**Amanda C. Thurman**

**Supervisor: Trine Lund Thomsen Aalborg University, Culture Communication & Globalization**

**July 31, 2014**

Bilingual Education in Utah



# Abstract

This research is focused on two immigration communities within the Western United States, and their abilities to succeed academically in a bilingual Spanish-English school. The two immigrant communities are the Hispanics, which are the largest immigrant population in the state of Utah and the Tongans which are part of the larger Polynesian population.

Both of these populations share many of same obstacles when it comes to academic success and high school graduation. The obstacles are racism, discrimination, poverty, and English learning. In the traditional method of education these immigrant groups were expected to follow a mode of assimilation when learning in America’s public schools. They were expected to leave their native languages and cultures for the private use, and adopt a White, American, English speaking manner in hope that they could succeed and achieve the American Dream.

This assimilation process did not work for thousands of newly arrived immigrants, and instead they obtained poor grades if the continued through school. Otherwise, there was a high dropout rate for these groups, especially if English was not their first language.

The research has focused on a type of bilingual school that teaches in half the day Spanish and the other half in English. This type of education has forced schools to abandon their assimilation approach towards minorities and instead adopt diversity management in order to fully administer this bilingual education.

The research focused on qualitative interviews to understand how these groups saw education in Utah in the English-only manner and how they perceive it after the change to a more multicultural environment. The results were that many of these immigrants from this group are now feels the benefits of the diversity management approach in the schools. They are having a more equal participation as both students and parents in the program. They are now both being recognized and valued for their contributions to the school and to the nation.

Table of Contents

[Emergence of Dual Immersion 3](#_Toc394495759)

[Methodology 8](#_Toc394495760)

[Hypothesis 8](#_Toc394495761)

[Question 8](#_Toc394495762)

[The Approach 8](#_Toc394495763)

[Hispanics 9](#_Toc394495764)

[Tongans 10](#_Toc394495765)

[Research Design 12](#_Toc394495766)

[Interviewee Groups 12](#_Toc394495767)

[Past and Present 13](#_Toc394495768)

[Location 13](#_Toc394495769)

[Qualitative 14](#_Toc394495770)

[Methodological Limitations 15](#_Toc394495771)

[Main Concepts 16](#_Toc394495772)

[Reliability & Validity 18](#_Toc394495773)

[Theoretical Framework 19](#_Toc394495774)

[Theory of Recognition 19](#_Toc394495775)

[Three Areas of Honneth’s Self-Realization 20](#_Toc394495776)

[Diversity Management 22](#_Toc394495777)

[Pierre Bourdieu Capitals 23](#_Toc394495778)

[Institution 24](#_Toc394495779)

[Directive Think Globally, Act Locally 24](#_Toc394495780)

[Policy 26](#_Toc394495781)

[Program 28](#_Toc394495782)

[Park City, McPolin Elementary 28](#_Toc394495783)

[Glendale, Mountain View Elementary 31](#_Toc394495784)

[Understandings of the Two Programs 33](#_Toc394495785)

[Teachers 35](#_Toc394495786)

[Interactional 40](#_Toc394495787)

[McPolin 40](#_Toc394495788)

[Glendale 44](#_Toc394495789)

[Hispanics 44](#_Toc394495790)

[The Broader Community for Hispanics 47](#_Toc394495791)

[Tongan 49](#_Toc394495792)

[Individual 52](#_Toc394495793)

[Tongans 54](#_Toc394495794)

[Hispanics 57](#_Toc394495795)

[Conclusion 62](#_Toc394495796)

[Bibliography 65](#_Toc394495797)

# Emergence of Dual Immersion

The State of Utah has seen a sharp increase of migration within the last twenty years. The percentage for minority population in the capital of Salt Lake City increased from 10% in 1990 to 36% of the total population in 2010 (ORLGC, 6; 2014) . The majority of this immigrant population is young, under 35 years of age, and primarily of Hispanic and Asian/Pacific Islander origin. With this increase change and continued demographic projections of further immigration to Utah from Latin America, and other countries, the State is slowly adjusting its policies both economically and socially to fit the needs of this every increasing multicultural State.

Public and academic debate have often drawn on close links between migrant cultural diversity and social inequalities (Faist, 298; 2010). This can been seen in various boarder States, like Arizona where large Mexican-American communities have high crime and poverty rates at close to 25% of the total population (City of Tucson, 22; 2012). And further, that a large number of persons of color in the United States live at just above or below the poverty line and are then forced to use welfare resources. Yet, little is known about how cultural differences matter for social upward or downward mobility (Faist, 298; 2010).

In the area of Utah education, it noticed that persons of immigrant background have much higher dropout rates than Whites, and few go on to obtain higher education. This is even truer if the student is one who is learning English as a Second Language (ESL). In the state of Utah, the educational system has seen a high number of students who are English Language Learners (ELL) dropout, at 52% of the total student population for 2011. (USOE, 2011; 3) The number Hispanic students who are dropouts are the second highest in the State at 39% of the total population, while the Pacific Islander group is at 29%. This Hispanic dropout number is almost double of the White percentage which is at 17%, and the ELL group is 32% higher than White dropout rates.

These statistical numbers suggest that these immigrant children are not succeeding in education like their White counterparts. This can be due to various reasons such as low socio-economic background, difficulties performing in English, limited access to educational resources, poor school facilities and so on. Many of these reasons can influence whether immigrant children will graduate from high school and go on to finish their university education.

 Utilizing diversity management within the educational institution helps to alleviate some cultural and social issues within the institution. The schools were there a large majority of immigrant pupils have opted to incorporate diversity management would allow for the recognition of various immigrant’s culture and language. Though, this new type of diverse structure is held suspect in many States throughout the Union, and in fact, the neighboring state of Arizona took the approach of legally outlawing the teaching of Mexican-American culture within the classroom. The State Attorney General, Tom Horne was so opposed the Mexican American Studies program and launched the attack against it. Horne viewed the curriculum as separatist and ethnically divisive, and created Arizona House Bill 2281. A law used to ban Spanish language classes and prohibit Mexican-American studies program, courses that “promote the overthrow of the United States government” or “are designed primarily for pupils of a particular ethnic group.”(Planas, 2012). This was a clear example of how legal entity charged with guarantee the rights of all its citizens created a personal attack that would isolate and devalue thousands of American citizens and immigrants.

However, no matter how many Hispanic students adopted for the English-only approach to education many students still performed poorly in testing and had continuously high dropout rates. Many educators and community members feel that one of the reasons why Hispanics are the lowest performing minority group in America is that the education system enforces that they stop valuing their identity by not speaking Spanish at school and adopt an English-only behavior. The Spanish along with other immigrant languages are not welcomed in the classroom at many public schools and are seen as inhibitors for students to gain academic knowledge and prepare for state test. This then creates an educational infrastructure of inequality between native English speakers and Hispanics. .

In fact, many schools throughout the United States function in a traditional model that was established through the Kennedy and Johnson Administrations in the 1960s, where all subjects are taught in English for eight hours a day. This model is still used today throughout most of the U.S. The traditional school model encourages students to adopt English as their major language, and subsequently adopt American attitudes and beliefs. Proponents of this traditional method of education believe that children learn in the “sink or swim” model of education where they will either pick-up English and succeed in school or they will not. It is further believed that they will be able to succeed more in the American educational system if they discard their 'immigrant language' at school and adopt an English-only behavior.

This value for traditional English-only education to all immigrants was heavily encouraged in recent years. It started with the 1980s movement for the U.S. to adopt an amendment in the Constitution were English would be stated as the National Language, and as a result all spheres in the public sector would operate in English. This was pushed in order to preserve American identity, and have both immigrant adults and children become more Americanized by adopting English as their public language and leave their native language for the private use. This belief is very apparent with the discussion in the Bush Administration during 2000s were bi-lingual or multi-lingual education was considered by some public school districts. The Assistant Secretary of Education under President George W. Bush, Diane Ravitch remarked to how using any other language than English in the classroom would inhibit immigrants from becoming successful American citizens due to the fact that they did not learn English . This is her response to the idea behind incorporating a more national model to bi-lingual education instead of the traditional English only education, Mrs. Ravitch responded by stating.

“…I think they have to be respected as individuals, the culture that they have come from has to be respected. This is where their parents were from. But there’s the reality. They are now in the United States, they either are or intend to be American citizens working in the American economy, living in American society. They need English. Now as terrific as their native language is. It may be a language that represents a wonderful brilliant literature, but they need English if they are going to survive” (Ravitch, 2003)

In this view, it can be seen that Ravitch pushes for students to leave their native languages for the private use and adopt English, and it is the role of her position to ensure that schools maintain an English only approach in order to help other immigrants gain academic success and be enculturated into American society.

In fact, many American policy makers at different political levels feel the same way as the former Assistant Secretary of Education. The belief that English taught in schools will ultimately help children assimilate and adapt to American society in order that they become successful in the workplace. Enculturation of children is seen as a fundamental tool where immigrants can began to adapt and become Americans. The school system is seen in as a primary means to help immigrant children learn English and become culturally American. It is also a mechanism where children will be given the chance to succeed in academics and achieve a higher social and economic status than their parents, which ultimately helps them follow the American Dream of economic independence and success.

This educational system was also seen as tool by society to help incorporate immigrant children into American society by providing them a sphere where these children would be *Americanized* through education and the school’s influence. This was particularly true for second generation immigrants. Through this process of educational integration children were encouraged to speak only English in class for most of the 19th and 20th centuries while adopting American ideals and beliefs. The overwhelming majority of the second generation and [minorities] became completely fluent in English and integrated in many ways in American society (Portes and Rumbaut 2001;)

However, while the second generation of immigrants became more successful in their command of the English language while they were educated in American schools, many of them still fell behind their White counterparts. A minority of the second generation does not make a successful transition to adulthood, dropping out of high school and/or failing to find employment, and some members of the second generation become involved in criminal activity including gangs and drugs (Rumbaut 2005). This was also, we must point out, the experience of an earlier second generation of European origins, during the first half of the 20th century (Foner 2000).

With the creation and political discussion throughout the United States regarding the value of having second languages used in the classroom especially with Utah's neighboring states, the Utah State Office of Education, USOE was faced with a dilemma on how to proceed to help educated its now multicultural population, and it was decided than in 2010, the State of Utah would adopt and fund policies and programs that would offer a varied form of multicultural education. It then created 98 intensive bi-lingual educational programs for 98 schools throughout the State that reached varied socio-economic school districts in hopes, that by Utah students both White and minorities would economically and culturally gain from learning Spanish, Portuguese, French and Chinese.

This act of State Government to effectively encourage thousands of Utah children to learn and adopt a second language as fluently as English sends a message to its citizens that diversity is not only tolerated within the State, but it is actively sought to help strengthen the economic prospects of its future, both economically and socially. Diversity management is strongly desired in the school system to value and recognize the contributions that immigrants make within the state.

The State of Utah is not only recognizing the multicultural differences within the classroom, but it is also redistributing the educational focus. These dual immersion programs are changing what was perceived to be the universally accepted ideal of America previously told White American culture, to one where many other ethnic voices of American identity will be equally recognized within the school system.

The USOE has taken a rather diverse approach towards the education of both native and immigrant children. It has embraced policies and practices that incorporate more than just the dominate white culture. USOE has actively sought transnational ties to Spain and Mexico for the singular goal of teaching the Spanish language, and its culture to Utah students.

# Methodology

## Hypothesis

The hypothesis for this research steams from previous research of minority students and bilingual education in the United States for the last decade. This data shows that while there are many internal and external obstacles for immigrant children to succeed academically in primary education. These children face racism, discrimination, poverty, and poor English skills.

## Question

How does the allowance for bilingual education in the classroom help foster a more multicultural environment where immigrant children can succeed academically?

## The Approach

The research initially set out to interview families at local elementary schools within the state of Utah. However, since there was no database of what families went to what school. I had to contact the administrative staff to get help from them, in regards to finding immigrant families to interview for the research. With this initial administrative contacts, I was able to interview a principal, school counselor, dual immersion coordinator and various teachers about their experiences with the dual immersion and its students.

The principal and the school consular were able to help me with finding families. In the wealthier neighborhood I was able to find only one family who would be willing to communicate. While in the more immigrant neighborhood I found several families who would wanted to share their story. However, in both of these circumstances I was treated with suspicion, because I was a White female, who could speak some Spanish with a Mexican dialect. I was initially suspected of being connect with the United States immigration authorities, ICE and INS, and the women were reluctant to speak with me upon the initial interaction. That was the main reason that I could only procure one family in one of the neighborhoods.

Though, within the second neighborhood, that had more immigrants I was able to speak with more family households due to the fact that I had obtained the trust of the school community coordinator, Elizabeth. In order to create this trust I went to several school community meetings and reached out to several teachers and counselors explaining my interest in speaking with these families. Once, I had in a sense proven that I was asking to only interview the women I was granted an opportunity to interview them, but they did not want to come individually, but rather as a group of Mothers or *Madres*  so that they could support each other during the conversation.

However, during one of my many meetings at the school I was able to speak with and listen to a teacher discussion with a group of Tongan immigrants and their issues with the school, community, and dual immersion program. I thought it would be useful to include their experiences within the same Spanish dual immersion program since the Tongans were part of the same immigrant group within Utah and faced many of the same obstacles that the Hispanics had endured in the school system.

I will know describe how each immigrant group Hispanics and Polynesians are placed within the Utah educational system and society.

### Hispanics

The term Hispanic or Latino is a term that is contrived by the United States to be a racial and ethnic marker of group of people who share a commonality of the Spanish language. Spanish is “the connector across geography and across, quite frankly, the cultural diversity that is in the Hispanic community itself. So the language thing is there and it is a connector or binder. But within that, there are these - the cultures of - the people of Cuba are culturally different from the people of Puerto Rico and the people of Puerto Rico are culturally different in some respects from the people of Panama.” (Dodson, 2013) Hispanic encompasses a group of people from Central and Latin America all through the Caribbean Islands. However, most people in this term many self-identify as Hispanic on Census, but rather see themselves as people from Mexico, Puerto Rico, Argentina and other Spanish speaking cultures.

A majority of Hispanics within Utah originate from Mexico due to the close proximity of the Mexican border to Utah. Many of these Mexicans have immigrated into Utah illegally, and as result maintain an exclusionary position within Utah. They cannot participate in any welfare resources, are afraid of being separated from their American born children, there is a constant fear being deported back to Mexico. They also have limited English skills due to limited interaction with the dominate English speaking majority.

Due to the close geography between the United States and Mexico there is the ability to stay in touch with the home country both technologically and logistically as many of the Mexican programs are broadcasted in Utah, and there are two large Spanish speaking news stations. There are also the ability for Mexican immigrants and Mexican-Americans to live in parallel societies along the dominate White American culture. This is due to a large percentage of businesses and public services being offered in both Spanish and English. As a result, there is a large community of Mexican Spanish speakers in Utah who operate within their own community.

### Tongans

Polynesians are the second largest immigrant group within the state of Utah, and Tongans make up a significant portion of this group. One of every four Tongans living in the United States resides in Utah (U.S. Census, 2010) and furthermore, Utah's Tongan population is an eighth as large as the population of the Kingdom of Tonga, meaning it's as if one of every nine Tongans left home to live here. (Salt Lake Tribune, 2014). Many of the Tongans that came to live in Utah have originally come due to religious conversion to the LDS faith. Later, more of the Tongans arrived in Utah due to family reunification processes and educational scholarships.

This groups does not face as much exclusionary factors within the Utah society like the Mexican immigrants due to the reason that most are either U.S. Nationals or have obtained residency cards. They also enjoy more privileges within the state due to their legal status and English language fluency.

However, this immigrant group while being positioned in a more inclusionary sphere within Utah due to the similarity in religious faith to the dominate group still has many obstacles. They face issues within misrecognition due to their physical appearance. They are perceived to be built to be large and tall and either to fall into the groups of American football players or to be members of gangs. This ideal is perpetuated by the media groups that promote Tongan football players and continuously report of Tongan Crip Gang Violence.

This research design will use a dual methodological approach to understanding the issue of bi-lingual education among Hispanic children in Spanish dual-immersion programs... The two methods will consist of a quantitative and qualitative approach. In regards to the quantitative measure, the study will use information from the U.S. Census 2010 to understand how many children are enrolled in specific schools, and their ages. The second use of data will come from the schools directly and this information will deliver the test scores over a ten year period for both White and Hispanic students. This will be valuable in understanding how many students live within a specific community, what schools they attend, and how they have been performing academically within the last decade.

The qualitative approach will come from four semi-constructed interviews with the parents of Hispanic children enrolled at the elementary schools. The questions will be guided by the academic plan of bi-lingual education within the school, and by the theory of recognition.

## Research Design

### Interviewee Groups

The research will focus on examining Tongan and Hispanic children studying in elementary school who are currently in the dual-immersion Spanish programs. The reason behind targeting the Spanish bilingual stream is that Spanish is the largest immigrant language used in the United States, and as such has the largest amount of schools in Utah using the Spanish dual immersion program.

The reason that I have chosen these two immigrant groups is that first, they are part of the largest immigrant groups within the state, and share many of the same issues regarding immigration, racism, poverty, ascribed cultural identity, low educational opportunities, and they share the many of the same neighborhoods within the Salt Lake Valley. The other reason that I chose to work with these two groups is that they were the easiest groups to interview due to their active participation within the school system. They both are enrolled within the same elementary schools and have the same academic programs for their children.

It is also of interest to examine how each of these groups feel they are being recognized and valued within the classroom. In that one group, the Hispanics have their language openly used within the everyday education, while the other group, the Tongans are learning English, the dominate language, and Spanish an immigrant language different to their own. I therefore, want to examine if by the schools both using English and Spanish in the classroom, than does it allow for more educational opportunities to validate the diverse cultures within the United States and ultimately aide in achieving academic performance of both of these immigrant groups.

### Past and Present

In the second part of the research I want to examine how each of these interviewees both the agents and the experts feel about how the schools were toward immigrant groups prior to the introduction of dual immersion and in the current state. This is possible since a majority of the interviewees will have an experience with both circumstances due to the newness of the dual immersion programs at the schools.

The reason to interview both the experts and the agents about the past and current experiences is to gain information about the cultural and educational changes they have experienced with the dual immersion program. I want to glean information regarding how the introduction of schools operating in a dual cultural environment might aide in the academic performance of various immigrant groups.

I also want to examine from the expert’s view on how they have adapted to these new diverse management programs and policies, and to see if they perceive the school to be more multicultural inclusive due to their dual immersion program.

### Location

In my choice of schools to examine, I will examine two elementary schools from varying socio-economic areas. The reason is to see why different schools administered policies of Spanish dual-immersion programs, and if the immigrant children are academically succeeding equally to their native peers by being validated by the group. I believe it is important to examine not only urban schools who used bi-lingual education to help their diverse students, but also schools in wealthier areas who chose the same linguistic policies, but have smaller amounts of minorities In each of these schools I will examine the academic success of the immigrant students using qualitative interviews.

The first school will be McPolin Elementary. It is from the wealthiest neighborhood in the group. McPolin Elementary is from a predominately White neighborhood at 71.9% and Hispanic population is 24.6%, the average income is $59,350, and the median house costs $717,770. (City Data, 2013). This school in the community of Park City, Utah. It has chosen that this elementary along with the four others will be a mandated dual-immersion program that will be open to all residents, instead of being a lottery. It was also decided by the community that Spanish will be priority language for the community.

The other school is Mountain View Elementary. It has a low range for incomes and housing prices at the average income being $47,679 and the average house costing $169,200. Both of these are below the Utah state average. This school is located within the urban area of the capital city of Salt Lake City. It has a large immigrant population from Latin America and Polynesia. The school has adapted to this mix of ethnicity and socio-economic factors by providing a community center for the neighborhood. The ethnic make-up for the city is 49.8% White and 35.4% Hispanic, with other races filling in the components. (City Data, 2013).

In each of these cases it is valuable to examine how each of these different socio-economic areas perceive the benefits of learning Spanish along with English, and how each of immigrant groups feel about their academic success and value as a participant in the crucial learning of this target language.

## Qualitative

In the qualitative research I will be creating interval constructed interviews to investigate how each parent of a student feels towards elementary schools using second languages of Spanish. I want to examine if by using this second language as a tool of academic instruction, the parents feel that the student and themselves are valued as equal members of American society and as a result the student performs well in the classroom.

It is important to understand the relationship of the interviewer and interviewee. In the position of interviewing, I am a White, American female who will be accompanied by a Mexican-American female in the interview process in order to help the interviewee feel more comfortable about being asked personal questions about his or her students, and also to ensure that the message will be understood in both English and Spanish. Another reason to use a translator, is that many families may be of illegal status and feel uncomfortable or untrustworthy to speak to a White American about their personal issues. Therefore, I have hired a translator for the 30 minute interview sessions so that the conversation can be conducted in familiar manner, and there will be no loss of information due the language barrier between English and Spanish.

In the interview of the experts I have conducted a semi-constructed interview that will last about 20 minutes in order gain information about the dual immersion program. I have decided to interview different levels of authority within the school system to better understand how the management process is being handled and perceived within the institution. I am also interested in examining how they view multiculturalism in their schools and to see what their values are concerning these new linguistic and cultural changes within the school.

With the Polynesian group I will being going to a Question and Answer Seminar held by one of the schools. There will be a discussion between the teachers and Tongan panel discussing the school programs and what is needed by the Tongan families for their children to speak. After the discussion is concluded I will conduct a 10 minute interview with the head of the panel about the personal issues and situation about Tongans participating in the Spanish dual immersion program.

## Methodological Limitations

The research will focus solely on the qualitative approach of how immigrants and educational professionals perceive the multicultural value within the school. It will examine through interviews of these individuals to understand if by introducing Spanish dual immersion programs they and their children, who are minorities within the school are being more widely accepted because the school is now bilingual.

The limitations of this approach is that there will be no quantitative facts regarding academic success regarding the qualitative interviews. The reason is that the program is new for the State of Utah and its schools. The two schools have only participated in this program for six years or less, and any of the children who have participated in the program have not even finished elementary school. Therefore, there is not enough data available regarding how children are performing academically, and if they there grades are at a higher level than those of their counterparts in the English-only program.

As a result, the work is focused primarily on the personal interviews from the agents and the experts in the program to understand if they perceive that they are doing better academically, because of the multicultural educational approach of the state.

## Main Concepts

The main concepts will cover a position that will be looked at throughout the longitudinal study. It is important that these terms are clarified since sometimes official documents use different terms for the same individual or group of individuals. I clarifying how I see each of these terms and how I will use them in this research so that there will be no confusion about the meaning of the data.

**Immigrant** - Persons who are themselves foreign-born or reside with at least one foreign-born parent. Foreign-born is defined as either a U.S. citizen by naturalization or not a citizen of the U.S. Native-born is defined as born in the U.S., Puerto Rico, Guam, the U.S. Virgin Islands, or the Northern Marianas or born abroad of American parents (U.S. Census, Kids Count, 2012)

**Minority -** In the U.S. educational system the breakdown of different ethnic groups whether they are first generation immigrants or American born children of immigrants is broken down to minorities. These minorities in the Utah educational system are as followed: White, Hispanic, Asian, Native American, Polynesian, and Black. The break down does not give enough information to determine if the members are immigrants, but rather what ethnic group their parents have decided their child shall fall into within the school system.

**Ethnicity/Race -** In this research I am aimed at using the term ethnicity to define the different ethnic groups within the U.S. racial and geographical categories of Asian, Hispanic, Polynesian and Black. I have decided to use this due to the matter that it is proven that humans do not have enough genetic differences to categorize each other into different racial categories. However, it should be noted that many forms and publications in the United States do use the term *Race* to define these different groups within American society. Therefore, the term *Race* will only be used if directly quoting a text.

**White -** The term "White American" can encompass many different ethnic groups, but is usually meant by those who come from European ancestry. Although the United States Census purports to reflect a social definition of race, the social dimensions of race are more complex than Census criteria. The 2000 U.S. census states that racial categories "generally reflect a social definition of race recognized in this country. They do not conform to any biological, anthropological or genetic criteria."(Questions and Answers U.S. Census, 2000). For this paper White is represent the dominate majority since this group comprises 86.1% of the state of Utah’s population (U.S. Census, 2010)

**Hispanic/Latina/so -** Ethno linguistic group of Americans with origins in the countries of Latin America and Spain. (U.S. Census, 2011; 8) More generally it includes all persons in the United States who self-identify as Hispanic or Latino. While the two terms are sometimes used interchangeably, Hispanic is a narrower term and refers mostly to persons of Spanish-speaking ancestry, while Latino is more frequently used to refer more generally to anyone of Latin American origin or ancestry, including Brazilians. In this paper I will use exclusively the term Hispanic when referring to the students who are of Spanish speaking background, but other written documents may use the term Latina/o as a term to refer to the same group of people.

## Reliability & Validity

These biographical interviews will be validated in a different manner from our quantitative research due to the fact that they are not constructed in the same manner, and it is very difficult to reconstruct the specific interviews in the same time and place. Therefore, we will be using a different criteria for assessing this study using the term proposed by Guba and Lincoln (1994) of *trustworthiness and authenticity.*

*The reason that I have chosen Guba and Lincoln's approach of 'Trustworthiness and Authenticity' is that their method has been used in many different diversity management studies in Europe and Great Britain. There method has allowed for the development of this style for qualitative data, and has also accounted for various types of interviews.* . In the term of trustworthiness we will be looking at for criteria which are as followed; credibility, transferability, dependability and conformability.

**Credibility** – I have carried out the research in good practice by making sure that all our findings have been recorded along with our notes pertaining to each interview. I have also offered to give each of the interviewees an account of our findings and a copy of the interview in order to create member validation in hopes that each respondent feels validated by the work they have helped contribute to its creation.

**Dependability** – All phases of our research process has been kept in files, starting with the initial problem formulation, notes regarding the brainstorming of our questions, and the questions themselves. Furthermore, I have kept complete records of our transcripts and audio recordings and field notes of all four of our interviews. These have all been retained so that this information can be accessible to all readers.

**Conformability** - This is shown by the transcriptions of the interviews that we had not overtly allowed personal values to influence the respondent’s answers. Instead we tried to remain a professional distance from the interviewee during the processes, and also asked neutral question regarding their educational experiences in the United Sates

# Theoretical Framework

In this work the theory that will be used to explain how Spanish bilingual education has shaped the result of closing the achievement gap for Hispanic and Tongan minorities and specifically its immigrants. The work will focus on three theories that complement each other and will be able to provide a broad understanding of the interviews. The three theories are Axel Honneth’s Theory of Recognition, Pierre Bourdieu’s work on *Forms of Capital,* and finally the theory of Diversity Management.

## Theory of Recognition

There have been studies drawn on the ideas behind the struggle for human recognition throughout the centuries. In fact, the German philosopher Hegel was one philosopher who coined a German term for the 'Struggle for Recognition’ as the *Kampf un Annerkung* (Fraser & Honneth, 28; 2009). While, theories were developed by Hegel and many others for the human need to be equally recognized, the theory really started to progress in the field of sociology and social work in the 1990s under the work of two prominent theorist Charles Taylor and Axel Honneth.

In the philosophical sense, recognition designates an ideal reciprocal relation between subject in which each sees the other as equal...one becomes an individual only in virtue of recognizing, and being recognized, by another subject. (Fraser, 2003 p. 10). In this sense, due recognition is not just a courtesy we owe people, but a vital human need. (Taylor, 26; 1992) . In this sense, it is important that the research examine if each student in the classroom is being fully recognized as a contributing equal by other students and the teachers.

 Axel Honneth sees that the need for an individual to be recognized is vital in attaining full, undistorted subjectivity. To deny someone recognition is to deprive her or him of a basic prerequisite for human flourishing (Honneth & Fraser, 2001 p. 28). In Taylor’s view, "nonrecognition or misrecognition ...can be a form of oppression, imprisoning someone in a false, distorted, reduced mode of being. (Fraser & Honneth, 28; 2009) Honneth agrees with this in similarity "we owe our integrity.. To the receipt of approval or recognition from other, understanding of the self an understanding acquired by intersubjective means. (Fraser & Honneth, 32; 2009)

The foundation of Honneth's work on the theory of recognition is stated in his work The Struggle for Recognition. In this work, Honneth states and there is a foundational and constable shift in modern politics away from conversations centering on nation, class, economy to that of identity, difference, culture and ethnicity. (Thompson, 2006 p.3) and that the fundamental 'idea of recognition' is now situated at the 'heart of what justice means today'….Moreover, a just society would be where everyone gets due recognition. (Thompson, 3; 2006) is that there are three key factors that impact and shape an individual's ability to engage and interact with others. These three factors are self-confidence, self-respect and self-esteem. These three factors will be further examined within the next section

## Three Areas of Honneth’s Self-Realization

Axel Honneth relies on a social framework identified in other works by Hegel and Mead, which focus on three spheres of human recognition. In the first level of recognition, Honneth focuses on the Hegelian terminology he defines as 'love', which are social interactions that are based on strong connections between small groups of individuals. These small connections are based off of the mother-child dyad. This relationship is one of the primary relationships in which humans learn to base other significant relationships such as friendship, husband-wife connections and various others. The reason that Honneth defines this relationship as being of particular importance is that in this stage of life humans begin to understand a pattern of recognition in the early stages of individualization, where children, through a successful relation with the mother, find themselves to be creatures of needs that cannot be fulfilled on their own. (Toniolatti, 2009; 374). In this sense children begin to feel their mother's love and care, and come to realize that their needs will be taken care of by their mother. Nonetheless, all loving relationships are driven by the unconscious recollection of the original relationship... that characterized the first months of life for the 'mother' and the 'child', even if this occurs 'behind the back of the subject and throughout the subject's life' (Honneth, 105; 1999) Honneth then sees that through this dyad children come to build self-confidence: "In becoming sure of the 'mother's' love, young children come to trust themselves, which makes it possible for them to be alone without anxiety." (Ibid., 168)

The second level of Honneth's framework for recognition is that of the level of peers. In this area, recognition encompasses interactions that cannot be included with in the first level, but still remain in small groups. It is in this level that the individual begins to interact with the community. It is in this order that Honneth filters, so to speak, the Hegelian notion of "person" through the concept of the "generalized other" outlined by Mead: through successful recognition relations. (Toniolatti, 2009; 374)

It is in this area that the individual begins to understand their rights in the community along with their responsibilities. They also understand who belongs with who, and which persons are not members of this community. However, it is through the relationship of peers within the community that individuals then start to shape what Honneth sees as their 'self-respect' by starting to see themselves as equals among other member of the community and sharing in the rights and duties at this level.

Then finally, in the third level Honneth characterizes recognition on a different level of love from that of the first level to one, of where love allows individuals to learn to recognize each other as individuals with specific abilities and skills in society that result in the individual's positive contribution in achieving the goals of the group. This then encourages the individual to relying on the social division of labor. It is then through this relationship in the much larger scale, that individuals develop 'self-esteem', by being able to refer to their own abilities and skills that they contribute to the division of labor within society.

Through these three levels of recognition within society, individuals are helped in aiding in their development with self-confidence, self-respect, and self-esteem. It is with the successful creation of these three behaviors that individuals feel fulfilled within society and themselves. However, when there is social injustice that manifests itself at misrecognition or social exclusion than the individual cannot create a positive recognition to the self. The next section will examine how these behaviors can create oppression within social reality.

## Diversity Management

In Europe, Canada and the United States the term diversity management has been used to create and define more culturally, economically, socially, and physically diverse organizations. The term of Diverse Societies is normally used by organizations and nations in a self-defining manner, where they see themselves as being diverse which “relates to deconstruction of notions of normality and dominate cultures as well as perceived inclusion through recognition.” (Fraser, Honneth, 30; 2003). In this sense, to have a diverse society is be able to have an equal voice and role for all citizens without the dominate culture creating a universal norm that puts their identity as the standard.

Diversity management is not working to emphasize the political rights of a single ethnic or minority population, but rather it is emphasizing these groups’ potential to contribute in a positive manner through cultural plurality.

Cultural Pluralism is a strong method emphasized within the theory of diversity management. It goal is to display diversity as a resource, whether that be religious, physical, sexual orientation, ethnic, or economical. In this paradigm all of these perceived differences are presumed to be valuable to the organization. In the next part of cultural plurality in order for diversity management to be effective there must be training programs which increase the cultural competences about these minority groups. This is so that the business can be more competitive and reach out to diverse populations.

In the final two areas of diversity management the organizations offers criteria for personal recruitment and offers special services to the diverse client and customers. This is so that the company is able to be well rounded and representative of their community within their organizations, and because they have a staff that the representative of the community they can better serve their clients.

Diversity management’s aim is to provide value and recognition to different social groups that are excluded by the dominant norm. This type of style want the value these groups and allow them to participate equally with their community peers in the organization.

## Pierre Bourdieu Capitals

The primary focus of Bourdieu’s work with capitals is that he wants to acknowledge agency in a method that acknowledges the interplay of different fields of capital.

*In the article The Forms of Capital Bourdieu defines capital as:*

 *“…accumulated labor (in its materialized form or its ‘incorporated,’ embodied form) which, when appropriated on a private, i.e., exclusive, basis by agents or groups of agents, enables them to appropriate social energy in the form of reified or living labor” (The Forms of Capital, 241; 1986)*

Bourdieu emphasizes the three types of capital that people have and which are used in social interactions between different agents. They three types of capital are economic capital, cultural capital and social capital. Each of these capitals are something that agents acquire continuously over a lifetime which enables the agent with a certain amount of influence in a specific social setting. Moreover the different kinds of capital can be institutionalized and are convertible into other forms of capital depending on the social setting where it is at play. (ibid 243) Each type of capital will now be discussed as to how it will be used within this analysis.

**Economic Capital –** is similar in concept to the Economic study of finance. It is a financial resource that the agent has at his disposal. This comes in forms of money from business rights to liquid assets and access to loans. This type of capital is important to analyze in order to understand if someone has a high or low status of this form, and it can be acquired.

**Cultural Capital** is in an overall sense what enables the agent to understand the cultural codes in a given society. This capital is hard to alter significantly if it can at all be changed. Within this capital there are three subgroups of cultural capital, the embodied state, objectified state and the institutional. The embodied state is a cultivation of culture that is incorporated and accumulated in the agent over time and it depends on the surroundings of the agent such as national, educational and family surroundings. The use of educational capital is important for the paper because it will allow us to understand what type of culture regarding nationality, class, and educational level each interviewee has had since birth and if this embodied state has altered since throughout their educational years. (Burr 5, 2013)

**Social Capital**, Bourdieu means the resources that an agent obtains through membership of a network or a group. The resources Bourdieu explains as “the collectivity-owned capital, a ‘credential’ which entitles them to credit, in the various senses of the word.” (Bourdieu, 249; 1986 )

The different forms of capital are acquired by the agent from birth and on throughout life. Many of these types of capital such as cultural capital cannot be easily altered or changed. Instead, it is passed from generation on through the means of socialization. These capital are important, because they help the individual navigate social settings and can be valued and recognized by certain groups within these settings. In this paper it is important to understand how each of these capital influence how the agent is recognized within the school system.

# Institution

## Directive Think Globally, Act Locally

The Utah State Office of Education, USOE has taken to creating programs that are more centered to actively developing a diverse and multilingual society within the state of Utah. The USOE and Utah Legislatures acted on the idea that Americans are now entering a more multicultural and ethnically diverse century both locally and abroad. Due to this increase of perceived diversity the future generation will need to know more than one language to succeed within the United States. “This state has not made it a political issue. Lots of people want to strengthen language learning these days for many reasons. Maybe it’s for business competiveness, maybe it’s for a broader education. Maybe it’s for general enlightenment. Maybe it’s for all these reasons, but it is all good.” (Bourgerie; 2011). In this regard, Utah has decided to direct policies that would change educational programs to be more multilingual starting with the Spanish dual immersion program. The goal may have started out to be an economic achievement, in where Utah would be more competitive on the national and world stage, because in the next generation there would be a large majority that spoke more than one language, and was competent in dual cultures, but it has expanded upon that original economic goal.

Instead, it has developed state-wide school policies where cultural diversity in the classroom is to be valued, and the minorities’ linguistic distinctiveness is seen as something to be desired in the classroom in order to help the entire class gain academic knowledge of the language. The goal of the dual immersion program from one of Utah’s Dual Immersion Board Members is that “One of the goals of the dual immersion is to have that bi-cultural, bilingual and bi-literal, and the culture part is so important. Because as you learn a second language, you learn a second culture.” (Caudell, 2014), and in order for the goal of the policy to be implemented she sees that the children “have to be kind of aware and immersed as well.”(Caudell, 2014). Utah’s directive then mandates that McPolin and Mountain View Elementary create a successful Spanish dual immersion program and be part of the State of Utah’s comprehensive dual immersion program

In this area, the directive of the state and the two schools is to recognize different embodied capital that were once seen as not completely belonging in the classroom. These embodied capitals are those of persons who come from Latin America and Spain, because they have a set of skills that are desired in this new program. With the schools’ policy being bilingual and multicultural they want certain children and teachers who have this specific embodied capital to come and share their culture so to benefit the goal of creating success in the Spanish dual immersion programs.

These two schools then are no longer trying to implement educational assimilation programs where immigrants were encouraged to leave their native languages for the home use and use only English in the public setting. In Castels and Millers definition, assimilation is defined for immigrants as “They were to give up their distinctive linguistic, cultural or social characteristics, and become indistinguishable from the majority population” (Castels & Miller, 247; 2009). Which was the case for many decades in Utah, where schools would put English language learners in ESL (English as a Second Language) classes and not value or recognize their specific cultural capitals, seeing that it was not American. Instead, what Utah’s directive is now doing is changing the policy and perception of diversity from the top down, and mandating that certain schools embrace diversity and stop school programs that encourage assimilation. This new directive is forcing administrators to hire different cultural staff, teach in foreign languages, and become more active in Utah’s multicultural communities all in hope that these children will become competent in a second language. “I think that mainly our goal is that we want different children to be aware of different cultures and languages so that when they grow up they can change this whole thinking that second languages is not good.” (Caudell, 2014).

Before the cultural difference from the English speaking America was not seen as good because the dominate group was perceiving this English-only to be the universally accepted norm in the United States. Instead, this directive has changed the state’s perception of what is to be the universal norm to something new. The norm for Utah is not working only in English, but recognizing that Utah needs to be more diverse and accepting in order to participate in a more global environment both internationally and locally. This directive has then begun to recognize those minorities who were originally not recognized as being valuable in Utah. Consequently, the directive from the Utah Legislators and USOE have come to change school policies and programs to implement diversity management.

In order to better understand how this directive given by the state on linguistic diversity is beginning to change the school experience of Hispanics and Tongans in their educational performance it is needed that the policy of each school be examined. This is to understand how the school sees itself within the policy and how they are proclaiming it to their diverse communities.

## Policy

The elementary schools of McPolin and Mountain View have shifted their educational paradigm from an English -only model to one that is in alignment with the USOE’s directive of multiculturalism and bilingualism. They have both publically decreed that they are schools that value diversity both in idea and practice. They both self-describe themselves as multicultural. In the official message from the Principal of McPolin Elementary the Principal states that “McPolin is a community school that welcomes a diverse population of students.” (Proffit, Letter to Parents, 2014). This letter is also translated into Spanish so that the Hispanic community can read and understand the yearly message due to the fact that the school has a significant proportion of Spanish speaking students. In the public letter from Mountain View Elementary to its community the main message is “ Mountain View's mission is to provide a successful school experience for all students,” in which this message is translated on its official website into eleven languages including Spanish, Farsi, Korean, Chinese and other various languages represented within the community.

In both of these examples of official school policy and ideals, the schools have decreed that they are working in a multicultural environment. They have abdicated the ideal that the immigrants must understand and operate in English in order to participate in their child’s education. Instead, both schools have envisioned themselves as being multicultural and diverse and have opted to operating within the ideas of diversity management. This means that they have provided public awareness about their policies and programs that value diversity as a resource and operate in manners that serve their diverse students and parents.

By the schools sending out official letters in various languages to their immigrant communities, and not just in English the schools have initiated an idea that they value the different embodied capitals within these linguistically diverse populations, and that they want every parent to come and participate in the school. They do this by initially providing translation in the most widely spoken languages within their neighborhood, and proclaim their policies of diversity and academic success to these groups. In order to better understand how these initial policies have affected the academic achievement of both the Hispanic and Tongan students within the Spanish dual immersion schools it is imperative to first understand the dual linguistic program and its implications to its students.

## Program

### Park City, McPolin Elementary

The Spanish dual immersion programs in both McPolin and Mountain View Elementary operate in a fifty-fifty model. That is that half the day the students are taught only in English and the other half of the day they are taught only in the target language, which is Spanish. In English, the students are taught writing and history, while in Spanish they are instructed to learn math and science. Then at the end of the year, the English teacher must help the students re-learn what they know in math in science from Spanish to English so that they may pass the state testing called the Dibbles.

The way in which the program is operated in encourages multicultural cooperation from the English and Spanish speaking teachers. The English teachers need to be trained on linguistic knowledge of Spanish in order to help the children pass their state tests, and the Spanish teachers need to help aide the English teachers in their understanding of the Spanish language, and also be academically supportive throughout the school year to ensure that each child grasps the knowledge of each subject in both English and Spanish. This partnership between the teachers helps each authority figure in the classroom become more interculturally competent within the bilingualism of the school. The dual immersion method also encourages the idea within the school that these different embodied capitals of the teachers are equally valued and are in a symmetrical place of power. One teacher does not have more power or influence over another teacher. Rather, each teacher regardless of their cultural background must work as a team and form a partnership with each other. The program has forced the school to take the action that both Spanish speaking teachers and English speaking teachers are of equal importance in helping the dual immersion succeed.

In the example of the English teacher Ms. Gant at McPolin Elementary she shares her experience in working in this new multicultural environment. “All this work makes me feel like pushing and pushing for more time to give all the information to the kids. It feels that it is never enough, and sometimes it feels like... re-teaching the information. It is different from when I had the ALPS Program (Accelerate Learning Program for gifted children) But this is a good program too, and things always change. I think it is important that children, Americans become more global.” (Gant, 2014). In this example, the teacher is expressing that this change from the old structure of English only education to the new bilingual structure has caused her to have more work. She now feels as though she is doubling her work load in a shorter amount of time in order to help the children pass their state tests. However, she acknowledges that though it might be more work for her to adapt to this new style of teaching she also sees a benefit for the next American generation to adapting to a more global and multicultural perspective. Gant is validating the need for Americans to diversify their cultural capital from an early age, specifically on the institutional capital, where they can academically learn multiculturalism. Gant is stating these state directed cultural changes are needed within the school and good for her country and her students.

In this same program, Proffit the principal also validates the value for learning in this bilingual environment. He understands it as a cultural and academic value not just for the White Americans, but also for the Hispanics. “There is this embrace for diversity and multiculturalism. The Whites learn a second skill, and the Latinos learn the academics [of Spanish], but [Latinos] ultimately are valued in the community and in the school.” (Proffit, 2014). In this area, the principal sees the cultural value of having Hispanics within each of these classrooms along with the White students. Proffit understands that the Whites are learning this language to help them increase their potential economic capital by hopefully having the students be able to operate in a more global business setting. On the other hand, Proffit also realizes that Hispanics are now feeling able to participate more freely in the classroom, and be welcomed for their embodied capital that they bring to the program. The embodied capital of the Hispanic is a socialization through the cultures and traditions of their respective Spanish speaking cultures that is needed in the classroom. This specific embodied capital is valued within McPolin’s classes, because it can be shared with other non –native Spanish speaking children, and then the children can become more immersed in the Spanish language and the cultures associated with the language.

The principal understands that they have the cultural capital that enables them to speak and understand Spanish, but he also wants these Hispanic students to increase their economic capital by learning the academics of the language so that they will be on par with the White students once they fluently learn the language. He notices that in his school the Hispanic students are ultimately valued in the community and the school because of the cultural and linguistic contributions they make towards the Spanish dual immersion program, and that they are now seen as being valued equally within the system, because they have a set of skills that are desired by the dominate culture. They dominate culture wants their children to learn Spanish so they have better chances in life for success, and a way that they can do that is to put their children in a dual immersion program with several native Spanish speakers as their peers. By the White families placing their children in these diverse classrooms, they then increase their child’s chance for acquiescing the Spanish language and cultures attributed to it.

In one of the interviewees’ personal example of what it was like to go to McPolin Elementary before the implementation of the dual immersion program, Zoila describes how speaking in Spanish was unwanted in the classroom. It was frowned upon by the staff and her peers. “When I was in school it was different. We didn’t have any programs like that [dual immersion]. And we would get in trouble if we spoke Spanish, cause most kids would think that we would be talking about them and so forth” (Zoila, 2014). In this case, her linguistic uniqueness was unwelcomed in the public sphere. She was not allowed to participate freely in the classroom, and had to remember to leave her Spanish language for the home or she would be punished in school for speaking in a language that was not used by the dominate culture.

Zoila’s was misrecognized within the classroom by her teachers and peers. They interpreted her actions as something that was malevolent and upsetting to the group. They did not offer to try to understand her as a person, her language or where she was from. Instead, they punished her frequently for not assimilating to the dominate culture. In Honneth’s view to have “misrecognition or nonrecognition by another ... can be a form of oppression, imprisoning someone in a false, distorted, reduced mode of being.” (Fraser & Honneth, 28; 2009).In this view, Zoila was psychologically hurt from this behavior from the school. She was presumed to be acting in a negative manner every time she spoke in her native language. Her embodied capital was unwanted by the school, and seen as undesirable. They then devalued her within the classroom.

The institution’s program has allowed for Spanish to be openly accepted within the classroom. This is a significant shift from the position of a decade ago where English assimilation was the model and Hispanic immigrants were heavily discouraged from speaking their native language by form of teacher’s punishment and misrecognition of Hispanic culture. In the next section it will examine how Mountain View Elementary has implemented the program with is more ethnically diverse student population

### Glendale, Mountain View Elementary

In another scenario of a different immigrant group participating with the previous English-only program at Mountain View Elementary it can be seen from one of the agents that there was a personal understanding that the school did not value the Tongan cultural capital within the educational program. “So I just had to check myself, and realize that I bought into something [education], that was not really catering to me. It was damaging to myself to know this, that we were seen as less” (Son Ulvame, 2014). In his experience at Mountain View Elementary Son Ulvame realized that one of the major reasons that his Tongan friends were doing poorly in school was that they were ascribed a status from the first day as being one of a ‘bad kid’ because they were Tongan. In the Son Ulvame’s view the dominate White culture perceived the Tongan cultural capital as “You are big, you’re dangerous. Therefore, you are destined to do sports or destined to go to the streets.” There is nothing else for us.” (Son Ulvame, 2014). The authority figures in the institution gave them this ‘bad kid’ label year after year in each class, because of their physical appearance of being big and tall, and the dominate culture’s misrecognition that all Tongans, especially boys turn out to be bad. Due to this label being pushed by the teachers they were sustaining their idea of them being unsuccessful due in part to the teachers own labels of Tongans. By these Tongan kids not succeeding there was no extra effort made by the teachers to recognize them any differently “A lot of them thought, “Well I am the bad kid in class, and I have known that since I was in kindergarten.” (Son Ulvame, 2014). This ascribing of identities and future academic potential by the teachers who were from the dominate culture helped ensure that many of these Tongan children would not succeed by reason of isolation within the classroom from being seen as less than equal, and participating in the cultural pattern that would that kept them subordinated due to the idea the teachers had behind their cultural capital.

This previous English-only program in various schools throughout Utah was encouraging both Hispanic and Tongan immigrants to assimilate within the classroom. The institution did not encourage these immigrants to share their unique cultural identity and participate as peers. Instead, it excessively ascribed their status within the classroom as persons who were less than equal, and as persons who were potentially harmful to the class with their ‘bad kid’ ways and speaking potentially hurtful things about others in a foreign language.

However, since the introduction of the dual immersion program the value of cultural capitals have altered within the classroom. The dual immersion program has forced the authority figures to take a difference approach when understanding their students’ diversity. Many of teachers, the students and the families have come to value different cultural capitals that were previously seen as intrusive to the education of Utah students. These groups have come to recognize that they need Hispanic students who are Spanish speaking to play an active role in sharing their language and culture within the classroom so that every student may learn Spanish. The program has now outreached and changed the dominate culture ideal from being one of a Christian, White, English – speaking American that was perceived to be the universal norm, and any distinctiveness from that identity was seen as something that was bad or leave at home, to where different groups could be simultaneously and equally valued in the classroom. This change in the model has been aided by the need of authority figures becoming more multicultural competent and aware so that they can help a diverse group succeed in the education of Spanish and English.

### Understandings of the Two Programs

The program has also offered more ways in which the schools can come to understand previously undervalued and nonrecognized groups within the school. It had started originally with each classroom learning about different Spanish-speaking cultures and regions such as in the case of Zoila’s sister where the school children learned about their Catalonian teacher’s country “what culture they do in Spain, and kind-of, but not religious , but culture-wise, their parties, their beliefs that they have in Spain.” (Zoila, 2014). To a more branching out of cultural understanding among the different groups in the school who were not native Spanish speakers. In this case, at Mountain View where the teachers and counselors were invited to monthly meetings to learn from immigrant community members about Somali, Vietnamese, Tongan and other cultures that are represented within the school. In these meetings it is not so much about the children becoming more global, but rather the focus is on the staff and teachers. The instructors are being required to learn and adapt to these different immigrant groups’ educational needs so that they can fit into the USOE’s value of Utah children becoming more multilingual and cultural. The teachers are also now learning about these different cultures so that they can become better teachers to their students and help bring multicultural awareness to the classroom.

In one such meeting at Mountain View the school counselor invited members of the community to come and give a presentation on their country of origin about the language, the societal needs of the immigrant group and the educational requirements of the students to help them do well in the Spanish dual immersion program. The meetings last one hour long, and teachers, counselors, aides and other education members are heavily encouraged to attend by the principal. In one meeting on Tongan culture that was held the questions the teachers asked were “What would you recommend for us, teachers, recommend for new teachers who wanted to teach here? What would you mandate for them to know?” (Teacher 3, Tongan Interview, 2014) In this sense, it can be seen that there is a willingness for the teachers to rethink how they should teach students, and Tongans, and that this information should not come just from their training from other educational professionals, but also from immigrant community members. There was a group demand from both the community and the staff to better learn an intercultural manner of teaching these Tongan youth in the school.

In the same conversation another teacher wanted to communicate to his peers that. “It is important for us to remember as teachers that our children might face racism from time to time, and it makes it more difficult for them to succeed in school. And the remedy for that is for our teachers to care. And try to establish a relationship that cares.” (Teacher 1, Tongan Interview, 2014). In this comment, there is an open acknowledgement that racism is a factor for children not to succeed, and an awareness that these children have personal battles due to cultural differences that can inhibit them from academic success. This statement from Teacher 1 within the dual immersion program shows that there is now a push for these teachers to come to know and value the different groups within the classroom instead of keeping the old misrecognition for Tongan and other immigrant cultures. The teachers are encouraged by the immigrants and other teachers to treat these perceived differences with care through establishing relationships and acknowledging that they suffer from racism. The management is now initiating spaces within the institution where groups like the Tongans and Mexicans can come and alter misrecognitions that they have received previously in the school and community, by offering to share their personal stories and teach these authority members more about their culture. As a result to this effort from the management the teachers are starting to change their previously held values towards these groups and come to see them as equals within the classroom, and value their unique cultural capital.

In this manner the dual immersion program is offering opportunities where there can be cultural exchanges between the teachers and students and between the different immigrant groups within the schools. Due to the program pushing for students to not only learn the Spanish language but the different cultures attributed to the language it has opened the door for the authority members to readjust how they perceive and understand the many diverse participants of the school, not just the native Spanish speakers. By having the teachers being required to learn about the different cultures that contribute to the school then it has allowed them to come to value the different cultural capitals. The teachers are now encouraged by the program and its management to not ascribe a certain low status to the students for being an immigrant. The institutional management are not perceiving them to be unwanted in the classroom. Instead, they are trying to change the previous norms held about Hispanics and Tongans that impeded imparity to one where there is an organic creation among the staff to is a create more equality within the two schools between the dominate culture and the Hispanic, Tongans and other minorities. Both of these immigrant groups have been given a voice, and asked to actively share and participate their uniqueness to the schools so that they may succeed and help other students succeed in this multicultural model.

In next section it will examine the program in more depth by examining how the teachers are using the program in the classroom and what kind of teachers are being brought in to help implement the Spanish dual immersion within these school

## Teachers

The teachers are the major implementing factor to the Spanish dual immersion program. They oversee the management for this program in each of the classrooms every day, and they are the main contact point for the community members. They represent an authority within the institution for both the parents and the students. This authority figure has a specific role to play within the classroom and that is to teach children not only the academics from the school, but also to help them grow as individuals. In this macro level of understanding, Honneth sees that people begin to develop self-esteem in this level due to the “subjects learning to recognize each other as individuals with specific qualities and abilities that result in a positive contribution in achieving society’s goals.” (Toniolatti, 374, 2009). In this, the society’s goal was set out by the overreaching Department of Education, the USOE, where the goal is stated that Utah students need to become more multicultural and multilingual for the benefit of Utah’s future.

Now with this goal in mind derived from the value of the USOE and the school’s administration of the Spanish dual immersion program, the teachers are needed to become more multicultural themselves as was seen in the previous discussion of Ms. Gant’s experience. This starts with each school’s hiring of the teaching staff. Both schools cannot fulfill the requirements of the Spanish dual immersion program if they do not have a diverse staff that can teach the language. Many of the teachers are selectively hired to come from outside the U.S. due to the fact that they are valued by the educational institution for their cultural capital, specifically their embodied capital that they can offer the organization and its students. “They do have that partnership with Spain and Mexico and they do want to give those teachers the opportunity to teach here” (Caudell, 2014). It is also noted by Caudell, who is a Board Member for the state’s Dual Immersion Program, that “If our goal is to prepare these kids to speak fluent Spanish than they need to be aware that there are many accents, and not to speak only Spanish from Mexico or Spain, and to hear things from all over Central and South America.” (Caudell, 2014). In this sense, Caudell is recognizing that there is a significant change in who is teaching at these schools. It has altered from a previously local Utah teaching staff to a more global and multilingual staff that is in charge of helping to create a diverse education environment. However, she does admit that the hiring changes are not yet enough to satisfy the needs of the Spanish dual immersion program, because the children still need to be exposed to more varieties of the Spanish language and culture to make them better prepared to speak fluent Spanish.

Nevertheless, there has been significant alterations in who is the authority figure in the classroom and a change in the cultural capital value within the classroom. These Spanish speaking teachers are now being asked to come to Utah to share their culture and language abilities with the students. They are teaching students to add to their language abilities by enhancing what they already know in the case of Hispanics or adding a completely new and unique language in the case of the Whites and Tongans. These teachers are now shifting how different immigrant groups are being recognized within the classroom due to the fact that the teachers are immigrants as well. The teachers might share similar embodied capitals with their students like in the case of Mountain View, where Ms. Caudell is a Colombian immigrant from Latin America, and had to adapt to American society in her teenage years. In this situation she can relate to many students who come from this area of the world and empathize with their immigration challenges in the U.S. Both of the schools have several teachers who are from Mexico and a few who parts of South America in which these teachers share not just the linguistic similarities with other Hispanic students, but the other qualities that go with the embodied capital, such as socialization process, cultural understandings, and cultural traditions. These similarities then help make connections and help the classroom to equally recognize differences in this regard, because the authority figure has the same or similar cultural capital as the students and families.

 “There is more equal opportunity [to participate] because of the school teaching in two cultures.” (Maria, 2014). In this sense by having the school continuously investing funding, training and personnel to creating a school that is multicultural it has created a new sense of solidarity within the community, where there are more opportunities for various groups to participate and gain esteem. In Honneth’s view a good society is “a society in which individuals have real opportunities for full self-realization would be a society where the common values match the concerns of individuals in such a way that no member in society would be denied the opportunity to earn esteem for his or her contribution to the common good.” (Anderson [Honneth], 17; 1995). In this the concerns of both of the community were that the minorities were being left out and failing in school. These needs were brought to the school administrators through various PTA meetings and school board hearings, and changes were made in the education process alongside the implantation of the Spanish dual immersion to help immigrants participate fully within school.

In this version of solidarity there can be examined that many various immigrant groups have opportunities within the schools to contribute to the common good and develop their esteem. The envisioned *good* of Mountain View Elementary is that of academic success in a multicultural environment. The success is defined by the teachers having all the students to pass their state tests, and maintain proficiency in both English and Spanish. The common values and interests at the schools is the multiculturalism set by the state board of education. The USOE is pushing for teachers to share the different languages, in this case Spanish and the cultures that go with it so that the students can be competent in dual linguistic and cultural setting. Due to the teachers instructing in this manner it opens the door for more equal participation from students in class

The educational organization of these two schools has shifted its values from an English-only system that operated from only just a decade before, to a more multicultural system that is now openly developing a diverse system. It is not only that the teachers are instructing in two languages in incorporating the Spanish speaking cultures into the classroom, but also they are teaching students about other minority and immigrant groups who were not previously discussed, when discussing American History and its people. In the expert’s view, Gant also believes that students are “understanding that minorities were not encouraged to speak their native language like in our book *Code Talkers* [U.S. Military used Navajos in WWII in battle against the Japanese who would not understand Navajo commands] there were Navajo Americans who helped with the war against the Japanese, because of their language. It was a shame that they were not encouraged to speak their own language in public or in school... uhh. It is sad.” (Gant, 2014). In this area, she has chosen for her students on the English side to read this year an American book whose main protagonists are not Whites, but rather Native Americans proudly serving their country. The book is teaching the students, that different languages are valued in U.S. Military and in the classroom. This book is allowing for more open conversation about ethnic and cultural differences to take place and for the students to value these different cultures. It is having the teacher take a more multicultural stance, upon where she encourages her students to openly learn about the contributions other groups who contributed to the United States, and by doing this she is clearly stating that diversity is a value in the classroom and minorities like the Navajo and Spanish speakers should be equally accepted alongside the Whites.

This approach is of teaching different cultural history in the McPolin classroom is in alignment to what the Tongans desire at Mountain View. “We just want it known in the classroom that we Tongans have value and worth and it taught what our contribution is to the United States. We want help to end this discrimination and racism.” (Mother Ulvame, 2014). In this message she had for the teachers at her school, Mother Ulvame suggested a way in which society could lessen the amount of discrimination and racism which is a result of misrecognition is to teach students how Polynesians, specially Tongans, contributed to the United States in much the same manner that the Navajos did in WWII.

At McPolin, Gant recognizes that the Spanish teachers educate students about different Spanish speaking cultures. So for her side of the day in reading she chooses books that teach students about different cultures within the U.S. This is in her mind the correct method in handling the new multicultural model set out by the USOE. “She is instructing children that Americans have many different cultural backgrounds, or cultural capitals and that they need to be aware of this. More awareness of America's diversity such as Navajo and Jewish and finally... I think there is a global awareness in the classroom.” (Gant, 2014). In this she is taking an authoritative role to choose specific topics that will allow her and her students to discuss these different groups within the educational setting so that she can help her students achieve global awareness.

In this type of educational setting both languages and the cultures associated with them are equally valued. The dual immersion program has helped change “institutions and social practices ... by deinstitutionalizing patterns of cultural value that impede parity of participation and replacing them with patterns that foster it” (Fraser & Honneth,31; 2009 ). Both Mountain View and McPolin have redistributed the teacher workload so that each cultural and linguistic value is equally recognized in the classroom, and furthermore, this change in social patterns of how teachers interact with students and how they teach multiculturalism in the classroom has now allowed for more participation from a diverse classroom. The teachers are no longer trying to encourage Hispanic and Polynesian children to assimilate to the previously viewed of American culture, but rather the teachers are instructing the students that how Americans now learn is multicultural, and diversity is encouraged and students are asked to share their cultural capital to benefit the group in learning.

# Interactional

In this level there is an understanding from Honneth that is order for individual’s to receive self-realization they must interact within the community. At this level the individual is able to obtain a manner of self-respect. In Honneth’s view of self-realization the term self-respect “has less to do with one’s opinion of oneself, and more with one’s possessing the universal dignity of persons.” (Jensen [Honneth], 14; 2014). This self-respect is created through the individual’s interaction with peers, and through this interaction the individual gains a sense of awareness about equals in rights and duties with other members of the community. (Toniolatti, 374; 2014). It is through this level of self-recognition that the individuals begin to see themselves as equal bearers of duties and rights among other members of the community and as a result gain a sense of self-respect.

## McPolin

In the community of Park City there is not much recognized diversity passed the two major groups, Hispanics and Whites as experienced from the agents and experts view. The Whites are the majority in the town and have the stronger recognized economic, social and cultural capitals. They have the influence to push for school program changes like when they pressed for the entire town to have mandatory dual immersion programs. “Because the community pushed for it. They wanted a no lottery system so every child could attend the dual-immersion program...uh.. Without the waiting system involved like in Salt Lake County. The community here is...Uh... White and wealthy rich families that are embracing diversity... so they wanted no obstacles to when they enrolled their kids.” (Proffit, 2014). The parents of the majority group saw primarily the economic value of having their children enroll in a dual immersion school starting from kindergarten and going all the way until 6th grade. This would mean that the parents would have enrolled their children for seven years in bi-linguistic educational system, which would also include the learning of different cultures alongside the English-speaking American culture.

Though, while there is an economic push for the dominate culture to have their children learn Spanish, there is also a cultural understanding taking place within the community. This is due to the children learning the Spanish language from the teachers, and then sharing the learned language and culture with the parents at home during homework time. “Where little kids go home and teach their parents English and then the others teacher their parents Spanish.” (Zoila, 2014). In this example, it can be seen that the White group is going home and sharing the knowledge of the language and Spanish speaking cultures at home, and elevating this identity to be equal to the English speaking knowledge learned in the same school. Also, the Hispanic children are sharing the same information with their parents, and as a result both ethnicities are learning and valuing the other group. There is this interaction and exchange of ideas and values being processed through the school to the children and finally out towards that parents who make up this community.

The community is becoming more aware of who is this other ethnic group through their child’s homework and school participation. In order for their child to succeed at McPolin the parents are needing to play an active role in helping their kids with their homework and doing volunteer work in helping with school plays and assemblies. This can be seen in the next example where Zoila describes how the White group and the Hispanic parents worked together to help the children put on a play for their parents in 1st and 2nd grade. “Yea, so when my little sister was in 1st grade they did this program, this play that they did in English and Spanish. And she did it in 2nd grade. She does this program [theater play], where they teach in English and Spanish, and then teach the whole town, and then the whole town gets together afterschool, and then they learn” (Zoila, 2014). In this aspect each of these groups has and equal and valuable role in helping the community aide in the children’s performance. The White parents are needed to help with the English part, and the Hispanic parents are valued for their aide in helping with the Spanish dialogue. Then during the performance the children are teaching the parents what they have learned linguistically and instructing the parents in learning new words both in English and Spanish. As a result both groups attain equal status and value in their work for this event, and gained what Honneth would call self-respect. They gained self-respect, because the Hispanics and Whites interacted with each other and valued each other’s’ cultural capital. They did not see each other in this moment as having less or more important cultural capital, but rather that the group needed both at this time to help the children complete their work.

In this dichotomy the Hispanic children now have a responsibility to help their peers with educational obtainment. They are now elevated from a position of knowing less-than the Whites, due to limited English proficiency to a role of influence within the Spanish class. They are treated as valuable students due to their language knowledge in much the same manner that the White children are in the English classes.

In this academic change at the school the agent is experiencing how the community has begun to alter its views of what cultures are now in the community. “Yea, just cause the community is getting involved in it. Then 10 ten years ago it wasn’t even like that. We weren’t allowed to even speak Spanish in class. You know? And now that the community is getting involved I think it is getting better. The kids learn different things. And not just Spain, but it could be from China or some other country. They could learn from the culture and from them. It would be helpful.” (Zoila, 2014). In this sense she is recognizing that her community has changed, because they are valuing the Hispanic families’ commitment to the new educational program. That they realize that this embodied capital that Hispanics families have with their language and traditions were not so different and harmful that they have decided to be more open to other potentially new cultures and languages like Chinese.

Though, through the practice of Spanish dual immersion within McPolin Elementary, Zoila’s sister is obtaining better opportunities by not only being able to speak Spanish openly, but in part, that her parents can now attend important school functions and maintain active communications with the teachers. The reason is that there are several teachers there who speak their native language within the classroom, and the hardest subjects for her math and science are now being taught in Spanish. “They go to parent teacher conference. They go, and they [teachers] tell them what is going on with her, what subject they have problems in like whether it is reading or writing, math or science” (Zoila, 2014). By having more openly accepted and practiced Hispanic cultural capital present in school many more Hispanic families are able to be more engaged in their child’s performance. They now have a commonality between the teachers and the parents. There is a trans-nationality link between the institution and the parents created by a commonality of the Spanish language.

The expert Proffit is also validating the interviewee’s view that there is this dual cultural value that is taking place within his community. “They are now more included and feel valued and accepted as a group instead of being pushed to learn English. It is easier for them to come to parent/teacher conference, because there is a teacher who speaks their language, and they can... uhhh.. know how their child is doing in school, instead of sending someone else in the family who speaks English...or ... ah.. rather not go at all. It is better for them.” (Proffit, 2014). This social acceptance and equality in the community is not just helping the Hispanic community gain self-respect, but it is also creating pathways in which the parents can participate more within other school functions that they were previously barred due to limited English levels.

By having Spanish being part of the everyday life of the children in this small community is has elevated the group of Hispanics from one of lower economic and cultural capitals, who could not participate as freely as the Whites, to a group that now has an active role in helping both groups of children learn in school. The dual immersion program has given those parents opportunities to participate fully alongside other White parents, and even participate on school board decisions and fundraisers like helping to raise awareness about Park City’s *Get Out and Play* Sports Program, where children of the community can learn how to ski and snowboard. The dual immersion program in Park City has now begun to value the different cultural capitals of its town, starting with the Hispanics. They have hired many Latin Americans and Spaniards who were previously not hired due to demand of diversity management. Also, the community of Spanish speakers are now beginning to be recognized for the academic contributions and being invited to participate equally alongside the White population in various school functions and plays. So as a result, both the Hispanic parents and children are achieving more self-respect in the community of Park City, because they can make equal contributions to the learning of the Spanish language and their embodied capital is valued. They each have roles to play within the community that requires them to fulfill their duty in helping to achieve a successful dual immersion program.

## Glendale

### Hispanics

This desire for bilingual learning is also apparent in the Glendale area as in Park City where, “I just met a parent yesterday where she drives from a long way from the East side, just so they can come to this dual immersion. In my other school it was the same thing, they would get special permits, just so they could go to the dual immersion program.” (Caudell, 2014). In the case of Mountain View which is in Salt Lake County there are not enough programs to fill all the Spanish dual immersion applicants. The community has the ability to attend automatically since they live within the school boundaries, but if there are open spots than Mountain View Elementary opens those places to other families within Salt Lake City. In the expert’s statement it can be seen that there are two major groups wanting to attend this school for various regions. The immigrant group wants to attend because it is in their community and they value their children learning about their culture and enhancing their language skills of what they already know. They feel validated within the school, because the school is teaching the immigrant language of Spanish to Spanish-speaking immigrants and other minorities.

Though, with the second group it is seen that those parents within Salt Lake City have the time and money to use to place their children within the program alongside other minorities for the potential economic capital gain that could occur in their child’s future. This economic desire by the wealthier families is very similar to that of the well-off families in Park City. Both of these groups share the need to enhance their families potential economic capital by having their children be in a Spanish speaking classroom, where they can start to be integrated in the language. “They want their kids to learn the second language. And there is tons of research now that shows that kids are going to need a second language to be successful in the future. So the jobs that are coming up for them are going to require some kind of second language.” (Caudell, 2014). In this, Caudell as one of the state’s authority members on the Utah’s Dual Immersion Programs is stating that many jobs within the United States will require future American to know and speak a second language in order to be economically successful. She is aware that many of the wealthier families are pushing for their children to gain academic skills that will help them financially in the future. However, the native Spanish speaking parents are also gaining these same skills, because they are being taught the same information alongside their White peers, and contributing more towards everyone’s learning in that they already speak the language.

Within the classroom there is a group interaction taking place where each child is needing to learn the Spanish language both spoken and written in order to pass the classes. Within the classroom the Hispanic children have the academic advantage since they have been speaking the language since birth. However, because of this linguistic skill they are able to become equal players alongside their peers. In Caudell’s experience from this type of program, Mountain View has a large majority of Spanish speakers compared to another schools that she taught that did not have as many. She has noticed that the Spanish-speakers help the class learn at a faster level, because many of the children already know the vocabulary and help the others non-native speakers learn it faster due to personal interactions and classroom work. “[This] type of setting, because we have so many Spanish speakers it’s like a 50/50 or maybe even more, where a lot of our students already speak Spanish, and then these students [all of classroom] get ahead a little bit faster, more than a school where if none of the kids spoke Spanish.” (Caudell, 2014). In this the Hispanics, are contributing to the classroom’s education in much the similar way that the Hispanics were in Park City. The children are playing a role within the community to help different children from different background like Whites and Tongans learn the language, and because of this they are developing their sense of responsibilities to the group in the form of linguistic duty to help their peers. By the Hispanic student having this responsibility they are gaining a sense of value. They are becoming active participants in the group and developing self-respect. This self-respect is created through the individual’s interaction with peers, and through this interaction the individual gains a sense of awareness about equals in rights and duties with other members of the community. (Toniolatti, 374; 2014).

This sense of self-respect due to equal participation in the Spanish dual immersion program is also seen from the interviewee’s view. In Candy’s view, she sees that her sons are also equally included in the English half of the program, because he speaks the language as well as the other children, “because they [my sons] speak English, as well as the Whites. So there is no difference between them they feel the same in inclusion as them [Whites].” (Candy, 2014). In the value of her sons are not diminished when they go to the English speaking class, because they are not native speakers, but the mother feels that her sons also have a sense of inclusion in the classroom; that the children still value them because they can contribute in English as well as in Spanish. As a result to being bilingual Candy’s sons are able to contribute to the learning of the Spanish language in one half of the day, and in the other still maintain an equal place of inclusion in the other.

The parents also have inclusionary opportunities because the Spanish dual immersion program. There are a large number of Spanish speaking teachers, administrators and personal at this school who need help in preparing lessons and spending time with the children. Because of these opportunities many of the Hispanic community members along with other minorities are asked to come and volunteer in order to help the children learn. “Yea, for everything, for volunteering we see everyone. There is a community here among us.” (Maria, 2014). In this specific case Maria is describing that her and her Hispanic peers come to the school often to come and volunteer. They are part of this *Madres* [Mothers] group. This *Madres* group comes in and volunteers with the children about once a week. They are encouraged by the staff to come and help out by teaching young students how to cook simple Mexican dishes like Salsa, teach Zumba to the older children, and help with the overall learning with the Spanish language. To do this volunteering it gives them a sense of place within the school. They are not isolated from participation due to an English language barrier, but instead welcomed because of their embodied language and culture. “I think that the reason that we are here in this school is because there is a lot of communication in Spanish at this school. And if the person, the teacher only spoke in English then we could not communicate well. We would not understand each other” (Anna, 2014).

In Mountain View, the administrative staff has come to value the embodied capital of both the Hispanic children and adults. In the terms of volunteering they are needing persons who are native speakers of Spanish to contribute their knowledge to help others learn the language. “Linguistic capital, defined as the mastery of and relation to language” (Bourdieu, 1990:114), is a form of the embodied capital within the larger area of cultural capital. By being asked to contribute their knowledge to the Glendale community the *Madres* are now continuously interacting with their peers who are of various cultural backgrounds and upholding their responsibilities of teaching Spanish to the children. This value that the community has for their cultural capital is allowing them to volunteer at the school, whereas before due to the English-only model they could not have been engaged as much due to having the inappropriate embodied capital to participate fully in the English speaking America. The *Madres* feel that their role is important there, and that there is a stronger sense of community, because many of them are given leadership roles to play within the school. “Yes, everyone is. There is more equal opportunity [to participate] because of the school teaching in two cultures.” (Maria, 2014).

### The Broader Community for Hispanics

 In the broader community of Glendale, outside of the school the interviewees are feeling how their different forms of capital are being valued, and from this value how they are being treated. In the scenario with Ana, she was running errands to various stores throughout the day. She is a Mexican immigrant who has lived in the United States for some time, but still does not have a strong mastery of the English language. So, she speaks with a strong accent. In her first encounter of the day she goes to Subway to order lunch, and is waited on by a Hispanic woman who does not value her cultural capital and looks down upon her for her thickly accented English.

“Yes, most definitely, but for example when I was at Subway [restaurant] the woman [Latina] didn’t like how I was pronouncing the English words. She looked down upon me for that. That I could not speak English well. She would not try to speak Spanish with me even though she was Latina. She looked down at me, even though we were the same [Latinas] .(Anna, 2014).

In this, it can be seen that in Anna’s view that her and this woman share the same cultural background and language, but the woman seems to not value her Spanish-speaking side and devalues others who have this embodied capital of coming from a Latin American country. As a result from this woman’s devaluing, she makes Ana feel uneducated, and incompetent and that she does not belong in the group, because she cannot speak English as well as she can. From this interactional view it can be seen that there are Spanish speaking persons who devalue the Spanish language and those Hispanics who have not assimilated into the English-speaking community. This devaluing of the language by native speakers is also recognized by the expert Caudell who states “There is a lot of culturally...ummm.. just kind of negative ...view points on speaking Spanish here in the United States, especially for the native Spanish speakers they just feel like they don't want to speak Spanish”(Caudell, 2014). In her view, she understands Ana’s experience at Subway where she was looked down upon for not speaking English. Caudell sees that in the larger national view, Americans do not value persons who speak Spanish and think of them less if they cannot speak English. In the national view it is seen that persons who have the embodied capital of Latin America do not belong in the U.S., and if they are here than they are not as equal nor do they have a role to play that would provide them responsibilities and duties to America. These persons who devalue this capital such as with the Hispanic Subway woman can create instances where the individual like Ana is not gaining any sense of self-respect due to this idea behind the embodied Latin America capital.

However, within the same community of Glendale Ana experienced a different interaction based on her embodied capital.

Then when I was at Baskin Robbins [Ice Cream Shop] an American girl was helping me. She only spoke English, but this girl tried to speak in Spanish to help me. She is American, but she tried, and the Latina wouldn’t. So you can see the difference. I felt good when the American spoke some Spanish, because someone wanted to speak my language. It made me feel proud.” (Ana, 2014).

On this same day Ana encountered someone who had a different embodied capital, an American who grew up in Glendale, in the United States, and only spoke English. She had little knowledge of the Spanish language and from the interviewee’s perspective had very little social connections to the Hispanic community. However, she knew some words of the language, and valued it enough to try to speak it to Ana. In her interaction she was treating Ana like any other customers and was working with her to help her fulfill her ice cream order. Through this interaction Ana felt proud that this American girl willingly spoke Spanish, her language in order to help her and make her feel included in the store.

Overall, in both of Ana’s experiences it can be seen that the Glendale community has different views and values towards the Spanish-speaking capital. Some of the Hispanics who are fluent English speakers look down upon those who cannot speak the language well, while other native English speakers try to speak the Spanish language out of empathy or helpfulness. It seems that there are many different persons and values towards this language in Glendale for many different reasons.

In the immediate community at Mountain View Elementary the *Madres* group seems to value other cultural capitals beyond that of the Spanish and English speaking. They are aware that many different cultural groups live within this small area, and they are proud of this fact. They feel a sense of community not with just other Hispanics, but Asians, Africans, Tongans and others. “Yes, yes I think so, because we are rich in culture. And in my experience we don't have to go and travel to try new things like Chinese and Vietnamese culture and food. We learn from each other. We have many groups here.” (Elizabeth, 2014). In Elizabeth’s view as one of the school’s activities coordinator she sees the interactional involvement of many different groups at the school. She has even coordinated community classes on Vietnamese and Somali culture in hopes that it brings more understanding and awareness.

In the view from the Hispanics mothers their children feel welcomed for their cultural capital and encouraged to share it for the benefit of the group. The *Madres* also feel that they are valued by the school for their linguistic contributions and that the Glendale community is in parts valuing the language and its speakers. However, it is important to examine not only how the Spanish-speakers are being valued in this bilingual program, but also how other non-Spanish speaking immigrant group like the Tongans are being recognized within this system

### Tongan

The Tongan families make up a significant proportion of the immigrant population in Glendale and Mountain View Elementary. They are the second largest immigrant group in this area, behind the Hispanics. Within the school there is a strong connection between the educational staff and the various immigrant communities, especially with the Tongans. Even though Tongan is not a language taught at school nor do many of the community members know this language, the culture is still valued in some ways.

The school authorities value the Tongan parents’ embodied and institutionalized capitals. The school has already set out to bring multicultural understanding and academic success to their students as was discussed in the institution section, and in order to do this effectively they need to bring in positive examples of their goal. As such, the school counselor and community coordinator ask Tongan parents to come and help the children learn how to study and be good students. In one of the examples of the school’s value, the school counselor valued Father Ulvame’s academic performance both as a student and father. He is a very passionate mentor who works to help students achieve success by sharing his immigrant identity, the embodied capital, and his personal educational achievements, the institutional capital. With regards to his embodied capital he recognizes that America and Utahans can devalue this type of capital through the use of racism. “Society uses racism. “You come from that part of town, so you must be like that.” And that is from my story.” (Father Ulvame, 2014). In this sense, he recognizes that is not just a linguistic devaluing done by the dominate culture like in the story of Ana, but rather that it is a geographical discrimination. That is because both he and Ana and the majority of the students come from Glendale. They have an embodied capital that is lower than that of others who come from the Eastern areas of Salt Lake City. This is one of the reasons that teachers at Mountain View ask him and many of his community to come and participate in helping with the learning process is that they can relate to the children’s culture even though they do not speak the same native language, but they do share many of the same struggles. “You need to understand that we have a lot of barriers. It seems so many are interested in a lot of things, and not just looking at the person. So what I am asking is that you understand, we got more hills to climb than you like language...” (Father Ulvame, 2014). In this statement Father Ulvame recognizes that immigrants in this community have many personal obstacles starting with the language in order to achieve academic success, and because he can relate and have similar immigrant experiences to many of the students on this level he is able to play a participatory role within the school by providing insight on these struggles, and helping the children overcome them.

Through this leadership position and engagement his is able to be provided with duties and responsibilities at the school to help the school become successful. The diversity management model of the school is wanting the school to be more multilingual and multicultural and in order for them to succeed they need help not from just the teachers, but the parents as well. They are then showing the students that they value Father Ulvame’s embodied capital and hoping to teach the students to value his and theirs by empathizing with the immigrant’s personal struggles.

In the second part of the school interacting with Father Ulvame and other Tongans like him, the teachers and staff have come to value his institutional capital. In this capital, they see that he was a good student as a child, and that he helped all of his older daughters go to college. “My oldest daughter is graduating from Harvard. She will be the first Tongan to graduate from Harvard. In all things she is graduating in English.” (Father Ulvame, 2014). In order for this daughter and his other children to graduate from college the father had to have some educational understanding and be able to help his daughters gain the same or better educational achievements. “We read together every morning, an hour before school…. I never missed one single parent-teacher conference. I was so determined that we were going to make it in America.” (Father Ulvame, 2014). In this aspect, Father Ulvame values education and the pursuit of education not just for knowledge, but also for achieving a higher economic standing so that he and his family could ‘make it’ in America, in that they achieve financial independence and success.

Because Father Ulvame has this institutional capital regarding his academic achievements he is valued at Mountain View Elementary. He is asked to participate at many school meetings as a voice of immigrants and is asked to help mentor many students, not just the Tongan community. In this, his volunteer work is somewhat different than the *Madres*, in that he is not being asked to share food recipes or langauge assistance, but rather he is being asked to contribute his personal knowledge and experiences in hopes that more students will succeed by interacting with an immigrant who has a valued cultural capital.

The interactions between the Tongan and the teachers are at more intimate level. They at times instruct both the Spanish and English teachers more about Tongan culture and communicate their needs as a community. “You [teachers] take time to take it a little deeper to really understand who we are, as human beings, as people with families. Comfort us as people with needs. And learn a little bit about our history, where we are coming from. I just shared with you earlier about how we think. What I shared with you came directly from the heart. We do not compartmentalize our communication methods.” (Father Ulvame, 2014). In this manner the interviewee is reaching out the Spanish dual immersion teachers to ask them to learn more about them as people and come to value them and their capitals as easily as they do with the English and Spanish speakers.

The interactions between the teachers and these two groups is influenced by multicultural awareness which is implemented in the schools’ diversity management. This diversity management program which was developed by the state’s dual immersion programs has created the current position of teachers at the schools, where there is a sense of pride in teaching in a bilingual and multicultural environment, and that the students are gaining an education that is beneficial for them. “Only the positive can be gained when any language program are introduced. They experience so much about the world. They gain awareness and can go on to learn more languages. Some have even gone on to take a third languages in High School.” (Gant, 2014) . These interactions in the Spanish dual immersion program then influence on how the individuals for personal relationships which will be analyzed in the next section.

# Individual

In the final phase of this analysis the research will focus on the individual level. In this level there will be a focus on how the each of the three parties understands how they are contributing to the academic development of the Hispanic and Tongan students. The parties will be from the teachers’ and parents’ view.

In this section the individual is the main focus of recognition and how someone achieves full self-realization is to achieve a sense of value and worth within society, the community and finally with individual relationships that involve love. In Honneth’s view of the individual he focuses much of his work between intimate relationships like the child and mother early relationship. This dyad is influenced from the Hegelian terminology of ‘love’ which are the small social relationships that are based on strong connections between individuals similar to the mother and the child. “Love relationships are to be understood here as referring to primary relationships insofar as they – on the model of friendships, parent-child relationships – are constituted by strong emotional attachments among a small number of people.” (Ibid, 153). In this sense, these types of personal connections are focused on the subjects’ interdependence. In Honneth’s work most of the recognition is focused on the early stages of a child’s development, where the child discovers that his needs cannot be met by himself, but rather he needs the aid of the mother or mother-like figure to help him fulfill his needs. Through this process the mother who providing care for the child helps him create a sense of confidence, in that his needs will be met by the parent. In this scenario, the child then develops a trusting bond with the mother knowing that she will love and care for this child. As a result from this love, self-confidence is developed in the individual. “On Honneth’s account basic self-confidence has less to do with a high estimation of one’s abilities, than with an underlying capacity and desire to express one’s needs and desire’s without being abandoned as a result.” (Anderson [Honneth], 17, 1995)

This mother-child relationship can also be taken a step further to incorporate other intimate relationships that individuals develop throughout their lives. This section will focus on some of these relationships to examine if there is a development of self-confidence in the Spanish dual immersion program at McPolin and Mountain View Elementary.

In the previous sections it was seen that the Spanish dual immersion programs had offered ways in which the school could participate in a more multicultural manner which resulted from their state implemented diversity management. Though in this section it is important to understand if the individual feels that they are being recognized as an individual of value in the classroom. The work will first start with the perspective of the Tongans.

## Tongans

The Tongans have been instructed to learn the Spanish language alongside the other students. Spanish is no more a common language to this group than it is to the dominate White population. So on this part it seems that they are gaining a skill that could be used later on in life to enhance their potential economic capital like the White group which can seem like a positive reason for learning the language. However, unlike their Hispanic counterparts they are not being socially recognized and valued for their immigrant language. There is no push from the state of Utah for the 30,000 dual immersion students to learn Tongan or any other Polynesian language. So in this manner, the Tongans are not being socially recognized on the state level for their unique language heritage like the Hispanic community.

However, in the personal interview of Mother Ulvame it can be seen that even though the institution is not pushing for teachers and students to learn Polynesian languages it does not mean that some teachers have not tried to connect personally with the knowledge of the language. “I had a teacher just say the number one in our language, and it almost made me cry. She said she knew this number, because her son went on a mission to Tonga, and she just wanted to share what she knew” (Mother Ulvame, 2014). Her response at hearing this teacher say when explaining this moment to other teachers at Mountain View was “We would feel so loved and valued if a teacher just said one word to us in our language. One word would mean so much to us.” (Mother Ulvame, 2014). In this small interaction between her and her child’s teacher shows that how the teacher interacted with the child’s mother was an act that created a bond of love. The teacher having some cultural awareness of some part of Tongan identity meant a significant amount to the individual. Mother Ulvame felt that her need for the teachers, for one teacher to appreciate her people as valuable was met in that moment when the teacher said “*taha*, [one]”. Even though this English teacher could not speak as much Tongan as she could Spanish to her students, she reached out and tried to make a small connection that showed that she valued the Tongan cultural capital.

This experience from Mother Ulvame in the dual immersion program is much different than the one her and her husband faced when they were with English-only model years ago. In this program, the teachers did not try to make this sort of connection instead, there was a lack of love. The teachers did not make the Tongan interviewees feel like their needs were being met or that there was any sort of bonding relationship between the student and the teacher. Instead, it was a situation of isolation and pain.

In fact, when I first started school in Utah, I could not speak the language, but I was really good at Math. I was the best in my class back in Tonga, and when we had our first Math test everyone was taking it, and I was the first to finish. They took an hour to finish, and I was done in 15 minutes. I was proud of myself and I went up and handed in my work to the teacher, and she accused me of cheating she said “Did you cheat? You cheated” It still hurts me today. It is a psychological pain associated with the fact she thought I cheated. I came from the top school in my former school where I never cheated, my culture taught me that, my religion. Now that is the kind of barriers we constantly run into. Society does all the time. . I was discriminated against, because of my ethnicity and where I was from. She was sure I cheated, and could not do Math, because I could not speak English and I was Tongan. (Father Ulvame, 2014).

In this time at Mountain View Elementary the teacher did not welcome the new student or treat him with the equality she did with the other students. Instead, she misrecognized Father Ulvame and ascribed him a status based on his cultural capital. The teacher immediately saw him as being incapable of doing math and punished him for the presumption of cheating. She hurt him deeply on a very psychological level that still lingers to this day.

In this intimate relationship between the child and this ‘mother’ like figure she did not fulfill Father Ulvame’s needs. She did not praise him for doing well in an exam or provide him with a sense of security and warmth. Instead, the teacher abandoned him based on a cultural value about their embodied capital, where Tongans must be cheaters and could not do well in school, because they did not speak English. As a result to this treatment in the relationship Father Ulvame could not make sense of his own failures within this new environment. In his previous environment with other teachers in Tonga he had learned that he excelled in math, and to be a good student was one that never cheated. So when he was accused of cheating it was not only an assault of the act against him, but an attack against his very identity. He was perceived by this ‘mother’ figure to be one of malevolent character due to the fact that he not only cheated, but was Tongan, and the misrecognition was the proof to him cheating.

However, in the latter years since the introduction of the Spanish dual immersion program the teachers have been pushed to be more multicultural within the classroom due to the need of incorporating a fully functioning Spanish bilingual program that requires all students to learn both Spanish and English proficiently. This strong introduction of multiculturalism has had an effect on how teachers relate to their students and how they form relationships.

In the cultural meeting Father Ulvame reminded the teachers that in order to have productive and meaningful relationships with the students at the school the teachers needed to understand the students. “I think that is one of things you should know., How people communicate, how people interact with one another then you can better serve the needs [immigrants] We are going to help by adopting this new country, but that thing can take various times. And then learn to adapt, and become adept in this new country.” (Father Ulvame, 2014). In this statement, Father Ulvame is encouraging other teachers that they need to form relationships with students by learning their specific uniqueness in how they communicate. He is instructing the teachers that they need to remain patient and open minded when working with the immigrant children at the school. He feels that they should not fall back to the era when the teachers imposed their cultural ideals about each immigrant groups’ cultural capital, but rather they must take the time to understand them as unique individuals. Father Ulvame, also explains how Tongans communicate as an ethnic group. “I told you that we feel a lot. It is not a lot verbal communication that we understand a lot, but a lot of body that Polynesian understand.” (Father Ulvame, 2014). In this sense he is going on to describe that they communicate as a culture through a lot of body language and are not as focused on the verbal as many Western languages.

By the Father Ulvame coming to speak with the teachers he is trying to create a loving relationship between him and them, both English and Spanish speaking. He is communicating at an intimate level, a position that comes from the heart. Ulvame is trying to meet their needs in teaching a diverse student group by providing them with information and personal experiences. It is not just the children that are involved in this intimate relationships, but also the parents as well. In these relationships the parents are now experiencing realizations of self-confidence that they did not get in their childhoods. Since the switch to the Spanish dual immersion school there has been more acceptance of multiculturalism, and encouragement for different minority groups like the Tongans to form relationships with the teachers. In the next section it will be examined how the Hispanic populations are creating personal relationships that may result in self-confidence.

## Hispanics

In another example of the teacher-student relationship there is one between the Hispanics of Mountain View Elementary. In the *Madres* group, one of the mothers continues to put her son in this school for the Spanish dual immersion stream. This is due to her son and the teacher sharing the same cultural heritage. They are both from Mexico and now both live in the United States. The son and teacher face many of the same cultural challenges with having the Mexican culture, and the teacher can empathize with the son. “Yes, in fact that is what I love about my son’s teacher. Because he always said “Don’t lose what/where we come from and always value what you are.” Mr. Martinez is from Mexico like me and my son. The have a special connection, because of this. That is what I like best about this teacher.” (Ana, 2014) In this sense the teacher is comforting the son on his issues to find a balance between being an American and a Mexican. There are many negative stereotypes within Ana’s son’s environment about being Hispanic and speaking Spanish “For so long it was frowned upon for speaking Spanish …. there is a prejudice against people, Hispanics pretty much.” (Caudell, 2014). However, Mr. Martinez is alleviating the son’s insecurities about speaking Spanish and having a Mexican identity. He is acknowledging that it is a good value and that he should not lose that by assimilating into the American culture. Instead, Mr. Martinez is encouraging the son to acknowledge the cultural capital as value by telling him through loving words. He is being an example to Ana’s son about how this specific capital can be valued. In that, he can both succeed as a teacher in America and publically display his Mexican identity. This was a very moving moment in the interview, because Ana had felt much frustration at times that the community did not want to value this Mexican identity, but when she described the situation with her son, she spoke with much pride about the situation.

The school is not only reaching out on an individual level to the students by speaking Spanish, but there is a strong effort by the staff to communicate on an intimate level. They are wanting to build a bridge between the authority and the students by coming to connect with them culturally in hopes that they will succeed academically. This connection is made culturally by the students and the teachers sharing the same ethnic background as in the case of Maria “They like having the Hispanic teachers, because they come from the same background as my child. The teacher is from the same culture, the same background, and there is a strong connection between the child and teacher. They are both Mexican. There is a cultural understanding.” (Maria, 2014). In this specific relation of Maria’s two daughters, they share a cultural understanding with the teachers when they go to school. They have a stronger desire to go and learn because they have a personal connection with the teachers. Though, this connection does not just stop with the students, but continues on with the mothers. They feel that they can go and speak with these teachers more freely, because they can also connect to them. In this situation the relationship plays out for each person in a form of love and respect. The mothers and children feel welcomed in the classroom, and feel that they are valued equally among the other parents and students because they share the same embodied capital as some of the teachers.

This is seen clearly during the interview when the question was asked if their children went to an English-only school would it hinder their child’s performance. The response from the interviewee Maria was descriptive in that “They could lose their confidence, their grades. It would be difficult. But now, the teacher speaks Spanish and they can talk about things, not just school.” (Maria, 2014). In this sense, both the mothers and the children are able to perform better in the Spanish dual immersion program, because there are teachers there who share the same cultural capital and can relate to them on an intimate level. In this example by Maria, she acknowledges, that the children would lose their confidence and that their academics might suffer because then neither the child nor the parent could form active relationships with the teachers.

Maria also describes that it is not just the school subjects that the mothers and the children talk about with the teachers, but it is also other things that are discussed, such as cultural values and ideas. In this, the teacher is meeting the needs of the family in these small relationships. The Spanish speaking teachers are helping to create confidence in the students which ultimately helps them succeed academically.

So in the scenario at Mountain View Elementary, there is a strong feeling from the interviewees that there are personal and intimate connections being made between the teachers and the students. These connections are derived from the matter that the school is more multicultural and has a diverse awareness that is helping the teachers to build a bond with the students culturally and linguistically.

In McPolin Elementary there can be seen a similar state of bond building through the actions of love. The student body of this school does not contain many other immigrant groups other than Hispanics, but it does have a significant proportion. “About 41% of the school are Hispanic. We are located around the service industry housing. With families living in 1, 2 bedroom apartments.” (Proffit, 2014). Herein, it can be understood that a little less than half of the school population is Hispanic and has low economic capital which forces the families to live in tight quarters.

As was discussed previously in the two sections of the institution and the interactional it can be understood that there was a shift in the school’s and community’s behavior towards Hispanics. Originally, they were undesired and seen as less-than by the dominate White group, but through the need of having Spanish speaking persons in the school the value changed to one of more equality and participation. However, to examine that situation more closely it must be seen from the individual’s perspective on their personal relationships.

From the experts view at McPolin the principal points out that he has many teachers that he has specifically hired because they are wanting to create the intimate relationship with children who are disadvantaged by having lower economic and social capitals. In this statement he points out that he has newly hired a teacher for this specific purpose. “Like this teacher here [Points to 3rd grade teacher who is teaching Spanish Class] She transferred to us from South Side Chicago and taught at a Spanish dual immersion school there to mainly underprivileged Black Children. She taught there for many years, but could have taught at wealthier schools, but stayed for her passion to help kids.” (Proffit, 2014). In this message from Proffit it is understood that this teacher wishes to continue to create personal relationships with the disadvantage. She originally taught Spanish in one the poorest and heavily gang ridden areas in Chicago, and with her experience she had the opportunity to advance her career to a position, to a place that would have provided her with more economic capital and higher connections in the social capital. Instead, she decided to continue her work in teaching Spanish to underprivileged children along with the privileged. In this she wishes to continue to provide a loving relationship to her 3rd grade class and help them succeed academically by devoting herself to aiding those groups who might be ostracized from the dominate like she did in Chicago.

This idea of creating strong relationships between the child and the student is also validated by the agent’s experience at this school. Her sister is in the 2nd grade and has experienced positive relations with her teacher based on the treatment of equality. The Catalonian teacher is pleased with her work, and encourages her to speak Spanish openly in the classroom and outside of it. The teacher helps build her confidence by giving her value to her uniqueness. “She always comes home and tells us about her day at school. She gets along with her friends and teachers.” (Zoila, 2014). As a result of having positive relationships with her teachers the daughter pushes harder to excel in her Spanish class. “She gets excited. She puts up her report card that she can read and write in Spanish. She tries double to learn and understand it.” (Zoila, 2014). At McPolin Elementary the teacher for Zoila’s younger sister is encouraging her cultural capital and giving her confidence in her ability to learn at school. She is validating her and providing her with constant encouragement that could be seen as a form of love in this relationship between the teacher and the student. This encouragement and personal validation from her teacher is aiding in her academic success. She feels pride and confidence in her ability to read and write Spanish, and as a result she tries harder to excel in the subject.

Also as in Mountain View Elementary the parents are able to form relationships with the teachers whereas before they were unable, do to not being able to speak English fluently. “They go to parent teacher conference. They go, and they [teachers] tell them what is going on with her, what subject they have problems in like whether it is reading or writing, math or science.” (Zoila, 2014). While the relationships might not be as intense between Zoila’s parents and the teachers as it was with the *Madres* at Mountain View Elementary, the relationship between the small groups is there. The parents can go to the Parent-Teacher Conferences and participate and form personal relationships with the Spanish speaking teachers, and discuss how their daughter is performing in school. They are able to speak about how she is on a more intimate level without needing a translator. They now have the ability to feel a connection with the teachers and the school.

The expert at McPolin is able to validate the agent’s view on being accepted within the school and being able to form more personal relationships. “They are now more included and feel valued and accepted as a group instead of being pushed to learn English. It is easier for them to come to Parent-Teacher Conference, because there is a teacher who speaks their language, and they can. know how their child is doing in school, instead of sending someone else in the family who speaks English...or ... ah.. rather not go at all.” (Proffit, 2014). In this statement the children are not the only ones being able to create personal relationships with the teachers, but also the parents. The parents feel that their need to being recognized as concern parents are being met by the staff at McPolin. They are able to take the position of loving parents attending conferences for their children as equally as the dominate White population due to the means that the schools staff is 50% Spanish speaking. There needs are being met by the personnel, and as a result they can maintain caring and engaging relationships with the teachers and the staff.

# Conclusion

The introduction of the Spanish dual immersion programs at both McPolin Elementary and Mountain View Elementary have led to diverse changes in the policy and program from what it was a decade ago. In many of the interviewees explanations of their education in Utah from when they were children they felt that they needed to assimilate to what was perceived to be the universal norm at the time; which was an idea that immigrants regardless of ethnicity must speak only English in public and try be like the White, Mormon majority as much as possible. Both the Tongan and the Hispanic interviewees also felt that in this time there were many prejudices put against them in the school by the teachers and classmates. The felt misrecognized and undervalued. In the case of the Tongans, it was seen that teachers perceived them to be low performing students, and children who would most likely go on to be gang members. This ascribed idea directed from the teachers onto these children gave them little room to share their culture and identity, and to ultimately be treated as an equal in the classroom.

In the Hispanic perceptions of education before this switch to dual immersion, many children were excluded from equality and shamed in public for speaking Spanish. This was due to the varied belief system on many different macro and micro levels that created a cultural pattern of ideas that Spanish speakers, especially those from Latin America did not belong in the U.S. and they were uneducated because they could not speak English. Different people such as teachers, community members and members in the larger society diminished the cultural value of this large group. They perceived them as being intrusive to learning in the classroom, and made little effort in terms of providing translators for school meetings or conferences so that Spanish speakers could attend.

Instead, Hispanic children were left feeling isolated and shamed by the assimilating nature of the school’s English –only program, and they could not relay on the adults to aide them like their White peers. In the interview of Zoila, it is seen that her parents could not attend school meetings and the teachers did not understand her personal struggles and discrimination. As a result, she was left to fail in the school system, being passed from grade to grade with little guidance and barely graduating high school.

In these few interviews it can be seen that the traditional method of teaching in the English-only style did not help foster cultural awareness, nor aide minorities contributing to their understanding and being valued. Instead, it let many of them fall behind academically and feel excluded from Utah society.

However, since the introduction of the Utah’s Dual Immersion Programs there has been a difference in change towards the understanding of diversity. The state directive pushed policies that were aimed towards the acceptance of multiculturalism for the citizens of Utah. The policies then helped develop the programs in which the schools operated. The programs became heavily focused on hiring diverse teachers with varied cultural capital. It encouraged the participation of cultural equality and recognition in the classroom, by allowing groups of immigrants to speak their native languages, as in the case of the Hispanics. The program also created opportunities for teachers and community members to come and share their culture more openly with the school, and it provided means in which there could be an open conversation between the teachers and community members.

The program then pushed the teachers to try to create more individual relationships with each other and their students. The teachers altered their values and their perception of what the universal norm was in America to an idea that the world and this nation is more multicultural than was previously assumed. The teachers created relationships in McPolin and Mountain View that were derived on the idea of connecting to the students varied embodied capitals through cultural and linguistic awareness.

This deeper cultural interaction between the teachers and students also led for more participation between the parents and the school and community. The parents both Hispanics and Tongans could now play in roles of leadership in the school, and not be excluded because of diversity. In the case of the Hispanics at both McPolin and Mountain View, the Spanish-speaking were able to participate equally alongside their White peers in Parent-Teacher Conferences, school plays, Spanish language practice and cultural awareness meetings. They were treated with value and recognition by the community and the teachers, because the children were learning this groups’ language and culture as part of their educational program.

The interaction from the teachers in the Spanish dual immersion program also created opportunities for the Tongans to participate as well. The diverse staff encouraged these parents to come and be an example for their students. They were treated as mentors at the school and advisors on immigration challenges for students.

Finally, this interaction between this different groups pushed the relationships to be ones created more intimately. The Spanish dual immersion program gave teachers tools on how to be more culturally aware and inclusive in the classroom. The teachers for the most part, were no longer trying to assimilate every immigrant child to an idea of only English speaking. Instead, the teachers were trying to enhance the diversity in their classroom by connecting with students based on their language and culture. They were doing this by creating personal relationships with the parents and the children in hopes that by developing this type of relationship that they could help the child succeed academically.

Overall, there was a top down approach to instituting dual immersion programs in the State of Utah. The directive created the policy which then influenced how the program would be managed in each school which then pushed the ideas on how diversity would be recognized in the classroom. Which then the program influenced how teachers would interact with students and finally this influenced how students felt about themselves. It resulted in an overreaching idea that diversity is a positive concept in Utah and that it should be embraced openly within the classroom instead of being excluded.

# Bibliography

2014, February. *UTAH'S POPULATION* (n.d.): n. pag. *Utah's Population*. Office of Legislative Research and Council, Feb. 2014. Web. May 2014.

Bourdieu, Pierre. *The Forms of Capital*. S.l.: n.p., n.d. Print.

Davidson, Lee. "One of Every Four Tongans in U.S. Calls Utah Home." *Salt Lake Tribune* [Salt Lake CIty] 12 Sept. 2011: n. pag. Print.

Faist, Thomas. "Cultural Diversity and Social Inequalities." *Social Research* 77.1 (2010): 297-319. Web. 30 July 2014.

Fraser, Nancy, and Axel Honneth. *Redistribution or Recognition?: A Political-philosophical Exchange*. London: Verso, 2003. Print.

Honneth, Axel. *The Struggle for Recognition: The Moral Grammar of Social Conflicts*. Cambridge, UK: Polity, 1995. Print.

Martin, Michael. "How Will America Cope With Diversity Changes?" *NPR*. NPR, 26 Mar. 2013. Web. 15 May 2014.

PBS, and Diane Rativich. "American Public Education Hisorty." *PBS*. PBS, 2010. Web. 30 Apr. 2014.

Proffit, Gregg. "Principal's Message." *McPolin:*. McPolin Elementary School, 2014. Web. 08 July 2014.

"Salt Lake City, Utah." *(UT) Profile: Population, Maps, Real Estate, Averages, Homes, Statistics, Relocation, Travel, Jobs, Hospitals, Schools, Crime, Moving, Houses, News, Sex Offenders*. City Data, 2013. Web. 30 July 2014.

"Spanish Dual Immersion Interview Mountain View." Personal interview. 08 June 2014.

"Spanish Dual Immersion Interview Mountain View." Personal interview. 10 June 2014.

"Spanish Dual Immersion McPolin Elelmentary." Personal interview. 12 June 2014.

"Spanish Dual Immersion McPolin Elelmentary." Personal interview. 27 Apr. 2014.

"Spanish Dual Immersion McPolin Elelmentary." Personal interview. 30 Apr. 2014.

Stoney, Sierra, and Jenna Baltova. "Mexican Immigrants in the United States." *Migrationpolicy.org*. Migration Policy Institute, 2013. Web. 30 May 2014.

Toniolatti, Edoarado. "From Critique to Reconstruction: On Axel Honneth's Theory of Recognition and Its Critical Potential." *Journal of Philosophy and Social Theory* 90th ser. 10.371 (2009): 372-90. *Equinox*. Web. 05 May 2014.

"TUCSON POVERTY MEASURES." *TucsonAZ.gov Home*. City of Tuscon, 2013. Web. 05 June 2014.

Ulvame, Father, Mother Ulvame, and Son Ulvame. "Tongan Immigration in Utah." Cultural Meeting. Mountain View Elementary, Salt Lake CIty. 30 Apr. 2014. Lecture.

U.S. Census Bureau. "Questions and Answers for Census 2010." U.S. Census 2010, 2010. Web. 12 June 2014.

U.S. State Department. "U.S. Relations With Tonga." *U.S. Department of State*. U.S. Department of State, 19 Aug. 2013. Web. 02 May 2014.

"USOE - World Language - Home." *USOE - World Language - Home*. Utah State Office of Education, 2010. Web. 30 May 2014.

Utah State Office of Education. "Utah Dual Immersion." *YouTube*. YouTube, 25 Nov. 2011. Web. 10 Apr. 2014.

Utah State Office of Education. "Why Immersion? | Utah Immersion." *Utah Immersion*. Utah Department of Education, 2010. Web. 30 May 2014.

Voices for Utah Children. "Indicator Selection | KIDS COUNT Data Center." *Indicator Selection | KIDS COUNT Data Center*. Annie E. Casey Foundation, 2014. Web. 30 Apr. 2014.

"Welcome!" *Mountain View Elementary School: Salt Lake City School District*. Salt Lake School District, 2014. Web. 18 July 2014.