Supervised by Malayna Raftopoulos

## 2016

# Formulating an ideal model for regional integration



**Development & International Relations** 

**European Studies** 

31-05-16

Jan Cuchran & Rasmus Valther Pallesen Aalborg University, Aalborg

### Contents

1. Introduction chapter	2
1.1 Thesis introduction	2
1.2 Problem statement	5
2. Methodological chapter	6
2.1 Ontology	6
2.2 Theory selection & Method of analysis	7
2.3 Case Selection and timeframe1	1
3. Theoretical chapter	4
3.1 Security communities	14
3.2 Buen vivir – Sumak Kawsay 2	23
3.2.1 Constitutional implementation of Sumak Kawsay in Ecuador	28
3.3 The theory of liberal intergovernmentalism	30
4. Analytical chapter	35
4.1 European regional integration	35
4.2 The European Union as a Security Community 3	38
4.3 Liberal Economic cooperation in The European Union 4	12
4.4 Regional integration in Latin America and New Regionalism4	<del>1</del> 6
4.4.1 New Regionalism Organizations 4	<del>1</del> 6
4.4.2 Different Dimensions of regional integration 4	19
4.4.3 Comparative selection of organizations	50
4.5 Comparative analysis of Buen Vivir and Security Communities in a Latin American context	52
4.5.1 Deutsch's Nine essential background conditions	52
4.5.2 Additional useful background conditions	53
5. Discussion Chapter	56
6. Conclusion Chapter	73
Bibliography7	77

#### 1. Introduction chapter

#### **1.1 Thesis introduction**

The importance of regional integration and cooperation in trade, money and politics has rapidly increased in the past years. As the World gets more and more globalized and connected, integration seems almost inevitable. However, this phenomenon is not a product of recent past as it has been present throughout history not only in Europe, but examples of unions, commonwealths, associations, pacts, etc. can be also found all around the World. The first wave of integration started in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, when Prussia established a customs union with various independent German states which led to the establishment of German Reich. Other examples can be found in Switzerland, Italy and France, where integration efforts led to various types on unions, giving the first impetus for creation of a larger European body which is today represented by the European Union (EU).

As has been mentioned before, integration attempts have happened in many places of the World. In the 1960's, the Andean Pact, the Latin American Free Trade Association (LAFTA) and the Central American Common Market (CACM) have been introduced. Another large project started in the 1990's called Mercado Común del Sur, better known as MERCOSUR. Other cases of integration can be found in America, Asia and Africa, but this paper shall focus on to two regions – Europe and Latin America.

The target of this thesis is to present different perspective on the possible success of integration in the Latin America region, emphasizing on the economic, social and cultural aspect of it. The combination of these aspects lies behind the reasoning that these should serve as a benchmark in order to promote and establish a long-lasting a sustainable regional cooperation. In order to do so, the process of integration in Europe and the European Union itself shall serve as a model for the integration in the region.

The EU is a very unique project, merging 28 of its European Member State countries into political and economic partnership based on the rule of law embedded in its founding treaties. The idea of integrated Europe began after the Second World War to make Europe a better and safer place. The initial integration process begun with the economic cooperation between states and as it gained momentum, the countries became more and more interdependent. As a result, in 1958 the European Economic Community (EEC) has been established because of growing economic cooperation between the six founding countries: Germany, France, Netherlands, Italy, Belgium and Luxembourg. What started as an economic union soon led to cooperation in various policy areas and the EEC soon changed its name to the European Union in 1993. Because of its effectiveness, a single market has been established and the integration continued in other

areas as well. (E. Commission, European Union n.d.) It can be said that the single market is one of the EU's greatest achievements, providing EU citizens with free movement of goods, services and labor, removing all barriers to intra-EU trade and thus creating an environment which favors both customers and producers. (E. Commission, The European Single Market n.d.) After integration has happened, the EU has experiences decades of peace, prosperity and improvements in living standards – living, working and traveling has never been as easy. Another important step in the history of united Europe has been the introduction of its single currency – the Euro.

The EU is from its beginnings emphasizing on the promotion of human rights not only within its borders, but also externally across the world. The values of democracy, respect, freedom and the rule of law have been embedded into the Charter of Fundamental Rights, legally binding EU's institutions and EU Member States governments to live up to them. (E. Commission, European Union n.d.)

The EU is a great example of successful and well-functioning regional body, to which many other countries look up to. It has been chosen as an example of a successful regional integration, which can help to show a way towards similar results in Latin America. However, it's easier said than done, as it's important to keep in mind that the way things happened in Europe is because of its specific economic conditions, historical and other set of events which allowed it. Nevertheless, the EU can be seen as a proper model of integration and can provide a good insight on how to move integration to the next level.

Despite numerous integration attempts in Latin America, the results can be described as rather modest compared to the success of the European model. The reason is due to different economic redistribution and ideological divergence in the continent which prevents integration to evolve to its full potential. This is however not the reason to give up the idea of integration attempts as integration continues to improve with the expectance of similar results as in Europe. In Latin America, integration is not a new phenomenon as there were numerous more and less successful attempts in the past.

these organizations and thus drifting away from their original purpose. (Mera 2007)

The history of Latin American integration goes back to 1948 and the creation of Gran Colombia - a customs union between Colombia, Ecuador, Panama and Venezuela. Other unions and associations have been introduced in the 1960 such as the Central American Common Market (CACM) and the Latin American Free Trade Association (LAFTA) aimed on the support of regional market through the reduction of tariffs and joint industrial planning. In the 1990's more sub-regional organizations emerged such as MERCOSUR, UNASUR, CELAC, ALBA and the Pacific Alliance along with others that have been renamed and reshaped like ASC, Andean Community and SICA. These organizations shall be later described in order to see how they've been successful with integration so far. (Mina 2014)

The process of regional trade initiatives in Latin America in the 1990's has been triggered by various

3

motivations such as political, economic and security. These initiations have been at first viewed positively especially compared to the inward-oriented regional integration process during 1950's and 1960's. However, the outcomes didn't meet the expectations as many of these agreements can be described as rather failure than success. Many Latin American countries had problems to follow the obligations they previously agreed upon, undermining the structure, sustainability and credibility of

Keeping these facts in mind along with different and specific conditions in Latin America, this calls for a different approach and a reinterpretation of current integration model in order to forge a strong and well-functioning regional body. This shall be done through the analysis of European integration and respectively, the analysis of attempts done in Latin America. These shall be further analyzed through the selected theories mixed with the local Latin American ontology, specifically represented by the theory of Buen Vivir - Sumak Kawsay. The aim of this thesis is to create a new model of integration in Latin America through the lenses of Ecuadiorian theory of Buen Vivir. The reasoning behind this approach is to point on the historical and cultural ties between the population within this region, assuming that paying attention to these factors would help to create a healthy ground for integration to succeed in this region the way it didn't happened before.

This thesis shall begin with the introduction chapter followed by methodological section to which has been paid signifficant attention in order to explain the overall aim of this work. Methodological chapter consist of subchapters such as ontology, theory selection & method of analysis and case selection. These chapters shall further clarify which theoretical tools will be used to analyzed the cases as well as the reason why these cases were chosen. All of the theories used in this paper shall be later introduced and explained in a separate theoretical chapter with its three subchapters. Moving on from this, the case of European integration and the EU shall be discussed in its own chapter and respectively, the Latin America region with its own regional bodies will be introduced in another chapter. These cases shall be later analyzed and discussed through the selected theories to give proper explanation to research questions stated in the beginning of this document. Analyzed data shall be presented in the discussion as this shall be the final chapter of the thesis.

#### **1.2 Problem statement**

How can a process of European integration be combined with local Latin American philosophies to formulate a reinterpretation of current regional integration schemes in the Latin American region?

*Why have efforts to implement an overarching body of governance in Latin America been less successful than the EU?* 

What alternatives to the current regional integration scheme could be applied in order to achieve success?

The purpose of this thesis is to research to what extent the European Union(EU) can be used as a benchmark model for regional integration in Latin America, in order to ensure peace and political stability, as well a social and economic in the years to come. The reason why the EU has been chosen as a benchmark model is that the EU has had relatively more success in its regional integration scheme, than what has been seen in Latin America. The idea is that tendencies related to culture and economic system will be revealed in the analysis the EU, and the lessons learned can then be applied to the Latin American case. In order to explain different types of integration, the thesis will use both the theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism (LI) by Andrew Moravcsik and Security Communities by Deutsch et al., the former to explain the process of regional integration that has happened in Europe, and that has been attempted in Latin America such as MERCOSUR, UNASUR or ALBA. The latter theory will be used to explain how a strategy for regional integration in Latin America should look in the future, when combined with local ontologies. These theories will be applied to case studies from both geographical regions. Moving on from the case studies, the thesis will look closer into possible parallels regarding institutions, community building, process and respective national cultures. When these parallels have been drawn, the thesis will attempt to combine these lessons learned scenarios from the European integration with aspects of the local ontology branch of Buen Vivir, called Sumak Kawsay, to form a reinterpretation of political, economic and regional integration schemes in Latin America.

Before the case studies, the concept of Sumak Kawsay will be introduced, as a possible foundation for institutional reinterpretation and concept building. The concept deals not only with alternative development, but rather alternatives to development in general, viewing it not as something linear. Furthermore, it works with a less centralized political structure with more influence by the local community. The idea is thus to work with different kinds of development than linear development, and not necessarily attempt to copy the regional integration scheme as seen within the EU. Instead this thesis seeks to explore what aspects from the European case can be used further on, and what aspects were made possible due to European culture. Moving forward with the results from the comparison of the integration process with a theoretical angle, the thesis will attempt to analyze and draw parallels between integration cases in terms of what solutions may be applicable from the EU towards Latin America, utilizing the theory of Security Communities. The next step from drawing and analyzing these parallels to regional integration is to combine parallels and lessons learned from EU integration with ideas from the theory of Security Communities and Sumak Kawsay to form a concept of political and regional integration.

#### 2. Methodological chapter

#### 2.1 Ontology

The world as is it today can be said to be made up of agreements and social interactions. A very substantial part of the world that we accept today as being something given, has in one way or the other been constructed by actors throughout history. When talking about constructivism, this can be said to be the basic argument, an argument which states that social constructs, meaning organizations, institutions and so forth are constructed and maintained by the actors in, and is thus not something that one would consider as something naturally given. Quite a few of the things that one would today consider as something normal or given, was at one point in history something groundbreaking and new. To mention an example relevant to this thesis, a concept like nation states as a concept goes back to only about 400 years ago. (Bryman 2012)

Taking a constructivist view, such as this thesis does, can lead to a few interesting points in regards to regional integration schemes and security communities. First and foremost, that any security community and the nation or federal states within it can be argued to be a negotiated order, and this bares the important implication that these security communities and nation or federal states can be re-negotiated. Secondly, that this implicates that the western view upon development and what it entails likewise is a negotiated order, and thus it is also up for re-negotiation. Thirdly, this means that the theory-testing as put forward in this thesis becomes an intrinsic part of this re-negotiation and can serve as an argument to initiate a re-negotiation of current regional integration schemes and views on what the concept of "development" is. The classical western interpretation of the word can be argued to be as a linear concept, which can be put together through a functionalist approach in which a given set of conditions are being implemented in a given negotiated order. This thesis seeks to offer an alternative to the interpretation, or potentially to offer an alternative to the word "development" in general. Furthermore, the thesis will attempt to confront the notion that development is attributed to financial improvements related to the free market as seen from a neoliberal angle.

#### 2.2 Theory selection & Method of analysis

This thesis seeks to explain the process of regional integration that has occurred on the European continent through Liberal Intergovernmentalism by Andrew Moravscik, and furthermore, to explain the relative success that the approach has had within Latin America. This approach as opposed to Buen Vivir and Security communities is a realist approach, and the choice of this approach will be discussed further on in this section. Additionally, the thesis seeks to explore alternatives to the said approach by reinterpreting the theory of Security Communities as put forward by Karl Deutsch by understanding it through the lens of Buen Vivir / Sumak Kawsay.

This thesis will be utilizing the ideal types of Max Weber (1964-1920) in order to develop a comparative approach that can employ constructed analytical concepts, and furthermore demonstrate the utility of these concepts through comparative research. Lastly, the thesis will attempt to develop a systematic perspective that could enable an understanding of the individual meanings and motivations in the context of cultural change. Ideal types can be argued to be a conceptual construct which is neither historically reality nor even necessarily the true reality, but rather formed by the synthesis of many more or less present and occasionally absent concrete individual phenomena. These phenomena are then arranged according to those one-sidedly emphasized viewpoints into a unified analytical construct. (Segady 2014)

The ideal type must however ultimately refer to existing empirical phenomena, and its utility can be argued to be to increasingly clarify the changes that occur in the conditions of these phenomena. This method does thus not serve as a means for the construction of concepts, but does provide a method for determining meaning at the individual level. It is for Weber not a complete method in the traditional sense, but a necessary step in validating the findings of research. A Weberian methodological approach can then be argued not to be averse to quantitative analysis in the social sciences, but these are then seen as providing "discovery question" for the formation and revision of ideal types, rather than being capable of establishing conclusions independent of an exhaustive study at the level of individual meaning. (Segady 2014)

The ideal types will be utilized in this thesis from the perspective of establishing an overarching understanding of the research undertaken. Through this construction of ideal types, the thesis aims to explain what makes a certain course of events stand out, by showing to what extent reality diverge from the unified analytical construct in regards to each particular case. This means in practical terms that Ideal Types much like Liberal Intergovermentalism will serve as benchmarking from which theoretical clarity can be attained, and through that allowing a complex situation such as regional integration through a reinterpretation of current development and integration schemes, to be understood in a simplified form. In a nutshell, this means that one of the aims of this thesis are to create an ideal type for regional integration, by utilizing the ideal types of Weber.

The reason why the theory of Security Communities can be understood through the lenses of Buen Vivir, is due to certain essential background conditions required for a security community to be established. These background conditions encompass a general "we feeling" and a "sense of community" with a "distinct way of life". It is furthermore argued by Deutsch that social mobility of persons and widespread expectations for increases in social and political equality in comparison to the recent past or that of neighboring countries. Furthermore, the thesis will show how principles of Buen Vivir has been incorporated into the constitution of Ecuador as twelve clear objectives which according to Deutsch et al. are necessary for developing a "we feeling" or "sense of community". The claim is that a sense of community should rely on something more than verbal commitment and thus incorporating Buen Vivir into a given constitution can be seen as moving away from a mere verbal commitment to the concept, towards a more practical understanding of what the concept really consists off.

The theory of Security Communities was originally developed as a top-down approach to be used to create a united Europe after WWII, but was widely overshadowed by Neofunctionalism and Liberal Intergovernmentalism as the main approach towards regional integration in Europe. As the latter approach was successful in the EU, the same approach has been attempted in Latin America, although the success can be said to have been relative. For this exact reason, this thesis seeks to explore alternative understandings of not only regional integration, but also alternatives to development in general. In the western world, a notion exist that regional integration and development can be seen as a linear process, and that this understanding will be applicable in any region at any given time. This thesis works with a notion that indigenous ontologies and narratives play a substantial role in understanding a specific political culture, in this instance being Latin America as opposed to Europe. Liberal Intergovernmentalism with Neofunctionalism is from the school of realism, while the theory of Security Communities takes a constructivist approach towards regional integration. The theory of Buen Vivir also has a constructivist approach, but following a bottom-up implementation scheme, meaning that the theory of Security communities will have to be reinterpreted as a bottom up approach utilizing Buen Vivir as a platform to do so. When using a bottom up approach, it is a given that the elite is not taken into consideration, as the bottom up approach doesn't rely on hierarchy, but rather wants it eliminated. This calls for a reinterpretation of Deutsch et al.'s claim to that an essential background condition necessary for the

creation of a security community is a broadening of the political elite. In this instance, through the lenses of Buen Vivir, this would mean that the political elite is being expanded to encompass all citizens within a given region, cf. the individual rights for political participation included in Buen Vivir. In a case in which everyone is raised to the level of the political elite, one can then put forward the question whether or not an elite exists.

The reason as to why this thesis is using theories from both the school of realism and the school of constructivism is due to the neoliberal policies implemented by IMF and The World Bank in the 1990's to be used as a tool for regional development in the developing nations at the time, a lot of these being part of the global south, and subsequently part of Latin America. This thesis wants to confront the western notion of development in regional integration, by using the realist theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism, which can be used as a benchmark theory to analyze efforts undertaken in Latin America this far, for example NAFTA or ALBA, which resembles similar European efforts of regional integration through development. This thesis will attempt to show that efforts undertaken in Latin America through a neoliberal /realist approach have had relatively lower success than the European case, and that a constructivist interpretation of regional integration in Latin America through the lenses of Buen Vivir, with the constitutional implementation of Sumak Kawsay is needed in order to create a security community as explained by Deutsch et. Al. This thesis is thus not reliant on Liberal Intergovernmentalism as a core theory, but rather as a benchmark theory as a means for comparison of regional integration and development approaches. The reason to as why a theory such as Social Constructivism is due to the fact that this thesis in particular doesn't work with the premise that attempt made at regional integration this far in Latin America have been of a constructivist nature. The Ideal Type that this thesis attempts to create is however of a constructivist nature, combining Deutsch et al.'s Security Communities with the local ontology of Buen Vivir understood through the Ecuadorian interpretation of Sumak Kawsay, and is supposed to be of an opposing nature to the Liberal Intergovernmentalism of the realist school that has been implemented in the European Union. The thesis thus takes into consideration that Constructivism is normally seen as a direct opposition to realism, but simultaneously acknowledges the potential for benchmarking and comparing the two by doing so. The thesis works with the notion that the regional integration that has happened in Europe at the time can be argued to be attributed to certain background conditions that existed at the time, and that these background conditions although to an extent theoretically similar, have to be interpreted through a different set of lenses in regards to Latin America

The method of analysis will be to compare cases from respectively Europe and Latin America, from the approach of both Liberal Intergovernmentalism and Security Communities with Buen Vivir serving as one or

several essential background conditions for bringing about social change. This thesis is using Liberal intergovernmentalism to explain the case of the EU, due to the fact that it is a realist top down approach that supports a neofunctionalist capitalistic view of the world. Additionally, an analysis of the European case will be taken from the approach of Security Communities, as the theory was originally developed for this purpose. For that same reason, the thesis expects the analysis to show sufficient coherence between case and theory, potentially showing another possible answer to the European puzzle. The method of analysis on the Latin American case will be similar, with the exception that the thesis argues that Liberal Intergovernmentalism with neofunctionalism does not sufficiently explain the dynamics between various Latin American governments, due to its lack of comprehensive understanding of local culture and ontologies. The thesis will then seek to explore if the theory of Security Communities reinterpreted through the lenses of Buen Vivir may offer a possibility for regional integration in Latin America, given that Buen Vivir will serve as one or several essential background conditions within the framework of Deutsch Security communities. Subsequently, the process of European integration will not be analyzed through the lenses of Buen Vivir, due to the fact that it is a Latin American ontology specific to the region, meaning that each individual region of Latin America will have to develop their own interpretation of Buen Vivir. Thus the ontology of Buen Vivir will not be able to explain the process of regional integration in the European Union.

The theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism has been chosen in this thesis because it holds the best explanatory power in the EU case and yet complements other theories in the thesis. As will be mentioned further, the integration process in the EU serves as a model for the integration in other places in the world. The region of Latin America is not an exception, however, the outcomes of the analysis of the EU from the LI perspective will serve as some sort of a guideline, a reinterpretation of the integration process that can be reconstructed in the region but with the usage of the Security Communities theory and Buen Vivir, considering the obvious differences between these two regions. The European Union in itself is a very unique project, one of a kind, and it naturally holds this status for those who wish to achieve the same level of integration. Since this project aims to present a different approach on how to achieve integration in Latin America, the analysis of the EU through LI will serve as a benchmark for other theories to add more to the pot in order to understand, whether and how it can be applicable in the conditions of Latin America The European case shall be firstly introduced in its own chapter through the description of events which trigged and led to integration in Europe and to the creation of the European Union as we know it today. In the analysis part of the EU case, the focus shall be put on the analysis of interaction between different states with the usage of Liberal Intergovernmentalism theory primarily and additionally with the theory of Security Communities. Even though one might argue that LI is a western type of theoretical approach with its own hierarchy of values and preferences, the theory of Buen Vivir in combination with the theory of

10

Security Communities will help to bridge this difference between these theoretical approaches and open a new perspective.

As been said previously, LI will be used in the analysis of the Latin American case as well but rather as a comparison to the Security Communities and Buen Vivir which is expected to hold better explanatory power over the integration in this region. These claims shall be supported further in the analysis part of the thesis as there is a wide area of conditions which have to be analyzed in both of the cases.

#### 2.3 Case Selection and timeframe

At a certain point in time, the general teachings were that case studies were appropriate for the exploratory phase of an investigation. Surveys and histories could be argued to be appropriate for a descriptive phase, and furthermore that experiments were the only way of doing explanatory or causal inquires. This however can be argued to be a common historical misconception, as this is incorrect. The more appropriate view of these strategies is a pluralistic one, meaning that each strategy can be used for all three purposes. The different use of the strategies depends heavily on the study questions that a given paper of thesis engages in, these being those of "who, "what", "where", "how" and "why". This thesis works exclusively with questions regarding "how", "why" and "what", where especially "how" and "why" can be argued to be of an explanatory nature, and these will according do Yin lead us to case, histories and experiments as preferred research strategies. Having established that "how", "what" and "why" questions are the focus of the thesis, a further distinction among history, case study and experiment exists. This distinction can be argued to be the investigator's control over and access to actual behavioral events. In this regard, the distinctive contribution of the historical method can be argued to be in dealing with the dead past in which there are no relevant persons alive to report on what occurred at the time, while the case study is preferred in examining contemporary events in which the investigator has no manipulative ability over the relevant behavioral actors. The case study relies on many of the same techniques as a historical approach, although the unique strength is its ability to deal with a full variety of evidence, these being documents, artifacts, interviews and observations. A historical method can also be undertaken to investigate contemporary events, although in this situation the strategy begins to overlap with that of case studies, which can be argued be the case in this thesis. Furthermore, this thesis will attempt to undertake theory development on Security Communities by Deutsch et al. to create a reinterpretation of the theory to be fitted to Latin America through the lenses of Buen Vivir, using the case studies as argumentation, and thus generalizing from case study to theory. In this regards, of the challenges that could potentially arise can be argued to be that of conceiving what is called "statistical generalization" as the method of generalizing the results of the case. This is argued by the fact that these cases should not be seen as "sampling units", and should not be chosen for this reason. Instead, these case studies should be selected

for their utility of serving as a laboratory in which the investigator undertakes his or hers "experiment". In this case, multiple cases can be argued to be multiple experiments, and under these circumstances, and the method of generalization can be referenced as "analytic generalization". When utilizing this method, a previously developed theory is used as a template with which to compare the empirical results of the case study. (Yin 1994)

Although case studies can be argued to be a distinctive form of empirical inquiry, many research investigators nevertheless have disdain for the strategy, and perhaps the greatest concern has been over the lack of rigor of case study research. In other words, in many instances the case investigator has been sloppy and has allowed biased views to influence the direction of the findings and conclusions. Another possibility that exists is that investigators may confuse case study teaching with case study research. When using case studies in teaching, case study material may be altered in order to prove a point, whereas in case study research in study step would be considered strictly forbidden. A second common concern, and one that has been briefly mentioned above, is the concern that case studies provide little basis for scientific generalization. A response to this is that the same concern can be argued to be relevant in regards to experiment, but that a generalization is never made from one single experiment, but rather are made up of several experiments. In this sense, the case study much like the experiment can be argued not to be a sample, and that the investigators goal is to expand and generalize theories through analytical generalization, as opposed to being enumerate frequencies. (Yin 1994)

This thesis finds the foundation of the case selection in the logic of critical case selection. The cases, as they are put forward by this thesis has thus been based on the belief that these cases can test and further develop the understanding and reinterpretation of Deutsch el al.'s Security Communities. An additional consideration has been that a critical case selection can be argued to be well suited for theory testing, especially within a critical theory framework. This is due to the fact that it focuses on cases that can help clarify and further explain the theory, rather than giving an illustrative measure, which simply show-case the elements of a given theory.

The thesis furthermore seeks to further limit the selection of cases by setting a time limit, starting the timeline at the end of WWII in 1945. This has been done based on a number of various factors. An obvious first reason can be argued to be the desire to create a community in Europe that would help maintain the peace on the continent. Additionally, before that time, it would have been hard to discuss regional integration in either Europe or Latin America. It was furthermore in the years that followed after WWII that Latin America, like many developing regions utilized the import substitution industrialization (ISI) development theory. This strategy was taken, as it was argued at the time that ISI was a tool to bring a third

world country to first world status through national industrialization. This strategy was however gradually abandoned in the 1980's and 90's due to pressure from IMF and World Bank to implement their structural adjustment programs that would ultimately lead to market-driven liberalization. This liberalization of the market and the economy along with other development strategies is what the concept of Buen Vivir aims to confront. (Gudynas 2011)

For the case study of the Latin American case, the nation of Ecuador has been chosen. It has been so, because the concept of Buen Vivir has been implemented in the nations national development plan for 2013-2017 and was before that in the 2009-2013 development plan. Ecuador is not the only region in which governments have been experimenting with Buen Vivir, but also in Argentina the government has attempted to include Buen Vivir into the national development plan. The reason why the Ecuadorian interpretation, called "Sumak Kawsay" have been selected over the Argentinian Suma Qamaña is because that while the Bolivian example is focused on Buen Vivir as an ethical principle, the interpretation in Ecuador offers a stronger approach because the concept is conceived as a plural set of rights. The Bolivian approach offers more options for cultural diversity than that of Ecuador, but does not include Buen Vivir as a right, while the Ecuadorian text clearly states that development in line with Buen Vivir is required to fulfill the rights of Nature. Furthermore, as these principles are implemented into the development plan, they become something tangible, and more than something held merely abstract terms, which according to Deutsch et al. is one of the essential background conditions around which a security community may form. (Deutsch 1957) (Gudynas 2011)

The case of European Union has been selected due to its specific position in regional integration sphere. It's been viewed as one of the most successful – if not the most successful projects in regional integration so far – counting more than 500 million people being part of it. Its uniqueness lies in its ability to merge 28 of its Member State's countries into a single decision making body, which operates by combining both intergovernmental and supranational decision-making. The EU has its own executive, legislative and jurisdictional bodies, internal single market with free movement of goods, people, services and capital, its own currency and strategic plans its common policies. (EU Commission n.d.) This makes the EU a fine example of a proper and well-functioning regional organization. It has been naturally chosen as an example or an inspiration shall be analyzed thought he usage of Andrew Moravcsik's theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism, a key theory of European integration, which has been developed from earlier theory of Intergovernmentalism, by Hoffman. Moravcsik's theory is labeled as a "baseline" theory according to which other theories are often compared because of its success in explaining the behavior of states

between each other within the intergovernmental bodies of the EU. Liberal intergovernmentalism is also labeled as a "grand theory" that tries to explain the overall evolution of regional integration. (A. &. Moravcsik 2009) These features of LI allows it to be flexible and universal in its explanatory power, making it very suitable to combine it with other theoretical approaches suggested in this study.

#### 3. Theoretical chapter

#### **3.1 Security communities**

The theory of Security Communities was originally developed during a time in which multiple governments around Europe strived to abolish war, particularly between Germany and France. Many scholars and academics at the time strived to understand more about what propelled the European integration and whether lasting peace would be possible at all. One of these academics was Karl Deutsch (1912-1992) who through the help of seven colleagues engaged in the study of how one might one day abolish war. The study resulted in the work called "Political community and the North Atlantic Area" finished in 1957 that focuses on historical cases of integration in order to analyze if lessons learned could be applied to the area of Western Europe, Canada and the United States. After analyzing the various cases, Deutsch et al. was able to conclude that in order to achieve successful integration a region would require a sense of community or so called "we feeling" with a core political area around which the community could fuse together. A rise in political capabilities would also be required in order to sufficiently meet the requirements of an enlarged geopolitical area. The key insight of the study is that integration is a learning process that will take time, and must happen around a set of common values, which will be discussed in the next section. Furthermore, communication and transactions between integrating territories must be ever expanding. The study furthermore turned out to be skeptical towards the functionalist approach, admitting however that functionalism had worked in the past. The study was originally overshadowed by neofunctionalism when it first came out, but has had a recent surge in interest from all parts of the world, as various integration schemes takes place and with the rising question of what it means to be "European" or "Latin American". Neofunctionalism is a theory of regional integration much like security communities with the explicit purpose to utilize the pioneering European experience of integration, in order to generate hypotheses for testing in other contexts. It describes and explains the process of regional integration with reference to how three causal factors interact, those being growing economic interdependence between nations, organizational capacity to resolve disputes and build international legal regimes and supranational market rules that replace national regulatory regimes. (Deutsch 1957)

This section will discuss the social, political and economic capabilities to successfully build a security community, and furthermore how integration should be understood within the framework of the study.

In order to have a proper framework of understanding, this section will start with explaining some terms that will be used in the next section where the different conditions and parts of integration will be covered. The thesis is researching political communities, regarded as social groups with a process of political communication. These are furthermore regarded as communities with some sort of enforcement machinery and some popular habits of compliance. It is important to notice that a political community is not always able to maintain peace within the area it covers, but some communities however do eliminate both war within their boundaries and the expectancy hereof. It is this kind of political community that can be classified as a security community. In Deutsch et al. own words, a security community is a group of people who has become integrated within a given region (Deutsch 1957)p4.

In this case, integration means the attainment of a sense of community or "we feeling" within a given territory or political community with institutions and practices strong and widespread enough to secure dependable expectations of peaceful change among its population for what can be understood as a relatively long time. This sense of community can be understood as a belief on the part of the individuals in a group that they have come to an agreement on at least one point, being that common social problems must and can be solved through a process of peaceful change. This peaceful change can then in turn be understood as the resolution of social problems usually by institutionalized procedures without the need to resort to large scale physical violence. Due to these understandings, a security community is then a political community in which there is a real assurance that the members of that community will not fight each other physically, but will settle their disputes in some other way. If assumed that the whole world would be one integrated security community, wars would automatically be eliminated. Deutsch et al. divide security communities into two sections, being those of either an amalgamated or a pluralistic community. The amalgamated security community can be understood as the formal merger of two or more previously sovereign units into one larger unit with a common government after amalgamation. This common government can then either be unitary or federal. Apposed to that is the pluralistic security community that is able to retain its legal independence of separate governments, which means that some overarching government decisions are centralized and standardized, while the day to day governance are being handled regionally. This means that with a pluralistic security community, national states stay sovereign, but have burdens removed from overarching governmental decisions, and have their capabilities increased by cooperation. If amalgamation happens without integration, a security community does not exist. Both types of integration require even though it may be very loose, some kind of organization on the

international level. In order to be able to say that a security community has been reached, it matters little how much time it took, as integration is here seen as a matter of fact, and not time. In regards to this note it should be added that integration and amalgamation overlap, and thus one can have integration without amalgamation and vice versa. (Deutsch 1957)

This thesis will be working primarily with the sort of integrated security community classified as pluralistic as opposed to amalgamated communities. Pluralist security communities have their own specific characteristics, but as these are more or less similar to those of an amalgamated one, the thesis will be taking all essential parts into consideration. The strengths of pluralistic security communities, however, Deutsch et al. found to be that that they are somewhat easier to attain and preserve, indicated in their studies by the relative successes and failures of each type of security community. Pluralistic communities were thus found to be a more promising approach to elimination of war over large areas. It is important to add though, that this particular type of security has certain limitations, being of those that it I was found to be working only in situations in which keeping the peace between participants would overshadow all other political goals. Often participants of a political community in historical cases have wanted more however; they have wanted a community or institution that could do more than merely ensuring peace among its territories, more in this case being able to act as a unit for other purposes. In regards to acting accordingly and efficiently for positive goals, amalgamated security communities have historically been superior and participants of a security community have often been willing to risk civil war in order to reach a point of amalgamation, in order integrate further and thus to ensure this greater promise of capacity for joint action. In modern times pluralistic security communities may appear a somewhat safer device than amalgamation for dealing the potential scale of destruction in the case that attempts fail. When we talk about the term integration, it's important to understand that Deutsch et al. originally believed it to be a one way process, or an "all or nothing" process in which there was a threshold that a unit or area could step over in order to be "integrated". On the one side of this threshold, population and policy makers considered warfare among states within the political community as still a serious possibility and prepared for it, while on the other side of the before mentioned threshold they were supposed to do so no longer. The historical cases however showed integration may involve a fairly broad zone of transition rather than a narrow threshold and that states might cross and recross this threshold several times. (Deutsch 1957)

Deutsch et al. furthermore suggests that integration being a more elaborate process than first assumed, can be understood within a revised framework developing a "sense of community" in order to facilitate the process of moving towards an either pluralistic or amalgamated security community. Populations of different territories could easily through verbal attachment agree to the same set of norms and values,

16

without them necessarily having the sense of community that will lead to political integration. Therefore, instead this sense of community should rest on something more than verbal assent to either some or many explicit propositions, more specifically it should be about a feeling of sympathy and loyalty and community in which participants would have mutual success in predictability of behavior combined with at least partial identification in terms of self-images and interests and a "we feeling". (Deutsch 1957)

In order to reach this kind of "we feeling", some particular habits of political behavior on the part of individuals and some particular traditions and institutions on the part of social groups and political units. These habits are developed and acquired through background conditions that happen so slowly that at any moment they appear as something given. The speed and extent of these habits of integrative political behavior are then influenced in each situation by these background conditions. The outcome of this political integration then depends on the interplay of the effects of background conditions with moving political events. In this interplay, it seems to be the aspect of political, economic and social capabilities of participating units that requires the most attention, as these were found to be related to the general capabilities of a given political unit for taking action in regards to politics and development. Development in is in this case of a linear fashion understood as increasing monetary power, increases in infrastructure and education combined with an increase in political participation of the broader population. Development is furthermore seen as an important background condition for creating either an amalgamated or pluralistic security community within a given region. Importantly, this thesis does not work with development as being linear, but as something more fluid, and understood in terms of community and general well-being. This terminology stems from the theory of Buen Vivir that will be elaborated on later in the thesis. This nonlinear understanding of development as community could prove to be the "we feeling" or "sense of community" that Deutsch et al. discusses as being important background conditions for successful integration into what is described as a Security Community. (Gudynas 2011) (Deutsch 1957)

The core of strength around which the integration process can occur is found in the most advanced political units in regards to politics, economy and education. Especially the amalgamated process seems to adhering to this general rule, as it turned out to usually be a nuclear process that happened around single cores. These capabilities of participating units turned out to be of vital importance to the process of political integration, as much as the further increase in these capabilities in the course of the movement towards amalgamation. It was seen in historical cases that amalgamation did not happen due to governments of political units being either weaker or more inefficient, but rather amalgamation happened after a substantial increase in the capabilities of at least some participating units, and sometimes all of them. These capabilities can be put into two broad classifications. One can be said to be related to the

capacity to act as a political unit, such as power and economic strength. The other can be said to be related to the ability of a unit to control its own behavior and to redirect its own attention. More accurately this means the ability of its political decision makers and relevant political elites to redirect and control their own attention and behavior so as to enable rulers to receive communications from other political units which were to be their prospective partners in the political integrative process. It furthermore means an ability to give a given message from another political unit the adequate weight in the making of their own decisions. In order to determine what communication to give more weight than others, it's necessary to perceive the needs of the populations and the elites of these other units, and furthermore it's equally important to respond to these needs quickly and adequately in terms of political or economic action. It is important to notice that Deutsch et al. takes an approach of a "top down" solution, involving the elites, which fits poorly with the theory of Buen Vivir, the latter being a "bottom up" solution that doesn't value the elites or ultimately hierarchy at all. This calls for a reinterpretation of Security Communities. (Deutsch 1957) (Gudynas 2011)

The first kind of capabilities related to overcoming external obstacles can then be classified as "power" while the second kind can be classified as "responsiveness". Closely related to this, is the importance of burdens put on the before mentioned capabilities of participating political units by the requirements of establishing or maintaining either an amalgamated or pluralistic community. These burdens include military or financial burdens, drains of man power or wealth. Furthermore, it covers the costs of social and economic readjustments such as the establishment of a customs union, but also included intangible burdens upon governments. These intangible burdens can be explained and visualized as traffic loads of vehicles at a road intersection. It thus requires a certain number of decisions to be made in a limited time framework. It can be explained as a burden upon the attention giving information process and decision making capabilities of administrators, legislatures or electoral majorities. Amalgamation in general tends to increase the load of demands upon resources and decision making of governments as decisions for larger areas and populations had to be made by fewer central institutions. The success or failure of political integration in this instance relies on the rate of change between rising capabilities and rising loads upon a given political government. (Deutsch 1957)

Having mentioned the importance of certain background conditions such as capabilities of various kinds, it's equally important to mention that Deutsch et al. also found that some background conditions may have been historically overrated. These conditions, although perceived as helpful, turned out to be nonessential. Such helpful but nonessential conditions include ethnically or linguistic assimilation and foreign threats. These conditions turned out helpful, but couldn't be said to be essential as each of them was

18

absent in the successful establishment of at least one amalgamated security-community. None of the essential or nonessential background conditions seems to be by itself sufficient for success, and all of them together may not be sufficient either. Nonetheless it does seem plausible that any group of states or territories which fulfilled all the essential conditions for an amalgamated security community identified this far should also be at least on a good part of the way to successful amalgamation. The essential background conditions can be broken into groups, the first group dealing with motivations for political behavior and in particular dealing with the values and expectations held in the politically relevant strata. It is necessary that these values and expectations are compatible within the relevant political strata of all participating units. It was furthermore found in the study by Deutsch et al. that values were most effective when held not merely in abstract terms, but instead incorporated in political institutions and in habits of political behavior which permits these values to be acted on in such a way as to strengthen a population's attachment to them. This connection between values and habits turned out to be crucial, and can be described as a "way of life", that is a set of socially accepted values and of institutional means for their pursuit and attainment. Such a way of life has to include at least some major social or political values and institutions which are different from those which existed in the area during the recent past or from those prevailing among neighbors, and would usually involve a significant measure of social innovation as against the recent past. It is noted in the study by Deutsch et al that the shift of loyalties from the old smaller political units only occurred under conditions when also a great number of other political and social habits were in a state of change. In regards to expectations it's found in the study by Deutsch et al. that all cases of amalgamation were preceded by widespread expectations of joint rewards for participating units. These joint rewards could be strong economic ties or gains envisaged for the future. Economic ties are here understood as close relations of trade permitting large scale division of labor. A few noneconomic expectations turned out to be of essential value for successful amalgamation. Widespread expectations of greater social or political equality or of greater social rights were found among important groups of the relevant political strata. (Deutsch 1957)

Moving back to capabilities Deutsch and his colleagues already observed that the most important condition for amalgamation was an increase in the political capabilities of the main political units to be amalgamated, but another essential condition for amalgamation closely related to the increase in capabilities is the presence of markedly superior economic growth either measured against the recent past or against neighboring areas. Such superior economic growth had to be present at least in the main partner or partners to be included in an amalgamated security community. Furthermore, in order to achieve successful amalgamation, it is observed that unbroken links of social communication can be considered an essential requirement, social links in this instance meaning social groups and institutions providing effective channels of communication both horizontally and vertically among the main units of the amalgamated security community and vertically among the politically relevant strata within them. An essential condition related to this one is the broadening of the political, social or economic elite, both in regards to its recruitment from the social strata and to its continuing connections with them. To integrate a certain political community into an amalgamated security community, it is highly important to get the population involved, which is why Deutsch and his colleagues determine that mobility of persons among the main units at least in the politically relevant strata is an essential condition. This is why one reason to why the concept of Buen Vivir is needed within the framework in order to complement the concept of Security Communities, and to form a reinterpretation of Deutsch et al. theories of regional integration. (Deutsch 1957) (Gudynas 2011)

The study furthermore found that successful amalgamation requires a fairly broad range of different functions and services. These require a multiplicity of ranges of common communications and transactions and their institutional counterparts. Along with this conditions goes that there has to be a balance of transaction between different participating units and territories. This can be broken down into two conditions, the first being concerned with the balance of flow of communications and transactions between political units that are to be amalgamated. It is also concerned with the balance of initiatives that originate in these territories or groups and the balance of respect or of symbols standing for respect between the partners. In this regard the study finds it important that each participating unit on occasion will take initiative to a particular phase or contribution. A condition following from the preceding one is concerning balance of flows of prestige or benefits, meaning that a territory at one time might receive a particular amount of before mentioned prestige or benefits, but then in turn become sources of benefits for their partners. Balance in this case also means that the political elite within a region might find themselves having majority on one subject and minority on another, without any particular division between majorities and minorities becoming permanent. Balance is also an important aspect of Buen Vivir as the concept doesn't work with hierarchy in the traditional sense, and thus the goal of an all-powerful elite is not to be attained within Buen Vivir. The involvement of the elite means that the approach of security communities can be said to be a top down approach, whereas Buen Vivir is a bottom up process, which calls for further studies, and perhaps a reinterpretation of the current framework. (Gudynas 2011) (Deutsch 1957)

A last essential condition for both pluralistic and amalgamated communities is determined to be mutual predictability of behavior among participating units. These must be able to expect from one another some dependable interlocking or at least compatible behavior, meaning that these must be able at least to an extent to predict one another's actions. The idea here is that by looking into their own minds, a given

20

population would be able to make a fairly good guess as to what their neighbors would do, and would thus trust or understand them to some extent, much as they would trust or understand themselves. Deutsch determines that some mutual predictability of political behavior is an essential condition for an amalgamated security community, but the extent of such predictability is unclear and is a matter for further research, perhaps through the lenses of Buen Vivir (Deutsch 1957)

Having talked about conditions successful for integration, the study moves on to talk about conditions that may in turn be disintegrative to a recently amalgamated or pluralistic security community. These disintegrative conditions can be grouped under two headings, being either conditions that increased the burdens upon governments, or conditions that reduced the capabilities of such governments to cope with the burdens put upon them. A condition that increases the load on a given government and thus tends to disintegrate security communities is a substantial increase in political participation on the part of social strata that had up until that point been politically passive. This will especially be a problem, due to the relative broadening of the political "elite". The needs of additional strata will then have to be taken care of within an old system of political decision making that would likely be unable to respond to them adequately and in time. Related to this condition is the increase in ethnic and linguistic differentiation along with an increase of political awareness of this differentiation. This can be said to be a consequence of the rise in political participation among groups that are already differentiated in language and culture from the predominant nationality or regional cultural group within the political community in question, in the case of Latin America being the inclusion of the native population in particular.

Of conditions that weaken the capabilities of governments is any prolonged economic decline or stagnation, leading to economic conditions comparing unfavorably with those in neighboring areas. This condition along with the closure of the established political elite tends to promote the rise of frustrated counter elites among ethnic groups in outlying regions. A last condition related to the foregoing can be said to be an excessive delay in social, economic or political reforms having come to be expected by the population. (Deutsch 1957)

After mainly talking about amalgamated security communities, Deutsch et al. moves on to specific characteristics for pluralistic security communities. These communities would sometimes succeed under far less favorable conditions than the success of an amalgamated security community would have required, and sometimes survived unfavorable or disintegrative processes which would have destroyed an amalgamated security community. Of the conditions appearing to be essential for an amalgamated security community, only a potential three were found to be very important for a pluralistic security community as well. The first can be said to be the compatibility of major values relevant to political

decision making, while the second condition is the capacity of the participating political units or governments to respond to each other's needs quickly and adequately and without resorting to violence. A third essential condition for a pluralistic security community can be said to be the mutual predictability of behavior. Member states of pluralistic security communities however have to make joint decisions on a more limited range of subject matters and retain a far wider range of problems for autonomous decision making within their respective borders, and then consequently the range and extent of the mutual predictability of behavior required from members of a pluralistic security community is considerably less than would be essential for the successful operation of an amalgamated one. Deutsch and his colleagues argue that the background conditions essential for an either amalgamated or pluralistic security community do not have to come into existence all at once, and nor do they all grow together. Rather, they may be assembled in almost any sequence so long only as all of them come into being and take effect and that the assembling of conditions happens slowly. When this is the case, the status and condition of any and all of these conditions can be treated together as a matter of stable seemingly unchanging background. The process however can be said to have exponential attributes, as the tempo of the process quickens as the last of the conditions in each sequence are added to those whose attainment was assembled previously. In this instance, background and process become one. This goes against the Neofunctionalist approach, which would argue that given background conditions would have to come into effect in a given sequence, happening within a given framework of time.

Substantial progress toward the establishment of a balance of flows of transactions between the different units may be a matter of political progress or else a political process directed towards the attainment of a security community may produce a better balance of transaction. In regards to functionalism as a tool to reach successful integration, Deutsch and his colleagues conclude that it is a tool that have been used both successfully and unsuccessfully in attempts of secession. The result has often relied on other conditions and processes. What can be said about functionalism is, that even if considered overrated, functionalism seems less hazardous than any sudden attempt at over all integration into an either amalgamated or pluralistic security community. (Deutsch 1957)

#### 3.2 Buen vivir - Sumak Kawsay

The way that the principles of Buen Vivir can be applied to the theory of security communities is through the emphasis that security communities put on background conditions essential for social and political change to happen within a given region. These conditions cover social mobility of persons within relevant political strata along with a mutual predictability of behavior combined with a mutual compatibility of main values. Furthermore, it emphasizes a distinct way of life within a given political community or region. These essential background conditions could potentially be covered by Buen Vivir, conditioned that the theory of security communities is re-interpreted to be compatible with the Latin American case. To do that, one needs to change the way that development is looked upon in the narrative of security communities, which is that development is a linear process, this interpretation being against the principles of Buen Vivir. The idea is then, that Buen Vivir can serve as a platform for reinterpretation of the theory of security communities while acting as the center piece for the essential background conditions that according to Deutsch are necessary to bring about social change. In this thesis it is additionally shown how principles of Buen Vivir has been incorporated into the constitution of Ecuador as twelve clear objectives which according to Deutsch et al. are claiming is necessary for developing a "we feeling" or "sense of community". The claims are that a sense of community should rely on something more than verbal commitment and in this instance, incorporating Buen Vivir into a given constitution can be seen as moving away from a mere verbal commitment to the concept towards a more practical understanding of what the concept really consists off. Furthermore, Deutsch et al. argues that widespread expectations of greater social or political equality or of greater social rights can be said to be one of the essential noneconomic background conditions. The principles of the concept Buen Vivir can be said to cover both increases in social and political equality while also contributing to greater social rights, thus serving as yet another essential background condition for successful integration for a given region into either an amalgamated or pluralistic security community.

This point is enforced by the fact that the study of security communities also found that a given set of values within a given region tends to be the most effective when held not in mere abstract terms, but rather incorporated into political institutions and furthermore into habits of political behavior permitting these values to be acted on in such a way as to strengthen a populations attachment to them. Deutsch et al. found this connection between values and habits to be crucial and described it as "a way of life". Such a way of life can be said to be a set of socially accepted values and institutional means, which has to include major social or political values and institutions which are different from those which existed in the area

during the recent past, or from those prevailing among neighbors. Buen Vivir, being incorporated into political institutions and habits of Ecuador, while being different from both the neoliberal neighbors and the neoliberal past can be said to potentially fill out this function and serve as both the "we feeling", "sense of community" and "way of life".

It is suggested in the study of security communities that a broadening of the political elite is another essential condition for the successful establishment of an integrated security community, but since Buen Vivir does not value elites or hierarchy, a reinterpretation of this condition is necessary. Such a reinterpretation can be said to be of an inverse nature, understood as an ultimate broadening of the elite, uplifting every citizen to be part of the elite cf. the rights of each individual through the lenses of Buen Vivir as seen in the first objective of Ecuadors Buen Vivir development plan<sup>1</sup>. As mentioned, Buen Vivir does not value elites or hierarchy, which is why one could find it odd to broaden the elites as far as to consider every citizen as part of the elite. However, it is important to note, that if everyone is part of the "elite", then this term will have lost the value that it previously held, as thus a classical understanding of the elite will no longer be a reality.

Buen Vivir or Vivir Bien is the Spanish translation used in Latin America to describe not only an alternative form of development, but rather an alternative to development which focuses on the good life in a broad sense. The term itself has been around for decades, but has recently grown in popularity, reaching its way into two new constitutions in Ecuador and Bolivia while becoming a popular term in some government programs and furthermore being used actively by social movements. The concept can be said to be plural with two main points of entry. On one side it's made up of critical reactions to classical western development theory, while on the other side referring to alternatives to development, emerging from indigenous traditions. In this sense the concept can be said to be exploring possibilities for development beyond the modern Eurocentric traditions. The term itself is difficult to translate into English without losing the richness of it. Often when a culture lack a word for something, it is likely because that given culture lack the understanding of it, which could be the case in this instance. The term includes the classical ideas of quality of life, with the catch that this well-being is only possible within a community. The term "community" when understood through the lens of "Buen Vivir" does not value hierarchy, and includes nature in an expanded understanding. The term therefore considers the notion of well-being within a community to also include well-being between man and nature. In regards to this, the concept is also plural, as there are many different interpretations, depending on cultural, historical and ecological setting.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Look further down in this section

This thesis will work primarily with the Ecuadorian "Sumak Kawsay" aspect of "Buen Vivir" (Ruttenberg 2013) (Gudynas 2011)

The concept emerged as a reaction towards the classical western idea of development, like countless other social movements against the negative effects said to follow this particular form of development. Most other reactions however were at a superficial level, attempting to repair or fix what was considered inappropriate applications of classical development. This meant in a practical sense that Western development was considered deceased or broken, but at the same time resuscitated and reinterpreted becoming what Gudynas in his text describe as a "zombie concept", being dead and alive at the same time. The challenge in this case is that classical development on one side can be declared as defunct and then in the next step promoted as the only way forward. Any alternative to development must then open paths to move beyond the modern western culture, and according to Gudynas, Buen Vivir offers that opportunity. (Gudynas 2011)

As mentioned before, the concept itself goes back centuries while early formulations of the concept emerged in reaction to classical development strategies due to its negative social or environmental impact. The critique of classical development stems from negative impacts of development projects implemented by governments and multilateral development banks in Latin America during the last decades and especially from realizing that instrumental fixes in the early 2000's were inadequate where after the classical development idea had to be abandoned. Buen vivir here represents a radical deconstruction of the cultural base of development, its legitimating discourses, its applications and institutional framework. This kind of radical questioning is possible within several indigenous traditions in South America, traditions which in turn lacked a word for "development". Further contribution of indigenous knowledge to Buen Vivir therefore continues to be a critical thread. The two most well-known approaches to Buen Vivir are the Ecuadorian and Bolivian examples. The former approach, Sumak Kawsay, is an old Kichwa word for a fullness of life in a community, together with other people and nature. At the same time as the former appeared in Ecuador, Bolivia experienced the emergence of a similar approach stemming from the Aymara concept of Suma Qamaña. Both concepts received widespread social, cultural and political support as they offered pathways to overcome the obsession with the word "development" and explore alternatives within a multicultural setting. These different approaches to Buen Vivir were incorporated into the new constitutions of Ecuador and Bolivia in 2008 and 2009. Both cases happened as a reaction to the neoliberal market reforms in the late 1990's and early 2000's, although the concept was handled in quite different ways in these two constitutions. This thesis however as previously mentioned will be operating primarily with the Ecuadorian concept of Sumak Kawsay using the Bolivian Suma Qamaña as a point of reference. In

the new Constitution of Ecuador, Sumak Kawsay is described as a set of rights, which include those referred to health, shelter, education, food and environment. It is then not understood as an ethical principle for the state as one would see in Bolivia for instance. Rather it is understood as a complex set of several rights, most of them likewise found in Western Tradition although fitted in a different framework. These rights are found in the same hierarchy level with similar set of rights that include freedom, participation, communities, protection and also the rights of nature which is one of the striking innovations particularly in the Ecuadorian text. Happening simultaneously was the adaptation of Buen Vivir based on the rights of the Ecuadorian constitution bringing together what can be called a "Buen Vivir" regime with a corresponding development regime that moves away from the classical approach where a classical development strategy determines and limits economic and social life. As opposed to this, the Ecuadorian approach requires that the economic, political, social, cultural and environmental areas should instead be arranged to guarantee Sumak Kaway. The Ecuadorian approach can be argued to be stronger than that of Bolivia, because the concept is conceived as a plural set of rights, rather than the Bolivian case where it is understood as an ethical principle, although the Bolivian approach offers more options for multicultural diversity than the Ecuadorian. As stated previously, the Ecuadorian formulation takes nature into consideration, manifested in that development in line with Buen Vivir is required to fulfill the rights of Nature or "Pachamama". (Gudynas 2011)

In both of the above mentioned cases, indigenous knowledge works as a key element in the political process, although Buen Vivir is not limited to those frameworks. Other understandings of Buen Vivir have existed for centuries but are only now being drawn into the debate around development, and are all distinct from Western knowledge rooted in modernity. Most of them have emerged as expressions of decolonial efforts to strengthen cultural identity. Even with this being true, Buen Vivir should not be understood as a return to a pre-colonial distant Andean past, being a static concept, but rather as an idea that is continually being created. All the different interpretations of Buen Vivir are specific to each culture and placed in diverse environments. Thus the Ecuadorian Sumak Kawsay is not identical to Suma Qamaña, and none of the two are identical with any other. Some of the interpretations are very specific to a certain region, and shouldn't be attempted to be applied in other regions, as these would have to explore and build their own Buen Vivir. (Gudynas 2011) (Ruttenberg 2013)

The term Buen Vivir is best understood as an umbrella for a set of different positions. The Ecuadorian interpretation of Sumak Kawsay is thus being given weight in this study, merely for its constitutional utility. As mentioned, Buen Vivir is not restricted to indigenous postures, but is understood as partly an umbrella concept, but also as a hybridization of ideas stemming from small marginalized or neglected critical

26

positions within modernity, which are critical of classical development and its deviations. In regards to this, can be mentioned three different cases, which offer examples of different possible linkages with indigenous traditions. The first one can be said to be critical studies on development in general, and post development in particular. In this instance, most of the relations are of mutual reinforcement with ideas like Suma Qamaña or Sumak Kawsay. The second one is radical environmental postures, particularly deep ecology and other biocentric approaches. The last positions come from feminist perspectives with their radical view of gender roles and its links with societal hierarchies, but also domination over nature. In this case, the relation of learning and openness to other views is reversed, as most indigenous traditions have a difficult time acknowledging gender inequalities and the importance of recognizing women's agency and power. Buen Vivir should thus not be seen as a position limited to indigenous knowledge, but as a useful concept than can support and enhance critical traditions looking for alternatives to development. Even though Buen Vivir can be understood as a plural umbrella concept, it is still possible to draw some borders around the concept, as it can be said to have a core of common ideas. First and foremost it can be considered as a platform where critical views of development are shared. All positions consider the alternatives presented by Buen Vivir not as instrumental fixes of current strategies, but as an alternative of the very idea of development. Furthermore, all positions promote ethical perspectives that are grounded in values, and thus acknowledge that there are several ways to give value, such as esthetic, cultural, historical, environmental and spiritual. Lastly, intrinsic values are recognized and Nature becomes a subject, and thus human beings as the only source of values are therefore displaced. The vision promoted supports a need to explore beyond conventional Eurocentric knowledge for alternatives to development. Decolonization is thus an important component within various Buen Vivir proposals, which opens the door to a different set of understandings and feelings towards the world. Furthermore, Buen Vivir moves away from the prevalence of instrumental and manipulative rationality, and thus rejects the modern stance that almost everything should be dominated and controlled, and at the same time it does not endorse the classical understanding of a unidirectional linear progression of history. Lastly it is not restricted to a material dimension, as it is also a common dimension of the concept to share feelings and affections. (Gudynas 2011)

Buen vivir as the ideal development objective is a new perspective for looking to the future, guiding it and imagining it. It is not just a change in semantics or discourse. To understand the concept to its fullest, one must look at the conceptual and programmatic implications of Buen Vivir, those being:

27

- Development is no longer single or universal but plural, and is thus understood to be comprehensive, able to address situations that are not homogenous and to incorporate social, political, economic and cultural aspects.
- Development can be no longer be seen as merely a quantitative aim, but rather as a qualitative process that has to consider the community's enjoyment of material goods and subjective, spiritual and intellectual realization.
- The accumulation of wealth and industrialization are no longer the aims of a desirable future, but are means for attaining the harmonious co-existence between communities and between and communities and nature.
- Co-existence between human beings becomes primary, and thus well-being does not depend on exploiting others, even less on the cultural exclusion of the indigenous people. (Prada 2013)

#### 3.2.1 Constitutional implementation of Sumak Kawsay in Ecuador

As previously mentioned, indigenous movements in both Ecuador and Bolivia have succeeded in articulating Buen Vivir politically, with both countries not only adopting the language of Buen vivir in their constitutions, but also incorporating it into their national development plans with the explicit goal of implementing policies to support the realization of Buen Vivir. In Ecuador, the indigenous Quecha concept of Sumak Kawsay has been incorporated into the country's 2009-2013 Buen Vivir Development Plan, which lists the following as explicit policy objectives among the government's commitments and development priorities:

- Objective 1: Promote equality, cohesion and integration in social and territorial diversity
- Objective 2: Improve the capacities and potentialities of the citizenry
- Objective 3: Improve the quality of life for the population
- Objective 4: Guarantee the rights of nature and promote a healthy and sustainable environment
- Objective 5: Guarantee sovereignty and peace, and promote strategic insertion into the world and Latin American integration
- Objective 6: Guarantee stable, just and dignified employment in its diverse forms
- Objective 7: Build and strengthen public, intercultural and common meeting spaces
- Objective 8: Affirm and strengthen national identity, diverse identities, plurinationality and interculturality
- Objective 9: Guarantee the valid existence of rights and justice

- Objective 10: Guarantee access to public and political participation
- Objective 11: Establish a social economic system based on solidarity and sustainability
- Objective 12: Construct a democratic state for the realization of Buen Vivir

Ecuador's Buen Vivir policy experience tests the utility of translating the abstract concept of Buen Vivir into practical socioeconomic development solutions. This plan for national development contains a platform for meeting human development objectives, including those of reducing poverty and inequality and strengthening human capacities. In both Ecuador and Bolivia the Buen Vivir experience can be said to offer an example of local values and wellbeing needs articulated by an indigenous population, furthermore incorporated into government policies and thus establishing a two-way policy relationship between top-down and bottom-up approaches to development. (Ruttenberg 2013)

As Buen Vivir has emerged as an influential driver for reinterpretation of development policy a range of considerations and criticisms must be taken into account, if the concept is to continue moving forward. According to Eduardo Gudynas who has analyzed both the policy framework of both Bolivia and Ecuador, the framework in Ecuador deserves commending for being able to find ways to overcome the countries dependence on natural resource exports and the extraction economy as basis of its development mode, and simultaneously he calls for more explicit mechanisms of policy implementation, follow up and evaluation. The post neoliberal paradigm has furthermore been criticized by the left for its practical moderation as an outgrowth of the former neoliberal era, rather than being a fundamental transformation in the social politics of power, or the exploitative structures of production that generate inequalities and potentially deepen poverty in the first place. According to Carlos Vilas, an author on the left in Latin America, the former ends up absorbing some of the worst habits of politics-as-usual, and thus diluting its own proposals for transformation into short-run pragmatism. Instead of implementing a structural transformation that overcomes the redistributive effects and increasing social inequality, the new left can be said to be an exemplification of a policy pragmatism that favors the short-term. They are then continuing the promotion of the same unsustainable neoliberal means and capitalist relations of production that have caused the social problems that their new socioeconomic policies seek to relieve. Buen Vivir as a paradigm can thus be seen as an inspiring framework for revolutionizing development policy and practice. To ensure the purity of the concept, it is important to recognize current structural and institutional limitations that can threaten the potential for a true transition toward post-extractivist and post-neoliberal development alternatives or alternatives to development. Furthermore, the lack of comprehensive understanding of what the concept actually entails can be said to threaten the integrity of Buen Vivir as a useful development strategy or alternative.

#### 3.3 The theory of liberal intergovernmentalism

Liberal intergovernmentalism acts as a baseline to which other theories of international relations are often compared. Given this, it can act as a useful tool to bring together the theory of social communities and Buen Vivir. Both theories of LI and SC share the same background and theoretical angle, but the theory of SC has been largely overshadowed by LI due to its collaboration with neofunctionalist approaches. Despite being both, a top-down theories, the theory of security communities shares the same basic approach with the theory of LI in terms of a shared will towards international cooperation based on the "we feeling" factor, which helps to merge independent actors to a larger unified body that covers wider range of collective fields of interest. This factor is present in all three theories and described as essential in order to create a long-lasting and reliable international cooperation. Despite the fact that the SC theory has been overshadowed by neofunctionalists, both theories can relate to neofunctionalist ground principles of integration. These principles complement the SC model of integration, where the European case serves as a guideline for the SC model to expand in the Latin America region. (A. &. Moravcsik 2009)

The theory of LI has received a widespread support in the EU and thus it can be seen more successful in compare to the similar attempts performed in the Latin America. The postulate is that the "western" theoretical approach represented by the theory LI holds its best explanatory power over the European case and will subsequently not be able to reach the same explanatory level in the Latin America. Therefore, the theoretical analysis of the integration in Latin America will be done not only through theories of LI and SC, but will be enriched by the local ontology of Sumak Kawsai, considering the economic, cultural and societal differences in both regions. The analysis will then also show if the theory of security communities has been rightfully overshadowed by neofunctionalism and liberal intergovernmentalism, and if it can be potentially revitalized.

LI is thus seen as a "benchmark" theory in this thesis, as its strong explanatory power over the EU case provides useful insight on how the successful results in the field of regional integration can be reached. It can be said that the task of this thesis is to show that a integration scheme which works in one particular region does not necessarily have to be implemented in the same manner in another given region, but rather that local cultures, narratives and ontologies are of vital importance for the success of integration in particular region. In terms of regional integration, Liberal Intergovernmentalism (LI) has been often referred as a "baseline theory" against which many other regional integration theories<sup>2</sup> are often compared. This has happened due to several reasons which shall be further discussed.

LI, grounded in a larger social science theory, is using traditional integration theories of European integration studies in combination with the traditional "intergovernmentalism" (developed by Hoffman). While the traditional integration theories (especially neofunctionalism) see regional integration and the European Union (EU) as a one of a kind activity, when combined with the intergovernmentalism they create a new viewpoint which allows LI to explain the motivations of social interactions between states and leaders and to predict their behavior and the dynamic impacts of integration process.

This approach made LI a "grand theory" and not just a simple narrow viewpoint for certain political activities. It seeks to explain the broader causes of regional integration through the linkage of multiple theories and factors to give one coherent approach on how to explain the trajectory of integration over time. (A. &. Moravcsik 2009)

LI despite its multi-causal approach remains simple as its basic assumptions can be summed up in a few general statements about the EU politics in rather simplified manner when letting go of certain secondary activities. However, because of the multi-causal approach, LI claims that proper explanation of integration needs to be done by combing at least three theories that has to deal with preferences, bargaining and institutions. Moreover, these theories vary when it comes to the area of interest and other specific circumstances. Despite this approach, the simplicity of LI differentiates it from other concepts such as "multi-level governance" because of its ability to operate with rather descriptive metaphors than with the analysis of all possible political interrelationships inside the EU. Yet, the parsimony and generality along with other functions are not the only source of LI's success in its predictions about European politics. (A. &. Moravcsik 2009)

In its very basics, LI sees states as actors in the international environment of anarchy. In this context, the EU just like any other international institutions can be analyzed by its ability on how to achieve its goals through bargaining and negotiations with other international actors. This is happening through a common strategy and approach of its member states rather than by actions taken by some ruling authority from within the EU. In this respect, the European Community (EC)<sup>3</sup> coordinates its policies for the sake of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The main purpose of integration theories is to explain European integration, which started in the 1950's in Europe. The Theory of neofunctionalism has been dominating since the beginning of European integration until 1990's, followed by the Theory of liberal intergovernmentalism developed by Andrew Moravcsik. These theories are refered together as classical or traditional theories of European integration. (A. Moravcsik 1993)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> According to The Free Dictionary, European Community (EC) and the European Union (EU) can be defined as: *"An economic and political organization formed from the consolidation in 1967 of three western European treatyorgan izations: the European Economic Community, the European Coal and Steel Community, and the EuropeanAtomic Energ y Community. In 1993 the European Community was integrated into the new European Union."* (A. Moravcsik 1993)

greater good. This is not however a "realist" assumption, as security factor is not the main reason behind the coordinated approach of the Community – the relationships between states in institutions such as the EU are based on decision-making and political legitimization of its Member States, which might not necessarily share the same opinion about their preferences.

Following this assumption, LI sees states as rational actors in the international environment. What this means is that these actors take into consideration other possible outcomes of a certain decision and choose the one that maximizes and favors their position in their future activities, despite the uncertainty about the future. Therefore, the establishment of international communities can be seen as a rational state choice achieved through international negotiations.

To sum it up, international cooperation can be reinterpreted as a three step method. Firstly, states identify their preferences, which are secondly during process of negotiations transferred into (thirdly) common institutions which secure the outcomes of negotiations in respect to the uncertain future. In this process, each of these stages can be explained through different theory, so the outcomes of the cooperation can be explained only after the end of the whole process, e.g after the process of preference formation, bargaining and institutionalization of the outcomes. At the end of this process, there is a concrete proposition based on the combination of these theories. (A. &. Moravcsik 2009)

In Moravcsik's book *The Choice for Europe* (1998), he addressed a set of questions after looking at the evolution of the EU in the period of 1955 until 1992, namely:

*"1. national preferences were driven by general geopolitical ideas and interests of by issue-specific (generally economic) interests;* 

2. substantive bargaining outcomes were shaped by the manipulation of information by supranational entrepreneurs and information asymmetries or by intergovernmental bargaining on the basis of asymmetrical interdependence;

3. the choice of EU institutions reflected federalist ideology, the need for technocratic management, or an interest in securing credible member state commitments." (A. &. Moravcsik 2009, 69)

The process of EU integration can be understood from the upper mentioned as a series of rational choices stated by national leaders which takes into consideration their abilities and capabilities in achieving their economic interests, their relative powers based on asymmetrical interdependence and therefore the creation of international institutions to secure the credibility of their commitments. The process of European integration shall be discussed and analyzed later in the paper.

LI sees states as unitary actors are able to reach their consistent preferences through the three stage process despite the wide spread of domestic actors (private actors, organizations with independent interests) that contribute to the process preference formation. Yet, according to theories of international relations, domestic actors have impact on the formation of foreign policy preferences by taking into account the opinions of domestic social groups that are being represented through political institutions. These preferences are not fixed, as they might possibly change in time, depending on the issue-specific domestic situation and societal interdependence.

To avoid misunderstanding, LI doesn't assume that the producer's interests prevail or that policy is being shaped due to economic preferences. For example, in economic area national interest is based on the balanced choice between producer interests and taxpayers along with regulatory components involved in the process. In other non-economic areas the economic factor is less important, while other non-economic components play more crucial role in the preference formation process.

The establishment and design of international institutions from a rationalist point of view is based on regime-theoretical aspect, e.g. it sees international institutions as a tool to tackle the unexpected, unpredictable and often unwanted outcomes. LI takes a different approach based on neo-liberal view, according to which international institutions provide states with better and more durable international cooperation. In this context, states delegate a portion of their sovereignty towards supranational bodies, which have certain authority above national governments and are able to set the conditions in case of uncertain and unexpected future events. Furthermore, international institutions provide states with more efficient international negotiations at reduced costs along with information about other states preferences and behavior. These institutions are the result of negotiations between states, where they also set the rules and consequences in cases of both compliance and non-compliance between them. Respectively, issuespecific problems of cooperation require different institutional designs. In such cases, in order to improve the ability of reaching agreements a rearrangement of polling sovereignty or different arrangement of delegation may affect the issue-specific compliance results. In the EU for instance, most of the procedures are ment to improve the process of bargaining along with the reduction of the unexpected. In such cases, the Member States can delegate decisions in common decision-making to the EU. This eventually reduces the costs of negotiations and reaching joint decisions. Moreover, international institutions can help governments to deal with issues stemming from domestic politics. (A. &. Moravcsik 2009)

According to some scholars, the theory of LI cannot properly explain regional integration processes. This is the case with rational institutionalists who claim that LI is unable to provide proper explanation to daily decision-making processes of institutions and therefore it limits itself to just a portion of EU decisionmaking in which institutions play less significant role. Secondly, according to historical institutionalists, LI is focusing way too much on the treaty-amending and on the intergovernmental decision making process and therefore it doesn't pay enough attention to the unexpected and unwanted outcomes which comes in the future. This raised further questions about LI's ability to deal with the European integration process. The theory of LI identifies itself as a theory of intergovernmental decision-making in the conditions of anarchy. It not necessarily deals with the pre-institutional period, which led to assumption that it focuses primarily on the treaty-amendment moments, where the theory of rational institutionalism fits better with the everyday analysis of decision-making. More recent models and along with a lot of new literature emerged that are dealing with the analysis of the institutions, their decisions and procedures, explaining why institutional details matter.

Yet, despite the evidence, the truth is that LI holds its explanatory power also over the everyday decisionmaking in the EU. It's true that LI fells at its best when decision-making happens unanimously rather than in the conditions of delegated or polled sovereignty. But a lot of decisions created by the EU actually require either coming to a consensus or unanimity in voting even if the official procedure does not say so. This happens is the case in many EU institutions. (Moravcsik 2009, pg.73)

This does not mean that institutional design doesn't matter or that LI can explain everything. There are institutions in the EU with delegated authority which can act relatively autonomously; still LI has its purpose in the everyday decision-making of the EU.

Another critique from historical intergovernmental point says that LI doesn't count with the unanticipated consequences of the agreements reached by states. These consequences can be understood as shifts in national preferences, changes in governments after elections or other societal changes that can change the trajectory of international cooperation and the institutional design in the future.

LI does not only explain them; it expects them to happen. Here, the institutions precisely incorporate reached agreements in order to be able to credibly react towards future unexpected changes in the governments of its member states.

Despite this, LI cannot be seen as a universal theory because it limits itself in its own assumptions about preferences, bargaining and reached agreements. This gives space for other theories with more narrow orientation in its scope to prove that LI cannot explain all processes of the European integration. Nevertheless, LI remains a baseline theory of European integration even though there are studies framed against it with actual results. (A. &. Moravcsik 2009)

#### 4. Analytical chapter

#### 4.1 European regional integration

Europe nowadays is more prosperous than it has ever been in its history. The historical process of integration which led to the creation of the EU has changed the economic and political landscape of Europe through intense transnational cooperation and mutual interdependence between states. This is a result of intense integration process that changed the face of Europe compared to how it looked before the Second World War.

Contrary to popular belief, the process of regional integration on the European continent did not emerge in the aftermath of World War II, but rather it emerged twenty years earlier in the aftermath of World War I. The carnage and destruction which Europe experienced led to motivation of ending the old rivalries between European states. In the 1920's various pro-European organizations and movements have been established such as the Pan-European Union or the Association for European Co-operation. In 1920 negotiations have been made about the European Customs union along with the recommendation for single market due to economic stagnation in Europe and increased economic cooperation between the U.S and Japan. The proposal of creation of a European Federalist Union presented during the League of Nations Assembly in 1929 has been supported by many ministers and other officials and surprisingly not by Winston Churchill who's been actively promoting the creation of "United States of European political and economic reality. Despite the visionary idea behind these intentions, the rise of Nazism in Germany in 1933 combined with the overall lack of mass following led to the failure of integrated Europe. (Dedman 1996)

According to Professor Walter Lipgens, the biggest impact on the idea of unified Europe emerged after the World War II. Federalist ideas became increasingly popular as Europe's status has been significantly diminished compared to the risen superpowers; the U.S. and the USSR. Nation states suddenly became seen as incapable of providing sufficient amount of security and independence. Lipgens also rather surprisingly suggests that during the Nazi European occupation people got accustomed with the model of larger continental economy, which has been more effective than ten-year activity of Pan-European Union. Germany played an important role in the idea of federalized Europe as there was a common belief that only by allowing Germany (with its strong economy) to become a part of Europe will prevent any further resurgence of violence on the continent. The establishment of common market at the 1944 International Conference of Resistance Fighters in Geneva has been marked as an economic necessity to prevent the events that followed the economic crisis in 1930. It has been recognized at the Conference that Europe can only gain its ground among the company of the two superpowers of the USSR and the U.S. by achieving a level of federation. (Dedman 1996)

It's important to note that ultimately it was not only up to Europe to decide its path and structure after the War. The ultimate decision regarding the faith of post-Ward Europe would be in the hands of not the Europeans but rather in the hands of the Allies, these being the UK, the U.S. and the USSR who would have the final say. Since 1943, the Americans have been very actively supporting all European regional integration activities in order to prevent the potential spread of the USSR influence over Europe. (Dedman 1996) For this purpose, the Marshall Plan has been introduced – a package of financial help of the amount of 22 billion dollars for the European countries destroyed by war to help with their economic recovery and mutual cooperation. At the same time, the tension between two superpowers resulted into the Cold War which left its mark over the Europe as its Eastern fell under the influence of the USSR for an extended amount of time during the following years. The border has been drawn across Europe, going through Germany as it also became divided into two separate states each under the influence of one of the superpowers. The Americans realized that a weak Western Germany means weak Western Europe, so the economic recovery over the area became a priority in order to reduce the military costs of occupation and enhance the transatlantic trade. At that time, European countries were too fragile to stand on their so cooperation became inevitable in order to improve the economic and political situation in the region. (Dinan 2007)

In 1950, French Foreign Minister Robert Schuman announced the proposal of cooperation in coal and steel production which became official in 1951 after signing the Treaty of Paris. This treaty established the European Coal and Steel Community (ECSC) with its internal market between France, Germany, Belgium, the Netherlands, Luxembourg and Italy, without Britain. (Hubert Zimmermann & Andreas Dur 2012) Yet, despite the economic reasons behind the establishment of the ECSC, its biggest impact had a more political character as it symbolized the rapprochement in Franco-German relationship just few years after the War. The ECSC project which started because of economic reasons gained its political ground and made the war between the two former adversaries almost impossible. (Dinan 2007)

The establishment of the Coal and Steel Community has been an important step towards further European integration. According to neofunctionalists it led to the effect of spillover as the economic cooperation gained its momentum, the scope of cooperation between European states started to expand. The next big step in European integration has been the establishment of the European Economic Community (EEC) in 1958 with the creation of a common market and free movement of goods, services and (potentially) people. (Dinan 2007)

The Community gained new members in the two rounds of its enlargement in the 1970's. Deepening of the Community eventually meant that the Rome Treaty objectives became fulfilled. The Customs Union launched in 1968, eighteen months before the official date. The Community launched its Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) in 1970 through its own recourses – money gathered from tariffs and recourses. Furthermore, the EEC finished its preferential trade and aid agreement with countries in Africa, the Caribbean and Pacific (ACP). (Dinan 2007)

As the integration process gained its new momentum, an important step has been taken in 1986 in Luxembourg with the introduction of the Single European Act (SEA) signed by the nine Member States of the Community. SEA was a revision of the Treaties of Rome which established the European Economic Community. It formally completed the internal market along with various institutional and political reforms such as the reform of European institutions and strengthening the power for the Community in its field of activity. It also established the institution of the European Council as an official platform for the meetings of the highest Member States political representatives. The Council was now voting by qualified majority instead of unanimity which speeded up the decision-making process and avoided delays in search for a joint agreement among Member States. The Act also established the foundations for the Court of First Instance. (EUR-lex, The Single European Act 2010)

The important institutional reforms in the SEA paved the way for deeper political integration and the economic and monetary union which happened few years later in 1992 as it has been probably the most important year in the history of European integration. The Treaty of the European Union, signed in Maastricht opened the way to political integration. It merged Euratom, ECSC and EEC (which has been renamed to EC) into the European Union with its three pillars: the European Communities, Common Foreign and Security Policy (CFSP), and police and judicial cooperation in criminal matters (JHA). It all happened in the lights of events that changed the political map of Europe and the World. The fall of communism in Eastern Europe and the German reunification brought new opportunities for strengthening the international position of the Community. Furthermore, it came with the concept of European citizenship, strengthened the competences of the European Parliament and introduced the European Monetary Union (EMU). Inside the Community, Member States were favoring further supplementation of the SEA by new reforms. (EUR-lex, Treaty of Maastrich on the European Union 2010) The Monetary Union didn't become a full-scale European feature as the European currency - the Euro – has been adopted so far by 19 out of 28 Member State countries. (C. D. Commission n.d.) As a result, membership in the EMU still falls behind the membership in the EU as this trend continues. This doesn't necessarily have to be understood in negative connotation, but rather as a result of EU's continuous

enlargement. As more and more countries joined the EU, this has been reflected in the changes of national preferences of its Member States. The level of economic performance of the EU Member States varies from country to country and so does their level of participation in the EU's policy areas. This is however not the case of the Schengen Area, in which people may travel freely in the EU without being subjected to checks at borders. In this case 27 of 28 EU countries decided to participate with the exception of the UK and Ireland which decided to maintain its free travel zone with its neighbor. Norway, Switzerland and Iceland as three non-EU countries are also members of the Schengen Area.

What is important to note is, that in lights of the Maastricht Treaty, the perception of the Union by its citizens didn't meet the expectations. National governments became pointing on the EU's political dimension as it more resembled a nation state than an international organization. Europeans didn't felt the same way towards the EU in compare to their countries of origin, primarily being French, German or Spanish than European. (Dinan 2007)

The Maastrich Treaty has been updated in the following years by three new Treaties namely by the Treaty of Amsterdam (1997), the Treaty of Nice (2001) and the Treaty of Lisbon (2007). (Dinan 2007), (EUR-lex, Treaty of Maastrich on the European Union 2010), (EUR-lex, The Treaty of Lisbon: introduction 2015) These Treaties provided the European institutions with further competences and helped to shape their institutional design to the way we know it today.

# 4.2 The European Union as a Security Community

When speaking about the EU as a security community it's important to distinguish between the EU as institution and the EU as a core of a larger European geographical area. In terms of security communities, the EU stretches beyond the borders of its Member States and expands towards its peripheries. The scope of a security community doesn't necessarily have to limit itself to its own supranational body, rather taking into the account all those international actors who are willing and trying to build a secure environment through cooperation with others. (Laporte 2012) A security community is not formed by orders or secretariats as well as it cannot be maintained by a mere vision. There has to be more than just that, the community has to share the same spirit, its membership has to be earned not given. In this section, the EU shall be considered as a core in a larger European security community environment. (Gambles 1995) The EU constantly reshapes the meaning of 'European space' through an ongoing process of economic and political integration and redefining the meaning of 'security' by shifting its emphasis from the concerns regarding its territorial defense towards transboundary threats and non-military actors. To sum it up, this

process is not bound to Europe and Europe only since the process of EU's enlargement is of dynamic nature that needs to react to its own consequences. (Bremberg 2014)

According to Deutsch, states can become a community through a set of common values and social relations. This community can use its ties which bind states together in order to form a security community in which they settle their disputes in a rather peaceful way, avoiding war as a solution to their problems. (Deutsch 1957)

There are various types of security communities based on the level of their integration. The EU has been established as a result of a long process which started after the World War II to make a brighter future for Europe which has been forged by centuries of wars between its countries. In order to put an end to its war history, the EU serves as a platform where collective violence has a place no more, thus it makes EU a 'security community'. More specifically, it's a pluralistic security community as it's not governed by a central ruling authority but through a set of common rules. In these terms, the EU is very well developed as in time it created well-functioning mechanisms of mutual interaction between its members. Furthermore, it's a 'tightly-couple' community as it shares the same values and principles of behavior and interaction. (Laporte 2012) The security community with EU's neighboring countries has been able because of what Deutsch defines as 'peaceful change' – the will to resolve problems without violence, using institutions as a platform to solve them. (Deutsch 1957)

A security community does not equals a defensive alliance or a system of collective security which are both based on security guarantees but it is expected that the security community will not stumble or break apart because of external factors or pressures, but rather that its members will in time be more willing to stand together in turbulent times. (Gambles 1995)

In Western Europe, the EU has been a guarantee of security for decades. European security community fully expanded after the fall of communism in Europe, extending its territory eastwards. This has happened due to its domestic, regional and geopolitical stability that in time became solid and trustworthy for its neighbors. (Gambles 1995)

Even though the EU cannot be considered a comprehensible international actor, because of a network of international organization it is involved in (OSCE, NATO, Council of Europe) it became one of the world leaders in terms of security community-building. The EU while being a political project is also considering itself to be a form of a legal organization. Since the European project has been launched in the aftermaths of the Second World War, it gradually expanded its competences, power and member base. As it has been mentioned in the previous section, the extent to which EU's Member State countries participate in EU's

field of activity (politics, economics and security) vary from country to country. This unparalleled level of integration is a feature of the EU constructed by its members and can be therefore understood a more intergovernmental than supranational in its nature. EU countries delegate a portion of their sovereignty to the EU and its institutions so that the EU can create its own decisions in certain areas. This gives the EU the ability to operate on its own but still within the framework that's been ratified in treaties by its Member States. National defense and security are still within the competence of EU's Member States and it will most likely remain this way in the future. Yet, this didn't stop the EU from developing its own security identity. (Moustakis 2009)

The European integration process has been related to security since the beginning – one of the purposes of the ECSC was to economically bind countries together, so that solving disputes amongst them by violence and war would not be an option anymore. The EU sees itself as a 'soft power', meaning that it focus on the development through economic progress and stable societies as opposed to military power. It stands behind its ideals such as human rights, democratic ideals and societal as well as individual security. As a soft power, the EU prefers to respond non-militarily by using civilian security measures such as diplomacy and dialogue. However, the whole concept of the security is reflected in the EU 'pillar' structure. The second pillar (CFSP) and the third pillar (JHA) are the core of the European security concept. While the third pillar – Justice and Home affairs – deals with EU's internal and individual 'human' security, the second pillar, EU's Common Foreign and Security Policy is explicitly devoted to EU's external security and activities related to it. (Moustakis 2009) An important element of the CFSP is the Common Security and Defense Policy (CSDP), a descendant of EU's Security and Defense Policy (ESDP), ratified by the Lisbon Treaty. The CSDP is EU's grand strategy, with its purpose to complete the ESS and to define the EU's as a global security actor. It also enhances military cooperation between the EU Member States. (Biscop 2010) The EU is already a global player, but in terms of economics as it produces a quarter of the world's Gross National Product (GNP). As an economic power it got the capabilities to shape its international relations through trade policies and development aid. (Moustakis 2009)

Another example of EU's security measurements is the European Neighborhood Policy which has been introduced in 2004. The European Neighborhood Policy is the EU's instrument for a close political association and economic integration with its southern and eastern neighbors. It's based on common interests and shared values such as the rule of law, democracy, respecting human rights and social coherence. Those countries which agree to these conditions are being supported by the EU financially, politically and by other benefits such as easier travel to the EU and access to EU markets. The EU also supports their local population by promotion of democracy in its partner countries. As can be understood, this cooperation is based on mutual effort and it's not imposed solely by the EU. Currently, there are 16 members of the ENP action plan. (EEAS n.d.) The ENP is a great example of how the EU expands its security community and how it motivates potential members to become a part of it. The ENP provides the EU's with an effective instrument that helps to secure EU's periphery without the need for further enlargement of the Union.

The EU's promotion of security is not an exclusive feature devoted to its Member States only. Even though one might think that European security community copies its borders, as has been explained in the ENP, this is not the case. In these terms, the EU security community enlargement does not necessarily have to follow the process of the EU enlargement. It is dependent on other factors such as the promotion of security practices within the EU between Member States but also among members and non-members. (Bremberg 2014) This process is complex in its nature as according to Bremberg:

"Importantly, practices of co-operative security are not only 'an assemblage of military, diplomatic, political, economic and social practices, but they also consist of consist of constellations of communities of practice, some of whose performances may be in the realm of peacekeeping, while others exist in the realm of economic integration' (Bremberg 2014)

The process of integration into a security community can be therefore driven by various intentions that don't necessarily have to be military only, but it's rather flexible in its nature as the drivers behind the integration can vary from region to region. Traditional approaches to security however claim that if we take these other aspects such as political, economic, social and environmental into the account, it might cause disruption in the field itself and intellectual incoherence. However, various academics and analysts have different opinion and increasingly point on the importance of these aspects when discussing security. This approach has been adopted by the most influential international organizations such as the EU, NATO and the UN. (Moustakis 2009)

In his early years of academic work, Deutsch kept pointing on the fact that in order to develop a 'sense of community', it's necessary to create transnational transactions and social communication between states and societies. The idea of collective identity-formation became increasingly popular as the 'we feeling' is considered to be more effective than the inner-oriented practices between states. Nevertheless, Deutsch also points on the importance of institutions that can guard in the long run the dependable expectations of peaceful change. International institutions and organizations are also a ground for socialization that in time creates a regional "culture" based on commonly accepted values, as Adler and Barnett can be observed arguing in Niklas Bremberg's book on the European Security community from 2014. These institutions might dispose of collective identity feeling but they don't necessarily have to. (Bremberg 2014) In these

terms, the EU lacks a strong collective feeling of a common European identity, but Europeans share the same values, patterns of mutual behavior and social interaction which ultimately creates unity and to some extend a "we feeling" in the continent.

## 4.3 Liberal Economic cooperation in The European Union

According to Moravcsik, the core of liberal intergovernmentalism theory consists of three main elements. These are "the assumption of rational state behavior, a liberal theory of national preference formation and an intergovernmentalist analysis of interstate negotiation". (A. Moravcsik 1993)When applied to the EU with a bit of metaphorical spice to it, the process of domestic preference formation serves as a demand, and the process of interstate negotiations reflected in the EU's response as a supply. This type of interaction has a significant impact on the direction of a foreign policy of its Member States. When applying the liberal approach on the process of European integration, it's eminent that it favors such initiative because of its focus on domestic interests and state-society relations. It also shares the same position as in the previous section of the thesis by adding a security element to the integration process. According to Moravcsik, the motivation behind the integration process in Europe was to abolish conflicts and create a common front against - now former - Soviet Union through the establishment of common institutions and through the economic interdependence between European states. (A. Moravcsik 1993)The economic interdependence became the main driver of European integrations as the economic factor stood behind the creation of first European institutions and continued to fuel further integration.

Liberal theories of economic interdependence stand on the key claim that the increased transnational flow of goods, services and other factors creates the pressure to increase policy coordination amongst states. National governments are favoring policy coordination if such an action benefits them, allowing them to achieve goals that would otherwise be highly unlikely to happen if their foreign policy would remain restrictive. Such type of coordination occurs when this type of action eliminates the so called 'negative externalities' of international policy. These can be understood as costs imposed by the actions of one government on another, undermining the potential of the second government to reach its objectives. Examples can be found in competitive devaluation or barriers against foreign trade of goods and services. When the negative externalities are high, the possibility of getting rid of them through the coordinated policy with another state or states became a favorable option. Yet, if the country is able to deal with such externalities on its own, the possibility of such cooperation drops accordingly. (A. Moravcsik 1993)In Europe, the Member States integrated within the Single Market produce a quarter of the World's GDP.

The process of policy coordination consists of two major steps – the reciprocal market liberalization and policy harmonization. The first step includes removal of barriers on imports and export, liberalization of the

movement of goods, services and factors of production and supporting the producers operating in internationally competitive fields with the owners respectively. The second step of policy coordination includes practices such as socio-economic equality, regulatory protection and macroeconomic stability. If economic interdependence is underlined by jurisdiction, the incompatible parts of various governments' legislatives might cause disruptions in the flow of the coordinated policy.

Coordinated policy might not necessarily lead to its immediate implementation by national governments. Those nations and domestic groups who shall not benefit from it will most likely oppose such actions. Such cooperation can only be achieved if all of the participants gain more than loose. (A. Moravcsik 1993) Societal groups and movements play an important role in either enhancing or rejecting the process of international negotiations. Such negotiations can be constrained by these groups even if the society as a whole might profit from it. Domestic societal interests therefore play crucial role in shaping the direction of intergovernmental dialogue. The consensus needs to be reached through various level of society – some of them more or less influential, but in general the profit of such cooperation needs to be eminent to everybody. The success of international agreements therefore relies not solely on the national governments, but rather on the common interests of dominant societal groups in different countries. This has been the case in the EC during the negotiations over agricultural prices, where the pressure from the interest groups prevailed during the bargaining process. (A. Moravcsik 1993)The definition of different dimensions integration will be addressed further in the thesis.

The structure of linear development of the European economic integration has been developed due to Europe's specific economic conditions and political philosophy which can be described as classic western development grounded in the principles of liberal economy, the rule of law and democracy. The success of European integration was possible due to mutual understanding of these conditions by all of its members. The European integration process inspired other similar projects in the world to try to replicate it, but it's important to keep in mind that what worked out in Europe doesn't necessarily have to work elsewhere. The economic development in Latin America and its further integration should be therefore reconsidered due to its specific economic and political conditions, especially when European inspired attempts at regional integration have been undertaken with a relative lower success than on the European continent. An argument can be made in favor of a reinterpretation of current regional integration schemes, moving away from the classical western linear development process following the economic dimension of integration, and rather towards the political and social dimension.

In its fundamental level, the theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism is a theory of international relations which seeks to explain how states cooperate and also compete between each other. It also sees integration

as an elite-driven process or a top-down process. (Peterson n.d.) Here, an argument can be made, that the EU integration since its beginnings has been driven by elites and their political will to cooperate. When compared to Buen Vivir theory, these two theories differ from each other already in their fundamental levels, since Buen Vivir and its sub-section Sumak Kawsai emphasize on the strong societal agitation in politics and on the political practices that are driven by a bottom-top approach rather than top-down as the LI theory as well as the EU itself does. LI's strongest point is in describing, explaining and predicting on how the negotiations in high politics arise from transnational political action and also what kind of political topics will be negotiated during supranational negotiations together with their outcomes. Even though the theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism is at its strongest when analyzing the Treaty-amending and decision-making process at supranational level, it's important to note that these processes are the ones that are giving a particular supranational institution its power. To be more precise, the institution is only as strong as its members will to cooperate and their ability to reach consensus. The Community-building process in itself starts with a series of intergovernmental negotiations. Therefore, the theory of liberal intergovernmentalism shall provide a useful look to the insights of the EU's decision making process as well as what kind of motivations and factors stand behind it. As has been mentioned in the methodology section of this thesis, this theory has been chosen because of its strongest explanatory power in compare to other theories of IR when it comes to decision making at supranational level, especially regarding the EU case.

From an intergovernmentalist point of view, the EU is accepted by the national governments until their membership in it strengthens their control over their domestic policies, allowing them to achieve goals that would be highly unlikely to happen without such kind of membership. The membership in the EU indeed provides governments with such benefits. Firstly, it is a platform for inter-state bargaining which ultimately reduce the costs of this activity. The EU Member States can later operate with an even greater range of agreements, because of the monitoring of compliance in the implementation of such agreements. Furthermore, the EU provides its Member States with greater legitimacy and credibility to their initiatives. National governments can potentially mobilize domestic coalitions in favor of policy coordination with less effort. (A. Moravcsik 1993)

At the systemic level, it's almost impossible to implement any kind of major policy without the agreement of the three EU institutions: The European Council, the European Parliament and the European Commission. Naturally, the process of intergovernmental bargaining cannot be skipped but with the growing importance of co-decision making process in the EU, recent policy debates point on the increasing importance of inter-institutional bargaining. This is more of a case for institutionalists, but in practice, most policies are being set using this type of procedure. Yet, the co-decision procedure ratified by the Treaty of Amsterdam moved the EU closer to being a parliamentary democracy. This is most notable when it comes to the internal market, when the EP was able to stand its ground against the Council, and succeeding in the implementation of its policy details. However, it is important to note that as any other parliaments, the EP also consists of various parties, often representing different opinions through the left-right division not only in the parliament. (Peterson n.d.)

Speaking about the structure of the EU, generally, the EU lacks hierarchy. It has no unified government and no opposition. The ubiquity of various networks in the EU pushes it to bargaining process when it comes to policy formulation as there is very diverse spectrum of actors involved in this process. The political agenda of the EU is a subject to negotiations itself as there is no such thing as a political programme or manifesto. Furthermore, the EU lacks an institution or a platform which can efficiently manage political dialogue. As confusing as this might sound at first, especially because such an institution already exists (the EP), the EU still heavily depends on its ability to reach the consensus between a large variety of decision-makers before particular policy can be launched. These decision makers consist of the members of national parliaments, the EC, the EP and various interest groups and social movements. Yet there are occasions where bargaining doesn't play a crucial role. These occasions count meetings of the Council of Ministers, plenary sessions in the European Parliament or meetings of 'conciliation committees' which settle down disputes between the Council and the EP. They do so because they are able to reach consensus relatively easily, in order to reach the necessary agreements. (Peterson n.d.)

At the sub-systemic level the EU's – and the Commission's in particular – agency is deeply divided into often hermetic policy sectors which belong to the competence of national administrations. Moreover, in order to start the EU policy process, it firstly needs to be negotiated and agreed after a set of negotiations between a cluster of networked organizational units before it can start. The EU unlike any other systems of governance starts its policy process by negotiations in its policy networks. The so called directive is the EU's main legislative tool that sets the policy and its goal, but doesn't specify the way it needs to be done. Here, the shape and the content of the directive rely on the impact it will cause on both national and supranational interest groups. This is a subject of negotiations between these groups together with national administrations and various lobbyist groups, because they provide the necessary intel and information on the possible impact of the legislation and because the effective implementation of such legislation requires support from all or most of the upper mentioned actors. (Peterson n.d.) This status is not fixed as the EU constantly evolves and reshapes its institutional design and patterns of interaction between various institutions. In order to be more effective and to be able to reach consensus more easily, it's necessary to remain flexible and to react adequately to the realities around, especially if the consensus have to be reached through a very complex and wide range of institutions and actors as occurs in the EU.

Yet, this is what makes the EU so unique as it seeks to unite and to establish a set of common rules among otherwise independent international actors. It's possible, but it requires a substantial amount of effort and an effective pattern that such an international body needs to develop.

# 4.4 Regional integration in Latin America and New Regionalism

The European union can be argued to be a highly sophisticated model for benchmarking. It is not seen as a completely perfect pattern, but can be viewed to be able to serve as a solid reference. The process of European integration can however be argued to be a unique process, due to the complexity involved in the deterministic historical context in which the process of regional European integration occurred, more specifically the end of World War II. Nevertheless, one would have to keep in mind that the goal of lasting peace on the European continent might not have been enough in itself, had it not been built on a foundation of similar economic philosophy and politics. (Mina 2014)

Some scholars have since argued that the process of European integration should not necessarily be used as a benchmark to judge similar attempts at regional integration, such as that of Latin America. Instead they argue that one should only be comparing regional policies or philosophies to institutional developments. (Mina 2014).

Numerous attempts at regional integration have been undertaken in Latin America, many of them following a linear model of European integration, all of them being similar and all having modest results in common. This development or lack thereof can be argued to prove that specific conditions such as ideological and economic differences within the region have made, and still make regional integration as inspired by the EU close to impossible. Sustained European efforts have been made in favor of its model and experiences, and nevertheless Latin America can be argued to be following their own path towards regional integration, although using different ingredients. The question then is if regional integration at the level of Europe is achievable, but also if European integration is even desirable in the region. (Mina 2014)

# 4.4.1 New Regionalism Organizations

In order to get an overview of the attempts undertaken at regional integration within Latin America, this thesis will start out by describing the organizations that were created under the umbrella of New Regionalism since the 1990's. The term itself was created and launched in 1991 by Robert D Palmer in his book called *Regionalism in Asia and the Pacific.* One of the fundamental features of the concept was openness to the world, both economically and politically. Furthermore, it was able to link nationalism with

international aspiration. The concept emerged and fits well in a framerate in which the world went from being controlled by hegemons to a multipolar world, and during this same time the interest that the United States had in Latin America greatly diminished, and thus leaving a vacuum of power that various Latin American states attempted to fill by signing multiple interregional agreements. The New Regionalism in Latin America can be argued to include new as well as old regional and sub-regional organizations, the new organizations being MERCOSUR, ALBA, UNASUR, CELAC and the Pacific Alliance, while the older, renamed and reshaped organizations can be argued to be made up of SICA, The Andean Community and ASC.

Most of these organizations experience the same kind of internal consensus problems, and common for all of them are their limited success. All of the organizations mentioned above aim at regional integration, but all of them have different motivations and goals by doing so. MERCOSUR and ASC can be argued to mainly strive to achieve the before mentioned economic integration, while SICA can be argued to be more oriented towards creation a region of peace and democracy, while achieving regional security. This can be argued to be more politically oriented towards integration. The organization of CAN can be said to seek economic integration, while at the same time being interested in marketing the region internationally. ALBA is an interesting organization in regards to the integration that this thesis aims to achieve, as it promotes cooperation based on solidarity and social economic sustainability, where we also find traces of the social dimension of integration. ALBA is furthermore interested in acquiring an international profile. An organization as UNASUR attempts to cover all cooperation dimensions in order to establish a common market based on a South American identity. This South American identity is furthermore an interesting aspect for the aim of the thesis, and has potential to be utilized a later point in time. CELAC is seen as a political dialogue mechanism that aims to become the main voice of the region, but can't be said to be doing much more than that. The final organization the Pacific Alliance can be argued to be less interested in the political dimension that the other organizations, but instead it attempts to take the economic dimension of integration to the highest level. The differences in aim and scope of the various organizations is however not the only aspect that sets them apart. Furthermore, the organizations can be argued to be divided by institutional differences, MERCOSUR, SICA, CAN and UNASUR being closest to a replica of the European mode, as least in respect to institutional foundation. These organizations are followed closely by ALBA and ASC, while CELAC and the Pacific Alliance can be said to have no supranational institutions what so ever. Even though some of these organizations can be argued to have a similar institutional structure to the EU, the organizations of Latin America make decisions at the presidential level through consensus on the occasion of regional summits. Subsequently this can at times attribute to the decision making process not being very smooth, and sometimes being time consuming. This is one of the arguments as to why the region have experienced difficulties implementing the before mentioned common policies essential to

crossing the threshold between intergovernmental cooperation and genuine integration. Returning to the emergence of the social dimension in regional integration, all the said organizations can be argued to have the social dimension in their founding documents, either in terms of social justice, social inclusion, social development or involvement of the civil society. (Mina 2014)

### 4.4.1.1 The Bolivarian Alliance for the People of Our America – Peoples' Trade Treaty (ALBA-TCP)

Created in 2004 in Havana at the initiative of then Venezuelan President Hugo Chavez, ALBA can be argued to be an "integration platform". The organization can furthermore be argued to be of the left, as the current member states are states with leftist governments, these being Venezuela, Cuba, Bolivia, Nicaragua, and Commonwealth of Dominica, Antigua and Barbuda, Ecuador, St. Vincent and the Grenadines and Saint Lucia. The aim of this particular organization is towards regional economic integration based on principles such as "widest solidarity between the peoples of Latin America", and additionally "no commercial criteria or selfish interests related to business profits", this meaning bartering and mutual economic aid. The organization was officially founded by the signing of the Agreement for the construction of the Bolivarian Alternative for the Peoples of our America and the Trade Agreement between the Peoples of the three countries of Bolivia, Cuba and Venezuela. The most important achievement so far can be said to be the creation of ALBA and Petro Caribe Bank. The important institutions of this organization are the Presidents Council, the Ministers Council, as well as the political Commission for Permanent Coordination of ALBA. The organization furthermore wishes to create a monetary union, and thus the first step was to create a common monetary unit. This unit is named SUCRE. (Mina 2014)

#### 4.4.1.2 The Pacific Alliance

Being both the most recent and most dynamic sub-regional mechanism of economic cooperation, the Pacific Alliance was founded by four likeminded Pacific Rim Open economies, these being Peru, Mexico, Columbia and Chile, and was an initiative of the then Peruvian President Alan Garcia Perez. The organization was functioning from April 2011, although only *de facto* up until 2012 where it was formally launched in Chile. This organization has an international scope through observer countries from various nations around the world, and was built on coherent center-right trade policies promoted by the four member states mentioned earlier. The main objective of this particular organization is to "deepen the integration of the economies on the basis of the existing Commercial Agreements and to develop a mechanism of political dialogue and cooperation with Asia-Pacific". Furthermore, it aims at gradually moving towards a goal of free movement of goods, services, capital and people between the four countries. The organization can be said to primarily be economic in nature, but nevertheless added a nascent political dimension during the Lima Summit. It did so by creating an informal framework for political dialogue among its members. Furthermore, during the Summit in Cali, Colombia on May 23<sup>rd</sup> 2013 the member states announced a commercial liberalization by 90 percent, the creation of a public-private committee to offer services of consulting to companies, along with the implementation of a unified infrastructure of foreign exchanges. Another mentionable example of the organizations objectives is the objective to sign an Agreement with the Trans-Pacific Partnership. (Mina 2014)

### 4.4.2 Different Dimensions of regional integration

Having briefly touched on the regional integration schemes under the umbrella on new regionalism, it's clear that different propositions and expectations exists in regards to integration, and not a lot of organizations seem to have a common goal or common understanding. Several scholars agree that integration rely on states moving in a common direction. One of the said scholars is Nicholas Moussis who wrote the book *Access to the European Union* in which he offers a definition on integration through the quote:

"The multinational integration process is the voluntary establishment by treaty, concluded between independent states, of common institutions and the gradual development by them of common policies pursuing common goals and serving common interests." (Moussis 2015)

As opposed to the regional integration schemes under the umbrella of New Regionalism, an important keyword in Moussis quote seems to be "common". Another aspect to notice from New Regionalism is that several understandings and aims. One can argue that two major dimensions of integration have been favored in the region, being those of the political and economic dimension. An argumentation can be made in favor for adding an additional and third aspect to this traditional understanding of integration, and aspect that is particular interesting for the scope of this thesis, more specifically the social dimension. For the purpose of the analysis, this thesis will briefly define the terms as follows:

# 4.4.2.1 The political dimension of regional integration

The nature of this dimension works with the premise that states have common interests and the political will to turn them into reality. It furthermore means creating the necessary instruments and enabling them to act in this respect. These necessary instruments can be argued to be common institutions. Common institutions however cannot be argued to be enough to make the cross-over from intergovernmental cooperation towards genuine integration. According to researchers, making this cross-over requires that member states establish common policies, through giving up some of each individual states sovereignty and then transfer that sovereignty to supranational institutions previously created. (Mina 2014)

#### 4.4.2.2 The economic dimension of regional integration

This aspect of integration can be argued to follow a Neofunctionalist approach. It can be so, due the fact that this dimension consists of four different stages, being implemented chronologically. The first stage is that of the free trade area, meaning more specifically a region in which the member countries have eliminated tariffs on goods traded between them. The free trade area is followed by a customs union, meaning a region in which states allow free movement on their territories for all products, regardless of their original origin. A customs union furthermore applies common tariffs for the region towards third countries. The third stage towards economic integration is the creation of a common market, meaning a region in which goods, services, capital and labor can circulate unregulated. The fourth and final, not to mention most advanced step in regards to the economic dimension, is that of an economic and monetary union. This union implies a single monetary policy, along with a single currency and the convergence of national economic policies. (Mina 2014)

#### 4.4.2.3 The social dimension of regional integration

This dimension is understood as involving the civil society in elaborating common policies; cf. the essential background conditions as put forward by Deutsch, who put emphasis on this specific dimension. The social dimension is furthermore understood through the commitment of states towards implementing Corporate Social Responsibility national strategies, which would converge into a common strategy over time. This aspect seems to be overlooked in contemporary attempts at regional integration. This social dimension will be further emphasized further in the thesis.

#### 4.4.3 Comparative selection of organizations

An important aspect of understanding the difficulties and challenges to Regional Integration in Latin America would seem to be ideology, as this is an aspect that has major influence on integration dynamics. This can be argued as difficulties in reaching consensus due to ideological differences in some cases are seen to make an integration process within an organization happen slowly, and perhaps even stagnate. An example of this can be argued to be MERCOSUR, which has seen its fair share of internal difficulties stemming from difficulties settling differences between the member states Brazil and Argentina. Furthermore, since the admission of the centralized economy Venezuela and with Bolivia and Ecuador in negotiations, these being equally centralized, the main essence of MERCOSUR has come under pressure. This is due to the fact that MERCOSUR is founded on the opposite set of principles, namely the common open market, as opposed to centralization. It is a fair assessment that reaching consensus internally within the organization may of a problematic nature in the near future. In inter-regional dialogue, the results produced have not been much better. A specific example, and one that is relevant to the comparative nature of this thesis, is the example of the MERCOSUR-EU negotiations, in which yet again Brazil and Argentina are seen arguing among themselves in regards to a potential long time offer to the EU. Additionally, as the organization has not been able to achieve its 1991 vision of creating a customs union, the integration on the economic axis can be argued to be a relative failure. An even more challenging organization in which to reach consensus can be argued to be CELAC in which not only the members of MERCOSUR has to reach consensus, but also all the other Latin American and Caribbean member states. The contesting ideologies and motivations within the organization makes the process of negotiating very long, as every member state wants to add to a given deal or action plan. They do so to respond to each of their respective interests, these interests not being consistent with other member states and sometimes even colliding with the interest of said other member states. (Mina 2014)

An example of positive economic integration however can be found in the The Pacific Alliance, as this organization have been able to achieve 90 percent tax-free commerce within their own internal market. An important aspect to notice in this regard is that The pacific Alliance is founded by states having similar ideologies and comparable economies. The political dimension in this organization is lacking however, arguably nonexistent as the organization has no institutions. This particular organization can thus this far be said to be following the path of economic integration as seen in the EU to a relative extent. It would from this seem that integration as seen in Europe to an extent is theoretically possible within comparable states both ideologically and economically. It is however still observed how reaching consensus in Latin America remains difficult, and this shows that integration based on different premises may be necessary in other parts of Latin America, namely countries in which a different political and economic ideology than that of the western countries exists. For these countries, integration on the political and social dimension may offer a better alternative to regional integration. (Mina 2014)

An organization focusing on these aspects of integration can be argued to be ALBA. This organization furthermore has a foundation of similar states in terms of political, social and even economic aspects. This organization not being focused primarily on economic integration makes this organization a potential platform for regional integration through the social and political constructivist approach that this thesis has chosen by the use of Security Communities and Buen Vivir. The organization furthermore has the member country Ecuador, in which the "Sumak Kawsay" interpretation originates. Finally, the organizations principles of solidarity between all people of Latin America, mixed with their "anti-commercialist" approach related to business profits fits well with the principles that exists within Buen Vivir. ALBA can furthermore be viewed as relative successful in its endeavors, as it has succeeded in implementing a virtual common currency in the SUCRE. This currency was as of 2015 used to compensate trade between Cuba, Nicaragua, and especially between Ecuador and Venezuela. (Jazeera 2009)

# 4.5 Comparative analysis of Buen Vivir and Security Communities in a Latin American context

#### 4.5.1 Deutsch's Nine essential background conditions

In this section, the thesis seeks to explore to what extent Buen Vivir can serve as one or several of the essential background conditions as put forward by Deutsch et al. The thesis approaches this analysis by investigating by comparing the potential outcome of regional integration through Security Communities and Buen Vivir to the outcome created by using a Liberal Intergovenmntalism inspired approach.

The previously mentioned "we feeling" and sense of community combined with ever increasing communication and transaction necessary for successful amalgamation can be according to Deutsch and his colleagues be broken into nine essential background conditions with three potential other conditions. The nine essential conditions are as follows:

#### 4.5.1.1 Mutual compatibility of main values

The reason that Buen Vivir will be able to serve as mutual compatibility of main values can be argued to be the dynamic nature of the concept. This dynamic nature can be explained by understanding Buen Vivir as an umbrella for a set of different positions. This thesis has briefly touched on the various understandings on Buen Vivir, specific to each region, and subsequently to each culture, language, history and specific social or political contexts. This thesis is focusing mainly on the Ecuadorian Sumak Kawsay, due to its strong constitutional implementation, although it is important and relevant to the argument to underline that it is not possible to identify one idea of the Buen Vivir as the best one, which would become a standard reference to be followed by all other indigenous groups in Latin America. Note here that this thesis then uses Sumak Kawsay mainly for its constitutional implementation.

When talking about mutual compatibility of main values, one is touching on subjects that have briefly been mentioned in the last section. It was observed how organizations involved in regional integration in Latin American, in general have a problem with that exact aspect of creating supranational institutions. The organizations that were observed to have to biggest relative success, were of those in which the organization was founded was states with comparable economies and similar ideologies. This aspect can be argued to be compatibility of main values. In the end of the last section, a few organizations were identified either for their relative success, or for their internal homogeneity. It is clear that a lot of different motivations exist in the region, which is why one can benefit from looking at two examples on either side of

the spectrum, in regards to fiscal and economic policy, and also in regards to what type of integration each organization is trying to implement, cf. the three different dimensions previously attributed to integration. On the economic side of integration, the Pacific Alliance was observed to an extent to have relative success, seen in how the organization have been able to create a 90 percent tax-free internal market. This can be seen as a relative success compared to similar attempts in the region, namely that of MERCOSUR who have been trying to create a customs union for more than 20 years. As mentioned, an important aspect to notice in regards to the success of the organization, is once again the argued compatibility of main values. This type of integration however, cannot be argued to be inclusive as it will only fit those states having economies and ideologies that resemble those of the Western world. This type of organization can then be argued to have an internal mutual compatibility of main values, but not much further than that.

Seeing as this type of integration offer little room for inclusion, another type of integration organization is observed in the case of ALBA. This organization emphasizes the aspect of political integration, with an additional extra added focus on social integration, rather than having the economic integration as a main driver. This organization can do so because the economy is not seen as a main goal in itself, but rather as a tool to achieve the organizations other goals of social integration through solidarity and equality between the people of Latin America. This organization can thus be seen as more inclusive, because it offers room for economically vulnerable minorities that does not fit in in the classic western integration and development scheme. Internally within this organization, a mutual compatibility of main values also exists, as none of the member states have sworn allegiance to the neoliberal open market development policies, such as the Pacific Alliance have. The member states of this organization instead lean to the left in terms of economy, but the emphasis is on people and social integration. This makes ALBA a good platform for experimenting with social leftist approaches such as Buen Vivir / Sumak Kawsay. It can be argued that political and social integration is a more compatible approach to go about integration in any case, as the social and political dimension tends to have deeper roots than that of an economic idea. It should here again be underlined that one of the countries to adopt Buen Vivir into its constitution, more specifically Ecuador is a member country of ALBA, which opens up an argument that mutual compatibility of main values in regards to Buen Vivir does exist within this organization.

#### 4.5.1.2: A distinctive way of life

This dimension is to an extent relatively similar to that of mutual compatibility of main values, but refers even more to ideology and the social dimension of integration than the previous dimension. As this background condition focuses primarily on the social and to an extent political integration, organizations that focuses on economic integration in the classical western sense will be ignored in this regard. The focus will continuously be on the organization of ALBA and the case of the member country Ecuador. The thesis has already established grounds for support that a mutual compatibility of main values exists within ALBA, and even more so through the lenses of Sumak Kawsay. The distinctive way of life that according to Deutsch et al. is necessary for the creation of a security community, can be found in the constitutional implementation of Sumak Kawsay in the Ecuadorian constitution as seen in chapter 3.2.1. This constitutional implementation shows a distinctive way of life, or at least the pursuit of it. This pursuit can be argued through the observation of several of the objectives in the country's current development plan. The important objectives in this regard, cover the promotion of equality and integration in social and territorial diversity, as well as improving the quality of life for the population. It's additionally observed in the development plan that certain type of ideology makes the foundation for a distinctive way of life, name that of guaranteeing the rights of nature, as well as the rights of man, and to include nature as part of society. This is very distinctive for Buen Vivir, and can be argued to attribute a distinctive way of thinking about life, leading to a distinctive way of living life. Another distinctive objective of the Sumak Kawsay development plan is found on objective eleven, being that of establishing a social economic system based on solidarity and sustainability. This objective can also be argued to attribute to a distinctive way of life, in the sense that solidarity and sustainability is not emphasized much within the organizations that focus primarily on economic integration. The solidarity aspect fits specifically well with the organization ALBA however, as this organization aims at consolidating a regional space of social, cultural and even economic integration based on the prioritization of social rights and welfare, with the goal to make it possible for member countries to prioritize social spending without having the World Bank or the IMF dictate austerity measurements. The fact that ALBA aims at distancing itself from the World Bank and the IMF can furthermore be viewed as supporting a distinctive way of life, that's different to that of neighboring regions, as well as the recent past. The disconnection from the neoliberal development policies that IMF and The World Bank represents furthermore falls nicely into line with Buen Vivirs confrontation of current development schemes, and will thus not collide with current ideologies within ALBA. (Azzellini 2014) (Ruttenberg 2013) (Deutsch 1957)

#### 4.5.1.3: Expectations of stronger economic ties or gains

As briefly touched upon in last section, ALBA has the scope of removing themselves from the influence of the World Bank and the IMF, and have been doing so in the creation of a common virtual currency, called the SUCRE. This currency has enabled the organization to, in the possible extent to replace the dollar in regional trade, and have been doing so since 2010. An important aspect of replacing the dollar with the SUCRE was to gain more autonomy from the U.S dollar and to lower the pressure on the ALBA countries to gather dollars on international markets in order to finance their import needs. Additionally, on the internal

market of ALBA, member states are aiming at doing trade through bartering and exchanges, and has also been doing so since 2010. An example of this can be found in Dominica for instance, that has part of its oil bill payed through English textbooks. This can be argued to attribute to both stronger economic ties, as well as strengthened economic ties between the member countries, further removing them from the austerity measurements of the IMF. An argument can be made in favor for this bartering and internal trade being economic development, although not in the neoliberal western sense. To western eyes, this may take appearance as devolution, in which states return to a time before the monetary system, but what it really is, is an alternative to the western development that numerous countries all over the world consider a given today. This newly gained autonomy and sovereignty have additionally made it possible for member countries of ALBA to vote on their own interests in the UN and other international forums. They have done so several times since 2010 on subjects ranging from climate issues to U.S interference in Latin American affairs. This falls well into line with objective number five in the national development plan, an objective that deals with guaranteeing sovereignty and promoting strategic insertion into the world. As an example, it's worth to mention that before the creation of ALBA, I was seen as unthinkable that any of the member countries were likely to raise their hand against U.S interests. The process undertaken furthermore supports objective eleven of the national development plan, in terms of establishing a social economic system based on sustainability and solidarity. This argument can be supported by the creation of SUCRE, and the enablement of bartering on the internal market. (Azzellini 2014) (Ruttenberg 2013)

#### 4.5.1.4: A marked increase in political capabilities

An increase in political capabilities can be observed through some of the same arguments used in the previous section, such as ALBA voting on its own interests as international forums and standing up to the UN on climate issues. Furthermore, as a strategic political alliance, ALBA's fundamental and historical objective is to unite the capabilities and strengths of the countries that conform it, so that structural transformations take place, and make possible the state of integral development required for the continuity of the sovereignty of the member states. This is enforced by the transnational concept that lies at the heart of ALBA, this concept being based on the following principles:

Firstly, the organization is founded on a historical and geopolitical premise, that is the Bolivarian vision of a great nation, created by the union of the Latin American and the Caribbean republics. The geopolitical aspect is especially relevant, seeing how the world is dominated by neoliberal development policies, these being divided into regional and sub-regional blocs. This transnational concept can be compared to that of a mega state, due to the fact that joint political actions between states share a common view on the exercise of national and regional sovereignty. The idea is that these states would work together towards to

consolidation of a socio-political identity, without falling into the trap of creating too many supranational structures. The concept is furthermore deeply rooted in the belief that it is necessary to go beyond the local sphere if the economies of the member states are to achieve the degree of development that is required to satisfy the needs of the majorities. In a nutshell, the concept aspires to remove national barriers from the equation, and furthermore to strengthen local capabilities in order to take joint action to confront the challenges of the global situation. Lastly, this transnational concept has ideological foundations shared by those who conform the ALBA, and especially those related to the critical view upon neoliberal globalization. The ideology that this concept stems from defends sustainable development as well as social justice. (ALBA 2008)

The transnational concept as described above shows several similarities or openings in regards to the Sumak Kawsay as seen implemented in the Ecuadorian development plan. The first objective in the development plan, being to promote equality, cohesion and integration in social and territorial diversity, is observed in the transnational concept as due to the joint political actions between states share a common view on the exercise of national and regional sovereignty. Objective two of the development plan can be observed in the transnational concept through the goal of strengthening local capabilities, in order to confront the challenges of the global situation. Objective five from the development can, can once again also be observed by the increase in political capabilities by taking joint action to confront the U.S for example. Objective five has to do with guaranteeing sovereignty and promote strategic insertion into the world, as well as Latin American integration, and sovereignty in this regard is thus observed as ALBA maintaining sovereignty towards the rest of the international community, and doing so by all member countries joining forces. It has also been described how one of the goals for ALBA, is for its member countries to work towards the consolidation of a socioeconomic shared identity, which fits very well with objective eight in the national development plan. This objective works with affirming and strengthening national identity, diverse identity, plurinationality and interculturality. This strengthening of identity should then not be seen as being on a national level, but rather on the level of internal identity within ALBA. The organizations confrontation of the neoliberal development policies and neoliberal globalization of the western world in their transnational concept, can be argued to fit well with objective eleven in the development plan, being about creating a social economic system based on sustainability and solidarity. In outside observer could even assume that ALBA was founded on principles of Buen Vivir, as the transnational concept is described as having been created on a foundation of sustainable development as well as social justice. The biggest similarity however, is found with objective twelve of the development plan. This particular objective aims to construct a democratic state for the realization of Buen Vivir. This is observed in the transnational concept through the goal to eradicate borders between nations. Further

support to this claim can be found in description that the organization was first created on a Bolivarian initiative in an attempt to unite the Latin American states into one nation. An important aspect to note here, is that the very same Bolivia have recently implemented principles of Buen Vivir into their own national development plan, under the name of Suma Qamaña. This implementation was however disregarded as a case study for this thesis, due to Ecuador's stronger institutional implementation. Lastly, the transnational concept was observed described as a mega state, due to the fact that joint political actions between states share a common view on the exercise of national and regional sovereignty. (ALBA 2008) (Ruttenberg 2013)

The organization ALBA can already be argued to be behaving like a mega state, to the extent that overarching governmental decisions are being processed on the international level, in order for ALBA to make a combined front to stand up for their own interests. Examples of this has been mentioned earlier in the thesis. The organization furthermore exhibit goals of even further integration, with the eradication of national borders, as well as creating a socio-economic identity. Of the observed characteristics and behavioral patterns at this point, Buen Vivir can't be argued to be an unlikely candidate for the before mentioned socio-economic identity.

#### 4.5.1.5: Superior economic growth

When talking about economic growth in regards to Buen Vivir and Sumak Kawsay, it is important to keep in mind that Deutsch et al. developed the theory of security communities for the European region in the aftermath of World War II, with the goal to achieve regional integration through the economic dimension. It is thus difficult to see this particular aspect through the lenses of the Ecuadorian development plan. It does however appear in the achievement goals of ALBA, as it appears so in "The Deed of Constitution of the Bank of ALBA". It describes that it is "necessary to accelerate the economic growth and the generation of dignified employment, strengthening the internal markets and substantially improve the living standards of the population" (ALBA 2008 p6). The Deed furthermore describes the need to develop the internal financial market in order to raise liquidity and activate a cycle of political, cultural, economic and social transformations in the region. Additionally, the Deed emphasizes the need for a new financial structure in the region, further underlining that it can no longer be delayed. The new structure is thought out to be existing under the control of the Latin American and Caribbean people, and is oriented towards reducing external vulnerability and prioritizing the basic needs of the people. The new financial structure should furthermore have institutions, with the sole purpose however of promoting and funding the joint socioeconomic development of member nations. It is later agreed upon to create said bank with the main objective to contribute to socio-economic development, and furthermore promoting economic exchanges

which are also fair, dynamic, harmonious and equitable to all members of the ALBA. The Deed however does not emphasize the specific nature of these economic exchanges and thus does not underline the nature of economic growth. As the Deed expresses the need for economic transformation, Sumak Kawsay could help offer a reinterpretation of the concept "economic growth" cf. ALBA's own declaration of intent within the Deed. (ALBA 2008)

Therefore, as the thesis has taken a critical point of view towards the classical concept of development, it will also have to assume a critical view towards the classical understanding of economic growth. It must do so because the classical western interpretation of development relies heavily on economic growth through currency as the main driver for development and subsequently integration. What can be observed in ALBA is rather a political and social integration, using economic development as a tool, and not as a tangible goal in itself. Even the use of the word "economic" is more often than not seen being accompanied by the word "socio", bearing testimony to the fact that ALBA aims at economic growth in a social economy within a regional integration scheme on the social and political dimension.

Having established that ALBA has an alternative interpretation of development than that of the neoliberal paradigm and the specific economic growth that is its premise, an alternative example of economic growth can be argued to be the enabling of bartering internally in the organization. This makes the market a lot more dynamic in the sense that a nations trading power become greatly increased, when traditional exports, goods or services can be used as payment as it is the case with the fuel that ALBA receives from Venezuela. This enablement of bartering can be argued to be an increase in economic growth, as it will fuel the market, due to the increase in the trade of services and goods. When this increase in trading power is interpreted as economic growth, then Sumak Kawsay objectives from the Ecuadorian development plan once again become observable, this time more specifically objective eleven, that has the goal of establishing a social economic system, based on sustainability and solidarity. Bartering can certainly be argued to be attributed to a social economic system, and with a dynamic trading and purchasing power of member states, it can also be further argued to be sustainable and solidary. An argument can furthermore be made in favor for the presence of objective three in this increase of purchasing and trading power, because objective three is to improve the quality of life for the population. The argument here is that an increase in market dynamics through and increase in purchasing power through bartering will stimulate the economy and bringing about what can be argued to be economic growth, as well as improving the general quality of life for the population. For supporters of the social inclusive economy, this will be the equivalent of a markedly superior growth to that of both the neighboring countries and the recent past (Azzellini 2014) (Ruttenberg 2013).

#### 4.5.1.6: Unbroken links of social communication, sociologically and geographically

Social links can in this instance be understood as social groups and institutions providing effective channels of communication both horizontally and vertically among the main units of the amalgamated security community and vertically among the politically relevant strata within them.<sup>4</sup> The member states within ALBA can be argued to be part of an organization based on principles of cooperation, solidarity and complementarity that seeks to accumulate popular and institutional forces for anew declaration of Latin American independence, a movement of people and for people. The organization is furthermore building hemispheric integration from below and from the left based on principles on solidarity and inclusion, with no commercial criteria or selfish interests. As established previously in the thesis, an initial initiative for the creation of the organization was the goal to unite the nations of Latin America and the Caribbean into one nation, and it has continuously been a goal to eradicate internal borders. The organization furthermore has a great foundation of support provided by more than 200 various social movements from twenty-two countries, who each sent their respective delegate to the Continental Assembly of Social Movements towards ALBA. (Bishop 2013)

At the assembly, these social movements called for further integration observed through the statements as observed in the declaration of the assembly. Here the social movements call for the promotion of unity and regional integration based on an alternative, sustainable model, supportable model where the modes of both production and reproduction are at the service of the people of ALBA. These social movements furthermore call for establishing networks and effective coordination of popular communication, which will equip the member states in order to engage in the struggle of ideas, and to curb the manipulation of information on the part of corporations and the mass media. Lastly these social movements call for a deepening the process of political and ideological formation in order to strengthen the internal organizations, in order to move forward with processes of unity that are consequent and consciously in accordance with needed transformations. These aims and goals of both the ALBA itself and the social movements towards it, can be argued to be compatible with those of Sumak Kawsay in the sense that objective one, being to promote equality, cohesion and integration in social territorial diversity can be linked with the social movements call to promote unity and regional integration, based on an alternative sustainable and supportable model where the production is at the service of the people of the respective member countries. The sustainable and supportable model, is observed through objective eleven and four, those dealing with respectively establishing a social economic system based on solidarity and sustainability and guaranteeing the rights of nature and promoting a sustainable environment. Objective seven can be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See security communities in the theroretical chapter

observed in the social movements call to establish networks and effective coordination of popular communication, as objective seven in the development plan aims to build and strengthen public, intercultural and common meeting spaces. By a further deepening of the process for political and ideological formation in order to move forward in unity in accordance with the necessary transformations, it can be interpreted that these social movements are in line with objective twelve of the national development plan, dealing with construction of democratic state for the realization of Buen Vivir (Ruttenberg 2013) (Bishop 2013).

## 4.5.1.7: A broadening of the political elite

This aspect has previously been mentioned in the thesis, where an idea was formed on how to reinterpret this aspect. As Buen Vivir attempts to implement as much equality as possible, a broadening of the political elite, would defeat the purpose of creating a security community on the foundations of Buen Vivir. The thesis has already briefly introduced the ideas behind this reinterpretation, but to re-cap, it can be said that since Buen Vivir attempts to dismantle hierarchy in politics, and to mobilize the general population, a broadening of the political elite can also be understood as involving all parts of the population, and thus turning most of the general population into the political elite. This aspect can be reinterpreted in this sense due to Deutsch et al. own description of the condition, this being "broadening of the political, social or economic elite, both in regards to its recruitment from the broader social strata, and to its continuing connections with them". In a nutshell, in a Latin American context this background condition can be argued to be the removal of hierarchy in general, meaning a broadening of the political elite of Olympic dimensions. (Goodchild 2015)

When a broadening of the political elite is interpreted in this way, this essential background conditions starts to be visible within the organization of ALBA. It does so through the social movements who are able to organize within ALBA via the official council of social movements, which is hierarchically equal to the councils and ministers and therefore, in theory at least, takes on an authoritative positions of equal footing to governments. This grass root support for the ALBA from independent social movements is key to the claims by the ALBA that is an integration agreement created from the grassroots. This feature is regularly praised by commentators as an important and innovative aspect with regards to regional agreements. These social movements furthermore organize through the continental assembly of social movements towards ALBA, which sits outside of formal structures and in intended to be a bottom up initiative which is relatively autonomous of state power. These dual fronts which social movements are aiming at highlighting the complex relationship between the social and political aspect. Many social movements which mobilized against neoliberalism are broadly supportive of the ALBA, but simultaneously they remain committed to

maintaining autonomy, including the ability to mobilize and pressure the ALBA and its member governments if necessary. This dynamic relationship between the organization itself and the social movements which operates around it, contribute to a general broadening of the political elite from being kept within the political organization, to also include grassroots movements relevant to the political and social ideology of the organization. (Goodchild 2015)

The relative power of the social movements towards ALBA can be observed through the calls made towards ALBA by these social movements on the continental assembly. An important call of these, although these calls have already been briefly touched upon in section 4.4.6, is the call the relaunch the struggle of the masses and the class struggle at a national, regional and continental level, that allows the people of the social movements to dismantle neo-capitalist programs and projects, these widely being known for having an excessive amount of hierarchy. (Bishop 2013)

Furthermore, with this updated understanding of how a broadening of the political elite can be understood, objectives for this background condition can be observed through the Ecuadorian development plan. It can be so firstly through objective number one being about promoting equality in social and territorial diversity, meaning a broadening of political and social rights, in regards to both class and territory. It can additionally be observed through both objective nine and ten, these dealing respectively with guaranteeing the valid existence of rights and justice, along with guaranteeing access to public and political participation. Objective nine can be understood as broadening of the political elite through an equal treatment towards the general population in regards to the justice system and social rights. These rights have in the past primarily been seen as services reserved for the political elite. Expanding of these rights to the general population can then be argued to be a broadening of the political elite. Objective ten being as direct as it is, is vastly self-explanatory in regards to increased public and political participation. (Ruttenberg 2013)

#### 4.5.1.8: Mobility of persons

It has previously been established in the theory section, that in order to integrate a certain political community into an amalgamated security community, it is highly important to get the population involved, which is why Deutsch et al. finds mobility of persons among the main units at least in the politically relevant strata. This mobility of persons can be directly observed within the organization of ALBA through the more than 200 delegates from 22 Latin American countries present at the continental assembly for social movements towards ALBA. An argument can even be made that the organization of ALBA was founded in the context of tipping political balance scale during the 90's as new combative social movements rose up to challenge the neoliberal state along with the revival of militant social movements. (Goodchild 2015)

This mobility of persons falls neatly into line with the increased political participation of the general public through the utility of social movements, these social movements having direct influence on the political ideology of the organization. This can be observed through the relative power that social movements have through the fact that these can make demands towards ALBA, observed at the continental assembly. Addressing the assembly, the leader of Brazils Landless worker's movement(MST) Joao Pedro Stedile declared that he considered the gathering as a third phase in the Latin American social movements. The first phase, he argued, was the "moment of resistance" during 1990-1998, in which social movements were able to halt the advance of neoliberalism and imperialism, along with networks, organizations and continental forums beginning to emerge. The first phase had its culmination, according to Stedile, when Chavéz was elected president in 1998. The second phase he argued to be the creation of the Assembly of Social movements, which is a broad anti-neoliberal alliance that does not have socialism as an explicit goal. The creation involved a series of debates and gatherings, and happened simultaneously as the election of other progressive governments happened, along with the creation of government based regional integration organizations. Accordingly, the third phase now required social movements to create a proposal for integration independent of the governments, although united behind the same project. Social movements needed an autonomous space, with the moral obligation to criticize and support these various governments when needed. (Fuentos 2013)

The emergence of the increased emphasis on social movements in regards to regional integration and development, can be observed through the Ecuadorian development plan in objective one, five, seven and ten, objective one respectively promoting equality cohesion and integration in social and territorial diversity, observed through the halt in the advancement of neoliberal policies and imperialism, along with the creation of organizations and continental forums emerging. Objective five and seven can be observed in phase two, through the creation of the Assembly of social movements, as this is building and strengthening public, intercultural and common meeting spaces, along with promoting strategic insertion in to the world. Additionally, through phase two, objective ten can be observed, as this objective aims to guarantee access to public and political participation. It is most clearly observed, however, through phase three which is the creation of proposals for integration independent of governments as put forward by social movements. The fact that these social movements seem to operate on an autonomous level relative to the governments of the member states, is of significant importance, as these social movements can then help to provide unbroken links of social communication both geographically and sociologically cf. chapter 4.4.6. Furthermore, it contributes to specific ideology, or even a specific way of life across different territories and regions. (Ruttenberg 2013)

#### 4.5.1.9: A multiplicity of ranges of communication and transaction

Deutsch et. Al found in their study that successful amalgamation requires a fairly broad range of different functions and services, and that these require a multiplicity of ranges of common communications and transactions and their institutional counterparts. It lies implicitly in this condition that there has to be a balance of transaction between different participating units and territories, concerning both flows of communication and flows of prestige and benefits. An argument can be made that this multiplicity of ranges does exist within the organization of ALBA, as this can be interpreted as both the various member states, but also through the autonomous status of social movements towards ALBA. These social movements ensure communication and transactions across nation borders, as the Assembly of Social Movements towards ALBA have movements from not only from the countries that are member states, but from countries all over Latin America. This means that ALBA does not rely solely on intergovernmental communication and negotiation, but also on the input of several autonomous umbrella movements. These umbrella movements can be argued to lift the task of increased communication and these call for a further deepening of political and ideological formation, in order to strengthen institutions and to move forward in unity. Furthermore, they call for establishing more networks and effective coordination of popular communication, which will contribute to an increased range of communication between the respective governments and social movements. (Bishop 2013)

Another range of transaction that can and should be emphasized in this regard, is the enablement of bartering on ALBA's internal market, enabling member states to increase their trading power, and thus enabling said states to increase their amount of economic transactions between their respective governments and companies. This can be argued to contribute to an increase in the flow of benefits between member states, as these no longer have to rely on foreign capital to finance their imports. This bartering goes both ways, shown by the example of Venezuela paying for some of its oil bill through textbooks, showing a situation in which both countries have mutual benefits of this bartering. This aim to have a wide range of communication institutions can be observed through objective seven in the Ecuadorian development plan, dealing with the creation and building of public, intercultural and common meeting spaces, ensuring communication across borders and organizations. (Ruttenberg 2013)

#### 4.5.2 Additional useful background conditions

Indications were found in the study by Deutsch et al. that three additional conditions could prove to be useful but not essential to successful amalgamation. These not being necessarily considered essential will be emphasized less, and subsequently analyzed accordingly. These conditions are taken into consideration, in order to support the hypothesis that a security community founded on the principles of Buen Vivir can be implemented through the regional integration organization ALBA. Should these background conditions prove to be present, it can be argued to support the hypothesis that this thesis works with.

#### 4.5.2.1 A compensation of flows of communications and transactions.

This background condition can essentially be connected with the previous essential background condition 4.4.1.9 that deals with a wide range of communications and transactions. This condition follows the preceding one, meaning that a territory at one time might be receiving a particular amount of before mentioned prestige or benefits, and then in turn become sources of benefit for other member countries. This can be observed in ALBA both through founding principles and through practical applications. In regards to ALBA's founding principles, it can be mentioned that ALBA is founded on mutual solidarity and equality between the member countries, and that the idea of having a dynamic compensation of flows of communications and transactions are then built into the foundation of the organization. In regards to practical applications it is observed in ALBA how bartering can be negotiated between member countries, meaning that one good can be traded equally for another good, and thus compensating the use of dollars for financing a given member state's imports. This means that when one country has an abundance of a given good, it may negotiate to exchange that good for another that has a higher relative utility for that given state.

This background condition for regional integration can be observed in the Ecuadorian development plan through objective six, that aims to guarantee stable, just and dignified employment in diverse forms, due to the fact that the before mentioned bartering will increase the relative purchasing power of a given state and thus warrant an increase in both production and consumption. This increase will subsequently create more jobs, that is not relying on economic inflation, but rather on the stable exchange of transactions and communications through bartering. In connection with the preceding objective, this thesis recognizes objective eleven as a directly observable aim to increase compensation of flows of communications and transactions, as this objective aims to establish a social economic system based on solidarity and sustainability. Using bartering to break the dependence on the dollar for financing imports, and furthermore creating a common currency for the internal market, can be argued to give both an increased flow of communications and transactions, but argued to contribute to a compensation of said communications and transactions, and can categorically be argued to attribute to the implementation of a social economic system with incorporated principles of solidarity.

### 4.5.2.2: A not too frequent interchange of group roles

The rationale of this particular background condition can likewise be put in reference to background condition 4.4.19 in the way that this interchange of group roles refers back to communications and

transactions, only here in regards to interchange rate of which a given country on occasion will take initiative to a particular phase or contribution. Different phases have already been mentioned previously in the thesis in regards to social movements. The dynamic relationship between member states and social movements within the organization of ALBA could serve as the mentioned interchange of group roles, understood through the fact that member countries do not carry the entire responsibility alone, when it comes to contributing to the political processes of ALBA. The creation of the Assembly of Social Movements towards ALBA, and subsequently the creation of a proposal for integration independent of the governments can be argued to be a specific contribution from the social movements within the organization. According to Fernando Bossi, the organization of ALBA is furthermore in a phase of the ancient and permanent confrontation between the Latin American and Caribbean peoples and the imperialism that has been dominating the region since the days of the colonialists, and most recently contributed to "the lost years" in the Latin American narrative, meaning more specifically the 1980's and 1990's. In this before mentioned phase, countries are required to choose sides between the ALBA and socialism, or the US and their open market capitalism. Internally this has meant conflicts between neighbors such as Ecuador and Venezuela with Columbia, and externally all of the member countries with the United States. This means that the role, or in this case the political ideology is expected to become stable and thus not interchangeable, and that all member countries on occasion will play out their part in halting the advance of neoliberal development policies as well as imperialism. (Hirst 2010)

In regards to this not too frequent interchange of group roles, objective seven and ten can once again be observed, as objective seven connects with the creation of the assembly for social movements towards ALBA, and subsequent creation of an autonomous integration strategy, which can be interpreted as a contribution to multiple phases by the social movements, while objective ten links with the social movements directly. Objective eleven can be observed through the phase that Bossi is referring to, in which countries have to select what side to be on, in regards to the canyon between the ALBA and the socialism within it, and the open market capitalism of the US, as objective eleven aims to establish a social economic system based on solidarity and sustainability, rather than a capitalist open market system based on individual freedom.

#### 4.5.2.3: Considerable mutual predictability of behavior

Having had Deutsch et al. establish that mutual predictability of behavior can be argued to be a useful background condition for successful amalgamation, it is important to understand exactly what this background condition means. The idea is that the participating units must be able to expect from one another some dependable interlocking or at least compatible behavior, meaning that these must be able to

at least to an extent predict one another's actions. By looking into their own minds, a population of a given participating unit, here meaning member state, would be able to make a fairly good guess as to what their neighbors would do, and would thus trust or understand them to the same extent to which they would trust or understand themselves. This background condition is thus connected to background condition 4.4.1.1, which deals with the mutual compatibility of main values, which is why some of the same arguments can be utilized in support for the claim of compatibility between member countries in ALBA. Furthermore, parallels can be drawn to Bossi's claim that Latin America is in a phase in which member states have to pick a side between socialism and neoliberalism, in order to have mutual predictability of behavior in the future. (Hirst 2010)

In regards to Buen Vivir and the constitutional implementation of Sumak Kawsay, it can be argued that when the before mentioned phase of selecting sides has passed, then the member countries of ALBA will have what can be argued to be a distinct internal ideology with compatibility of main values between member countries, and additionally towards Buen Vivir, which will lead to mutual predictability of values, as objectives and background conditions from the economic dimension to the social dimension in regards to regional integration can be argued to be streamlined to Buen Vivir, the most clear of these objectives being the construction of a democratic state for the realization of Buen Vivir and establishing a social economic system based on solidarity and sustainability. An argument can here be made that to an extent, ALBA is functioning pluralistic security community today, with broad potential to become an amalgamated one through the support and ideology of Buen Vivir, that can be argued to be streamlined to work within the organization of ALBA, given that the phase of selecting sides between socialist and neoliberal policies reaches its completion.

# **5. Discussion Chapter**

The process of European integration is perceived by many other countries as an ideal model of integration that together with its institutional design and free market attracts many to either become a part of it or to try to replicate its success. This success, however can be argued to only be present within the region of Europe. What this indicates is, that even though many valuable lessons and practices can be taken and used in other integration attempts, the shape that the EU has today has been tailored due to its needs. These needs cover specific historical and regional background conditions present at the time.

It is argued that the main drivers behind European integration are economic integration, aided by the Marshall plan and security.

However, this security factor can be argued to not necessarily be enough for a fully developed regional integration scheme, as the economic elements of integration lay at the of the process from the beginning, and would continue to fuel the process continuously. The economic dimension of European integration is grounded in the principles of the liberal economy that has been mutually adopted by both, the EU and the U.S. This Western economic approach, grounded in the Washington Consensus, allowed Europe to thrive, rapidly increasing the economic output because of European Common Market (later European Single Market) and intense transatlantic trade. Due to the momentum the European economic integration, the process soon gained a political dimension, this after a set of various Treaties which reshaped the institutional design of the Community.

It can be argued that the success of the European Union lies in the commonly accepted values, ideological and economic practices of its members. Even though similar attempts have been made in Latin America, they have been rather unsuccessful in achieving their goals while following the European way of integration. This is due to several factors that shall be discussed below.

Firstly, the problem in Latin America is that there not that many organizations with common goals, which makes deeper integration more difficult to achieve. It has been suggested earlier in this thesis that integration only works if states move in a common direction. This process doesn't necessarily have to be driven by economic, military or diplomatic factors, but can also include social and environmental factors, as those became increasingly important when discussing integration or security. An example of such international cooperation is the EU case, in which the EU established multiple international platforms of economic and political cooperation between neighboring states based on the acceptance of the European values. What binds the EU together is the mutual ideological recognition of both member states and non-member states. An ideological basis such as this can then be argued to be unique for a specific region, and does not necessarily have to rely solely on economic drivers. The success of regional integration in Latin America can then be equated to lie in its own philosophy and ideology.

In this thesis, such ideology is represented by the theory of Buen Vivir and its Ecuadorian interpretation Sumak Kawsay. This theory differs from the European theoretical approach in integration in its very foundations, because it takes a liberal intergovernmentalist approach. The theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism has been chosen because it is seen as the most influential theory of integration, especially regarding the EU case. It assumes that the integration process is driven by the elites and their

67

political will to cooperate. Such an approach doesn't correlate with the basic premises of Sumak Kawsay as it is a bottom-up approach that has a strong emphasis on the social and environmental aspects of living. Since this is a local ontology of the Latin American region, it is argued that this theory could represent a stronger ideological bond between states that will help to evolve the integration process in Latin America to its full potential.

The EU as an international institution is a very effective platform for international dialogue and bargaining between its member states. The institution reduces costs related the integration process, and furthermore holds the instruments necessary for implementing reached agreements, as well as monitoring member compliance. Such an institution provides its members with more capabilities in reaching further and more complex agreements than if they tried to do so without it. Furthermore, the social element of integration can be clearly seen in the EUs decision-making process. This process is accompanied by the presence and influence of various lobbyists, social organizations, groups and movements. These actors will either support of reject implementations of the EU, and thus the EU's legitimacy relies heavily on its broad acceptance among society. If implemented into a Latin American context, such an institution would help to promote integration and cooperation between states and states and society more effectively.

Having briefly mentioned Buen Vivir in regards to The European Union as an opposing ideology to the Classical Western Neoliberal Globalization, it is equally interesting to discuss the concept in Latin American context. First of all, it is worth to discuss the selection of ALBA as the integrational platform for utilizing the concepts of Buen Vivir.

The organization of ALBA was chosen over the Pacific Alliance, as organizations such as the Pacific Alliance can be argued to not have an inclusive set of common policies, as neoliberal development policies require that a country to an extent follows a classical western interpretation of economic growth, and has development policies in pursuit of said growth. This condition becomes highly problematic for countries in which the word "development" hardly exists, and even less so in the western interpretation, as these countries will have a hard time even implementing neoliberal policies, as their respective economies can be argued to not be ready for an open market policy.

It can be argued that these economically marginalized countries have a need for a more inclusive organization in which the concept "economic growth" can be understood and interpreted in more than one way, and economic integration is utilized as a tool, rather than an explicit goal in itself. Although the ALBA can be argued to have socialist oriented policies, the organization itself does not have socialism as an

explicit goal, and countries taking the path of admission would thus not have to adhere to a specific set of goals at this point in time, but rather chose to take a stand against neoliberalism. It can then be argued that the organization is more inclusive than that of the Pacific Alliance. Prior to the analysis, it was furthermore indicated that the organization of ALBA was founded on a set of principles that are closer to those of Buen Vivir, than the Pacific Alliance. Additionally, the organization exhibited goals for economic integration in the larger scheme of integrational dimensions.

An argument is made in favor of superior economic growth being present in the organization, but not through classical economic growth, but rather through the relative increase in interstate purchasing power, and through the creation of the bank of ALBA. The bank can be argued to have the goal of economic growth or development, even though the specific nature of these developments on the internal market is not particularly outlined. This is supported by the fact that the bank has the explicit goal of implementing a new financial structure to reduce external vulnerabilities, contributing to a markedly superior growth to that of neighboring countries and the recent past. The social dimension of integration can be observed though the background condition of unbroken links of social communication. This is due to the involvement of the general population in the political process through the importance of social movements towards ALBA, and through the calls made by same social movements towards establishing effective coordination of popular communication. These social movements work autonomous of the governments of member states, and can be argued to contribute to an increased range of communication independent of governments and political institutions created by the said governments. This background condition and subsequent arguments for practical implementations of the ALBA are directly connected to the background condition concerned with broadening the political elite. Through the social dimension of integration, this background condition can be understood as increased access to political participation of the general population, observed through the relative autonomy and hierarchical equality between social movements and governments, showed by the creation of an integration strategy independent of governments. Thus, the argument can be made that the ALBA attempts to broaden the political elite to include the general population though social movements, and by doing so, creates a dual front used to highlight the relationship between the political and social dimension of integration. When understanding a broadening of the political elite through this interpretation, it can also be linked directly to the background condition of mobility of persons, in which social movements can be argued to play an obvious role, as mobility of people entails getting the general population involved in the political process. The involvement of social movements in the political process is described through Stedile (Fuentos 2013), who argues that social movements have passed through three different phases in the creation of ALBA. These phases have been described previously in the analysis. This once again demonstrates the dynamic relationship between political and social integration that exists in

ALBA, and how social movements play a critical role in securing social communication, as well as contributing to a specific way of life.

Therefore, the argument can be made that many if not all of the essential background conditions for the creation of a pluralistic security community already exist within ALBA. The organization can be said to exhibit clear political, social and economic goals for integration, although the latter is being utilized more as a tool, rather than being an explicit goal in itself. The organization of ALBA itself expresses aims and goals to further deepen the political process and subsequent political integration, by creating common policies to create a united front against neoliberal development policies. According to Stedile (Fuentos 2013) and his argued phases, this however requires that member states will reach a consensus of selecting sides. This thesis will now summarize how the ontology of Buen Vivir can be utilized within the organization of ALBA according to the organizations own goals and ideologies.

In accordance with the essential background conditions, various objectives from the Ecuadorian national development plan have been observed within the organization of ALBA. The distinctive way of life was analyzed and are linked to the increased rights of both citizens and nature in objective two, three and four, while the expectation of stronger economic ties and gains can be seen through objective five and eleven. These objectives are showing clear signs of both political, social and economic integration, although not through a compatible interpretation in regards to western economic integration.

Increased autonomy can be viewed as strategic interstation into the world through economic integration, while the SUCRE and internal bartering can be seen through the objective in the Ecuadorian development plan to create a social economic system. The transnational concept briefly discussed before, furthermore shows extensive similarities with the Ecuadorian development plan on objective one, two, five, eight, eleven and twelve as referred to in chapter 3.2.1, supported by the cooperative political actions and a common view on the exercise of regional sovereignty, as well as the goal of strengthening local capabilities. The argument finds further support in the increase of political capabilities through economic independence from the U.S, these increased capabilities understood as strategic insertion into the world and the creation of a socioeconomic identity.

The confrontation of neoliberal development policies and the fact that the transnational concept is based on sustainable development can furthermore be argued to fall well into line with the goals of the Ecuadorian Development plan in general, not to mention the creation of a socio-economic system. The principle similarity can however be argued to be the Bolivarian vision of a great nation made from Latin America states, based on solidarity and sustainability, in context with the goal of developing a state for the realization of Buen vivir. This is because this concept works with the same set of principles for development.

On the note of development, and more specifically, economic development, Deutsch background condition of economic growth can be observed, although in an alternative interpretation through objective eleven and three in the development plan. This can be interpreted through an improvement of life for the general population through the relative increase in interstate purchasing power, and through economic growth as bartering. This can be argued to be connected with the goal of a socio-economic system, which enables member countries to complement each other, due to contribution of bartering to a markedly superior growth through alternative channels of distribution.

Social movements can also be argued to contribute to alternative channels, those channels being communication and political ideology formation. This can be observed in the background condition of social communication, in which objective one, four, seven, eleven and twelve is observed through the social movements call for unity and regional integration based on an alternative model. This alternative model can in this regard be viewed as Buen Vivir's socio-economic system. Further support for the argument is found through the calls made by the movements to coordinate popular communication to engage in the struggle of ideas, and the deepening the political process in order to move forward in unity. This unity is a recurring concept that can furthermore be observed in the background condition of broadening the political elite through objective one, nine and ten, due to the reinterpretation of the background condition, meaning a broadening of political and social rights, as well as the importance of social movements and equal treatment of the general population connected to justice and social rights. Moreover, it helps guaranteeing the right to political participation of the general population. This is an important aspect, as it has been established that mobility of persons is an essential condition for creating an amalgamated security community. The mobility of persons can be observed in the development plan, through the phases of social movements towards ALBA as descibed by Stedile, and can be so through objective one, five, seven and ten through the halt of neoliberal policies and imperialism initiated by social movements in the 1990's. It can furthermore be observed through the creation of the Continental Assembly for social movements towards ALBA, which can be seen as an attempt to create and strengthen intercultural meeting spaces as well as strategic insertion into the world. The creation of proposals independent of governments represents an attempt to guarantee political participation to the general population, as these social movements have been argued to be hierarchically equal to governments of member states.

As previously mentioned, these social movements contribute to a multiplicity of ranges of communication and transactions. This is also a background condition that can be observed through the development plan. In this regard through objective eleven and seven, due the implementation of bartering, enabling member countries to complement each other's economies. Further support to the argument can be found through the social movements being spaces for intercultural meetings and negotiations across territories. The compensation of flows and transactions in this background conditioning can furthermore be supported by bartering and economic independence through the SUCRE, and can additionally be seen in the founding principles of ALBA. The similarities are observable through objective six and eleven in the development plan due to compensation of goods through bartering creating increased production and subsequently and increase in jobs, these jobs relying on the steady concept of bartering, rather than the elusive concept of inflation. Moreover, the SUCRE can be argued to be a compensation of the dollar, which connects to objective eleven of a socio-economic system of compensation and complementarity. In this regards, complementarity can be argued to be understood through more than economic integration, this being through the political and social dimension. This can be argued as social movements compensate and complement governments in political ideology formation against neoliberalism. This aspect of integration can be observed in the development plan in objective seven, ten and eleven due to the creation of the assembly for social movements, and through the dynamic power relationship between governments and social movements, and finally through Bossi's (Hirst 2010) call for member states to choose sides, in order for common policies to evolve. The idea is that when this selection of sides is over, then participating units may be able to expect interlocking or compatible behavior, leading to a predictability of values. This goal to choose sides and to evolve common internal policies can be seen in objective twelve in the development plan, and brings the discussion of Buen Vivir in the ALBA close to its end. It does so, because development objective twelve is the construction of a democratic state for the realization of Buen Vivir, as seen in chapter 3.2.1, being close with the goal observed in ALBA's transnational concept to eradicate borders. It is observed through the analysis and the discussion how all of the Buen Vivir development goals can be argued to be in line with the development goals of ALBA, and that the background conditions as put forward by Deutsch can be argued to be present in the organization of ALBA through a reinterpretation of certain concepts. This reinterpretation covers concepts such as development and economic growth to fit both the organization of ALBA and the narrative of Buen Vivir.

It can thus be argued that ALBA has a strong approach to all of the integrational dimensions, however using the economic dimension primarily to fuel other dimensions of regional integration. The organization can however be argued to suffer from internal conflicts resulting from member countries not having a clear consensus towards the economic policies desired in each region. Thus, all essential background conditions can be argued to be present within the organization of ALBA. It can be further argued that all these essential background conditions can be argued to potentially be filled out by Buen Vivir, which is why this

72

thesis concludes that a suggestion can be made to implement a merger between the foundations of Buen Vivir and the foundations of ALBA. This is especially due to the similarities between objective twelve and ALBA's transnational concept, as these will complement and strength each other. This could offer a stronger approach to regional integration, due to the homogeneity that already exists between the organization and the concept of Buen Vivir. It is granted however in regards to this claim that the organization would have to reinterpret the understandings of respectively "development" and "economic growth" such as this thesis has done, and by doing so interpreting the relative increase of interstate purchasing power as "economic growth", while political autonomy from respectively the U.S and the U.N through economic independence can be understood as "economic development".

# 6. Conclusion Chapter

The aim of this thesis has been to develop a comparative approach to apply a constructed analytical concept, and to so through the ideal types of Weber. This means that one of the aims of the thesis have been to create an ideal type for regional integration. The thesis has done so by analyzing existing phenomena, and arranged these phenomena to fit a unified analytical construct. The aim of this analysis have been to show to what extent the theoretical concept of European Integration could be applied to regional integration organizations in Latin America, and benchmark current development schemes in the region to that of European Integration, in order to attain theoretical clarity.

The case of European integration has been analyzed through the theory of Liberal Intergovernmentalism and the theory of Security Communities. Both theories have shown a great level of integration and indeed, the EU can serve as a model for future attempts elsewhere. However, as it has been demonstrated in the analysis and discussion, that the European integration was formed and modified through a set of specific events and conditions that cannot be recreated elsewhere. In its historical context, the World Wars played a crucial role in uniting Europe as well as the East-West divide and the upcoming Cold War that threatened European integrity and security. Furthermore, European integration would not have happened the way it did without the external help from the U.S. in the form of The Marshall plan. The amount of money provided to Europe by Americans was sufficient enough to reconstruct the continent's infrastructure and industry. Here, a parallel can be drawn with the Latin America, since the continent struggles a lot with the unequal redistribution of resources in general which might be compared to the state of Europe before the implementation of Marshall plan. This parallel is drawn purely from the economic dimension of integration, as Latin America never experienced war quite like Europe.

The main driver behind the integration process has been the economic cooperation between European

states, grounded in the principles of liberal economy. An example of regional cooperation is shown with the European Neighborhood Policy (EPN) established to enhance the economic and political cooperation with neighboring states. Through the ENP, Europe promotes its values and ideology abroad and creates a secure environment which can serve as an example for the Latin America in its integration attempts. The EU as an international institution is a very effective platform for international dialogue and bargaining between member states. It helps to reduce the costs of this process and provides the necessary instruments for the implementation of reached agreements as well as monitoring of compliance of its member states. Such an institution provides its members with more capabilities in reaching further and more complex agreements than if they will try to do so without it. Furthermore, the social element of integration can be very well seen in the EUs decision-making process which is accompanied by the presence and influence of various lobbyists, social organizations, groups and movements. Paraphrased into the Latin America region, such an institution would help to promote integration and cooperation between states and also between states and society more effectively.

It is argued that The Pacific Alliance in Latin America is showing theoretical signs of potential European Integration, in that it adheres to the same open market policy, and that internal homogeneity exists. It is concluded however that the organization is not inclusive enough, due to its neoliberal development policies. An equivalent of the Washington consensus would need to be developed in order to ensure internal ideological consistency both on the economic and political dimension. This becomes problematic for countries in which the word development has a different meaning to that of western ideology, and thus this thesis concludes that economically marginalized countries have a need for more inclusive organizations, such as the ALBA.

This thesis can at this point conclude that organizations do exist in Latin America that have potential to achieve regional integration, but not through the classical western interpretation. The integration that occurred in Europe was driven by economic integration, with a large emphasis on security, following a neofunctionalist approach towards the said economic integration. Furthermore, European integration happened at a time in history in which the world was divided by contesting economic and political ideologies. Therefore, economic integration happened in the region to establish its commitment towards western development strategies and ideologies. The east-west divide and the hegemonic consolidation of the United States was halted around the same time as Neoliberal development policies were abandoned in Latin America, and the neoliberal advance was brought to halt cf. Stedile's phases of social movements in ALBA. The economic integration that is happening in ALBA can then be concluded to be undertaken to establish the organizations disconnection towards neoliberal globalization policies, and that economic

74

integration is happening to support political and economic autonomy from the U.S and subsequently their development policies. The economic integration in ALBA cannot be argued to follow the same pattern of a neofunctionalist approach as seen in Europe, as not all four phases have been implemented. The phases that have been implemented have been done so in a practical order, rather than a theoretical neofunctionalist order.

This thesis concludes that ALBA can serve as an integration platform for regional integration schemes in Latin America, due to the all the essential background conditions as put forward by Deutsch. The distinctive way of life internally in the organization is described to be the disconnection with the classical western interpretation of globalization and the halt of neoliberal development policies initiated by social movements towards ALBA in the 1990's. The enablement of this distinctive life is argued to be the economic sovereignty and autonomy gained through economic integration, making the member states of ALBA less reliant on the U.S dollar for import financing. These arguments are being used to further support the conclusion of the presence of expectations of stronger economic ties and gains for countries within the organization, and for countries to join. The thesis concluded that this will subsequently lead to an increase in political capabilities. The increase in political capabilities can already be observed through the fact that ALBA can be seen speaking against U.S interests to favor their own instead. Historically, this would not have been happening before the creation of ALBA. A further argument in support to this claim is found in the Bolivarian vision of a great nation that lies at the heart of ALBA, and can be so because of the specific aim to create a socioeconomic identity. The aim of the identity is to remove national borders and development sustainable common policies as well as social justice, and this aspect can thus be linked to the political dimension of integration.

After a reinterpretation of the classical western meaning of "economic growth", the thesis concludes this background condition to be present within the organization, as economic growth through both the lenses of ALBA and Buen Vivir can be argued to be understood as a relative increase in interstate purchasing power. It is furthermore supported by the creation of the bank of ALBA, due to its goal of economic development through a new financial structure. This new structure reduces external vulnerabilities, which is seen as markedly superior growth to that of neighboring countries. This aspect is in this thesis argued to be integration on the economic dimension, here again underlining that the economic integration follows an untraditional path of implementation.

The presence of the background condition of unbroken links of social communication is argued to be present due to the importance of social movements within ALBA, the functions that these movements have and subsequently the calls they make. An example of said importance can be seen in the defeat of FTAA in

2005, demonstrating the resistance of social movements, and a new geopolitical transformation (Bishop 2013). Further support to the argument can be made by viewing the autonomy of the social movements. This autonomy is argued to be contributing to an increased range of communications between governments and the general population, but also between populations in general. These aspects can be argued to contribute to increased integration on the social dimension. On the social dimension, this thesis can furthermore support the argument that the background condition regarding a broadening of the political elite is present, due to an increased access to political participation through the before mentioned social movements and the fact that these have created integration strategies independent of governments. The political elite is then concluded to be broadened through social movements, and thereby creating a dual front to highlight the relationship between the political and social dimension of integration. With the evidence on display at this point, it is an easy task to argue in favor of the background condition regarding mobility of persons being present within the organization, and further support is found through the phases that social movements have gone through in the creation of ALBA, as argued by Stedile (Fuentos 2013). Finally, the background condition of a wide range of transactions is argued to be present through the common currency, the SUCRE, as well as the enablement of bartering and the role of social movements. The SUCRE is directly contributing to increased economic sovereignty. The compensation of transactions is in this thesis argued to be trade compensation through bartering and political and social compensation through social movements, as these compensates governments in political ideology formation through input and criticism.

With these background conditions being present, it is argued that a pluralistic security community exists with the organization of ALBA, and that the organization shows promising signs for further integration into an amalgamated one, with its goals to create common policies in order to have a united front. This however requires complete consensus within the organization, which requires a selection of sides argued by Bossi (Hirst 2010). The leftist approach of ALBA can be argued to find support in Buen Vivir, as the concept and its Ecuadorian implementation can be argued to be compatible with the foundations of ALBA, and furthermore that the concept can offer support in regards to political ideology formation. The Ecuadorian implementation furthermore shows aims towards the background conditions by Deutsch et al, and can thus be argued to offer further support for regional integration.

This thesis furthermore makes the argument that the before mentioned consensus can be achieved by social movements through a bottom up formation of a socio-economic identity through the lenses of Buen Vivir. It can so because Buen Vivir is concluded to have strong similarities with the organization itself, but

76

especially with the transnational concept that lies at the heart of it. This is supported by the observation of all the objectives in the Ecuadorian implementation of Buen Vivir argued in the discussion and the analysis.

Lastly this thesis argues that ALBA has a strong approach to all three of the dimensions of integration, and that Buen Vivir is both in line with the foundation of the organization, but also that Buen Vivir can offer strong support for consensus building through hemispheric bottom up creation of a socio-economic identity by the social movements towards ALBA.

"We want to be brothers and sisters. We want respect and equality. Simon Bolivar, our father, said a balanced world - a universe - a balanced universe in order to have peace and development."—Hugo Chávez

# **Bibliography**

- ALBA. 2008. "Political Declartion of the sixth summit of the Bolivarian Alternative for the peoples of our America." Alternative regionalisms. January 24th-26th. Accessed May 12, 2016. http://www.alternative-regionalisms.org/wp-content/uploads/2009/09/documentos\_albavi.pdf.
- Azzellini, Dario. 2014. *NACLA reportnig on the americas since 1967*. Accessed May 12, 2016. https://nacla.org/article/alba-tcp-building-solidarity-and-autonomy-among-nations.
- Biscop, Sven. 2010. From ESDP to CSDP : Time for some Strategy. January 16. Accessed May 15, 2016. http://www.diploweb.com/From-ESDP-to-CSDP-Time-for-some.html.
- Bishop, Jordan. 2013. "Declaration of the First Continental Assembly of Social Movements towars ALBA "Hugo Chávez Frías"." *Integración de los Pueblos.* May 23. Accessed May 13, 2016. http://www.movimientos.org/es/content/declaration-first-continental-assembly-socialmovements-towards-alba-hugo-ch%C3%A1vez-fr%C3%ADas.
- Bremberg, Niklas. 2014. "The European Union as Security Community-Building Institution: Venues, Networks and Co-operative Security Practices<sup>\*</sup>." *Journal of Common Market Studies*, November 2014: 674-692.
- Bryman, Alan. 2012. Social Research Method. 4th. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Commission, Communication Department of the European. n.d. "European Union." *The euro.* Accessed May 10, 2016. http://europa.eu/about-eu/basic-information/money/euro/index\_en.htm.
- Commission, EU. n.d. *European Union*. Communication department. Accessed April 2016. http://europa.eu/about-eu/basic-information/about/index\_en.htm.
- —. n.d. The European Single Market. Communication department. Accessed May 2, 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/growth/single-market/index\_en.htm.

Dedman, Martin. 1996. The Origins and Development of the European Union 1945-95. London: Routledge.

- Deutsch, Karl W. 1957. "Political community and the North Atlantic Area." In *The European Union: Readings on the theory and practice of european integration,* by Brent F. Nelsen & Alexander Stubb, 121-143. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Dinan, Desmond. 2007. "Fifty Years of European Integration: A." *Fordham International Law Journal* (Berkeley Electronic Press) 5 (31): 27.
- EEAS. n.d. *European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP)*. Accessed May 12, 2016. http://eeas.europa.eu/enp/about-us/index\_en.htm.
- EU Commission, Communication department. n.d. *European Union*. Accessed April 2016. http://europa.eu/about-eu/basic-information/about/index\_en.htm.
- EUR-lex. 2010. "The Single European Act." *EUR-lex*. June 26. Accessed May 10, 2016. http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=URISERV%3Axy0027.
- —. 2015. "The Treaty of Lisbon: introduction." *EUR-lex.* September 22. Accessed May 12, 2016. http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=URISERV%3Aai0033.
- —. 2010. "Treaty of Maastrich on the European Union." *Eur-lex.* October 15. Accessed May 10, 2016. http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=uriserv:xy0026.
- Fuentos, Federico. 2013. *Green Left Weekly*. May 27. Accessed May 16, 2016. https://www.greenleft.org.au/node/54166.
- Gambles, Ian. 1995. "Introduction: the European security-community." In *A Lasting Peace in Central Europe?*, by Ian Gambles, 4-9. Paris: Chaillot Papers.
- Goodchild, Laurence. 2015. Albainfo.org. Accessed May 16, 2016. https://albainfo.org/what-is-the-alba/.
- Gudynas, Eduardo. 2011. "Buen Vivir: Today's tomorrow." In Development, by Eduardo Gudynas, 441-447.
- Hirst, Joel D. 2010. *Americas Quaterly*. Accessed May 17, 2916. http://www.americasquarterly.org/hirst/article.
- Hubert Zimmermann & Andreas Dur. 2012. *Key Controversies in European Integration*. London: Pelgrave Macmillan.
- Jazeera, Al. 2009. www.aljazeera.com . October 17. Accessed May 12, 2016. http://www.aljazeera.com/news/americas/2009/10/2009101712255748516.html.
- Laporte, Vincent. 2012. *The European Union an Expanding Security Community?* Department of EU International Relations adn Diplomacy Studies, College of Europe, Brussels: Peter Lang Bruxelles.
- Mera, Laura Gomez. 2007. Obstacles to Regional Integration in Latin America and the Caribbean: Compliance and Implementation Problems . University of Miami: Miami - Florida European Union Center .

- Mina, Bianca. 2014. "The European Union as an integration model for Latin America and the Carribean reality or wishful thinking ?" Edited by Institutul de Studii Latino-Americane. *European Journal of Latin American Studies* (ISLA) 2:2: 95-11.
- Moravcsik, Andrew & Schimmerlfenning, Frank. 2009. "Liberal Intergovernmentalism." In *European Integration theory*, by Ante Wiener & Thomas Diez, 66-87. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Moravcsik, Andrew. 1993. Preferences and power in the European Community: A Liberal Intergovernmentalist Approach. Harvard University: University Press.
- Moussis, Nicholas. 2015. Access to the European Union 21st editions. Europedia.
- Moustakis, Fotios & German, Tracey. 2009. *Library of European Studies : Securing Europe : Western Interventions Towards a New Security Community.* I.B.Tauris.
- Peterson, John. n.d. *The Choice for EU Theoretists: Establishing a Common Framework Analysis.* Department of Politics, Glasgow: University of Glasgow, 25.
- Prada, Raul. 2013. "Buen Vivir as model for state and economy." In *Beyond Development*, by Permanent working group on alternatives to development, 145-159. Amsterdam: Transnational Institute.
- Ruttenberg, Tara. 2013. "Development Alternatives for Inclusive Human Security." *Wellbeing Economics and Buen Vivir* 68-88.
- Segady, Thomas W. 2014. "The utility of Weber's ideal type: Verstehen and the Theory of Critical mess." Sociological Spectrum, 34 354-361.
- Yin, Robert K. 1994. Case stuy research Desgin and Methods, second edition. London: Sage Publications.