators to assist community owned tourism businesses to optimally run these businesses while taking into consideration those principles that Bernie and I referenced earlier, you know, the environmental impact, the social impact and the economic impact. I remember years ago I worked in another Department and we brought a bunch of young people in as Rangers. The Rangers were all 60 and over, so we felt we wanted to transform it and then on most of the Rangers were men. and it was an absolute disaster. The young people had all the education but had never experienced the park versus the ranger, who has been in the park since he was 20, is now 65. He knows that part inside and out alignment at the book smarts, but he knows the park, knows the animals. How did we plan to transition that circle? A little easy fix brings young people in and indeed its open and the easiest but there is a lot of complexities around intergenerational issues, patriarchy issues that also comes in with business activities and trying to transform traditional environment.

Lucky

Do you see any potential in the creation of a policy that will encourage sustainable tourism development and consider sustainable tourism consumption? And if yes, kindly elaborate.

Maylene

I think we already have SANS 1162 standard and obviously there is a whole room of legislation that is implemented and an enforced by DEAF (Department of Environmental Affairs and Fisheries). But do we want to become law? I would not support it being compulsory and would rather need to give you a very solid education campaign around the benefits of sustainability across the board in the world. We are really struggling a lot with transformation you know we are now in court with a couple of entities around our tourism equity fund, for example because, you know, we have not necessarily done a good job around educating our stakeholders around the importance of some of these issues you know and the critical measure, which is basically a business imperative. If you want to be sustainable in South Africa, you need to do it again in a transformative way and you need to be sensitive to the realities of climate change. I do not think big businesses is necessarily going to just jump on board, I think, so it is easier to work with small businesses. And then big business because they have the muscle, and they can just ignore you know, and do you turn down a 10 billion Rand investment from VW because they are not building their planting a sustainable way when it is going to create 1000 jobs when we are sitting at 30% unemployment rate. So, because we are juggling so many balls in trying to address the,

you know, an equity in our economy, it is difficult. I know treasury is busy with a process for incentives for 100 centres of green business. To try and incentivise people to do it you know, is that necessarily the best way you know? Should people be incentivised to do what is a business imperative? It seems that that is the look we have been going all along, and people have become accustomed to that. And so, I think it is something that we can address a need to address at the school level through education rather than making it law and forcing people to do it. But that is just my view. For example, BEE, is voluntary but all the other legislations are to be integration. The SANS 1126 are responsible tourism standards are also voluntary, but you know it needs businesses to do it because if you control that your business is environmentally sustainable because consumers are far more aware it just makes sense but forcing people to do it. I would not be a proponent of that.

Lucky

How would you describe your collaboration with other stakeholders involved in tourism development in the area such as the government, transportation services, scholars, the accommodation sector, and attractions?

Maylene

Well, I do not think I can add much more than Bernie is saying, I think the government through the network process, for example, is trying to do that at the at restructured level. When you have states you have big business, and the social problems like unions and NGOs and social formations. Yes, I think in theory which are trying to talk to it, but when you get down to the sector level it becomes a little bit more challenging. So, can we work better Together? Absolutely, you know, can we be more inclusive community inputs? And I think that is you know we are trying to really involve communities in terms of rural and tourism businesses now at better than previously marginalised and like I said, the community-based tourism incubation programme is a stepping in that direction. We took him as well. In the private sector, think I see in South Africa they are doing phenomenally well if you look at the presentation or those sponsors and support, they could be in place for the sector because of COVID-19. I think we could have worked more closely with him, maybe in terms of that effort as opposed to, you know we are here they are there, and we need to be their other voice not. You know we have a sector to save as work together and deal with it. So, it is crucial.

Lucky

It brings me to my second last question, and I am just like. Interested like maybe what have you guys found is like the greatest challenges in trying to develop tourism in South Africa.

Maylene

Words that exact topic that we were talking about. You know the collaboration, the public private partnerships, and there might be a lot of willingness from the private sector. But on the public side, the willingness is not there as much they know will sit under a cloud of so folder. What is this corruption, you know? So, there's not reputation. Do we work with the privacy to how many people see that? And we need to overcome some of that. You need to move from the policy at the legislative framework, which is probably second to run. I was on the UN WTO workshop this morning and were presented to dial A nations. And you know they're heading South Africa, so its data acquisition is policy and it's you know, between work and loving the safer we

experience it somewhere different in our Constitution is probably next to the Canadian Constitution. One of the best in the world, but the implementation thereof. You know the professionalisation of the public service must happen because we will not be able to realise a lot of debt. So, for me, there's a. You know, the key challenges and little own resources you know, given what we need to achieve us with the resources we have available, if the tax base is as small as it is, and we do not have broad based benefits and we don't grow the middle class. Do not create an enabling environment for business. We will be in the cycle of death where we must switch off the lights, you know, figuratively speaking we will look at the budget statement that was presented. You know about the public servants you know. Looking for four increases, the better you know is that sustainable? How there are some tough choices that need to be made. And unless we make those choices, we will not be. You know that it will be a light at the end of the tunnel, but it will be a train coming towards us as opposed to Horizon that we can see. In today's fall for the next generation. So, I am the very things that we are trying to address. It will not, you know, serious about addressing in moving from policy and legislation to implementation that is measurable and is accountability for the lack of achievement of those measurable targets and indicators will be whistling in the wind.

Lucky

Yeah, well I. Also brings me to my concluding question. What are your hopes for like the future of Sustainable tourism development in South Africa?

Maylene

Well, I think for myself I think I have covered it. You know, to move from policy and legislation to implementation that we embark on an awareness and education campaign ticket in schools about the important. To ensure that we see development and growth that is sustainable in info security and then it becomes more inclusive of women of young people of communities. And, you know, I will diversify our own tourism offering because we have been so heavily focused on the international market high in SA, known as an expensive destination. When you have so much to offer. So, I think that notifies to diversify our offering if we drive the sustainability message and South Africans are you inculcate that message of knowing where tools and can do and that we are all brand ambassadors, I think if it can be a major contributor to those three challenges so that respectable states as they hold it facing our economy over above all the other stuff that I think I've already said.

Appendix 6 Bernie Meyer, Director of Incentive and Responsible Tourism South Africa.

May 12th, 2021

Bernie

My name is Bernie Meyer and I work in the tourism incentive programme and Department. So, we have several incentives and support mechanisms which includes areas of transformation. Well, we have two programmes currently and market access where we support small businesses to go to international trade shows, tourism businesses. We have a support programme that offers discounts on grading and then I think if I'm not mistaken, the one that you might be most

interested in is green tourism Incentive programme where we encourage tourism operators to improve their efficiencies.

Lucky

So, the first question, my questions are like three sets and it's like a total of 11 question, so I hope it's not a lot, but like the first question I had was like how important is like tourism for our local community or like our local economy.

Bernie

I think everything that magazine said. I agree with the jobs, the jobs potential in tourism is obviously one of the key drivers. But I think in addition to that, tourism is also a major foreign export for the country. It helps economically very significantly and with all things being equal, the importance of tourism is critical, and I think we, the country will realise it now. The impact of COVID-19 on reduced level and to see just the number of jobs affected. The number of small enterprises that is affected with ultimately also erodes your tax base if these companies cannot operate and they will not pay taxes and that as another impact, and then I think on top of that is there is a range of software impacts and place specific with tangible impacts in terms of promoting the country as a destination and creating pride and social cohesion and those helpful things. And Lastly you. You mentioned local communities, and I think that is an important point, because even though these sits on a national level and work around developments on a national level and promotion of tourism offer on a national level. Tourism happens locally in communities whether it is a city or a small village in a rural area doesn't really matter. But that is where the direct impact is felt in terms of job creation or economic concessions. So, I think it is critically important.

Lucky

I understand that my follow up question would since this study is based on sustainable tourism like what is your understanding or how would you describe sustainable tourism or sustainable development?

Bernie

I am familiar with support again. What might be inside, and I think we have moved in a way but beyond. Global general global acceptance of sustainable tourism. Being the three pillars of economically sustainable, socially sustainable, and environmentally sustainable, and I think that's very SA, focus on and the term responsible tourism is more appropriate because it will obviously differ a little bit in each location and inclusivity, as a lot to do with social responsibility and social sustainability and transformation and those things are unique to our country, I think, and it needs to form part of that definition. So, it's not just environmental, it's not a social or economic and we can only get all of those things that needs to be fairly impacted on. Nothing at all points about the maybe I'm jumping the gun here, pointed out the world and the market, the global tourism market increasingly wanting responsible travel experiences and sustainable products to visit is just an indication of where things are going.

Lucky

Since you guys mentioned like the Triple bottom line like the environment, social and economy part of it. I am just like maybe interested in knowing like how much focus is put when you

develop tourism products and services on those like 3 sectors, like too often to consider these successful social parts of it. The economy can. The environments are part of it.

Bernie

Everything that we do is based on those three areas of sustainability (Social, Environmental and Economic) And I think it is interesting if you go back to just the whole development of tourism in the country, even before the Democratic elections. Um, although I think in those early days after tourism started, really developing around the world in the 1950s on the mass scale I think most countries or destinations in the world assume the mass tourism agenda where they try to maximise numbers and inflow economic inflows, so the focus was only or very much limited to the economic side. In South Africa, however, I think our tourism product base has always been nature based, so most of our attractions we have known as a nature based in outdoor type of destination. So, I think it is just natural that we must focus on the environmental aspects because we need to protect that assets to continue exploiting it in a way and then I think socially we've probably prior to the Democratic elections, we not critically focused on it or tourism development has not but since the Democratic election that has become a very important part, and it then followed that, I think it is the 1996 White Paper was in fact the first white paper that's already recognised sustainability and that was in those days done with people like Harold Goodwin that still around and many of the sustainable tourism scholars and people that started this movement and then on the principles of it and that was adopted by governments and all tourism strategies after that focused on these elements so apart from wanting to create an economic impact order, economic impact through jobs and foreign exchange income, and it's just economic activity, which is the economic leg of sustainability. We naturally must look more at conserving our natural assets and look at environmental resources in tourism and the base of the product. And then most recently I think we are focused more on cultural and social side with lots of focus being placed on cultural tourism and the social aspects of as may be mentioned, woman in tourism. So, I think if you look at almost all of the Department projects or programmes or initiatives are centred on these three principles, so we always take all of that in into consideration. Transformation plays a significant role in anything that the Department does and so does cultural, cultural impact and economic impact and environmental. So, I think it is ingrained in our thinking and our policies and stuff. I think that has not happened as well as on the policy and strategic side is we have been preaching responsible tourism and sustainability for a long time and have initiatives like fair trade and tourism and then those guys set up already early in our democracy. But I think the industry has been a bit slow in implementing and the Department is already to some extent implementing things to drive it, so also be included and it was a lot of talk and less walking, and I think that is busy changing with programmes that are very specific on promoting women in tourism, promoting transformations or mechanisms for that and the environmental programmes. So, I think there is a shift, and that is what we're trying to do on the incentive sides to encourage operators in tourism to adapt their business models on the Green tourism incentive the whole purpose is to adopt better more responsible operational practises and Maylene mentioned the state owned entities before we started with the incentives we had a pilot initiative where we looked at some of our major State owned tourism attractions like Robben Island as a World Heritage Site the National Parks and the botanical gardens and we had a pilot initiative where we had eight sites and four of them in Kruger National Park and three in the botanical gardens and Robben Island as a world heritage sites where we fitted those with solar PV systems and the impact has been significant on those specific sites where they've moved from Robben Island case from diesel electric generation to clean energy and renewable energy with battery backup and the same for the parks, which are often in more rural areas where it's easier to run renewable energy then retired stifle systems. So yeah, that is another thing that is starting to happen in practise, which is implementing the strategies and policies which is happening.

Lucky

I really like the conversation we just had now because it covered two of the questions that I had as follow up questions, what is the tendency of the local people when tourism is being developed in the region. Care to share your experiences?

Bernie

You ask about communities whether the communities are open to through accepting tourism and so forth, I think that I think the communities keen on tourism and I think they will see it in towns were, other industries are dying like mining towns like Palaborwa and those type of places. Tourism is kind of the last option left for many of them, so I think communities are keen to do tourism, and there is a whole lot of initiatives to promote this as well in some parts, for example, how communities around parks where they focus on supporting and involving communities living adjacent into the parks. So, I think community-based tourism and the social Impact of that is very important and I think communities realise it. I think that the tenants that we set forth is often there as Maylene mentioned and the infighting within the Community because you often find many landowners and different opinions on how and what should happen, and we should benefit. So those are things that in practice makes it difficult or impractical, but I think in theory I think most people support tourism above other sectors, and I think they can see the benefits in terms of jobs and income and the sustainability around it.

Lucky

Do you see any potential in the creation of a policy that will encourage sustainable tourism development and consider sustainable tourism consumption? And if yes, kindly elaborate.

Bernie

I tend to agree with Maylene Lucky, I think. If you look at tourism, it is already indirectly over regulated, so we not directly through our legislation as tourism act regulating the sector. We only regulate the tourist guide in that, so anything less regulated from our code. That is all-other major slicing impacts on tourism operations because tourism is such a complex industry that does not, or sector that does not fit into a specific economic sector, that we are affected by food regulations, alcohol regulations, environmental regulations. So, there is enough legislation in place that already regulates our sector and for small business those regulations and rules books allot of burden on them, so you do not want to add burden by creating more rules that need to be enforced. I agree with Maylene, that is not the way to go. Incentives this it is one option, but it is risky, so legal legislation and incentives are blunt instruments. I think the true way to do this is through awareness and education, as Maylene says. He said the benefits of doing things in a different way and how it can do it that way benefits yourself and benefit others. I think that is the way to do, you can bring in incentives, but it must be creative incentives, not just random. So, I think not legislation, but otherwise specifically awareness and education as long-term initiatives, but it needs to happen that way, so that becomes a culture.

Lucky

How would you describe your collaboration with other stakeholders involved in tourism development in the area such as the government, transportation services, scholars, the accommodation sector, and attractions?

Bernie

I do not think it is as good as it should be and could be, but I think it is a very important point that you raise I think all of this is dependent on collaboration and it relates to the integrated nature of tourism. We are reliant on as a sector on different departments on government level transports and home affairs, and all these different sectors need to work together to get the enabling environment that works for the sector on all levels. But at the same time as government, we are also the enabler we cannot drive the thing it needs to be driven by communities and private sector. So, it is I think in theory we always talk about it in the underworld papers they talk about integrated approach where you have all sectors, or all stakeholders involved in our important it is, so we do it in writing and in our policy work, but in practise those relationships are dynamic and fluid. So, now I do not think we had the best space with private sector. I think we were in a much better space I think in the last 10 years, around 2010 with the FIFA World Cup, I think that was the closest that industry and governments and everyone has ever been to one coordinated goal and I think we slipped a little bit so we not working as well together as we should. But that is the answer you need to have alignment and collaboration between different stakeholders to make anything but so. Yeah, I think it is critically important.

Lucky

It brings me to my second last question, and I am just like. Interested like maybe what have you guys found is like the greatest challenges in trying to develop tourism in South Africa.

Bernie

I am 100% agreed, I think, um. There are those things that that is the answer, and that's the challenges that we are facing. Is there the collaboration? I think in addition, maybe just to add is also awareness within. Both governments and corporate of the role that tourism complain the economy. I think it needs to be. Understood that tourism is maybe not the answer to everything and everyone and as a solution for everyone. Is it that it is a major player and that recognition of the importance of tourism across different stakeholders I think is critical? So, one awareness. But once I capacity so specifically when you look at local government level later. It happens very often, have capacity challenges on a municipal level. When people hear about tourism, but they do not really understand it's and how to play their role, so tourism is always spoke about that it's never ladies supported in the way that it should on local level, and I think that's the challenge. So, if you have greater awareness and understanding of tourism amounts, different stakeholders, and they coordinate. To plan an investment role and what the value is for and where it fits in with whatever you are doing. Very humanism product your big corporates. I think if other winners in recognition of tourism and the capacity to implement it improves, then we will move faster and basic forward towards economy coordinator goal. So, I think those are the only major additional challenges is that I wanted to flag. So, I can just afford anymore, then you say you have chosen happens at the local level, and if you look at ID peas for example, even potential growth and development strategies, referring tourism as a sentence or paragraph, you know, take the problems that I come from. Specifically, the purple, and even when I was not introduced a I really tried to switch the agenda from focusing on mining to tourism, because it can create more jobs, more sustainable. OH, I bet that shift wasn't there yet because the big investments are so. So, unless also at that local government and provincial district level, the importance of tourism is not cascaded down in calculated, you know like we are envisioning for tourism as a major growth sector to support much needed growth and development that we need in South Africa will still have a challenge and it is not translated adaptable. If you look at my IDPS and even provincial growth and development strategies.

Lucky

Yeah, well I. Also brings me to my concluding question. What are your hopes for like the future of Sustainable tourism development in South Africa?

Bernie

And for me, lucky I support 100% what my Maylene says, I think. It is an amazing sector that has so much potential to have impact on various levels social, economically, environmentally for future generations. So, it is a sector that has this potential and I think strangers as it may sound the whole. Situation that we currently in and that was brought about by COVID-19 under infected it is said. Is so negative now that. At the same time, it creates an opportunity to almost restart things. So, Laura Spectre, everyone that was negatively affected and lost her job and companies that closed. I think there is an opportunity now to restart and do things. Correctly where we maybe might have not done it correctly and traffic changes and fix it, you know, and I would have an opportunity to redevelop in there in the correct way from the start. So, it is not a clean slate. And they say that it is an opportunity to read our rates and to install this culture and my means correct the post to start with it is on school level and changing a culture and an understanding and upbringing of kids. But I understand what tourism is and why I need to visit my country and how I work in it and what benefits it offers and what the dangers are so that you do not end up in there. The best, like some of these mass tourism destinations where the people do not want to what they call over tourism these days. And if people do not want to live anymore because tourists have taken over and make it unpleasant so that balances installed from there from a young age. People understand the different benefits and dangers of tourism. I think we have that opportunity now, so I would like to see it. Just do better than it has before and grow again. I found I am convinced that it will go back to where it was, and even beyond that there is an opportunity now to do it in a better way. And that is what I hope to see happening around the world.

Appendix 7 Beki Libangalele Director of Responsible Tourism South Africa

Lucky

How important is tourism for the local economy?

Beki

Tourism plays a key role in the economy of South Africa; it contributes 10% of the GDP. Tourism is part of that of the economic recovery plan because of the belief that tourism can play a bigger role in reactivating the local economies, tourism has a potential to create jobs that can be accessed

by people with minimum skills or education and that if used well, especially in local communities, it can act as the catalyst for also other sorts of development. Furthermore, it has numerous benefits throughout the value chain, meaning if I start a lodge or restaurant in Soweto, it will trickle down because there's cleaning services there's food and beverages and other sectors involved.

Lucky

What is your understanding of sustainable tourism?

It is an approach that was introduced, a few years ago to help us understand that for tourism to grow it needs to grow in a manner which is sustainable because tourism, largely in many countries, depends on the natural resource so we must make sure that we will preserve those natural resources for future generations. We must make sure that the resources we use, we do so in a responsible manner. We use a lot of resources in the tourism sector whether they be energy resources or water resources, or many other resources that we do, so any responsible manner. But most importantly if you look at the 1996 White paper tourism growth and development. It speaks very clearly that we must make sure that in South Africa in particular, that tourism must be a role in developing local communities and creating opportunities for communities that live and work around major tourism attraction. Certainly, it must contribute in terms of getting people on board and important people, but also from an environmental point of view must make sure that we will use those resources in a manner that is responsible.

Lucky

How would you describe sustainable development?

Beki

Broadly speaking, we must concede that tourism is a business and at any given stage when one invests in a business, one might make sure that this venture is in fact, economic. So, for us we must make sure that all the efforts and all the work has been done to make sure that we have done proper research within proper feasibility studies to make sure that these businesses are not going to fail in the future. But as they start their market for them to grow and for them to continue to operate, going forward. So sustainable development also looks at the broader issue of climate change, the broader issue of the interface between tourism and the environment so must make sure that our activity does not impact negatively on the environment. Then lastly, sustainable development must be a development that brings on board African language masses of our people into the economy because if you have a business and growing this business, you are making lots of money by people around you, people live and work around your business are not benefiting in a manner that also uplift them then they cannot sustainability sources. Ability must rest on those three pillars of economic, environment and social sustainability.

Lucky

How has the approach to tourism development changed in the past 10 years since climate change is evident?

Beki

I mean firstly. If you look at the past ten years now, a climate change has been a new concept. The new issue that we have had to understand and integrate into our plans. So, you know, initially we did a study to gain a deep understanding on how climate change was going to affect or impact on tourism in South Africa. Even did a much more detailed study where we did what we call a vulnerability assessment study So, in which case will go to a place like Kruger National Park or Table Mountain or Robben Island and then we will look at the key elements of that property and begin to analyse how all those various elements have will not be impacted by the potential impact of climate change, so we did a few major attractions this year. Then following that we have developed what we call a climate change action plan, which then identifies a list of activities that we must undertake so that in general we can respond to the challenges of climate change. But also, we can make sure that our activities we can minimise their negative contribution to climate change. So, we are really trying to make sure that we understand and make sure that as we develop the anticipated negative impacts of climate change that reflect are those in.

Lucky

I would like to know what the tendency of the local people towards tourism developments in South Africa.

Beki

Look It all depends on the kind of engagement that takes place between the initiators the funders and the developers and the local community. If just approach someone in the village like the chief and they give me land, and I then build lodge I am going to encounter problems because I have not brought on board the people, the local people. To tell them my vision and to understand what their plans are and how their plans can link with what I want to initiate. So, if we do that, then people generally welcome tourism development and they also understand that compared to other forms of economic activity, it can be done in a manner that is sustainable and does not impact on the environment, they understand that tourism, if it is done in a manner which is a partnership, you can then in the value chain, create various opportunities for local people. So, if we do that, then we you know we get a positive response. You know, um, I am in an example isMangaliso national park which is our first World Heritage Site in South Africa. There has been contestation there, mining and tourism and by far most people because they understand now what tourism worth Village can is bringing. They understand in relation to other economic activities like mining which is finite, and it will most likely have a negative, far bigger negative impact on the environment and many years after the mining had stopped, in many years after the people who approved this thing would have been gone. So, if we do that then people understand the support tools mean they want tourism.

Lucky

Do you see any potential in the creation of a policy that will encourage sustainable tourism development and consider sustainable tourism consumption? And if yes, kindly elaborate.

Beki

I think it is not just necessarily, but I think it is a critical requirement. It should be a critical requirement for any future development that leads to tourism because if it is only if we do that, we can make sure that we can sustain the future and protect the future or the tourism sector. Now if you have read which I imagine you have read the 1996 white Paper, it is very clear but the only

way for us to grow tourism in South Africa is through responsible tourism. The paper dates to 1996 so it was major requirement then, and I think that strongly a policy that forces people to integrate these principles into how they plan, develop, and manage their businesses is critical. Because if we do not do that if we do not do that then responsible tourism becomes like a tax in your business is not part of your business it just is a nuisance, this thing that you know you must do but you do not like doing it. So, unless we build it so that it is part of the DNA of how you develop tourism.

Lucky

I would like to know what you think is like the biggest challenge when trying to adopt sustainable development strategies or like implement them?

Beki

People do not see tourism as something that is necessary for them to do it is not integral in terms of what they need to do so they can decide to do it if they want it and if they do not want, they will not do it, and nothing happens. So, and in some instances, people see it is in as an extra burden and I have been doing my business in this way for all these years, and this is now a new thing that we must do in terms of conserving energy and stuff like that. But also, in an environment where tourism businesses were squeezed quite tightly in the last two or three, three, five years, people look at things that we really must do their businesses to get them going, and some of the things that they believe is kind of nice to do. So sometimes people see responding to something that is nice to do, but if I do not do it, nothing happens. Okay, so yeah, probably that is like the biggest challenges, I guess.

Lucky

How would you describe your collaboration with other stakeholders involved in tourism development in the area such as the government, transportation services, scholars, the accommodation sector, and attractions?

Beki

We as the national government work very with the different spheres of government, which is the in our case the provincial and local governments. There is also an appreciation of the importance of these issues that relate to responsible tourism or relate to sustainability and in communities are concerned is a no-brainer because responsible tourism seeks to do just that. To benefit the local people so people like the approach in they see how this approach can in fact be beneficial to them. Yes, we work very well. Especially through the various bodies that represent the various sub sectors of the tourism economy so we work very well with them because they understand why responsible tourism is important and why this issue must be embedded in everything that we do so we work very well in several projects in fact, we do them together with the private sector. We had a programme last financial year we train young people to become energy or resource efficiency auditors in hotels and several hotels are very happy to take on those students for internships therefore we have several projects that we collaborate with the private sector on.

Lucky

Doing things are fresh and I was maybe interested in knowing projects that you guys might have for like the incoming financially or something like that. Do you have anything you would like to share?

Beki

We have Several projects that we are initiating for the new financial year. One of which? Is what we call the tourism and environmental implementation Plan, which seeks to consolidate all the. The policies of government. That impact on the environment. And seeks to make sure that the activities that we undertake that relate to the environment. That we have put measures in place to minimise the negative impacts that may have. And for that we must report annually. And. And that plan is reviewed on a 5-year basis. We also have got our tourism adaptation programme. Why didn't we work with the tourism sector? To make sure that there are measures in place to adapt to some of the challenges. That arise because of climate change. So, um, I part of that is to develop a national communication plan on climate change. But also, to conduct further emissions impact studies, so will choose a few other attractions and conduct a climate change. Impact studies. So those are just some of the initiatives were also convicted. For the sector, a framework for company-based tourism. Um, that people can be able to use to make sure that when we do, and I take. Could you please tell them we do so in a manner that that is not it sustainable and beneficial to the local communities? No, not very.

Lucky

I am going to thank you, um. This brings me to me. Closing question, which is what are your hopes for the future of sustainable tourism development in South Africa? Well.

Beki

I hope sustainable tourism development should be at the forefront of all the activities that we undertake for tourism in South Africa. I am hoping that it is some stage as we discussed it, it can become a requirement. For all future development especially development that is led by government or sometimes you know government is involved. As you know, in building hotels in government owned properties. And sometimes we fall short ourselves of making sure that those development which are done by government by public money that they infect at least meet the minimum requirement for sustainability. Making sure. No, I did not. I never knew that like you guys did that which is I believe it could set like the example or like the president to like just like do it. If the government is the one that is at the forefront of this, and I am sure it will inspire the private sector to do the same as well, yes.

No, but that was my final question. I do not have much, maybe to say, unless if there is anything you would like to share me with me, or maybe something I should know that maybe I do.

Appendix 8 : Yanga Gijana; Founder of Travel with Yang Steeze

• How important is tourism for the local or the regional economy?

I believe tourism is really important for regions that participate on the sector because it helps with the economy and it creates jobs for young people who are often disadvantaged, and they can provide for their families in the process. It also helps by maintaining a sustainable income for the region.

• What is your understanding of sustainability or tourism sustainability?

Sustainability is the idea of using what you have right now without jeopardizing the same resources for the future generations to use those resources. In a tourism context I think it refers to using the natural environment to develop the economy of the people living there without affecting the environment negatively and also in a social perspective it means that you should involve everyone, and they should benefit equally and finally the economic side should benefit everyone equally.

• According to you or your sector, how would you describe sustainable development?

Sustainable development simply means development that takes account towards the environment's well-being by conserving and protecting the natural environment, encouraging the society to develop from the lower class towards the middle or higher class through education and skills development and finally, creating economic freedom for the residents.

• How much focus is on tourism towards social, economic, and environmental development in the area?

This is always the case with tourism especially in a developing country, tourism always looks to uplift societies through interactions with the local people and educating them about different cultures. Tourism is good for the local economy as it provides jobs and business opportunities for the local entrepreneurs and also the direct and indirect spending helps boost the economy. The environment benefits from tourism immensely because it provides the income needed to protect and conserve the environment.

• How has your approach to tourism development changed in the past 10 since climate change is evident?

Climate change is evident on tourism especially here in Cape Town. For example, we have been having droughts and a few years ago we had day zero where we did not have enough water to support the residents of the city let alone tourism activities and it was difficult so the development of the sector has changed a lot since then. We focus more sustainable ways to provide tourism activities now like saving water, using renewable energy source wherever we can and just cutting down on our emissions as well as one-time plastic use.

• What is the tendency of locals towards tourism development in the area?

Locals love tourism as they understand that it is important for the local economy but as you can imagine there some instances where the locals feel left out especially when tours are done by large corporations and they feel like they don't benefit from the tourists visiting the area. Also, tourism has encouraged lots of locals to start business due to the influx of tourists.

• Do you see any potential in the creation of a policy that will encourage sustainable tourism development and consider sustainable tourism consumption? And if yes, kindly elaborate.

Policy is important, imagine if all businesses had to a quota, they needed to achieve every year to show they are sustainable and that was required by law. A lot would change instead of using these certification programmes that can be manipulated and basically bribed then after the certification those businesses do not follow those "rules" anymore so definitely a law is needed considering climate change as well, the government needs to do something before it's too late.

• What do you think are the greatest challenges in adopting this kind of tourism development strategy?

The biggest problem inequality, South Africa is inequal therefore developing tourism is often reserved for the rich and people who have income to start businesses. There is a saying that tourism has low or no barrier to entry but that is a lie because you need to finance a business and banks do not usually fund tourism businesses. Therefore, the government needs to do more to help people develop tourism.

• How would you describe your collaboration with other stakeholders involved in tourism development in the area such as the government, transportation services, scholars, the accommodation sector, and attractions?

Stakeholder collaboration is complicated in my opinion. No stakeholder does something in order help tourism develop sustainable instead they all do it knowing that there is something they will benefit including the government too. So, the collaboration is bad honestly, all the SME's fiend for themselves and big companies only work by themselves and the government is just doing its own thing while the people who need to benefit are neglected by all the parties I have mentioned.

• What are your hopes for the future of sustainable tourism development and consumption in the area?

My hope for tourism is that we find a way to work together and enforce sustainability. I hope the government works on a law that benefits everyone.