“We are the bridge”

A case study of the organization Fundación Frè, between Haitian migrants and the Chilean state

Frida Stepputat

Master Thesis 2017

Global Refugee Studies
Supervisor: Zachary Whyte

AALBORG UNIVERSITET

Abstract

Over recent decades, Chile has experienced increased migration, including the new phenomenon of Haitian migration. Haitian migrants can encounter many obstacles that may lead to a vulnerable position in the Chilean society. This is partly caused by a legal framework for migration that is outdated and inherently selective, and the presence of racial nationalism, which marks immigration as a threat to the Chilean national identity.

Through a case study, this thesis seeks to identify and examine the organization Fundación Fré as an actor in the space between Haitian migrants and the Chilean state. Through its work, Frè aims to help, accompany, and promote integration of Haitian migrants in Chile, and is thereby an example of how other actors can influence the migrant-state relations.

I conducted fieldwork with Frè, working as a volunteer, where I collected data through participant observation. Using perspectives from literature on non-profit organizations and social movements to interpret the empirical material, the analysis of this thesis seeks to understand Frè as an organization, including its objectives, how it interacts with the Chilean state, and how internal dynamics can affect the workings of the organization.

The organization performs charitable acts and activities to promote integration of Haitian migrants. The choice of beneficiaries as well as participation in public debate serve as a critique of the Chilean state and certain structures in society. The organization also acts as a protector and mediator for the migrants by facilitating contact to the state and enabling access to rights. The organization thereby functions as a substitute for the state by providing services that are otherwise perceived to be within the responsibility of the state. However, through this, the organization risks becoming an extension of the state, by reproducing the state agenda and allowing the state to continue being absent. Internal disagreements and the focus on fulfilment of personal motivations can stand in the way of achieving the general objectives of the organization, as participation in itself becomes the means to an end. Ultimately, certain aspects can risk obscuring the organization's possibility of initiating a change in the Chilean society.

Acknowledgements

Quisiera agradecer a Juan Carlos, Claudio, Margarita, Noel y los demás voluntarios y a la familia Frè en general, el cual tuve el placer de conocer durante mi estadía en la organización. Admiro el trabajo y el corazón que ponen a la obra cada día. Agradecer además a Tomás y Eleonora por su amistad, el respaldo y especialmente a Eleonora por todos sus consejos y el cariño que me dio durante mi investigación, fue sin duda invaluable. Espero poder trabajar en un futuro con ustedes, en algún lugar en el mundo.

Cover photo: Sofía Yanjarí Aburto

“In terms of social harmony, I would say that we have to generate a change in mentality ... Chile is an ‘island country’… Geographically as well, we have the mountain range, we have the desert, we have the Antarctica, and we have the ocean, meaning that any person who wants to enter the country, must enter with intention. It’s not like in Europe or in North America where you cross a highway and you’re in another country. The mentality is also somewhat of an island”

- Juan Carlos Cortez, Fundación Frè

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

Despite mostly being known as a sending country, particularly associated with the migrants and refugees who left the country during the dictatorship of Augusto Pinochet, Chile has experienced increasing immigration throughout the last decades, due to the relative economic and social success in a South American context. What started out as immigration from neighboring countries, now includes migrants from other countries in South America, but also from countries in the Caribbean, like the Dominican Republic and Haiti (Polloni & Matus, 2011; Stefoni, 2011).

My interest in the Chilean immigration issue was spurred by my personal experience of living in Chile. When I returned to Santiago de Chile in January 2017, it had been almost one and a half years since I left. I immediately noticed an escalation in the debate on immigration, an issue which was now on everybody's lips. What especially caught my attention was the matter of Haitian migration. As most migrants in Chile come from other South American countries, they share many physical and/or cultural traits with the Chileans, most evidently the Spanish language. Haitians speak Creole and French, and do not resemble Chileans in their physical appearance, both characteristics which I presumed could complicate their position as migrants in the Chilean society. This understanding motivated me to further investigate Haitian immigration, and in February 2017, I started my fieldwork with a non-profit organization working with Haitian migrants in Santiago, called Fundación Frè.

The epigraph above is a quote by Juan Carlos Cortez, a priest in the church San Saturnino in Santiago, and the founder of Frè. This quote introduces interesting perspectives on migration to Chile, including the character of Chile as a receiving country and the complicated relation between the Chilean state and society and the migrants, and a wish or intention to change this complicated relation. Migrant-state relations are often seen as rather black/white, with the state as the actor in control (Nicholls, 2013, pp. 226, 227). However, as I will argue, the space between the migrant and the state is inhabited by other actors as well. In this thesis, Frè will be examined as an actor in this space, an actor seeking to make a difference, both for Haitian migrants and in the Chilean society. This will be done by addressing the question:

How does Fundación Frè play a role in the space between Haitian migrants and the Chilean state?

Within this question lies an interest in achieving a better understanding of the situation of migration in Chile today. The new character of migration poses new concerns to the Chilean state and society. Examining migration through the new phenomenon of Haitian migration to Chile provides an

opportunity to engage with the dynamics and structures in the country, and how these are at play in relation to migration. Frè as an organization is a response or reaction to the position of Haitian migrants in Santiago. In this sense, looking closer at Frè will not only provide an opportunity to understand an organization created in step with the emergence of a new phenomenon, but it also offers a possibility to understand how Frè may influence the space between the state and the migrant, a space which is not inhabited or influenced only by the state and the migrant.

2. Methodology: An Introduction to the Case

2.1. A Case Study: Fundación Frè

To answer the research question, this thesis applies a case study approach. According to Yin (1989) a case study "is an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon in depth and within its real-life context" (Yin, 1989, p. 23). In this thesis, the case is how relations between immigrants and the state, and internal dynamics between volunteers, affect an organization working with immigrants, here with Frè as the object of study. Although using a case study methodology may not enable greater scientific generalization, it provides a method for understanding a phenomenon, as one of the strengths of applying a case study methodology is that it enables the researcher to examine the case in connection to its specific context (Yin, 1989, pp. 21, 13). Frè is a reaction to its surrounding context, which is why this, along with an examination of the role of the organization and the internal dynamics and motivations of the volunteers, is paramount when seeking an understanding of the organization.

Fundación Frè was started by the priest Juan Carlos Cortéz, in the church San Saturnino, located in the center of Santiago, Chile. Cortéz told me that when he was transferred to this church in 2016, he was met by a church damaged by earthquakes in 1985 and 2010, and a demotivated parish. He therefore started to look for a worthwhile project he could spend his time on. Through observing the neighborhood, he noticed many migrants passing time in the square in front of the church. Cortéz had heard about the arrival of many Haitian migrants, so he decided to invite a couple of them to the church. It began with a week of Spanish classes, but the venture developed, and soon more Haitians started to participate, and more volunteers arrived to help with the expanding activities, which included serving breakfast, providing legal aid, and the management of a job bank. Throughout the months I was there, the actual organization of Fundación Frè developed into what it is today, a recognized non-profit organization. Frè means brother in Creole, and is also an acronym for the

organization's values, namely "*Fraternidad, Responsabilidad, y Emprendimiento",* fraternity, responsibility and entrepreneurship.

While I was there, it was difficult for me to decipher the nature of the relationship between the church and the organization. The activities were started by the priest, and took place in the facilities of the church. Moreover, on Saturdays there would always be a mass before the Spanish classes started, although attendance was never a requirement, neither was being Catholic. It was obvious that many volunteers were there because of their connection to the church, but other volunteers, like myself, had no apparent connection to this specific church, or any specific religious affiliation in general. As the organization started to develop into the organization it is today, it was important for its leaders to separate the organization from the facilities of the church. This meant that in June 2017, the organization moved to a new location, a high school in the same neighborhood.

My confusion regarding the role of religion in the organization will likely be apparent throughout the thesis. I do not consider religion, in this case Catholicism, as the main factor for the organization, which is why it will not play a larger role. However, I do recognize religion as an important element in terms of the presence of the priest, the facilities of the organization, and the motivation of some of the volunteers, which means that it will be included when relevant for understanding the organization.

2.1.1 Data Collection

The methods I used to collect data for this thesis were participant-observation, a single semi-structured interview, and data from already existing sources. To create a framework for understanding the context in which the organization is located, I have mainly relied on regional academic literature, regarding migration in South America and the Caribbean, and more specifically migration in a Chilean context.

In terms of fieldwork, I gathered data by conducting participant observation through involvement as a volunteer with the organization, which allowed me to collect data in a natural way, by taking part in the daily life and activities, while at the same time observing my surroundings (Musante & DeWalt, 2010, p. 13; Hastrup, et al., 2011, p. 61). I first arrived at the church where the organization was located on Friday February 24th, after having read about their activities in a newspaper article. Although I had explained the purpose of my visit, namely my thesis, I was mistaken for a new volunteer. I was therefore asked to teach a Spanish class, and although I felt uncomfortable, I decided that this was the best way to contribute, and that it would give me a plausible reason for engaging with the organization. Later I successfully escaped the responsibility of teaching Spanish, and instead

I helped with other activities or simply just 'hung around'. As a volunteer, I participated in the weekly activities, listened in on the weekly announcements, participated in the workshops they held, and spent time with the other volunteers and the Haitian migrants. Although I often interacted with the Haitians, the extend of the conversations was limited by the language barrier, as both the Haitians and I were communicating in our third language. This is also partly why this thesis does not include more of the Haitian migrants' point of view, while this is also due to the choice of object for the case study, namely the organization.

Being a volunteer naturalized my presence in the organization, which gave me the opportunity to observe as well. Participant observation, like the name reveals, consists of two different processes, often understood as an oxymoron, namely participation and observation (Musante & DeWalt, 2010, p. 28; Hastrup, et al., 2011, p. 61). These two processes can be understood as opposite ends on a continuum that extends from pure participation to pure observation. The researcher must strive to continuously move between the two, trying to exercise both at once, which however can be difficult (Hastrup, et al., 2011, p. 62). In terms of my fieldwork, I struggled to find the right balance, mainly due to the double role I held of being a researcher and a volunteer, which at times was difficult to manage. As a rather inexperienced researcher, I found it easier to dive into the role as a volunteer, which meant more participation than observation. However, after some time, I tried to focus more on observation. I did this by trying not to take on too much responsibility as a volunteer, to give myself the opportunity to step back and observe the activities. Despite my role as a volunteer, the fact that I am Danish and not Chilean gave me the opportunity of studying the surroundings, interactions, and activities, from the outside, and gave me the opportunity to ask questions and be curious (Hastrup, et al., 2011, pp. 62, 63). Another way in which I was able to observe, was through the volunteers' WhatsApp group. I never participated in the discussions myself, but being a member gave me a look into the written discussion of the volunteers, which exposed many issues that were normally not brought up or talked about during the actual activities in the organization.

Apart from these conversations, and information from the Facebook page of the organization[1], the data collected and used in this thesis derive from my fieldnotes, which I carefully wrote after each visit to the organization, and even sometimes while I was there. Furthermore, to clarify certain things, I arranged an interview with the priest, Juan Carlos Cortez. This interview was semi-structured, as I

[1] https://www.facebook.com/SomosFre/

had prepared a few questions within certain topics I wanted to get covered, including his role in the organization and his view on the services of the organization (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009, p. 130).

The empirical material will be used to advance an understanding of the case. Throughout the thesis, mainly in the analysis, excerpts from my fieldnotes and from the WhatsApp group chat will be introduced, just like I will include stories I heard from the other volunteers and conversations I had with them or witnessed, and general observations I made while volunteering. While I always wrote my fieldnotes in English, mainly for my own convenience, almost every interaction I had throughout my fieldwork, including the interview with Cortez, was in Spanish. However, for this thesis, I have translated the quotes that will be included into English.

2.1.2. Positionality

Through the course of my fieldwork, I found that positionality influenced my data collection. Positionality holds many aspects of one's identity, like gender, class, or ethnicity, which "mark the relational positions in society, be they fixed or acquired" (Stiedenroth, 2014, p. 82). Apart from my struggle to balance the roles of researcher and volunteer, other positionalities or labels that followed me are important to mention, as they influenced my position in the field. Firstly, my identity as a white European was something that in many ways paved the way for curiosity around me, but it also cemented my position as an outsider. While most Haitians did not notice that I was not Chilean, in my appearance or in my way of speaking Spanish, the Chilean volunteers almost immediately noticed it. As will be explained in the thesis, being of European descent has positive resonance in Chile. This is also important to mention in terms of the existence of a European privilege, which I have often experienced in Chile. Although these are only speculations, I cannot help but wonder whether this provided me an easier access, both in terms of an interest in me, but also in terms of a general overestimation of my capabilities, e.g. when I was invited to teach Spanish. My 'privileged position' qua being European, was very sharply contrasted by the status of Haitians in the Chilean society, who often fall victims to the existence of a racial hierarchy in Chile, something which will be elaborated in a later chapter (Correa, 2016, p. 42).

My positionality as a female researcher is also imperative to mention, as I experienced that perceptions of gender affected my fieldwork, and especially my approach to the field. My first experiences when entering the field, at a time when the specific frame of my thesis was yet to be defined, was that it was easy to approach possible informants because of my gender, which became apparent when they expressed more interest in me as a woman than as a researcher. It became obvious

that my gender had potential to both produce a space for me amongst possible informants and give me a way to enter a specific setting of social life (Stiedenroth, 2014, p. 83). However, I did not feel comfortable using my sexualized position, because I, in some way, felt that I would be taking advantage of some people, while also fearing the possibilities of uncomfortable situations. These experiences therefore changed my approach, and I decided to enter the field through an organization, which is also one of the reasons why I contacted Frè. However, being a young female still affected my interactions in the organizations, which meant that I in certain cases distanced myself from situations, where I could have gained more data.

2.2. Structure of the thesis

While this thesis does not have a general theoretical framework, the use of more specific theories is informed by the general perspective framed by Giddens as structuration, in which Giddens seeks to transcend traditional divisions between structure and agency. Especially relevant for this thesis is his understanding of the dynamics between the two, in terms of how people are "always capable, to some degree, of resisting the constraints imposed on them by society and of influencing and transforming their social situation" (Layder, 2005, p. 133). This does not mean that power relations will necessarily be changed or equalized, but it does infer that people are always capable of acting or resisting, with their possibilities determined by "the resources at one's disposal" (Layder, 2005, p. 141). This provides a point of departure for understanding the actions of the organization within its context. The organization, as an agent, is capable of acting and reacting from its position within a certain set of structures. As I will argue, Frè should be seen as a reaction to the context in which it is located. It is a reaction to the migrants' position in the Chilean society, which is partly defined by the societal structures of the country, the nature between the Haitian migrants and the state, and the characteristics or agency of the migrants.

Following this, it is therefore important to examine the context of the organization to understand the rationale and actions of the organization, including the conditions and constraints it works under. This is the aim of chapter 3; the State and the Migrant. The first section of this chapter, 3.1, will focus on the Chilean state. Here, the current situation of migration in Chile will be accounted for, including the legal framework that partly defines the realities of migrants today. Moreover, the link between the attitude towards migrants in Chile will be examined through a historical perspective which will be related to racism and nationalism in the Chilean society. The second section, 3.2, is a presentation and theorization of Haitian migration, both in general, and more specifically to Chile, including a

brief characterization of the lives of Haitian migrants in Chile. The final section in chapter 3, 3.3, is an analysis of the relationship, or encounter, between the Chilean state and Haitian migrants, which seeks to demonstrate how the position of Haitian migrants in Chile is affected by the Chilean state and society. Although this section will focus mostly on the how the state influences the lives of Haitian migrants, it sets the scene for an important point in this thesis, namely that there are other actors in the space between the state and the migrant.

Chapter 4 is an analysis of the role of the organization in the space between the state and the migrant. In section 4.1, the functions and services offered to Haitian migrants will be examined in relation to objectives and goals of the organization, and in continuation, a characterization of what type of organization Frè is. Further, in section 4.2, interactions between the organization and the state will be analyzed to gain a better understanding of how Frè actively seeks to engage in the space between the state and the migrant, and what these interactions can say about the function of the organization. In the next section, 4.3, the internal dynamics of Frè are investigated, in terms of the motivations and intentions of the volunteers. This will provide a basis for understanding the organization from the inside, and how the volunteers and their expectations and understandings of the organization might impact the efforts of the organization.

Chapter 5 is a conclusion, which aims to summarize and conclude on the findings of this thesis, and answer the question of how the organization plays a role in the space between Haitian migrants and the Chilean state.

Finally, chapter 6, will attempt to put into perspective a question which will not be answered throughout this thesis, namely whether the Chilean state actually has a responsibility towards migrants, who come to Chile looking for better opportunities. Through a brief discussion of different theoretical approaches on the matter, this chapter seeks to insert the findings of this thesis into a larger debate on migration, sovereignty, and human rights.

3. The State and the Migrant

As previously stated, this chapter will provide an insight and understanding of the context that makes up the space in which the organization exists, and the context to which it reacts. This is both in terms of the Chilean state and society, and a characterization of Haitian migrants. This chapter aims to promote a comprehension of the structures and dynamics at play, which are crucial to envisage in order to achieve a better understanding of the organization.

3.1. The Chilean State

This chapter will introduce what I call the state. It includes an introduction to the character of migration to Chile today, including the legal framework which gives a brief introduction to the migration law. Furthermore, a historical view on migration is presented and examined with theoretical concepts by Anthony D. Smith, to understand how ideas of the Chilean national identity have always been connected to migration, and how this affects the view on migrants in Chile today.

3.1.1 Migration to Chile

Today, Chile is experiencing historically high numbers of immigrants, and although the percentage of immigrants among the total population is still lower than the world average, respectively 2% and 3%, the political and popular debate about migration in Chile has reached an all-time high (Reveco & Mullan, 2014, p. 2; Correa, 2016, p. 36; Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015, p. 218).

With the return to democracy in 1990, after the fall of the military dictatorship of Augusto Pinochet, the numbers of migrants coming to Chile rose. This happened in step with the "economic growth, political stability, and perceived social safety" that came to characterize the Chilean society (Reveco & Mullan, 2014, p. 1). The reputation of Chile as economically and politically stable was partly promoted by the Chilean state itself, as it sought to project an image of success to the exterior by emphasizing the prosperity of the country (Polloni & Matus, 2011, p. 15). The tale of success in Chile meant that throughout the 1990s, more people started to migrate to Chile, searching for the "Chilean dream", which offered hopes of jobs and stability (Tijoux, 2016, p. 15). This immigration has mainly been intraregional, south-south migration, due to the proximity and relative success of Chile in a Latin American context, where many countries have been experiencing political and economic instability (Correa, 2016, p. 36). At first, this entailed an increase in migrants from the neighboring countries, Peru, Argentina, and Bolivia, the largest migrant communities in Chile, who throughout the 19th and 20th century had represented a constant flow of migration, particularly to the capital Santiago and the north of Chile (Polloni & Matus, 2011, p. 18). However, in recent years the variation in sending

countries has increased. These 'new immigrants' include Venezuelans, Columbians, Dominicans, and Haitians (Valenzuela, et al., 2014, p. 3). The surge in migrants has put pressure on the legal and social system, which by many considered unprepared in terms of dealing with the realities of migration in Chile today (Reveco & Mullan, 2014, p. 2)

The Legal Framework

The current migration law in Chile, *la ley de inmigración y extranjería*, is from 1975, which means it was developed during the dictatorship of Pinochet. Even though several important modifications and revisions have been made throughout the years, including provisions that give migrants access to public health and education, the law from 1975 is still in use. During the dictatorship, the issue of migration was presented through a discourse of menace and mistrust (Reveco & Mullan, 2014, p. 2; Fernández, 2016). The administrative procedures were therefore instilled with the purpose of complicating the process of immigration, ultimately aiming at protecting national security. The law was created to be inherently selective in terms of who was granted access to the Chilean society, measured by the perceived usefulness of the foreigner (Valenzuela, et al., 2014, p. 107). Although there have been several attempts to change the law from both sides of the political spectrum, the efforts have ultimately ended in failure or oblivion. This means that immigrants in Chile are currently still subjected to the law from 1975, which has several consequences for the lives and opportunities of the migrants, as will be discussed in section 3.3.

Most immigrants enter Chile on a tourist visa, and subsequently have 90 days to regularize their status (Valenzuela, et al., 2014, p. 108). After entering, foreigners can apply for visa of residence. There are four options, namely the visa subjected to contract, which depends on an employment contract, the temporary visa granted to people who can prove familiar attachments or interests in the country, and "whose residence is considered useful and convenient", a student visa for those enrolled in an educational institution, and a permanent residency visa, which can be applied for after two years in Chile with a valid visa (Gobierno de Chile, 2017a; 2017b; 2017c; 2017d)

3.1.2 Migration, Nationalism, and Racism

The increasing numbers of immigrants in Chile, along with the recent change in the origins of migrants, have incited a new level of attention and debate on immigration in Chile today. Attitudes towards immigrants in the Chilean society need to be understood in a historical context and in relation to the Chilean nation and national identity, as migration has always played a role in the process of constituting the 'national' (Correa, 2016, p. 42). This section will explore how the view on migration

today and through history can be seen in relation to the ideas of race and nation that developed in Chile throughout the 19th century. Here, the theoretical contribution of Anthony D. Smith on the concepts race, racism, nation, and nationalism, will be employed to help understand the dynamics at play in the Chilean society.

Throughout the 19th century and the beginning of the 20th century, many European migrants came to Chile, mainly from Germany, Italy, Spain, England and France[2] (Stefoni, 2011, p. 15; Polloni & Matus, 2011, p. 17). This was in part a spontaneous migration, with migrants leaving Europe searching for new opportunities in the New World, but it was also orchestrated by the Chilean state (Polloni & Matus, 2011, p. 14; Stefoni, 2011, p. 34). The state implemented initiatives to attract migrants from Europe, by introducing policies that gave rights to land, free medical care, and resources to initiate industrial activities, which made it lucrative for Europeans to migrate to Chile (Stefoni, 2011, p. 34). At the time, Europeans were praised as developed and modern by those in power in Chile, which contrasted the view on the indigenous peoples (Correa, 2016, p. 42). The arrival of Europeans to especially the south of Chile, which was predominantly populated by indigenous peoples, can be seen as a deliberate attempt to replace the cultural pattern of the indigenous peoples of Chile, and a way to modernize agriculture and incorporate the territory into the national economy, (Palominos, 2016, p. 193; Polloni & Matus, 2011, p. 17; Stefoni, 2011, p. 34). The selective immigration was thereby a strategy of the state to "improve the Chilean race"[3], and ultimately assist in the advancement of Chile as a nation (Correa, 2016, p. 36; Palominos, 2016, p. 188).

Smith defines race as a social group who is believed to share certain characteristics based on their physical appearance (Smith, 1979, p. 87). In Chile, the perception of race was used to identify and exclude indigenous people from the community, in this case, the nation. It can thereby be argued that values assigned to respectively the Europeans and the indigenous peoples were based on racism, as people perceived to belong to a certain race were seen as superior to others belonging to another (perceived) race (Smith, 1979, p. 87). These beliefs created a continuum between the superior, and wanted, Europeans, and the inferior, and unwanted, indigenous peoples. This also assisted in constituting the Chilean national identity as deriving from European descent, and therefore

[2] Migration to Chile also includes other important groups and populations, e.g. Arabs escaping the Ottoman empire, immigrants from ex-Yugoslavia (Croats), who arrived in the mid20th century, and Spanish immigrants fleeing the civil war in Spain (Stefoni, 2011, p. 35, Schwabe, 2016, p. 11).
[3] Own translation. Original quote: "mejorar la raza chilena"

emphasizing the image of the Europeans; modern, white, homogeneous, and successful, while negating the indigenous origins and identities (Palominos, 2016, p. 193; Zeran, 2016, p. 12).

The self-perception of being superior also translates into the image projected by the Chilean state both internally and externally, where a picture of economic and social prosperity has been promoted. Apart from reconstructing the self-image of the Chilean state and the Chilean national identity, it has ultimately also attracted migrants, who are looking for better opportunities. However, many of these immigrants fall victim to a racial hierarchy in Chile, as the idea of the homogenous superior Chilean 'race', can be mirrored in today's attitude towards immigrants from other South American countries. Especially those from Peru, Bolivia, Columbia, the Dominican Republic, and Haiti, are placed in this racial hierarchy (Tijoux, 2016, p. 15; Correa, 2016, p. 36).

An example of this is the different attitudes towards respectively Peruvian and Argentinean migrants in the 1990s. At the time, there were more Argentinean migrants than Peruvian migrants, but only the Peruvians were seen as a threat and as invading Chile (Correa, 2016, p. 39). This discrimination was to a large extent built on certain connotations and prejudices connected to race. Unlike Argentina, Peru is a country with a large number of indigenous peoples, and the Peruvians were therefore inherently positioned in opposition to the 'Chilean whiteness', which is believed to stand in contrast to 'the indigenous' or 'the black' (Correa, 2016, p. 39). Furthermore, these categories entail certain stereotypes, including being 'ugly', 'lazy', 'less developed' etc., which in turn came to characterize Peruvian migrants (Correa, 2016, pp. 39, 40).

The figure of the migrant thereby rests on associations connected to race, and as identified non-nationals, some migrants represent an otherness that could possibly threaten the national coherence. The 'level of threat' evidently depends on how far the migrant differs from the self-image of the Chilean, as some migrants fall into certain racially defined categories. The racial hierarchy in Chile, both through history and today, has been executed to, on the one hand, secure territory thought to belong to the nation, and on the other hand, 'improve the race' or protect the (perceived) coherence of the nation. This can be seen in relation to nationalism, as the state has sought to protect both the autonomy of a territory and the coherence of a specific social group, here the Chilean nation (Smith, 1979, p. 87). Furthermore, the promotion of the Chilean national identity happens through the exclusion of other social groups, in an effort to uphold the exclusiveness of the national community. In this sense, racism, the designation of perceived social groups as superior and others inferior, has been used for nationalist purposes, namely to protect territory and coherence. Through legislation

giving European immigrants rights to land to secure the inclusion of territory into the national economy, based on the perception of being modern and developed, the state thereby favored the presence of Europeans over indigenous peoples as part of the Chilean nation (Palominos, 2016, p. 193). Smith calls this racial nationalism, because race is used as a tool to construct the nation and to differentiate one nation from another (Smith, 1979, pp. 99, 114). In this case, the identification and perception of different 'races', and the actions carried out based on this, were performed to advance the Chilean nation, both in terms of territory and development of the nation.

Ultimately, the unwanted migrants are at risk of being positioned as racial others in the process of reconstituting the Chilean national identity, thus posing a threat to this identity. Migrants, in their role as excluded from the national community, as well as being threats to the cohesion of the nation, thereby become 'a problem' for the Chilean society (Correa, 2016, p. 36). Moreover, many immigrants are also seen as the root of many problems existing in the society (Tijoux, 2016, p. 15). This reinforces the perceived need to exclude these 'others', who based on race are characterized as problems, to protect the nation.

3.2. The Haitian Migrant

Like for many other migrants from South America and the Caribbean, Chile has become an established destination country for Haitian migrants. Haitian migration to Chile is a recent phenomenon, not more than a decade old. Although there are no exact official numbers, Rojas et al. (2017) state that there are approximately 50.000 Haitians in Chile today, with more than 40.000 arriving between 2013 and 2016 (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2017, p. 66). Moreover, the Chilean Police Investigation department estimates that in 2017, around 48.000 Haitian migrants will enter Chile (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2017, p. 74). Although Haitians are far from the largest migrant community in Chile, the remarkable exponential growth of Haitians entering Chile demands attention and further enquiry.

To better grasp migration from Haiti to Chile, this chapter will apply Hein de Haas' multifaceted understanding of migration. De Haas states that prevailing migration theories are too abstract and fail to provide an adequate framework for understanding migration, and social change in general (de Haas, 2014, p. 4). Instead he gives preference to a combination of fragmented insights from different theories, aiming to develop a more "*contextualized* theorization of migration" (de Haas, 2014, p. 13). By employing de Haas's view on migration theories, this chapter seeks to theorize and contextualize Haitian migration, and more specifically Haitian migration to Chile.

3.2.1. Theorizing Haitian Migration

Haiti, the poorest country and the only labeled failed state in the Americas[4], is a country marked by many years of political instability and natural disasters (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015, p. 221). Due to factors like social inequality, political instability, and the inability of the state to help its people, natural disasters, like the earthquake in 2010, have had fatal consequences for the population. Furthermore, ecological disaster, which has plagued the country for more than 40 years, means that the conditions of land for cultivation are very poor, making it difficult to maintain agriculture at a sustainable level (Ferguson, 2003, p. 9). These circumstances have exacerbated the vulnerable position of the population, and has created a continuous humanitarian crisis (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015, p. 222).

Considering the prolongation of both political and humanitarian crisis in Haiti, it is problematic to name one specific reason or cause for migration. Furthermore, as will be elaborated later, the possible destination countries of Haitian migrants vary, and depend on both social, economic, and political factors. Considering de Haas' ideas of migration, it is important to reflect on both the aspirations and capabilities of the potential migrants, as well as the structural conditions in both sending country and possible receiving countries, along with the migrants' perceptions of these.

Three main patterns can be observed when looking at destination countries of Haitian migrants. The first group includes people who seek towards the United States, Canada, or France. The second group has in recent years typically migrated to Brazil or Chile, while the last group who historically has sought towards the Dominican Republic, is now increasingly also migrating to Chile (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2016, p. 8). The differences between the groups correspond to the degree of economic, social, and cultural capital, or what de Haas calls the migrants' aspirations and capabilities. De Haas advocates for seeing migration "as a function of migration *aspirations* and migration *capabilities*", within a "given set of opportunity structures", thereby recognizing the co-depending roles of agency and structure (de Haas, 2014, pp. 23, 33). Migrant capabilities reflect the migrants' ability to control their own life, in this case, the capability of choosing where to live. The degree of freedom to choose depends on access to social, economic, and human capital (de Haas, 2014, pp. 25, 26). Migrant aspirations "are a function of people's general life aspirations and perceived spatial opportunity structures" (de Haas, 2014, p. 23). This is a way of considering subjective agency of the migrant, recognizing that not all migrants respond in the same way to external factors. Migration

[4] According to the Failed State Index from 2016, Haiti was the only state characterized as being "failed or fragile" in the Americas (Fund for Peace, 2017).

capabilities and aspirations are connected to certain structures, both in the countries of origin and the possible destination countries, which create 'complex opportunity structures'. These structures can both enable and hinder migration ambitions and opportunities, and affect people in various ways, depending on age, gender, skill, class, ethnic, and regional affiliations. In other words, structures can "simultaneously constrain the migration of particular groups while facilitating the migration of other groups" (de Haas, 2014, p. 29).

The first group, those migrating to North America or Europe, has more economic and social resources, and is therefore able to migrate to places where these capabilities are necessary. Furthermore, their aspirations are oriented towards personal development and 'cosmopolitan aspirations' (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2016, p. 10). In the same way, the second group is often driven by aspirations of better job opportunities, and personal development. However, this group does not possess the same resources or capital as the first group. Therefore, these migrants look towards other countries perceived to have the same opportunities, but are more attainable, in this case Brazil or Chile. These aspirations, and the groups' perceptions of the opportunities and risks connected to possible destination countries, ultimately play a great role when choosing a destination country. According to Rojas et. al (2015, 2016), there exist certain perceptions, or imaginings, concerning Chile as a destination country. Although it is not seen as being equally close in cultural or linguistic aspects, as e.g. France, Canada, or Brazil, it is seen as a prosperous country, with political stability and good economic opportunities (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2016, pp. 9, 10).

The last group is the group with the least capabilities. This group has normally sought towards the Dominican Republic, a labor migration that became regularized when the United States occupied Haiti from 1915-1934 (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015, p. 221). Haiti and the Dominican Republic share borders, which makes the Dominican Republic a destination country available for those with scarce resources. However, in later years, the legal status of Haitian migrants in the Dominican Republic has become problematized through new regulations, and racist attitudes of superiority towards the Haitians have become more prominent (Ferguson, 2003, pp. 4, 9). For this group, migrating is an immediate need in terms of economic necessities, which in turn leads potential migrants to take greater economic risks, e.g. by migrating to Chile.

Furthermore, it is important to consider migration within a "given set of opportunities and structures" (de Haas, 2014, p. 4). In the case of the three groups, it is important to consider that each group through certain aspects is subjected to different structures, which, for some, - those with networks,

and easier access to legal migration - makes it easier to migrate while making it impossible for others. Structures within Haiti are therefore important in terms of defining the scope of possible migration countries. Moreover, structures in possible destination countries also play a meaningful role, as restrictive migration policies in e.g. the United States and countries in Europe, and institutional racism in the Dominican Republic, affect the choices of the Haitian migrants (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015, p. 221).

Although Chile is geographically further away than other destination countries, and culturally and linguistically different from Haiti, the aspirations and capabilities of possible migrants, as well as the structural conditions in Haiti and the (assumed) structural conditions in Chile, have turned the country into a popular destination for many Haitians, especially due to perceived opportunities in terms of work, personal development, legal entry, and a less racist society (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2016, p. 7).

3.2.2. Living in Chile

Like most migrants in Chile, the majority of Haitians reside in the capital Santiago, the economic centrum of Chile. Haitians arrive to Santiago by plane via Panama with a tourist visa, which provides a regular and legal entry point to Chile. Most Haitians live in low-income municipalities marked by poor access to public services and high levels of insecurity. Furthermore, due to stigmatization, economic status, and the language barrier, Haitians are often forced to live in demeaning conditions, and are at great risk of being conned by landlords (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2016, p. 10). Haitian migrants mostly perform unqualified work, such as construction, washing cars, working in gas stations, or in warehouses for men, while women primarily work in cleaning or sales. They often work more hours than what is allowed, for a lower salary, and sometimes in illegal and dangerous conditions (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015, p. 224).

Although not all Haitian migrants face the same problems in Chile, it is possible to state three obstacles that are common to most Haitians. The first is the institutional barrier created by the institutional complexities of the migration law, which makes it difficult to obtain a regular status. The second is the language barrier. Haitians speak Creole and French, which means that most Haitians arrive to Chile with no, or very limited, Spanish skills. The third are the prejudices that exist in the Chilean society, both in terms of race, as explained in the previous chapter, and the lack of knowledge of Haiti, predominantly associated with underdevelopment and poverty, which validates social-

cultural exclusion rooted in racism (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2016, p. 10; Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015).

3.3. The Encounter between the Chilean State and the Haitian Migrant

The next section will attempt to understand the structures and dynamics at play, when speaking about the state and the migrant, more specifically contextualized in the encounter between the Chilean state and the Haitian migrant. The point of departure for this section is the seemingly complicated position of migrants in Chile, especially in terms of laws and policies. This presumes uneven power relations, which infers the position of the migrant as an outsider, or even excluded, in the context of the nation-state. Theoretical points by Sarah S. Willen on criminalization of migrants will be considered to help shed light on these relations. In her work, Willen raises several interesting issues regarding both the use and the effect of the often contested concepts illegal, illegality and irregular. Through her work, Willen seeks to problematize the careless use of the concepts, which ignores the forces behind the words and the consequences their use can have (Willen, 2007, pp. 12, 27). Willen continuously uses "illegality", because while she recognizes that it is contested and negatively charged, she found that it was used in the field by state and immigrants alike, which she believes legitimizes using it for analytical purposes. Therefore, when using Willen's theoretical approach, I will also use "illegal" and "illegality".

As stated earlier, most Haitian migrants enter Chile legally with a tourist visa. In most cases, this eliminates the necessity for illegal entry, which is otherwise one of the main causes for illegality (Willen, 2007, p. 2). However, policies of the Chilean state, particularly the migration law from 1975, complicate regularization of migrants. As most migrants, including the Haitian migrants, come to Chile with the goal of finding employment, their tourist visa does not suffice in achieving a legal status in Chile, although it does provide legal entry. Examples of this are the complications connected to obtaining a visa subjected to contract, where the migrant must have a valid employment contract, including a clause stating that the employer will pay the ticket to the home country when the job terminates (Valenzuela, et al., 2014, p. 108). As many employers are not willing to do this, migrants are often forced to, unofficially, renounce these rights. In other cases, migrants buy fake contracts to apply for the visa, because they are unable to fulfil the demands otherwise (Valenzuela, et al., 2014, pp. 108, 109). Following arguments made by Willen, the effects of the status of illegal depend on how the state treats this theme. Schemes employed by the state can further intensify the effects of a migrant's status, for example through "sophisticated state techniques of surveillance and discipline",

which can turn migrants into ‘wanted criminals’ (Willen, 2007, pp. 2, 13). The complexities concerning the regularization of migration status, like the examples above, can be seen as state techniques which leave few (legal) options for regularization. Instead many migrants become illegal or are forced to become involved in illegal acts, as those described above, in order to regularize their status. This can be a vicious circle, as the legal status, if achieved through illegal measures, will be affected by unlawfulness, and can risk permeating other elements of a migrant’s life.

Willen’s idea of state-techniques should also be considered in relation to the complications connected to the actual process of applying and obtaining a visa. Although a person might qualify for a visa, the priest told me that it can take months to have an application transmitted, in part because the number of applications exceeds the capacity of the department in charge of processing them. Further, the priest had been told that the department of alien status and migration had given all applications from Haitians and Venezuelans to another division, located under the Police Investigation department, for them to process the applications. Initiatives or state techniques like these can complicate the process of obtaining a legal status.

As mentioned earlier, although the migration law in Chile is from 1975, and holds many complications for achieving legal residency, there are certain rights that can be enjoyed by migrants, such as access to public health and education disregarding the status of the migrant. This means that the migrant is not completely excluded or without rights. Furthermore, I heard from other volunteers that Haitians could not be deported before they had been in front of a judge, which gives them a certain degree of status in the justice system. In this sense, it can be argued that the Haitian migrants have possibilities in the Chilean society, and are not necessarily deemed to a life permeated by exclusion and illegality.

Nevertheless, Willen argues that criminalization and perceptions of illegality can create a consensus in society, where the migrant becomes criminalized merely through their presence (Willen, 2007, pp. 2, 9). Thereby, the status of a migrant is also cemented in how the public host society views them, through their bodily presence, often connected to perceptions of irregularity. This is especially true for those whose appearance differs from the norm of the host society, as their ‘otherness’ is painted on their skin (Willen, 2007, p. 17). This can be seen as true in a Chilean context, where the existence of racial nationalism means that migrants are judged based on their perceived racial category. ‘The other’ is identified based on race, which also determines the perceived level of threat, which in turn can incite exclusion based on appearance. This exclusion infers a feeling of non-belonging, and is

contrasted by the inclusion of the regular citizens (Willen, 2007, p. 2). According to Rojas et al., Haitians in Chile experience racial prejudices, especially based on the perceptions of Haiti as an underdeveloped country, which infers a view on Haitians as being of a lower class (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2015, p. 225). Furthermore, until this year (2017), there has been no agreement between Chile and Haiti enabling Haitians to verify their studies in Chile. This has played into the image of Haitians as uneducated, generating a general disapproval of their qualifications. Most Haitians are therefore restricted to taking unqualified jobs, as they, qua the lack of agreement of verification of studies, arrive to Chile with no recognized educational background (Rojas Pedemonte, et al., 2017, p. 79).

In continuation, it is possible to talk about a socio-spatial segregation, as most Haitians live in low income neighborhoods, where access to public services is poor and the level of insecurity is high. Willen argues how the mark of illegality, or other state techniques that can exclude migrants, can be a catalyst for situations of abjectivity (Willen, 2007, p. 11). Despite the fact that illegality might not perhaps be a suited concept to use on many Haitians in Chile, it is possible to conclude that the state and structures in society can complicate the lives of Haitian migrants, which in some cases can lead to abjectivity. From what the Haitians coming to the organization told me, my understanding is that many of them lived in miserable conditions in poor neighborhoods, had to take informal jobs, and in some cases, could not afford rent or food.

This chapter has demonstrated that the space between the migrant and the state, and the relationship between them, are formed by structures of the destination society and the characteristics of the migrants. Following the arguments by some scholars, in this thesis represented by the perspectives of Willen, this space is characterized by state techniques and excluding discourses that make it difficult for immigrants to claim rights and seize opportunities within the existing structures (Nicholls, 2013, pp. 226, 227; Willen, 2007). However, although e.g. Willen recognizes the agency of migrants, this point of view does not consider other actors who may influence the migrant-state relationship. The next chapter will provide a response to this, by examining how Frè can be seen as an actor in the space between Haitian migrants and the Chilean state.

4. The Organization

The previous chapters have provided a framework for understanding and discussing Haitian migrants and the Chilean state and nation, which make up the context in which Frè is located, and to which it responds. To understand the organization, and its role between Haitian migrants and the state, this chapter will provide an analysis of the organization, and attempt to answer questions such as how we may understand Frè, in terms of what type of organization it is, considering services, functions, and objectives, how it interacts with the state, and how internal dynamics and motivations of the volunteers affect the workings of the organization. To help answer these questions and to interpret my empirical data, I have chosen to look at two bodies of literature about non-profit organizations and social movements. Literature on non-profit organizations includes work by Helmut K. Anheier (2005) and Pascale Joassart-Marcelli (2013). Anheier provides an analysis of non-profit organizations in Western societies. His interdisciplinary research on the different types of organizations and their purposes will be employed to characterize the organization according to their services, functions, and objectives. Joassart-Marcelli works on non-profit organizations that provide services to immigrants in Boston, in the United States, and the levels of services and help that are available to foreign-born populations in different areas of the region. This will be used to examine how Frè can be seen as a provider of public services and the workings of the organization in relation to the state. Although neither author deals with the Chilean context, nor a South American context, they provide useful contributions with which to analyze the organization. Additionally, this analysis will apply the concept of social movement through literature by David S. Meyer (2002), Graeme Chester and Ian Welsh (2011), and Marc Edelman (2001).

Theoretical conceptions concerning the concept of social movement can be useful to analyze Frè as an actor in the space between the migrant and the state, as it enables a perspective of Frè as a reaction and a response to its context. It is important to note that 'social movement' is a contested concept with a long history of enquiry, and has been the object of much discussion of the relation between "contemporary developments and established approaches" (Chesters & Welsh, 2011, p. 1). Just as I do not wish to label Frè as a social movement, nor state that it necessarily should be seen as one, I do not wish to ascribe to one approach, or engage in an in-depth discussion on the different directions. However, to understand the applicability of social movements to this case, it is important to, briefly, delineate some of the most prominent positions and developments within the vast field of social movements theory.

Among these positions, is the Marxist approach that focused on labor movements and "viewed conflict in capitalist societies as revolving around the fundamental contradiction between the bourgeoisie and the proletariat", making the main conflict the discord between "labor and capital in industrial societies" (Edelman, 2011, p. 288). Later, in a postindustrial society, the points of crises were increasingly conflicts based on identity politics, focusing on "symbolic, informational, and cultural resources and rights to specificity and differences" (Edelman, 2011, p. 289). To mark the difference from the labor movements, movements engaged in these struggles were called 'new social movements'. While this direction has been more prevalent in Europe, the most popular American counterpart has been the concept of 'resource mobilization'. This is a more 'strategy oriented paradigm', where the rational actor and the movements are considered in terms of "analyzing resources – material, human, cognitive, technical, and organizational", thereby focusing more on "resource availability and preference structure" (Edelman, 2011, p. 289). Here, the actors are not those who are most affected by the conflict or point of interest, but instead socially connected groups. The measure of success is therefore also different, as it through resource mobilization is understood as "the achievement of policy objectives rather than in relation to broader process of cultural transformation" which is the objective of new social movements (Edelman, 2011, p. 290).

Chester and Welsh attempt to create a common concord of the social movement directions stating that:

> *"old, new [social movements] can be thought of as historically and spatially located expressions of social and cultural responses to prevailing political and economic dynamics. Put another way, in each epoch key aspects of social, sexual, cultural, racial, political and economic equality and equity are contested by social movements utilizing the range of resources available in a given place and at a given time"* (Chesters & Welsh, 2011, pp. 1, 2).

This will be the point of departure for using social movements to understand Frè. As will be elaborated in the analysis, the structural and societal conditions have shaped the existence and character of the organization. Frè can be seen as a reaction to the structural and societal conditions that produce the context in which the organization exists, or more specifically a reaction to how these shape the life conditions of the Haitian migrants in Chile.

This chapter will examine how the organization works in the space between the state and the migrant, and how it can be seen as a reaction to its context, in terms of trying to circumvent and object to certain structures in the Chilean society through helping Haitian migrants. To begin with, the services

and functions offered by the organization are considered in relation to the Haitian migrants and their needs. This is used to look at the characteristics and workings of Frè as an organization, also encompassing its goals and objectives. Next, the interactions between the organization and the state is examined, including how the organization engages and intervenes in the relationship between the migrant and the state, and what effect this may have for the organization and the migrants. The last section will consider the internal dynamics of the organization by analyzing the motivations and intentions of the volunteers. This is both in terms of their view on the role of the organization, and their own participation, and ultimately how these can affect (the workings of) the organization.

4.1. Frè and the Migrants: *"Helping started as a natural thing"*

"… Little by little it was put together, what we now have in the church. Naturally, together with the classes came the breakfast, because I saw that they were hungry. Naturally, seeing them in July without anything but a shirt… freezing obviously… I got the idea of handing out clothes from my closet, from other friends, from… I don't know, family, from all sides. Helping started as a natural thing, clothes and then food and so on. And the curriculum, I realized that in fact, they did not have access to a curriculum in Spanish... in the center, they always charged them for each page, and they were always poorly made, they didn't speak a lot of Spanish …"

Excerpt from interview with Juan Carlos Cortez, April 27th, 2017

Joassart-Marcelli states that immigrants have to "deal with a multitude of complex and challenging tasks to settle and integrate in a new place" (Joassart-Marcelli, 2013, p. 731). In chapter 3, it was established how the structural conditions in Chile, the multiple reasons for migrating, and the specific difficulties of the Haitian migrants in Chile, construct the conditions under which Haitian migrants live. This includes institutional complexities created by the migration law, the attitude towards immigrants affected by racial nationalism, and other practical obstacles including learning the Spanish language. Combined, these difficulties can hinder possibilities of integration for Haitian migrants in the Chilean society. Here, the role of the organization becomes apparent through the services and functions it offers to Haitian migrants. The need for such 'help' is flagged by Joassart-Marcelli who argues that "the multifaceted economic, social, and emotional costs of migration and

integration into a foreign place […] cannot be borne by individuals and families alone" (Joassart-Marcelli, 2013, p. 731). Hereby, organizations can be seen as actors that help migrants with the challenges and obstacles they face, which in certain contexts can seem insurmountable. In Frè, the services provided emerged in step with needs expressed by the Haitians coming to the church, or needs as observed and interpreted by the volunteers. Learning Spanish was the first objective, as this is the most apparent cultural difference that sets Haitian migrants apart from most other migrants in Chile, and therefore also the first impulse of the priest when he invited the first Haitians into the church. Later, the volunteers experienced that many attendees arrived hungry to the classes, which gave reason for the daily breakfast serving. During the first winter, it became apparent that Haitians were not prepared for the cold, which motivated a collection of winter clothes. As the Haitian migrants' primary concern was finding jobs to earn money, the organization helped with making curricula vitae, and helped looking for job opportunities by creating a job bank. Furthermore, problems with obtaining visas and problems with employers prompted the establishment of a legal aid department.

Frè describes itself as a non-profit charitable organization, whose purpose is to welcome, accompany, and help Haitian migrants, who have chosen to come to Chile. In terms of the provided services, the description covers the broad range of activities of the organization. Firstly, the charitable elements can be seen in the services that are concerned with immediate needs, or in other words, those that are concerned with survival. Clothes and food are examples of immediate needs, needs that stress the abject and vulnerable position of many Haitians in Santiago. In this sense, the organization attempts to exercise a form of poverty relief by meeting the most pressing needs. Further, this can also be seen in the light of the religious context of the organization, as religious organizations through history have fulfilled human and social needs in the broader community, "beyond the spiritual needs of their own members", often through charitable acts that are central to many religions (Anheier, 2005, pp. 106, 8). Although the organization today does not proclaim to have religious anchorage, it is undeniable that the origin of the organization should be seen in the context of being a charitable religious cause, as it was started by a priest in church facilities, introducing charitable acts that were meant for a broader audience than the parish.

Though the services aiming to meet immediate needs are not necessarily connected to a political agenda, the choice of beneficiaries is a politically charged selection. Commonly understood, charity should "benefit the public as a whole, or large segments of it" (Anheier, 2005, p. 44). In this sense, the choice of beneficiaries gives the charitable functions of Frè a selective twist, where they appoint

what they believe to be one of the most vulnerable groups in the Chilean society. This can create complications however, especially in its connection to the church. The priest told me that sometimes Chilean citizens would come to the organization, at this point located in the facilities of the church, to ask for help. The priest had to deny them help, as the benefits and efforts of the organization are intended for migrants, and more specifically, Haitian migrants. In the concentration of their effort, the organization leaves out other people who might also be poor, hungry, need clothes, etc. Through this, the sole distinction between who is a beneficiary and who is not, becomes whether the person is from Haiti or not, instead of whether the person is poor or jobless. Moving past the charitable religious elements that should benefit the broader community or larger segments of the public, the charitable services of the organization instead lean on a political agenda, as they take a stand on a topic within a highly political field, namely migration, through their services and beneficiaries.

Frè also seeks to facilitate integration of the Haitian migrants into the Chilean society, which is articulated in their mission written on their Facebook page as: "promoting social integration [of Haitian migrants]"[5]. Here, the organization attempts to meet long-term challenges, coinciding with what Joassart-Marcelli labels as social, cultural, and political integration, civic participation, "upward mobility", and in some cases vulnerability (Joassart-Marcelli, 2013, pp. 731, 738). Through activities such as Spanish classes, the job bank, making curricula vitae, and legal aid, the organization attempts to provide options for the Haitians which they might not have had access to otherwise. In this sense, the organization identifies the conditions that they believe, or experience, hinder integration, and consequently attempt to give Haitians a chance of becoming integrated, whether this is in terms of economic, social, cultural, or legal aspects. In this sense, by teaching Spanish, helping with job search, and providing legal aid, the organization attempts to facilitate the Haitian migrants' insertion into the society, by offering not just survival in the excluded position they might be in, but opportunities that are not awarded by the state or otherwise available for them. The organization thereby assumes a mediating role between the Haitian migrants and the Chilean society, by attempting to reduce or minimize the impediments of the (structural) obstacles that stand in the way of integration.

By assuming a mediating role and identifying obstacles hindering integration, Frè offers an implicit critique of the Chilean society. Through its functions and services, the organization criticizes laws, policies, and societal structures, which cause the vulnerable position of Haitians, and try to counteract them. In terms of critique, the services can mainly be regarded as stop-gap solutions, where the

[5] https://www.facebook.com/pg/SomosFre/about/?ref=page_internal

organization tries to curb what it sees as the failings of the state and society in general. However, the organization also attempts to voice its critique publicly. Through appearances and statements in radio shows, tv segments, and news articles[6], and participation in demonstrations protesting the current migration law, the direction of Frè publicly comments on the situation of Haitian migrants in Chile. The publicity it attempts to generate is both concerned with openly disapproving laws, both existing and forthcoming, while also making suggestions for possible solutions, and showing the reality of Haitians living in Chile. This is also a way of appealing to the Chilean public by attempting to create a foundation for understanding the situation of Haitians, both by demonstrating the conditions under which they live, but also by trying to circumvent and possibly eliminate the prejudices that exist in the Chilean society, as explained previously.

In terms of the objectives of Frè, as mentioned above, it is useful to consider them in respect to the different directions of social movements theory. On the one hand, the organization seeks to create awareness of the complications, and injustices of the migration laws, and ultimately advocate changes in policy. This is similar to the view on social movements in the resource mobilization approach, where the criterion for success is seen through "achievement of policy objectives" in terms of changes in migration law and the like (Edelman, 2011, p. 290). On the other hand, the organization also seeks to create a change in terms of a "broader process of cultural transformation", which characterizes new social movements theory (Edelman, 2011, p. 290). As stated by Juan Carlos Cortez, the priest, in the epigraph of this thesis, creating social and cultural change is a definite objective, as he says, "we have to generate a change in mentality", something which is further elaborated by the organization in its mission, as it seeks to generate a welcoming mentality of harmonious social co-existence in the national community. This points to a wish to change the position and image of Haitians in the Chilean society. However, following the new social movements theory, traditionally, social movements struggling for a change in the "relations of domination characteristics of the "way of life"" are characterized by the capacity of the affected actors to collectively act for themselves (Edelman, 2011, p. 288). In the case of Frè, it is not the subjects/actors themselves who act, but Chilean volunteers who act on their behalf, as is more commonly seen in resource mobilization, where collective action takes form through socially connected interest groups (Edelman, 2011, p. 289). This can ultimately

[6] Examples: http://www.revistasur.cl/revistasur.cl/2017/07/migracion-haitiana-hacia-el-sur-andino-y-fundacion-fre/ http://www.24horas.cl/nacional/incertidumbre-por-proyecto-que-exigiria-visa-a-ciudadanos-haitianos-en-chile-2445400 http://www.biobiochile.cl/especial/noticias/copa-confederaciones/la-roja-copa-confederaciones/2017/06/23/la-euforica-celebracion-de-un-grupo-de-haitianos-tras-el-gol-de-alexis-sanchez.shtml

affect the workings of the organization, a point which will be elaborated and discussed later in the analysis.

The next section will analyze how the organization intervenes and acts in the migrant-state relationship, how the organization interacts with the state, and how this might affect the objectives of the organization.

4.2. Frè and the State: "*Please don't get into trouble*"

Today, during the weekly messages, the priest announced a forthcoming event; an official from the Alien Status and Immigration Department would visit the parish within the next few weeks. The priest explained that the idea was to show the government official the organization, and it would be an opportunity for the Haitians to ask him questions, and even complain; because the officials often don't know what happens (on the ground). As Noel, the priest's Haitian counterpart, translated this message in creole, I noticed that many Haitians look confused and even uncomfortable. Maybe the priest noticed this as well because he promptly reminded them that the government official could not deport anyone, not in this situation, nor in others. He explained that the only way a person can be deported, is if it is ordered by a judge. In continuation, the priest mentioned a trend among the Haitians; buying fake employment contracts to obtain a visa. He announced that this has now become illegal [I wondered why this had not been illegal before…], and stated that the laws keep changing. He said: "My advice is, instead of buying a contract that will not help you and is illegal, save your money to buy an extension of the tourist visa. Please don't get into trouble!"

Claudio, a volunteer, who was sitting next to me, whispered that he believed this change in law, making the purchase of fake contracts illegal, was just an excuse to be able to deport the Haitians for doing something illegal; "they are good people, they don't do anything wrong".

Fieldnotes, San Saturnino, April 15th, 2017

Whether talking about immediate needs or measures to promote integration into society, Frè takes on the role as a mediator and provider of services for Haitian migrants. Immigration measures like these are often seen as "a national policy concern" performed by the state, but as Joassart-Marcelli describes, states that are not accustomed to high numbers of immigrants, are often "ill-prepared" to

meet the needs of immigrants (Joassart-Marcelli, 2013, pp. 731, 732). Combined with political conflicts on immigration matters, this has resulted in restructuring of state policies that seek to restrict the availability of rights and services to immigrants, often also connected to the cutbacks in costs in ventures and institutions that deal with immigrants (Joassart-Marcelli, 2013, pp. 735, 737). These regulations and cutbacks have resulted in a transfer of responsibility to help immigrants by states to local governments and non-profit organizations, like Frè (Joassart-Marcelli, 2013, p. 734).

Rather than only taking on the role of service provider, Frè has an additional agenda. Taking on the role of mediator, Frè attempts to facilitate a form of contact between the state or local government and the migrants, and in this sense, tries to break the barriers of exclusion faced by many migrants. In the story told in the vignette above, the organization attempts to create an encounter between the state, here represented by a government official, and the migrants. In other words, the organization seeks to make the migrants visible to the state. By inviting a government official into the facilities of the organization, they seek to create an available pathway for the migrants to claim rights from the state, or at least have the opportunity to be seen and heard, something which can otherwise be difficult due to the exclusion felt by some migrants. As this happens in a safe place, namely at the facilities of the organization, the Haitians are in a place of comfort, where they are not excluded, but included. In this way, the organization acts as protector of the migrants in their interaction with the state. This is especially clear through the priest's emphasis on their right to complain, focusing on the encounter as an opportunity to claim rights from the state, and not an opportunity for the state to further exclude the migrants.

Another example of this aspect of Frè's work, is the legal representation that is available through the organization, where the Haitians have opportunities to file a lawsuit if they have not been fairly treated. Instead of subduing to the pervasion of illegality, e.g. by working in illegal conditions without possibilities to change anything, they now have opportunities to object. As discussed in chapter 3.3, in Chile, the migrants are not necessarily excluded from the legal system qua access to health care, etc. However, as becomes clear when the priest emphasizes that they cannot easily be deported, many migrants might not be aware of their rights, or how to claim them. When the organization acts as a link between the migrants and the state, the organization minimizes the distance between the two, and attempts to circumvent the structural and practical obstacles that can hinder the migrants' possibilities to object or claim rights.

Further, the organization also plays an active role in the relation between the state and the migrants. In the vignette, it is evident that the organization, here represented by the priest, advices the migrants on how to navigate within the existing space, thereby directly affecting the movement and strategies of the migrants. The priest talks about the newly instituted illegalization of the purchase of fake contracts used to obtain a visa subjected to contract, and warns the Haitians against buying these. He says that it is "stupid", and instead he advices them to save their money and buy an extension of their tourist visa. In this case, the priest, and the organization, try to guide the Haitians in how to navigate the system, or how to act in the meeting with the state, or in other words, how to avoid falling victim to state techniques like these. Again, this is an example of how the organization acts as protector of the migrants, as they express that they do not want them to get into trouble. Following the perspective of Claudio, the volunteer, who sees the illegalization as a way of affecting the Haitian migrants, the migrants are "good people", who do not do anything wrong. However, simultaneously, there is a recognition that dynamics between the state and the migrant can force migrants to perform illegal activities, as the priest talk about the purchase of fake contracts as a likely situation. While recognizing that this is the reality for many of the Haitian migrants, the organization attempts to offer other opportunities, for example as in this case, by offering advice on how to avoid this path of criminalization.

Considering the provision of services, advice, and the help to claim rights, the organization can be seen as substitution for the state, and a substitute for the protection otherwise awarded to citizens by the state. As those outside the national community are excluded through amongst other things state techniques enabling criminalization, the state can in this way avoid responsibility of providing certain rights. Here it is relevant to include a story I heard from the priest and other volunteers. In despair over the facilities of the church, which were too small and decrepit, the priest had gone to the municipality to ask for a new location for the organization. He had told them that although the municipality did not have the responsibility to help him, he believed they should provide new facilities, as he, and the organization, were doing their job without any real obligation to do so. He further threatened to stop the activities of the organization, and instead give all the Haitians the address of the municipality and tell them to go there. When the priest told me this, he mentioned that he was embarrassed by his behavior, and that it was "super stupid". However, he was motivated by the approaching winter, and the poor conditions he could offer the Haitians in the church facilities. In the end, it worked, as the municipality arranged a meeting to discuss the possibilities for securing a new location for the next day.

This story raises some interesting points. The first is that, even though many migrants have difficulties claiming rights, the municipality can be seen as recognizing responsibility, as they responded to the threat of the priest, who said he was doing their job. From this, it can be argued that the migrants are within the responsibility of the state, here represented by a local government institution. However, through state techniques and discourse of exclusion it is made more difficult for migrants to claim rights. Their socio-economic status and the illegality that in many cases affects their lives in some way, e.g. an overstayed visa, working in informal jobs or in illegal conditions, prevent or disable many people from claiming their rights.

When the priest admits that the municipality has no obligation towards him, he also argues that he is not obligated to do the work he is doing either. Through this, he creates an obligation for the municipality to help him, or maybe, he is aware that the municipality is unwilling to help, which gives him leverage to raise demands. He uses his position as an included citizen, and more so; a priest, to achieve objectives, which in turn enable him, and the organization, to help those who do not have the opportunity to make demands themselves. However, there is also an alternative explanation that needs to be considered. Instead of seeing the response of the municipality as a recognition of responsibility, it can be seen as a way for them to avoid the work and use of resources to process cases, and reject migrants, and the uncomfortable situations it might bring. Seen through this, the work of the priest and the organization will save the municipality working hours and resources, regardless of whether the employees at the municipality believe it is their responsibility or not.

When I, on another occasion, asked the priest if he thought the organization was doing the job of the state, his first response was “absolutely”. He went on to talk about how, as believers, performing acts of charity was part of practicing faith, and that the church was not an NGO, supposedly referring to how the organization began in the church. However, then he continued by criticizing the state, or more specifically, the effect of the politics of the Chilean state, and the changing governments. He stated that although many see Chile as a developed country, with less corruption etc., than in many other countries, it is still not ‘developed’ in his view, particularly due to the implications of a system marked by partisan politics, referencing to how the different political parties in power can (and do) change the stately institutions in line with their politics, including the health system and the educational system. From this, it is possible to state that, other than a general discontent with the political system in Chile, the priest believes that the services provided by the organization should be performed by the state, but that the state in Chile is incapable of doing it. In this sense, he presents a

vision for how he believes, or wishes, a state should help immigrants, but also recognizes that this is not the reality in Chile, thereby emphasizing the necessity of the work of the organization.

However, when the organization carries out activities and duties that in some contexts are performed by the state, it can be argued that it helps, or at least enables, the state to avoid these responsibilities. Although there are no guarantees that the state would help, particularly when considering the structural obstacles that can hinder a migrant's claim to rights, the municipality's response to the priest implies that either there is a consciousness that they are responsible, at least to some degree, or a more pragmatic approach where the municipality can avoid problems with a minimum of resources. The organization thereby, in some sense, promotes the interests of the municipality, and participates in the existing structures, despite that the original goal was to protest or break with these. This further complicates the organization's position between the migrant and the state; it responds to the needs of the migrant, which exist because of the absence of the state or exclusion from the state, while simultaneously enabling the state to be absent. The organization is in a position where it can demand things from the state or local government, and facilitate a connection between the migrant and the state, and through this invoke rights that may have been absent or unreachable. However, by doing this, they create a way for the state and local government to avoid doing anything, and instead of actually breaking with structures, in some sense, they instead allow the state to continue politics of exclusion.

Joassart-Marcelli makes the argument that although non-profit organizations provide many services for immigrants, most organizations are not able to "succeed without financial support from the public sector", which means that many of these organizations "rely heavily on government contracts and grants to finance their operations" (Joassart-Marcelli, 2013, pp. 740, 732). Frè has since it started in 2016 relied on funds from fundraising events, such as a Christmas event, and donations from private persons or donations through the church. However, now the organization has applied for public funds, through different stately instances. This means that, in the long run, the organization can become at least partly dependent on public funding, and in this sense, not completely independent from the influence of stately institutions as it, to receive these funds, must target its efforts to fit the objectives of those providing the funds. I witnessed an example of this when the direction of the organization wanted to apply for the national public security fund. However, as this funding was meant to increase public safety, implying the public safety of Chilean citizens, the application had to be framed within this scheme, meaning that the work the organization is doing had to be positioned within a framework of security and public safety, which in some sense makes the presence of the Haitian migrants a public

safety concern. Ultimately, this can be seen as going against the objectives of the organization, as they end up reproducing certain prejudices and structures, or participating in the discourse that feeds acts of exclusion, instead of breaking with these to facilitate integration of Haitian migrants.

Thus, even though the organization can be seen as a substitute for the (absent) state, it is not completely able to distance itself from the state, as it in some way will be dependent on the state. In this sense, by acting as a substitute by performing services and facilitating rights otherwise awarded by the state, and by partly being financially dependent on the state, the organization risks becoming an extension of the state, or performing the state's agenda, both in terms of the interest they present when applying for, and receiving, public funds, but also in terms of inserting themselves in the discourse of the state.

The next section will examine the volunteers' different motivations and perceptions of the role of the organization, and how this may affect the workings of Frè.

4.3. The Volunteers: "*Arrogance has never suited me well*"

Volunteer 1: "Thank you. I hereby finish my work with the parish. [I'm] very grateful for the opportunity and love that you have given me. But I simply cannot betray myself, working with someone whose methods I don't share. Arrogance has never suited me well."

Volunteer 2: "In my opinion, I think that we should seek a solution to the core problem, perhaps the intervention of a social worker could be of great help in these cases, because the truth is that we cannot afford the luxury, I feel, of taking away free opportunities from those who need it. We are the bridge, the channel that enables better opportunities and if we are having these difficulties, I think it would be healthy to resolve them and put them on the table. In this way, we all win."

Volunteer 3: "Boys and girls ... remember that in this group we are all "volunteers" ...that is, in our free time, instead of spending it relaxing, we dedicate ourselves to this work. Why? Because of pure love of our neighbor, so obviously everything we do or suggest has the best intentions… although what we suggest is not to everyone's liking, it's valid and respectable… we all have our reasons to believe one way or another… there is no selfishness or irresponsibility behind any of the points of views shared here…. But obviously, we need to sit down and talk, and reach an agreement."

Excerpts from the volunteers' group chat in WhatsApp, March 28th, 2017

In the previous sections, it was demonstrated how the organization plays a mediating role for the Haitian migrants in relation to the Chilean state and society. In continuation, this section will analyze the role of the volunteers in the organization in terms of their views on the character of this mediating role and what it should entail, including their personal motivations. As Meyer argues, those who participate in social movements can have different reasons for doing so, which implies different motivations and goals, something that can ultimately affect the workings of an organization (Meyer, 2002, p. 9).

The messages above are excerpts from a discussion in the group conversation of the volunteers of Frè in WhatsApp. In a message preceding those presented, a volunteer told the group that an acquaintance was looking for a babysitter for her children, and thought about hiring a Haitian through the organization. The woman in charge of the job bank commented that she did not want to recommend Haitians for jobs involving children because of the language barrier. This comment started a discussion, as others, among these volunteer 1 and volunteer 2, believed that it should be up to the employer to decide whether this would be a problem or not. In a previous conversation in the group, they had a similar discussion, this time about possible jobs for the Haitians as actors in a tv commercial. The woman in charge of the job bank said that she was against sporadic jobs, because she prefers to provide more stable job opportunities for the Haitian migrants. In response, volunteer 1 said that her main concern was that the Haitian migrants could make some money and keep their dignity intact, which is why she endorsed the possibilities of sporadic jobs. This was also supported by volunteer 2, who said that in her opinion not offering these opportunities to the Haitians would be taking something away from them. Ultimately, as can be seen in the excerpts, volunteer 1 chose to quit after these disagreements, as she could no longer answer for the methods of the organization, and hinted at other people's arrogance.

These discussions are interesting because they introduce different dynamics and fundamental discussions of Frè, especially since it is an organization entirely run by volunteers. According to Anheier, organizations are largely affected by "the values and motivations behind them, e.g. people's concerns, commitments to, and compassion for others outside their immediate family, respect for others, [and] caring about their community…" (Anheier, 2005, p. 8). Further, Meyer states that people are driven to take strong stands, and led to participate in social movements, based on for example religion and ideology, while they might not necessarily have a specific end result in mind, or have conceptualized the changes they seek (Meyer, 2002, p. 9). In this sense, participation in organizations or social movements has many different foundations, which are based on different motivations and

goals. This is also applicable to the volunteers in Frè, both in terms of motivations, interests, and the views on their role in relation to the Haitians. In the conversation above, different views on the mediating role of the organization are noticeable, and in some way it is possible to see the valuation of the different services of the organization through the beliefs of the volunteers of how to help the Haitian migrants. Some volunteers, in the conversation represented by volunteer 1 and 2, believe that the most important thing is to help the Haitians with immediate needs, which means helping them take all kinds of jobs, and do whatever it takes to make a little money. Others take another approach, where the final outcome of integration is considered more important, as the quality of a job, and the possibility of a steady income in the long run, are seen as more important than the instant gratification of "a couple of pesos", as was said by another volunteer.

In terms of Frè's mediating role, as facilitator of integration, it is clear that there does not necessarily exist an internal agreement on how to achieve this among the volunteers, altough they might agree on their role as: "the bridge, [being] the channel that enables better opportunities" as volunteer 2 states. Following Meyer, many people participate in activism through social movements without having specific ideas or thoughts on how it might lead to actual political change (Meyer, 2002, p. 9). This is clear in the arguments of the volunteers, who in some cases, seemed more concerned with their ideas of how things should be now, and not necessarily how to achieve social change in the long run, or at least they did not agree on how this could be achieved, ultimately creating disagreement between the volunteers in terms of the purpose of the activities. These fundamental disagreements can (partly) be explained by the different motivations and convictions that lie behind participation in a social movement, or in this case, participation as a volunteer in Frè.

During my time with the organization, I experienced that the main motivations of the volunteers were rooted in respectively religion, politics, and self-realization. It is important to recognize the connection between religion and politics, especially in a South American context, where the Catholic church has often participated in political matters, especially through church-based activism (Daudelin & Hewitt, 1995, p. 221). However, in this thesis, I have chosen to separate them into two distinct categories for analytical purposes.

As mentioned, some members are directly linked to the church, and connect the work they are doing to their religion, and to their relationship with the priest. I first experienced this the first time I contacted the organization by e-mail. As a last comment in the response I got, the person who sent the e-mail thanked me for my admirable intentions, asking God to bless me abundantly, thereby

making a connection between working as a volunteer and blessings from God. Further, in the WhatsApp conversation, volunteer 3 says that they are spending their free time working for the organization because of "pure love of our neighbor", which can be interpreted as deriving from the Christian message of 'love thy neighbor', suggesting religious motivations. As discussed earlier, some of the services offered by the organization can be connected to charity and solidarity for the poor, which can be seen as a moral, religious duty, based on "compassion for those in need" (Anheier, 2005, p. 223). Consequently, participating in volunteer work becomes a way of practicing one's religion. This is especially relevant regarding the services of a charitable kind, in terms of showing compassion and helping those in need.

Other volunteers tried hard to distance the organization from the church, for example by advocating for changing the location to other facilities, which physically represents the separation of the church and the organization. This could be an effort to concentrate on other aspects, and send a message outwardly that Frè is not a religious organization. Although I experienced that many expressed their faith through the work they were doing, there were other volunteers who considered it necessary to emphasize the separation of Frè and the church. In one case, I saw how the perceived religious affiliation scared people away. A volunteer had invited a known Chilean researcher to visit the organization, but she blatantly denied coming when she found out the organization was located in the facilities of a church, which might have given her a specific perception of the motivations and activities present in the organization.

In my experience, many volunteers are politically motivated. They are driven by a resistance to the injustices they believe are created by the dominant political discourse on migration, and the 'unfair' societal structures, such as the presence of racism. In a message to the WhatsApp group from a woman who did not have any religious affiliation or prior experience with the church before she became a volunteer, she thanked the priest, as the founder of the organization, for the opportunity to do this work. She continued by saying that "I believe that together we can do many things, I dream that someday our mentality will change, I dream that one day injustices, abuses and discrimination cease to exist, we lack so much to achieve that, we need to love more, more love in this society, but I have faith that together we can do a lot". Here, she talks about the injustices, abuses, and discrimination that according to her exist in the Chilean society, and while she does mention faith, I do not believe that this is not connected to religion in the literal sense. I am convinced of this because we spent several hours together outside the church during mass, talking about our disconnection from religion, and because she rolled her eyes at another volunteer, who made cardboard hearts saying, "God loves

me", for the children. Instead, I believe that it should be understood as referring to faith in humanity, as she expresses belief or hope that the work she, and others, are doing with the organization can one day change structures in society, and through this make a difference.

The third motivation can be interpreted as self-realization or personal interests. This is implicitly present in the statements of volunteer 1, when her ideas are not accepted or shared by the group, and she immediately quits, and blames it on other's arrogance. Following Meyer, participation in a social movement can be a "concrete step toward becoming the kind of people they wanted to be: moral or decent" both in cases where religion is present, and when it is not (Meyer, 2002, p. 9). When volunteer 2 says "In this way, we all win" she infers that there is, or should be, something in it for the volunteers, or in other words, they also need to win through their participation in the organization. Consequently, this points to participation being about the gratification one gets from participating in an organization or social movement. This does not mean that the participants do not care about the cause, on the contrary, they participate because they believe they are acting "against what they view as dangerous and wrong" (Meyer, 2002, p. 9). However, the satisfaction of 'doing good' can risk overshadowing the actual wish or need for change. In the WhatsApp group, I noticed that the volunteers put a lot of effort into praising each other and themselves for their good work, i.e. when a volunteer wrote: "We are all marvelous. A great team! We can do great things together". This is an example of how participating in the organization automatically makes you a devotee to the cause. In the messages, volunteer 3 also makes this connection, when she says that because they are spending their free time, everything they do or suggest has the best intentions. Thus, simply by being a volunteer, they are fighting for the cause, although they might not put much thought into how to actually change the situation they are objecting to. The need to express the necessity for the work they are doing and how good it is, is evidence for the importance ascribed to simply participating. Seeing it from this perspective, it can be argued that the interest might not really be with the integration of Haitians into society, although there is no doubt that all participants believe in this cause and wish to work towards it. However, helping Haitian migrants instead becomes a way of satisfying one's own motives or motivations, whether they are of religious or political nature, or within the scheme of self-realization.

This resonates with the previously mentioned issue that many people who participate in social movements do not necessarily think about the possible political outcome, or how to actually achieve or make change. The cause of a social movement can in some cases, through its historical context and relevance, be an opportunity to protest certain structures, or exercise one's own motivations. In this sense, participation in social movements for a certain cause should be understood through "what

seems promising or available [depending] on one's social location, embedded networks, and ideology" (Meyer, 2002, p. 9). Looking at Frè and its services, it has already been established that the choice of beneficiaries assists a political agenda which offers a critique of the Chilean state and society. In this sense, choosing to participate in this exact organization, for this exact cause, can be seen as an opportunistic way for the volunteers to exercise their own motivations and personal goals. They see the Haitians as one of the most vulnerable groups in society, in a country where immigration is rising while the migration law and system is unequipped and unwilling to deal with the matter.

Meyer (2002) argues how notions of identity are established in relation to political process, especially in terms of "the process of turning physical features or social practices into "identities"" which is developed in the interactions between states and people, out of the conditions created by the state (Meyer, 2002, p. 5). This can be related to the connotations that are connected to certain migrants in Chile, especially those that fall victim to the racial hierarchy (Correa, 2016, pp. 39, 40). Being positioned in opposition to the Chilean national identity, can further exacerbate the difficult situations of Haitian migrants. Following this, the volunteers can be seen as objecting to the ascribed identity of Haitian migrants in the Chilean society through their work in the organization, where they try to circumvent and change the excluded position of many migrants.

However, while the work of Frè might be a reaction to the ascribed identity of Haitian migrants, the volunteers are not themselves the disaffected ones. In new social movements, where the struggles were based on contention of identity, the disaffected ones are collectively capable of acting for themselves (Edelman, 2011, p. 288). Although the position of Haitian migrants is the catalyst for reaction, contesting the structures permitting the dominant discourse on the position of the Haitians is not necessarily the result of the volunteers' efforts. Instead, the identity of the volunteers becomes relevant, as helping the Haitians becomes a cause that seems worthy and appeals to their personal motivations and reasonings. It can be used to critique political and social conditions, exercise charity or benevolence to the most vulnerable in society, or provide an opportunity to be part of something greater, working together for a good cause as 'good people', and thereby 'realize oneself'.

While this should not take anything away from the good intentions and actions I experienced between the volunteers in Frè, it is important to consider whether this can have consequences for the goals of the organization in terms of actually achieving the social change that is their mission. Good intentions, believing in the cause, and providing services, will not necessarily suffice in making a change. Instead, the daily work of the organization, both in terms of meeting immediate and more long-term

needs, can instead provide an opportunity for the volunteers to gratify their own personal interests, and despite the common wish for social change, simply participating in the work of the organization becomes the means to an end for the volunteers, as their purposes are satisfied merely through participation and involvement.

From this chapter, it can be argued that the services and actions of the organization should be seen as ways of objecting to the position of Haitian migrants in the Chilean society. Whether through services that meet immediate needs of migrants in abject or complicated situations, or measurements to facilitate integration, the organization seeks to create opportunities for Haitian migrants in Chile. However, as can be concluded from this analysis, there are certain aspects that can hinder the societal change that the organization wants to achieve. By acting as substitute for the state, the organization risks becoming an extension which, instead of protesting the behavior and politics of the state, enables a continuation of status quo. Further, due to diverse motivations and disagreements on the objectives of the organization amongst the volunteers, the organization might not achieve a greater social change in the structural conditions that hinder integration, which encouraged and motivated the existence and foundation of the organization in the first place.

5. Conclusion

By applying a case study approach, this thesis aimed to examine how Fundación Frè plays a role in the space between Haitian migrants and the Chilean state. Considering Frè through ideas of social movements enabled an understanding of Frè as a product, a reaction, and a response to its context. Through its services, activities, and advocacy work, Frè seeks to object to the position of Haitian migrants in Santiago, Chile. Haitians migrants in Chile are affected by the migration system based on a migration law from 1975 that is insufficient in terms of coping with the number of migrants coming to Chile today. Their position is also affected by the existence of racial nationalism, which justifies criminalization and exclusion.

The analysis, which is based on three months of participant observation, sought to elucidate the workings of the organization in terms of its relation to the migrant, its relation and interactions with the state, and the internal dynamics of the organization.

In the first section, the services offered by Frè were put into perspective in terms of a characterization of Frè as an organization. Services that are aimed at meeting immediate needs can be considered acts

of charity, which can also be connected to the religious origin of the organization. However, by choosing Haitian migrants as beneficiaries, one of the most vulnerable immigrant groups in Chile, the organization criticizes certain conditions in the Chilean society. This critique is also visible through advocacy work, and the services and activities that aim towards facilitating integration, which identify and try to curb the obstacles that may otherwise hinder integration and opportunities in the Chilean society.

The second section described how the organization also provides protection, and functions as a mediator between the state and the migrants. It facilitates contact between the state and Haitian migrants, and gives advice on how to navigate the system, which in turn gives the Haitians better possibilities for curbing exclusion and achieving access to rights. The organization can be seen as a substitute of the state, both in terms of protection, and by enabling access to certain rights. However, it is also argued that through their function as a substitute, the organization risks becoming an extension of the state, as it allows the state to be absent. When Frè takes responsibility for the migrants, it permits the state to continue its current politics.

The last section of the analysis examined internal dynamics of the organization. It was evident that the volunteers are not in agreement on how to achieve the objectives of the organization, or even what the objectives should be. The main conflict was between those who believe that the migrants' immediate needs should be the main concern, while others focused on facilitating integration. This disagreement can also be linked to the different motivations that can divided into three categories: religion, politics, and self-interest. By focusing on their own motivations and intentions, the volunteers meet their own personal objectives entirely through participation, which in turn can obscure the goal of achieving social change.

From this, it is possible to conclude that the organization in its role in the space between the Chilean state and the Haitian migrant helps the Haitians in their (often) excluded position in the Chilean society. Through services that meet immediate needs, facilitation of integration, and access to rights, the organization attempts to curb certain structures that can prevent Haitians from achieving this alone. Further, Frè aims to promote a change of migration policies and a change in the mentality of the Chileans. However, these objectives can risk being overshadowed by the position of Frè as an extension of the state and the volunteers' personal interests

Frè is protesting what they see as shortcomings of the state. However, it is necessary to consider that this is the point of view of the organization, influenced by the predominant view of the volunteers of

what a legitimate state should do. This is not necessarily the reality or expectations of others. The subsequent, and final, chapter will include a few theoretical considerations regarding states' responsibilities in relation to migrants and their rights, seeking to insert this thesis into a larger debate on migration, sovereignty, and human rights.

6. Reflections and Perspectives on State Responsibility

One question I still do not know how to answer with confidence, is to what extent the Chilean state has, or should have, responsibility to protect and provide rights to Haitian migrants. The difficulties in obtaining them for many migrants can be seen as one of the motivations behind the existence of Frè, as the organization is a reaction to the position of Haitian migrants in Chile. In this sense, the existence of Frè is a critique of the way the Chilean state is handling the matter of migration today, at least based on the expectations and wishes of the organization. This is not specific to the Chilean context, as criticism by organizations and movements of policies and management of migrants and refugees carried out by states, can be seen in many places. Two examples are Venligboerne in Denmark, a self-labeled popular movement helping refugees based on solidarity, and private housing arrangements in the Netherlands, one of several citizen initiatives protesting the "unfair treatment of asylum seekers… [who] are being excluded from basic social rights…" (Toubøl, 2015; Versteegt & Maussen, 2012, p. 15). What these organizations and movements have in common is a discontent with the policies and attitudes towards migrants and refugees, which infers that, in their opinion, states and authorities do not provide the necessary and just services and care.

This points to a general confusion or disagreement on who is responsible for providing rights and protection for migrants. This is a complicated question to answer. One approach is based on international law, and the existence of a "legal and normative framework affecting international migrants", which includes customary law and other binding and non-binding global and regional policies and agreements (Global Commission on International Migration, 2005, p. 53). Even when migrants enter or reside in a country against the corresponding immigration laws, the migrants should be protected by the human rights framework (Global Commission on International Migration, 2005, p. 55). Through this, states "should fulfil their responsibility and obligation to protect the rights of migrants" (Global Commission on International Migration, 2005, p. 32). However, the existence of international law does not suffice in explaining, or enforcing, who should provide rights to migrants. Enforcement of international laws on human rights is often seen as being in conflict with the principles of sovereignty, which can lead states to disregard certain international conventions and

agreements. This has led to a dispute between those who "are concerned by border control and national security" and those "whose main concern is the human rights of the migrants" (Global Commission on International Migration, 2005, p. 35).

The issue of sovereignty becomes especially pertinent in the context of irregular migration, which can be seen as a challenge to state sovereignty (Global Commission on International Migration, 2005, p. 34). While it is a fundamental right to move, and leave one's country, entering another is not. Movement across both national and international spaces is monopolized by sovereign nation-states, as movement is grounded in the division of the world into separate defined territories (De Genova & Peutz, 2010, pp. 10, 13). Moreover, the primacy of sovereign, territorialized nation-states is the basis for the distinctions between citizens and non-citizens, in this case migrants. Being accepted as a citizen denotes "official recognition of a special relationship, between a person and a state. Entailed in this political contract are obligations of protection" (Benhabib & Resnik, 2009, p. 2). Protection from the state, along with access to rights, are therefore intrinsically linked to the territorial belonging of citizens, which excludes those who do not belong to the territory in question. The idea of the territorialization of rights, connected to the given primacy of the nation-state, thereby offers the answer that a certain state is not necessarily responsible for providing protection or rights to non-citizens.

However, to challenge this view, it is useful to look at the regimes of mobility approach (Glick Schiller & Salazar, 2013). Glick-Schiller and Salazar argues that whether a person is a citizen or not does not provide a sufficient answer in terms of who has access to rights and who does not in the context of mobility. Instead, they encourage a view on mobility and movement in terms of other categories, depending on e.g. legal status, class, and global racializing (Glick Schiller & Salazar, 2013, p. 188). Not all those who move, move with the same prerequisites. Rather than merely taking the point of view on migration, or mobility, as citizens versus non-citizens, much can be gained from considering the differences in privilege and categories when it comes to mobility, as those who travel as students, those who travel as refugees, those who travel for pleasure, and those who travel for better opportunities, are all in different situations with a myriad of variances within each of them. Thereby, being a 'non-national' does not automatically leave a person without rights. Instead, other categories and conditions can affect the experiences and realities of mobility.

This can be related to my personal experiences in Chile. Although I spent time working in Chile, I was never considered a migrant, but instead an '*extranjera'*, a foreigner. The category of migrant

would, however, always be ascribed to characterize most people coming from other countries in South America and the Caribbean. Furthermore, I was never concerned about not being able to access rights, something which preoccupied the Haitians in the organization, and which is the basis for the existence of Frè. In the end, the not so simple question of who is responsible for providing rights and protection to migrants becomes further complicated. It is a matter of why certain people who move have access to rights while others do not. To achieve a better understanding of this, it is necessary to ask why some people are ignored and excluded, when others are not, and what contextual dynamics lie behind creating the categories that characterize different migrants.

References

Anheier, H. K., 2005. *Nonprofit Organizations - Theory, management, policy.* Routledge.

Benhabib, S. & Resnik, J., 2009. Introduction: Citizenship and Migration Theory Engendered. In: S. Benhabib & J. Resnik, ed. *Migrations and Mobilities: Citizenship, Borders, and Gender.* New York University Press, pp. 1-44.

Chesters, G. & Welsh, I., 2011. *Social Movements, The Key Concepts.* Routledge.

Correa, J. T., 2016. La inmigración como "problema" o el resurgir de la raza. Racismo general, racismo cotidiano y su papel en la conformación de la Nación.. In: M. E. Tijoux, ed. *Racismo en Chile, La piel como marca de la inmigración.* Editorial Universitaria, pp. 35-48.

Daudelin, J. & Hewitt, W. E., 1995. Churches and politics in Latin America: Catholicism at the crossroads. *Third World Quarterly,* 16(2), pp. 221-236.

De Genova, N. & Peutz, N., 2010. Introduction. In: N. De Genova & N. Peutz, eds. *The Deportation Regime: Sovereignty, Space, and the Freedom of Movement.* Duke University Press, pp. 1-29.

de Haas, H., 2014. *Migration Theory, Quo Vadis?,* Oxford: International Migration Institute.

Edelman, M., 2011. Social Movements: Changing Paradigms and Forms of Politics. *Annual Review of Anhropology,* Volume 30, pp. 285-317.

Ferguson, J., 2003. *Migration in the Caribbean: Haiti, the Dominican Republic and Beyond.* Minority Rights Group International.

Fernández, M., 2016. Nueva Ley de Migraciones: es necesario pensar, aceptar y querer un Chile multicultural. *El Definido,* 14 March.
Available at: http://www.eldefinido.cl/actualidad/pais/6618/Nueva-Ley-de-Migraciones-es-necesario-pensar-aceptar-y-querer-un-Chile-multicultural/
[Accessed 26 April 2017]

Fund for Peace, 2017. [Online]
Available at: http://fsi.fundforpeace.org/
[Accessed 26 April 2017].

Glick Schiller, N. & Salazar, N. B., 2013. Regimes of Mobility Across the Globe. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration studies,* 39(2), pp. 183-200.

Global Commission on International Migration, 2005. *Migration in an Interconnected World: New Directions for Action.* Global Commission on International Migration.

Gobierno de Chile, 2017a. *Permanent Residence.* [Online]
Available at: http://www.extranjeria.gob.cl/ingles/perm_definitiva.html
[Accessed 27 May 2017].

Gobierno de Chile, 2017b. *Residence Visa for Students.* [Online]
Available at: http://www.extranjeria.gob.cl/ingles/Visa_Estudiante.html
[Accessed 27 May 2017].

Gobierno de Chile, 2017c. *Temporary Visa.* [Online]
Available at: http://www.extranjeria.gob.cl/ingles/visa_tem.html
[Accessed 27 May 2017].

Gobierno de Chile, 2017d. *Visa Subjected to Contract.* [Online]
Available at: http://www.extranjeria.gob.cl/ingles/visa_contrato.html
[Accessed 27 May 2017].

Hastrup, K., Rubow, C. & Tjørnhøj-Thomsen, T., 2011. *Kulturanalyse, Kort fortalt.* Samfundslitteratur.

Joassart-Marcelli, P., 2013. Ethnic Concentration and Nonprofit Organizations: The Political and Urban Geography of Immigrant Services in Boston, Massachusetts. *International Migration Review,* 47(3), pp. 730-772.

Kvale, S. & Brinkmann, S., 2009. Conducting an Interview. In: *Interviews: Learning the Craft of Qualitative Research Interviewing.* Sage Publications, pp. 123-141.

Layder, D., 2005. *Understanding Social Theory.* SAGE Publications.

Meyer, D. S., 2002. Opportunities and Identities: Bridge-Building in the Study of Social Movements. In: D. S. Meyer, N. Whittier & B. Robnett, eds. *Social Movements: Identity, Culture, and the State.* Oxford University Press, pp. 3-24.

Musante, K. & DeWalt, B. R., 2010. *Participant Observation, A guide for fieldworkers.* AltaMira Press.

Nicholls, W. J., 2013. Voice and Power in the Immigrant Rights Movement. In: C. Menjívar & D. Kanstroom, eds. *Constructing Immigrant 'Illegality'.* Cambridge University Press, pp. 225-245.

Palominos, S. M., 2016. Racismo, Inmigración y políticas culturales. La Subordinación Racializada de las Comunidades Inmigrantes como Principio de Construcción de la Identidad Chilena. In: E. M. Tijoux, ed. *Racismo en Chile - el piel como marca de inmigración.* Editorial Universitaria, pp. 187-212.

Polloni, L. A. & Matus, C. M., 2011. *Somos migrantes. Experiencias de integración a la ciudad de Santiago.* Agencia Española de Cooperación International para el Desarrollo (AECID).

Reveco, C. D. & Mullan, B., 2014. Migration Policy and Development in Chile. *International Migration,* 52(5), pp. 1-14.

Rojas Pedemonte, N., Amode, N. & Vásquez, J., 2017. Migración haitiana hacia Chile: origen y aterrizaje de nuevos proyectos migratorios.. In: N. Rojas Pedemonte & J. Koechlin, eds. *Migración Haitiana Hacia el Sur Andino.* OBIMID, pp. 65-171.

Rojas Pedemonte, N., Amode, N. & Vásquez, J. R., 2015. Racismo y matrices de "inclusión" de la migración haitiana en Chile: elementos conceptuales y contextuales para la discusión. *Polis, Revista Latinoamericana,* 14(42), pp. 217-245.

Rojas Pedemonte, N. & Silva, C. D., 2016. *La Migración en Chile: Breve Reporte y Caracterización.* OBIMID.

Rojas Pedemonte, N. et al., 2016. *Migración Haitiana en Chile, Boletín Informativo,* Santiago: Departamento de Extranjería y Migración.

Smith, A. D., 1979. Colour, Race and National Identity. In: *Nationalism in the twentieth century.* Canberra: Australia National University Press, pp. 86-114.

Stefoni, C., 2011. *Perfil Migratorio de Chile,* Organización International para las Migraciones (OIM).

Stiedenroth, K., 2014. Female, Young, Unmarried. The Role of Positionality while Conducting Fieldwork in Pakistan.. *The Oriental Anthropologist,* 14(1), pp. 81-95.

Tijoux, M. E., 2016. Presentación. In: M. E. Tijoux, ed. *Racismo en Chile, La piel como marca de la inmigración.* Editorial Universitaria, pp. 15-18.

Toubøl, J., 2015. Septembermobiliseringen af flygtningesolidaritetsbevægelse. *Dansk Sociologi,* 26(4), pp. 96-103.

Valenzuela, P. J. et al., 2014. Integración Laboral de los Inmigrantes Haitianos, Dominicanos y Colombianos en Santiago de Chile. *Revista Antropologias del Sur,* Issue 2, pp. 101-120.

Versteegt, I. & Maussen, M., 2012. *Contested policies of exclusion: Resistance and protest against asylum policy in Netherlands,* Amsterdam Institute for Social Science Research.

Whittier, N., 2002. Meaning and Structure in Social Movements. In: D. S. Meyer, N. Whittier & B. Robnett, eds. *Social Movements: Identity, Culture, and the State.* Oxford University Press, pp. 289-308.

Willen, S. S., 2007. Introduction - Exploring "Illegal" and "Irregular" Migrants' Lived Experiences of Law and State Power. *International Migration,* August, 45(3), pp. 2-7.

Willen, S. S., 2007. Toward a Critical Phenomenology of "Illegality": State Power, Criminalization, and Abjectivity among Undocumented Migrant Workers in Tel Aviv, Israel. *International Migration,* August, 45(3), pp. 8-38.

Yin, R. K., 1989. *Case Study Research. Design and Methods.* Sage Publications.

Zeran, F., 2016. Prólogo. In: M. E. Tijoux, ed. *Racismo en Chile, La piel como marca de la inmigración.* Editorial Universitaria, pp. 11-13.